Pages 1 through 7 redacted for the following reasons:

Jothen, Janet M AVED:EX

From:

Jothen, Janet M AVED:EX

Sent:

Thursday, February 20, 2014 7:46 AM

To: Subject:

Simmons, Vicki AVED:EX RE: Juris Doctor forms

Yes, will do.

From: Simmons, Vicki AVED:EX

Sent: Thursday, February 20, 2014 7:45 AM

To: Jothen, Janet M AVED:EX

Cc: Mayer, Craig W AVED:EX; Rogers, Dorothy AVED:EX

Subject: FW: Juris Doctor forms

Hi Janet,

Can you please post the letter and the T&C to PSIPS?

Thanks, Vicki

Vicki Simmons

Senior Policy Analyst Governance and Quality Assurance Branch BC Ministry of Advanced Education

3rd Floor, 835 Humboldt St PO Box 9883 Stn Prov Govt Victoria BC V8W 9T6

(T) 250-356-2067 | (F) 250-387-3750 | (E) vicki.simmons@gov.bc.ca

From: AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX

Sent: Thursday, February 20, 2014 7:28 AM

To: Rogers, Dorothy AVED:EX; Simmons, Vicki AVED:EX

Subject: FW: Juris Doctor forms

fyi

From: Elsie Froment [mailto:Elsie.Froment@twu.ca]
Sent: Wednesday, February 19, 2014 2:59 PM

To: AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX

Subject: RE: Juris Doctor forms

Craig,

The Juris Doctor signed Terms and Conditions are attached. We are sending the originals to you by courier.

Thank you for your help with this process.

Elsie

From: AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX [mailto:DQABsecretariat@gov.bc.ca]

Sent: January-28-14 12:28 PM

To: Elsie Froment

Subject: Juris Doctor forms

Hi Elsie - in response to your inquiry to Vicki Simmons, please find attached the two documents that require your institution's signature as referenced in the Minister's letter (Special Terms and Conditions of Consent and Standard Terms and Conditions of Consent). Once we receive these signed forms we can then move the JD submission from Under Review to Ministerial Consent.

If you wish to fax these, our number is 250-387-3750 (attention myself or Vicki).

Thank you, Craig

Craig Mayer
Governance and Quality Assurance
Ministry of Advanced Education
250-387-1138
Craig.Mayer@gov.bc.ca

SPECIAL TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF MINISTERIAL CONSENT

Name of Institution: Trinity Western University

Consent for:

Juris Doctor

The following special terms and conditions are attached to the consent from the Minister of Advanced Education under section 4(3) of the Degree Authorization Act.

- 1) Consent period: The consent period will be five years.
- 2) Prior Commitments: The institution must implement the agreed to conditions made in its response of May 17, 2013 to the expert panel's report.
- 3) Faculty: The institution must hire qualified faculty with the necessary qualifications for the degree being offered.
- 4) **Approval:** The institution will be able to admit students into the program based on approval received from the Federation of Law Societies of Canada in December 2013.
- 5) **Reporting:** The institution must provide a report to the Board on the status of faculty recruitment and regulatory body approval prior to launching the program.
- 6) Misrepresentation or malfeasance: The minister may deny, suspend, or revoke consent, where the following has taken place, or was taking place, at any time during or after the consent process until such time as the minister is satisfied that the situation has been remedied:
 - information provided for reviews was not truthful and complete; and/or,
 - misrepresentations, falsehood, fraud, abuse, or charges pending against the institution or its staff members for violations of law had occurred, or was occurring.

I acknowledge that I understand the terms and conditions attached to consent, that all information provided in the application is true, and that I agree to comply with all representations made during the course of the application, and with the terms and conditions of consent.

W. Robert Wood		
Name of authorized representative		
Provost		
Position at the Institution		348
L-	Fab 19/14	C SMERKE BOX 144
Signature	Date	,

TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF MINISTERIAL CONSENT

Name of Institution: Trinity Western University

. Consent for: Juris Doctor

The following standard terms and conditions are attached to the consent from the Minister of Advanced Education under section 4(3) of the Degree Authorization Act.

- 1) Consent period: The consent period will normally be five years.
- 2) Scope of consent: Consent will be specific to the activity, program (major and minor, if specified) and site described in the submitted application.

The consent holder must inform the minister before implementation of any material change in circumstance (i.e., ownership change, location change, material change in learning outcomes, the minimum qualifications of faculty), or of substantive changes (i.e., termination or suspension of programs that have consent), which may change the scope of consent.

- 3) Consent not transferable: A consent is not transferable.
- 4) Notice for students and public: The following must appear in the consent holder's current calendar, and in the student's enrolment contract:

This program is offered under the written consent of the Minister of Advanced Education effective (consent date) having undergone a quality assessment process and been found to meet the criteria established by the minister. Nevertheless, prospective students are responsible for satisfying themselves that the program and the degree will be appropriate to their needs (for example, acceptable to potential employers, professional licensing bodies, or other educational institutions).

- 5) Advertising: A consent holder must not use any term or phrase in advertising that refers to approval of the minister or the Government of British Columbia other than that the program is offered under the written consent of the minister.
- 6) **Program Implementation:** The consent holder must enroll students in the degree program within three years from the date of consent. If the degree program is not offered within the three-year time period, consent is automatically revoked.
- 7) **Reporting:** A consent holder must provide the following information to the minister when requested:
 - > if accredited in another jurisdiction, proof of continuing legal and accreditation status, and any variation in status;
 - > A report on the current academic standards for each degree program for which consent has been granted, including but not limited to:
 - number and percentage of teaching staff/faculty by level of education, professional designations and experience;

TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF MINISTERIAL CONSENT

- number of full time equivalent (FTE) degree students per full time equivalent (FTE) teaching staff/faculty;
- > the institution's annual report (including audited financial statement);
- > the institution's most recent calendar;
- > tuition and related fees for the degree programs for which consent has been granted;
- > student full time equivalent (FTE) enrolment in programs by year, for which consent has been granted:
- > number of degrees granted in the previous year for programs for which consent has been granted:
- > student attrition and retention rates;
- > job placement rates (both direct and indirect);
- > employer satisfaction;
- > student satisfaction;
- > number and nature of transfer agreements entered into the previous year regarding programs for which consent has been granted; and
- > other performance measures requested by the minister.
- 8) Entitlement of consent holder to government funding: Ministerial consent does not entitle the consent holder to funding from the government of British Columbia.
- 9) Revocation and suspension of consent:
 - A consent holder's failure to comply with any terms and conditions or any legislative obligation may lead the minister to amend, suspend or revoke consent. The Degree Quality Assessment Board may also recommend that the minister amend, suspend or revoke consent as a result of a comprehensive review which determined that the quality of the degree program had not been maintained.
- 10) **Financial security:** The consent holder must meet conditions established regarding the security of tuition fees. These are outlined in the Degree Authorization Regulations established pursuant to Section 9(1) of the *Degree Authorization Act*.
- 11) Access to and security of student transcripts: The consent holder must meet the requirements regarding the access to and security of student transcripts established under Section 4(4) of the *Degree Authorization Act*.
- 12) Student contracts: A consent holder must have an enrolment contract for students enrolling in degree programs. The student's obligation under the contract must not exceed a period of 12 consecutive months. The contract must include the following:
 - > the title of the program and name of degree;
 - > the start date and end date;
 - > policies on student withdrawal and refund of fees and charges; and
 - > the statement required under term and condition #4.

TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF MINISTERIAL CONSENT

- 13) Awareness of policies affecting students: A consent holder must have a calendar or other comparable publication available to students and the public setting forth the following:
 - > admissions requirements and procedures;
 - > programs and courses with indication of when they are offered;
 - > rules and regulations for student, faculty and employee conduct;
 - > degree completion requirements;
 - > method of course delivery;
 - > tuition and other fees;
 - > transfer arrangements currently in place. If the consent holder has no credit transfer arrangements in place, the consent holder must indicate that no such arrangements exist.
- 14) Misrepresentation or malfeasance: The minister may deny, suspend, or revoke consent, where the following has taken place, or was taking place, at any time during or after the consent process until such time as the minister is satisfied that the situation has been remedied:
 - information provided for reviews was not truthful and complete; and/or,
 - misrepresentations, falsehood, fraud, abuse, or charges pending against the institution or its staff members for violations of law had occurred, or was occurring.

I acknowledge that I understand the terms and conditions attached to consent, that all information provided in the application is true, and that I agree to comply with all representations made during the course of the application, and with the terms and conditions of consent.

Name of authorized representative	N.
Provost	#
Position at the Institution	
h.	Feb 19/14
Signature	Date

Rogers, Dorothy AVED:EX

From:

AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX

Sent:

Thursday, February 20, 2014 2:49 PM

To:

'Elsie Froment'

Subject:

RE: Juris Doctor forms

Thank you Elsie. The consent is now listed in the proposal system.

Craig

From: Elsie Froment [mailto:Elsie.Froment@twu.ca]
Sent: Wednesday, February 19, 2014 2:59 PM

To: AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX

Subject: RE: Juris Doctor forms

Craig,

The Juris Doctor signed Terms and Conditions are attached. We are sending the originals to you by courier.

Thank you for your help with this process.

Elsie

From: AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX [mailto:DQABsecretariat@gov.bc.ca]

Sent: January-28-14 12:28 PM

To: Elsie Froment

Subject: Juris Doctor forms

Hi Elsie - in response to your inquiry to Vicki Simmons, please find attached the two documents that require your institution's signature as referenced in the Minister's letter (Special Terms and Conditions of Consent and Standard Terms and Conditions of Consent). Once we receive these signed forms we can then move the JD submission from Under Review to Ministerial Consent.

If you wish to fax these, our number is 250-387-3750 (attention myself or Vicki).

Thank you, Craig

Craig Mayer
Governance and Quality Assurance
Ministry of Advanced Education
250-387-1138
Craig.Mayer@gov.bc.ca

MacLean, Madeline AVED:EX

From: Minister, AVED AVED:EX

Sent: Monday, February 24, 2014 9:40 AM

To: AVED MCRU Incoming Corresp Working Box AVED:EX
Cc: Robson, William AVED:EX; Gill, Manjit AVED:EX

Subject: Cliff 96705 - FW: Copy of Correspondence to Law Societies Concerning TWU

Attachments: 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to AB Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ

Law Student Leaders Letter to BC Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to MB Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to NB Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to NL Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to NS Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to NT Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to NU Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to PE Benchers.pdf; 2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to SK Benchers.pdf;

2014 02 24 LGBTQ Law Student Leaders Letter to YT Benchers.pdf

Categories: Info/File, Minister

Please info/file as per the following:

Branch: Gov & QA Issue: TWU

From: Douglas W. Judson s.22

Sent: Sunday, February 23, 2014 11:33 PM

Subject: Copy of Correspondence to Law Societies Concerning TWU

To Whom It May Concern -

You are receiving this message because you are listed as a copy recipient on the attached correspondence. Please accept this transmission as your copy.

The attached letters concern Trinity Western University's proposed law school. The letters were co-signed by LGBTQA affinity groups at 15 of Canada's law schools, and were issued to each provincial law society (except Ontario - the Ontario groups issued similar correspondence to the Law Society of Upper Canada last month).

Should you experience any difficulty retrieving any of the 11 PDF attachments to this message, please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

Douglas W. Judson, BSocSc, BCom (Hon.)

Candidate, JD / MBA (2015)

Osgoode Hall Law School & Schulich School of Business, York University

s.22

UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law UBC OUTlaws University of British Columbia Faculty of Law TRU OUTlaws Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law USask OUTlaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law Manitoba OUTlaws University of Manitoba Faculty of Law Windsor OUTlaws University of Windsor Faculty of Law Western OUTlaws Western University Faculty of Law



Out In Law University of Toronto Faculty of Law Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law uOttawa OUTlaw University of Ottawa Faculty of Law OUTlaw at McGill McGill University Faculty of Law UNB OUTlaw University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law **OUTlaw Society** Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

February 24, 2014

Law Society of Alberta Suite 800, Bell Tower 10104 103 Avenue Edmonton, Alberta T5J 0H8

Dear President Feth, President-Elect Eamon, and Benchers:

We are writing in our capacities as leaders of LGBTQ affinity groups and organizations at Canadian law schools regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In your jurisdiction, this accreditation process falls within the authority of the Law Society of Alberta (LSA). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance an accreditation requirement in your province that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission.² The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the Charter of Rights and Freedoms and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students. They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing

AED-2014-00105

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community covenant agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: http://cfs fcee.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/>

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1ICEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1laMBSW), and Dalhousie (http://bit.ly/1flQqX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online:

http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe debate/editorials/trinity western should emulate its us equivalents/article13441598/

⁸ Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: thttp://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC; Media Release from Canadian Law Students, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ peers have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education for LGBTQ individuals. Institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The professional community turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest – contrary to the mandate of the LSA. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

- First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of *Whatcott* departs from the 2001 *Trinity Western* decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.
- Second, the 2012 SCC decision in *Dore*¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the *Charter* and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt LSA to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

The law schools we attend have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of Canadian society. The leadership of the Alberta profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. As future lawyers, we are committed to equality and promoting the values of the *Charter* within our practices. Our experiences have taught us that such professional standards can only be fostered in a learning environment that enshrines these values in policy and practice.

At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's LSA

-

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do>

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process. Should you wish to correspond with us as a group, please email outlawscanada@gmail.com.

Sincerely,

Christine Wilson, JD Candidate (2015) Shad Turner, JD Candidate (2015) President & Vice President OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law outlaw@ualberta.ca Flora Vineberg, JD Candidate (2015)
Gord Lamb JD Candidate (2015)
Co-Chairpersons
UBC OUTlaws
University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
flora.vineberg@gmail.com, glamb36@gmail.com

Kendra Morris, JD Candidate (2014)
Brent Ryan, JD Candidate (2015)
Sarah Marsh, JD Candidate (2014)
Executive
TRU OUTlaws
Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
truoutlaws@outlook.com

Cassidy Thomson, JD Candidate (2015) Executive UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law uvic.outlaws@gmail.com

Leif Jensen, JD Candidate (2014)
Linh Le, JD Candidate (2015)
Bruce Gordon, JD Candidate (2016)
Co-Coordinators
USask OUTLaws
University of Saskatchewan College of Law
usaskoutlaws@gmail.com

Joshua Shaw, JD Candidate (2015) Co-Chair Manitoba OUTlaws Robson Hall Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba outlaws@umanitoba

Patrick Jang, JD Candidate (2014) Co-President Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law patrickajang@gmail.com Executive
Western OUTlaws
Western University Faculty of Law
OutLawsWestern@gmail.com

Lana McCrea, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)
Dan Snyder, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)
Co-Presidents
OUTlaw at McGill
McGill University Faculty of Law
mcgill.outlaw@gmail.com

Leah Staples, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Schulich OUTlaw Society

Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University
schulich.outlaw@gmail.com

Ted Flett, JD Candidate (2016)
Chair
UNB OUTlaw
University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
eflett@unb.ca

Allison Vanek, JD Candidate (2014)

Executive Member

uOttawa OUTlaw

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

avane080@uottawa.ca

Benjamin Vandorpe, JD Candidate (2015) Jean-Paul Bevilacqua, JD Candidate (2015) Co-Chairs Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University outlaws@osgoode.yorku.ca Katelyn Scorer, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Windsor OUTlaws

University of Windsor Faculty of Law
scorer@uwindsor.ca

Ella Henry, JD Candidate (2015)
Pedram Moussavi, JD/MBA Candidate (2015)
William Goldbloom, JD Candidate (2015)
Co-Presidents
Out In Law
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
outinlaw.universityoftoronto@gmail.com

/dj

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University,
 Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

James Edward Merrigan, Chair, Constitutional & Human Rights Section, Canadian Bar Association, Poole Althouse, 49-51 Park Street, PO Box 812 Stn Main, Corner Brook, NL, A2H 6H7; jmerrigan@poolealthouse.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (BC), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Lisa Marie Barnet, President, Young Lawyers' Division, Canadian Bar Association, Ontario Power Authority, 1600-120 Adelaide St W, Toronto, ON, M5H 1T1; lisa_barnet@hotmail.com

The Honourable Dave Hancock, Minister of Innovation and Advanced Education (AB), 408 Legislature Building, 10800 97 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T5K 2B6; edmonton.whitemud@assembly.ab.ca

Marian De Souza, President, Alberta Branch, Canadian Bar Association, Alberta Lawyers' Assistance Society (Assist), 3400, 150 - 6 Avenue SW, Calgary, AB, T2P 3Y7; mdesouza@lawyersassist.ca

UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law UBC OUTlaws University of British Columbia Faculty of Law TRU OUTlaws Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law USask OUTlaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law Manitoba OUTlaws University of Manitoba Faculty of Law Windsor OUTlaws University of Windsor Faculty of Law Western OUTlaws Western University Faculty of Law



Out In Law University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University
Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law
uOttawa OUTlaw University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
OUTlaw at McGill McGill University Faculty of Law
UNB OUTlaw University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Society Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

February 24, 2014

Law Society of British Columbia 845 Cambie Street Vancouver, BC V6B 4Z9

Dear President Lindsay and Benchers:

We are writing in our capacities as leaders of LGBTQ affinity groups and organizations at Canadian law schools regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In B.C., this accreditation process falls within the authority of the Law Society of British Columbia (LSBC). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance an accreditation requirement in your province that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission. The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students.⁸ They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing

AED-2014-00105

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community_covenant_agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: http://cfs_fedee.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1ICEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1flQgX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online:

http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe debate/editorials/trinity western should emulate its us equivalents/article13441598/
8 Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online:
http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>
March 18, 2013, available online:
http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ peers have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education for LGBTQ individuals. Institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The professional community turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest – contrary to the mandate of the LSBC. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

- First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of *Whatcott* departs from the 2001 *Trinity Western* decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.
- Second, the 2012 SCC decision in *Dore*¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the *Charter* and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt LSBC to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

The law schools we attend have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of Canadian society. The leadership of the B.C. profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. As future lawyers, we are committed to equality and promoting the values of the *Charter* within our practices. Our experiences have taught us that such professional standards can only be fostered in a learning environment that enshrines these values in policy and practice.

At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's

_

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do>

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

LSBC accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process. Should you wish to correspond with us as a group, please email outlawscanada@gmail.com.

Sincerely,

Cassidy Thomson, JD Candidate (2015) Executive UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law uvic.outlaws@gmail.com Flora Vineberg, JD Candidate (2015)
Gord Lamb JD Candidate (2015)
Co-Chairpersons
UBC OUTlaws
University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
flora.vineberg@gmail.com, glamb36@gmail.com

Kendra Morris, JD Candidate (2014)
Brent Ryan, JD Candidate (2015)
Sarah Marsh, JD Candidate (2014)
Executive
TRU OUTlaws
Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
truoutlaws@outlook.com

Christine Wilson, JD Candidate (2015) Shad Turner, JD Candidate (2015) President & Vice President OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law outlaw@ualberta.ca

Leif Jensen, JD Candidate (2014)
Linh Le, JD Candidate (2015)
Bruce Gordon, JD Candidate (2016)
Co-Coordinators
USask OUTLaws
University of Saskatchewan College of Law
usaskoutlaws@gmail.com

Joshua Shaw, JD Candidate (2015) Co-Chair Manitoba OUTlaws Robson Hall Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba outlaws@umanitoba

Patrick Jang, JD Candidate (2014) Co-President Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law patrickajang@gmail.com Executive
Western OUTlaws
Western University Faculty of Law
OutLawsWestern@gmail.com

Lana McCrea, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)
Dan Snyder, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)
Co-Presidents
OUTlaw at McGill
McGill University Faculty of Law
mcgill.outlaw@gmail.com

Leah Staples, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Schulich OUTlaw Society

Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University
schulich.outlaw@gmail.com

Ted Flett, JD Candidate (2016)
Chair
UNB OUTlaw
University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
eflett@unb.ca

Allison Vanek, JD Candidate (2014)

Executive Member

uOttawa OUTlaw

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
avane080@uottawa.ca

Benjamin Vandorpe, JD Candidate (2015) Jean-Paul Bevilacqua, JD Candidate (2015) Co-Chairs Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University outlaws@osgoode.yorku.ca Katelyn Scorer, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Windsor OUTlaws

University of Windsor Faculty of Law
scorer@uwindsor.ca

Ella Henry, JD Candidate (2015)
Pedram Moussavi, JD/MBA Candidate (2015)
William Goldbloom, JD Candidate (2015)
Co-Presidents
Out In Law
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
outinlaw.universityoftoronto@gmail.com

/dj

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University,
 Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (British Columbia), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Dean Crawford, President, British Columbia Branch, Canadian Bar Association, 10th Floor, 845 Cambie Street, Vancouver, BC, V6B 5T3, B3H 1Y6; dcrawford@cplaw.ca

Sean E. Rowell, Young Lawyers Rep, British Columbia Branch, Canadian Bar Association, Perry & Company, 1081 Main Street, P.O. Box 790, Smithers, BC, V0J 2N0; sean@perryco.ca

Krystle A. Gill, Equality & Diversity Rep, British Columbia Branch, Canadian Bar Association, HART Legal, 300-1001 Wharf Street, Victoria, BC, V8W 1T6; kgill@hart-legal.com

Danielle R. Jarvis, Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, CBA British Columbia, 300-1090 Homer Street, Vancouver, BC, V6B 2W9, B3H 1Y6; danielle@jarvislegal.ca

Maria Morellato, QC, Chair, Equality and Diversity Advisory Committee, Law Society of British Columbia, Mandell Pinder LLP, Suite 422, 1080 Mainland Street, Vancouver, BC, V6B 2T4; maria@mandellpinder.com

UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law
UBC OUTlaws University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
TRU OUTlaws Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law
USask OUTlaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law
Manitoba OUTlaws University of Manitoba Faculty of Law
Windsor OUTlaws University of Windsor Faculty of Law
Western OUTlaws Western University Faculty of Law



Out In Law University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University
Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law
uOttawa OUTlaw University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
OUTlaw at McGill McGill University Faculty of Law
UNB OUTlaw University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Society Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

February 24, 2014

Law Society of Manitoba 219 Kennedy Street Winnipeg, MB R3C 1S8

Dear President Swayze, Vice President Clearwater, and Benchers:

We are writing in our capacities as leaders of LGBTQ affinity groups and organizations at Canadian law schools regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In your jurisdiction, this accreditation process falls within the authority of the Law Society of Manitoba (LSM). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance an accreditation requirement in your province that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission. The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students.⁸ They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing

AED-2014-00105

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: < http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community covenant agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: http://cfs_fede.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1ICEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1flQgX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online:

http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe debate/editorials/trinity western should emulate its us equivalents/article13441598/

⁸ Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>; Media Release from Canadian Law Students, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ peers have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education for LGBTQ individuals. Institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The professional community turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest – contrary to the mandate of the LSM. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

- First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of *Whatcott* departs from the 2001 *Trinity Western* decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.
- Second, the 2012 SCC decision in *Dore*¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the *Charter* and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt LSM to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

The law schools we attend have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of Canadian society. The leadership of the Manitoba profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. As future lawyers, we are committed to equality and promoting the values of the *Charter* within our practices. Our experiences have taught us that such professional standards can only be fostered in a learning environment that enshrines these values in policy and practice.

At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's LSM

-

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process. Should you wish to correspond with us as a group, please email outlawscanada@gmail.com.

Sincerely,

Joshua Shaw, JD Candidate (2015) Co-Chair Manitoba OUTlaws Robson Hall Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba outlaws@umanitoba Flora Vineberg, JD Candidate (2015)
Gord Lamb JD Candidate (2015)
Co-Chairpersons
UBC OUTlaws
University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
flora.vineberg@gmail.com, glamb36@gmail.com

Kendra Morris, JD Candidate (2014)
Brent Ryan, JD Candidate (2015)
Sarah Marsh, JD Candidate (2014)
Executive
TRU OUTlaws
Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
truoutlaws@outlook.com

Leif Jensen, JD Candidate (2014) Linh Le, JD Candidate (2015) Bruce Gordon, JD Candidate (2016) Co-Coordinators USask OUTLaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law usaskoutlaws@gmail.com

Christine Wilson, JD Candidate (2015) Shad Turner, JD Candidate (2015) President & Vice President OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law outlaw@ualberta.ca Cassidy Thomson, JD Candidate (2015) Executive UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law uvic.outlaws@gmail.com

Patrick Jang, JD Candidate (2014) Co-President Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law patrickajang@gmail.com

Executive
Western OUTlaws
Western University Faculty of Law
OutLawsWestern@gmail.com

Lana McCrea, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)
Dan Snyder, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)
Co-Presidents
OUTlaw at McGill
McGill University Faculty of Law
mcgill.outlaw@gmail.com

Leah Staples, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Schulich OUTlaw Society

Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University
schulich.outlaw@gmail.com

Ted Flett, JD Candidate (2016)
Chair
UNB OUTlaw
University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
eflett@unb.ca

Allison Vanek, JD Candidate (2014)

Executive Member

uOttawa OUTlaw

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

avane080@uottawa.ca

Benjamin Vandorpe, JD Candidate (2015) Jean-Paul Bevilacqua, JD Candidate (2015) Co-Chairs Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University outlaws@osgoode.yorku.ca Katelyn Scorer, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Windsor OUTlaws

University of Windsor Faculty of Law
scorer@uwindsor.ca

Ella Henry, JD Candidate (2015)
Pedram Moussavi, JD/MBA Candidate (2015)
William Goldbloom, JD Candidate (2015)
Co-Presidents
Out In Law
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
outinlaw.universityoftoronto@gmail.com

/dj

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University,
 Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

James Edward Merrigan, Chair, Constitutional & Human Rights Section, Canadian Bar Association, Poole Althouse, 49-51 Park Street, PO Box 812 Stn Main, Corner Brook, NL, A2H 6H7; jmerrigan@poolealthouse.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (BC), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Lisa Marie Barnet, President, Young Lawyers' Division, Canadian Bar Association, Ontario Power Authority, 1600-120 Adelaide St W, Toronto, ON, M5H 1T1; lisa_barnet@hotmail.com

The Honourable James Allum, Minister of Education and Advanced Learning (MB), 168 Legislative Building, 450 Broadway, Winnipeg, MB, R3C 0V8; minedu@leg.gov.mb.ca

Scott Abel, President, Manitoba Bar Association, Paterson Patterson Wyman & Abel, 1 - 1040 Princess Avenue, Brandon, MB, R7A 0P8; sabel@patersons.ca

Jason Gisser, Chair, Young Lawyers' Section, Manitoba Bar Association, University of Manitoba Faculty Association, 100-29 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2M7; jgisser@umfa.ca

Tatyana Bubnowicz, Vice Chair, Young Lawyers' Section, Manitoba Bar Association, Monk Goodwin LLP, 800-444 St. Mary Avenue, Winnipeg, MB, R3C 3T1; tbubnowicz@monkgoodwin.com

Karen Dyck, Chair, Equality Issues Section, Manitoba Bar Association, P.O. Box 1044, La Salle, MB, R0G 1B0; karen.l.dyck@gmail.com

Ken Mandzuik, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Manitoba Bar Association, D'Arcy & Deacon LLP, 2200 - One Lombard Place, Winnipeg, MB, R3B 0X7; kmandzuik@darcydeacon.com

Kristine Barr, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Manitoba Bar Association, CUPE Manitoba Regional Office, 703-275 Broadway, Winnipeg, MB, R3C 4M6; kbarr@cupe.ca

Richard Buchwald, Chair, Equity Committee, Law Society of Manitoba, Pitblado LLP, 2500-360 Main Street, Winnipeg, MB, R3C 4H6; buchwald@pitblado.com

UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law
UBC OUTlaws University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
TRU OUTlaws Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law
USask OUTlaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law
Manitoba OUTlaws University of Manitoba Faculty of Law
Windsor OUTlaws University of Windsor Faculty of Law
Western OUTlaws Western University Faculty of Law



Out In Law University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University
Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law
uOttawa OUTlaw University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
OUTlaw at McGill McGill University Faculty of Law
UNB OUTlaw University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Society Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

February 24, 2014

Law Society of New Brunswick 68 Avonlea Court Fredericton, NB E3C 1N8

Dear President Malone, Vice President Beaulieu, and Council Members:

We are writing in our capacities as leaders of LGBTQ affinity groups and organizations at Canadian law schools regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In your jurisdiction, this accreditation process falls within the authority of the Law Society of New Brunswick (LSNB). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance an accreditation requirement in your province that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission. The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students.⁸ They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing

AED-2014-00105

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: < http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community covenant agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: http://cfs_fede.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1IcEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1flQgX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online: http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe-debate/editorials/trinity-western-should-emulate-its-us-equivalents/article13441598/

⁸ Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>; Media Release from Canadian Law Students, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ peers have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education for LGBTQ individuals. Institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The professional community turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest – contrary to the mandate of the LSNB. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

- First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of *Whatcott* departs from the 2001 *Trinity Western* decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.
- Second, the 2012 SCC decision in *Dore*¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the *Charter* and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt LSNB to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

The law schools we attend have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of Canadian society. The leadership of the New Brunswick profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. As future lawyers, we are committed to equality and promoting the values of the *Charter* within our practices. Our experiences have taught us that such professional standards can only be fostered in a learning environment that enshrines these values in policy and practice.

At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's

_

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do>

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

LSNB accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process. Should you wish to correspond with us as a group, please email outlawscanada@gmail.com.

Sincerely,

Ted Flett, JD Candidate (2016)

Chair

UNB OUTlaw

University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law

eflett@unb.ca

Leah Staples, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Schulich OUTlaw Society

Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

schulich.outlaw@gmail.com

Katelyn Scorer, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Windsor OUTlaws

University of Windsor Faculty of Law

scorer@uwindsor.ca

Allison Vanek, JD Candidate (2014)

Executive Member uOttawa OUTlaw

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

avane080@uottawa.ca

Patrick Jang, JD Candidate (2014)

Co-President

Queen's OUTlaw

Queen's University Faculty of Law

patrickajang@gmail.com

Executive

Western OUTlaws

Western University Faculty of Law

OutLawsWestern@gmail.com

Lana McCrea, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015) Dan Snyder, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)

Co-Presidents

OUTlaw at McGill

McGill University Faculty of Law

mcgill.outlaw@gmail.com

Ella Henry, JD Candidate (2015)

Pedram Moussavi, JD/MBA Candidate (2015) William Goldbloom, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Presidents

Out In Law

University of Toronto Faculty of Law

outinlaw.universityoftoronto@gmail.com

Benjamin Vandorpe, JD Candidate (2015) Jean-Paul Bevilacqua, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chairs

Osgoode OUTlaws

Osgoode Hall Law School, York University

outlaws@osgoode.yorku.ca

Joshua Shaw, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chair

Manitoba OUTlaws

Robson Hall Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba

outlaws@umanitoba

Cassidy Thomson, JD Candidate (2015)

Executive

UVic OUTlaws

University of Victoria Faculty of Law

uvic.outlaws@gmail.com

Flora Vineberg, JD Candidate (2015) Gord Lamb JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chairpersons
UBC OUTlaws

University of British Columbia Faculty of Law

flora.vineberg@gmail.com, glamb36@gmail.com

Kendra Morris, JD Candidate (2014) Brent Ryan, JD Candidate (2015) Sarah Marsh, JD Candidate (2014) Executive

TRU OUTlaws

Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law

truoutlaws@outlook.com

Christine Wilson, JD Candidate (2015) Shad Turner, JD Candidate (2015) President & Vice President OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law outlaw@ualberta.ca

Leif Jensen, JD Candidate (2014)
Linh Le, JD Candidate (2015)
Bruce Gordon, JD Candidate (2016)
Co-Coordinators
USask OUTLaws
University of Saskatchewan College of Law
usaskoutlaws@gmail.com

/dj

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University,
 Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

James Edward Merrigan, Chair, Constitutional & Human Rights Section, Canadian Bar Association, Poole Althouse, 49-51 Park Street, PO Box 812 Stn Main, Corner Brook, NL, A2H 6H7; jmerrigan@poolealthouse.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (BC), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Lisa Marie Barnet, President, Young Lawyers' Division, Canadian Bar Association, Ontario Power Authority, 1600-120 Adelaide St W, Toronto, ON, M5H 1T1; lisa_barnet@hotmail.com

The Honourable Jody Carr, Minister for Post-Secondary Education, Training and Labour (NB), Chestnut Complex, P. O. Box 6000, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5H1; jody.carr@gnb.ca

Kevin J. Haché, President, New Brunswick Branch, Canadian Bar Association, 8 boul St-Pierre O, CP 5662, Caraquet, NB, E1W 1B7; kevhache@nb.sympatico.ca

Justin Robichaud, Chair, Young Lawyers' Conference, New Brunswick Branch, Canadian Bar Association, Cantini Law Group, 50 Foundry Street, Second Floor, P.O. Box 1007, Moncton, NB, E1C 8P2; jrobichaud@cantini.com

Shivani Chopra, Chair, Constitutional, Human Rights, and Equity Conference, New Brunswick Branch, CBA, McInnes Cooper, 600-570 Queen Street, PO Box 610 Stn A, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A6; shivani.chopra@mcinnescooper.com

UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law
UBC OUTlaws University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
TRU OUTlaws Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law
USask OUTlaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law
Manitoba OUTlaws University of Manitoba Faculty of Law
Windsor OUTlaws University of Windsor Faculty of Law
Western OUTlaws Western University Faculty of Law



Out In Law University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University
Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law
uOttawa OUTlaw University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
OUTlaw at McGill McGill University Faculty of Law
UNB OUTlaw University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Society Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

February 24, 2014

Law Society of Newfoundland and Labrador 196-198 Water Street PO Box 1028 St. John's, NL A1C 5M3

Dear President Murphy and Benchers:

We are writing in our capacities as leaders of LGBTQ affinity groups and organizations at Canadian law schools regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In your jurisdiction, this accreditation process falls within the authority of the Law Society of Newfoundland and Labrador (LSNL). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance a requirement in your province that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission. The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students.⁸ They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing

AED-2014-00105

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community_covenant_agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: http://cfs_fedee.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1IcEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1flQgX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online: http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe debate/editorials/trinity western should emulate its us equivalents/article13441598/

⁸ Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: <http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter-from-Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC; Media Release from Canadian Law Students, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter-from-Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ peers have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education for LGBTQ individuals. Institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The professional community turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest – contrary to the mandate of the LSNL. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

- First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of *Whatcott* departs from the 2001 *Trinity Western* decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.
- Second, the 2012 SCC decision in *Dore*¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the *Charter* and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt LSNL to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

The law schools we attend have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of Canadian society. The leadership of the Newfoundland and Labrador profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. As future lawyers, we are committed to equality and promoting the values of the *Charter* within our practices. Our experiences have taught us that such professional standards can only be fostered in a learning environment that enshrines these values in policy and practice.

At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's

_

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do>

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

LSNL accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process. Should you wish to correspond with us as a group, please email outlawscanada@gmail.com.

Sincerely,

Leah Staples, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Schulich OUTlaw Society

Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

schulich.outlaw@gmail.com

Ted Flett, JD Candidate (2016)

Chair

UNB OUTlaw

University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law

eflett@unb.ca

Katelyn Scorer, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Windsor OUTlaws

University of Windsor Faculty of Law

scorer@uwindsor.ca

Allison Vanek, JD Candidate (2014)

Executive Member

uOttawa OUTlaw

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

avane080@uottawa.ca

Patrick Jang, JD Candidate (2014)

Co-President

Queen's OUTlaw

Queen's University Faculty of Law

patrickajang@gmail.com

Executive

Western OUTlaws

Western University Faculty of Law

OutLawsWestern@gmail.com

Lana McCrea, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015) Dan Snyder, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)

Co-Presidents

OUTlaw at McGill

McGill University Faculty of Law

mcgill.outlaw@gmail.com

Ella Henry, JD Candidate (2015)

Pedram Moussavi, JD/MBA Candidate (2015) William Goldbloom, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Presidents

Out In Law

University of Toronto Faculty of Law

outinlaw.universityoftoronto@gmail.com

Benjamin Vandorpe, JD Candidate (2015) Jean-Paul Bevilacqua, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chairs

Osgoode OUTlaws

Osgoode Hall Law School, York University

outlaws@osgoode.yorku.ca

Joshua Shaw, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chair

Manitoba OUTlaws

Robson Hall Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba

outlaws@umanitoba

Cassidy Thomson, JD Candidate (2015)

Executive

UVic OUTlaws

University of Victoria Faculty of Law

uvic.outlaws@gmail.com

Flora Vineberg, JD Candidate (2015) Gord Lamb JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chairpersons

UBC OUTlaws

University of British Columbia Faculty of Law flora.vineberg@gmail.com, glamb36@gmail.com Kendra Morris, JD Candidate (2014) Brent Ryan, JD Candidate (2015) Sarah Marsh, JD Candidate (2014) Executive

TRU OUTlaws

Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law

truoutlaws@outlook.com

Christine Wilson, JD Candidate (2015) Shad Turner, JD Candidate (2015) President & Vice President OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law outlaw@ualberta.ca

Leif Jensen, JD Candidate (2014)
Linh Le, JD Candidate (2015)
Bruce Gordon, JD Candidate (2016)
Co-Coordinators
USask OUTLaws
University of Saskatchewan College of Law
usaskoutlaws@gmail.com

/dj

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University,
 Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

James Edward Merrigan, Chair, Constitutional & Human Rights Section, Canadian Bar Association, Poole Althouse, 49-51 Park Street, PO Box 812 Stn Main, Corner Brook, NL, A2H 6H7; jmerrigan@poolealthouse.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (BC), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Lisa Marie Barnet, President, Young Lawyers' Division, Canadian Bar Association, Ontario Power Authority, 1600-120 Adelaide St W, Toronto, ON, M5H 1T1; lisa_barnet@hotmail.com

The Honourable Kevin O'Brien, Minister of Advanced Education (NL), P.O. Box 8700, 3rd Floor, West Block, Confederation Building, St. John's, NL, A1B 4J6; kevinobrien@gov.nl.ca

Cheryl Mullett, President, Newfoundland & Labrador Branch, Canadian Bar Association, City of St. John's, Legal Department, P.O. Box 908, Stn C, St. John's, NL, A1C 5M2; cmullett@stjohns.ca

Koren Thomson, Chair, Young Lawyers' Forum, Newfoundland & Labrador Branch, Canadian Bar Association, Stewart McKelvey, Suite 1100, Cabot Place, 100 New Gower Street, St. John's, NL, A1C 6K3; kthomson@stewartmckelvey.com

Cletus Flaherty, Chair, Constitutional and Human Rights Law Section, Newfoundland & Labrador Branch, CBA, O'Dea Earle, 323 Duckworth Street, P.O. Box 5955, St. John's, NL, A1C 5X4; cflaherty@odeaearle.ca

UVic OUTlaws University of Victoria Faculty of Law
UBC OUTlaws University of British Columbia Faculty of Law
TRU OUTlaws Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law
USask OUTlaws University of Saskatchewan College of Law
Manitoba OUTlaws University of Manitoba Faculty of Law
Windsor OUTlaws University of Windsor Faculty of Law
Western OUTlaws Western University Faculty of Law



Out In Law University of Toronto Faculty of Law
Osgoode OUTlaws Osgoode Hall Law School, York University
Queen's OUTlaw Queen's University Faculty of Law
uOttawa OUTlaw University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
OUTlaw at McGill McGill University Faculty of Law
UNB OUTlaw University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law
OUTlaw Society Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

February 24, 2014

Officers and Members of Council Nova Scotia Barristers' Society Cogswell Tower, 800-2000 Barrington Street Halifax, NS B3J 3K1

Dear President Gallant, Officers, and Members of Council:

We are writing in our capacities as leaders of LGBTQ affinity groups and organizations at Canadian law schools regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In your jurisdiction, this accreditation process falls within the authority of the Nova Scotia Barristers' Society (NSBS). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance an accreditation requirement in your province that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission. The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students.⁸ They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing

AED-2014-00105

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community_covenant_agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: http://cfs_fede.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1lCEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1flQgX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online:

http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe debate/editorials/trinity western should emulate its us equivalents/article13441598/

⁸ Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>; Media Release from Canadian Law Students, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ peers have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education for LGBTQ individuals. Institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The professional community turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest – contrary to the mandate of the NSBS. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

- First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of Whatcott departs from the 2001 Trinity Western decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.
- Second, the 2012 SCC decision in *Dore*¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the *Charter* and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt NSBS to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

The law schools we attend have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of Canadian society. The leadership of the Nova Scotia profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. As future lawyers, we are committed to equality and promoting the values of the *Charter* within our practices. Our experiences have taught us that such professional standards can only be fostered in a learning environment that enshrines these values in policy and practice.

At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's

-

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

NSBS accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process. Should you wish to correspond with us as a group, please email outlawscanada@gmail.com.

Sincerely,

Leah Staples, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Schulich OUTlaw Society

Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University

schulich.outlaw@gmail.com

Ted Flett, JD Candidate (2016)

Chair

UNB OUTlaw

University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law

eflett@unb.ca

Katelyn Scorer, JD Candidate (2015)

President

Windsor OUTlaws

University of Windsor Faculty of Law

scorer@uwindsor.ca

Allison Vanek, JD Candidate (2014)

Executive Member

uOttawa OUTlaw

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

avane080@uottawa.ca

Patrick Jang, JD Candidate (2014)

Co-President

Queen's OUTlaw

Queen's University Faculty of Law

patrickajang@gmail.com

Executive

Western OUTlaws

Western University Faculty of Law

OutLawsWestern@gmail.com

Lana McCrea, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015) Dan Snyder, BCL/LLB Candidate (2015)

Co-Presidents

OUTlaw at McGill

McGill University Faculty of Law

mcgill.outlaw@gmail.com

Ella Henry, JD Candidate (2015)

Pedram Moussavi, JD/MBA Candidate (2015) William Goldbloom, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Presidents

Out In Law

University of Toronto Faculty of Law

outinlaw.universityoftoronto@gmail.com

Benjamin Vandorpe, JD Candidate (2015) Jean-Paul Bevilacqua, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chairs

Osgoode OUTlaws

Osgoode Hall Law School, York University

outlaws@osgoode.yorku.ca

Joshua Shaw, JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chair

Manitoba OUTlaws

Robson Hall Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba

outlaws@umanitoba

Cassidy Thomson, JD Candidate (2015)

Executive

UVic OUTlaws

University of Victoria Faculty of Law

uvic.outlaws@gmail.com

Flora Vineberg, JD Candidate (2015) Gord Lamb JD Candidate (2015)

Co-Chairpersons **UBC OUTlaws**

University of British Columbia Faculty of Law

flora.vineberg@gmail.com, glamb36@gmail.com

Kendra Morris, JD Candidate (2014) Brent Ryan, JD Candidate (2015) Sarah Marsh, JD Candidate (2014) Executive

TRU OUTlaws

Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law

truoutlaws@outlook.com

Christine Wilson, JD Candidate (2015) Shad Turner, JD Candidate (2015) President & Vice President OUTlaw Alberta University of Alberta Faculty of Law outlaw@ualberta.ca

Leif Jensen, JD Candidate (2014)
Linh Le, JD Candidate (2015)
Bruce Gordon, JD Candidate (2016)
Co-Coordinators
USask OUTLaws
University of Saskatchewan College of Law
usaskoutlaws@gmail.com

/dj

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University,
 Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

James Edward Merrigan, Chair, Constitutional & Human Rights Section, Canadian Bar Association, Poole Althouse, 49-51 Park Street, PO Box 812 Stn Main, Corner Brook, NL, A2H 6H7; jmerrigan@poolealthouse.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (BC), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Lisa Marie Barnet, President, Young Lawyers' Division, Canadian Bar Association, Ontario Power Authority, 1600-120 Adelaide St W, Toronto, ON, M5H 1T1; lisa_barnet@hotmail.com

The Honourable Kelly Regan, Minister of Labour and Advanced Education (NS), 6th Floor, 5151 Terminal Road, P.O. Box 697, Halifax, NS, B3J 2T8; min lae@gov.ns.ca

Robyn L. Elliott, President, Nova Scotia Branch, Canadian Bar Association, 5991 Spring Garden Road, Suite 1050, Halifax, NS, B3H 1Y6; relliott@elliottlaw.ca

Andrew D. Taillon, Chair, Young Lawyers Section, Nova Scotia Branch, Canadian Bar Association, Nova Scotia Department of Justice, 5151 Terminal Road, PO Box 7 Stn Central, Halifax, NS, B3J 2L6; tailload@gov.ns.ca.com

Lester Jesudason, Chair, Equity Committee, Nova Scotia Branch, Canadian Bar Association, Blois Nickerson & Bryon LLP, P.O. Box 2147 Stn Central, Halifax, NS, B3J 3B7; ljesudason@bloisnickerson.com

Scott Raymond Campbell, Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, CBA Nova Scotia, 900-1959 Upper Water Street, P.O. Box 997 Stn Central, Halifax, NS, B3J 2X2; srcampbell@stewartmckelvey.com

Tilly Pillay, QC, Chair, Gender Equity Committee, Nova Scotia Barristers' Society, Cogswell Tower, 800 - 2000 Barrington Street, Halifax, NS, B3J 3K1; pillaytp@gov.ns.ca

Trinity Western University: Proposed Law Degree B.C. Law Society vote

MANDATE: N/A

VALUE: Government does not interfere with independent regulators.

TOP 3 MESSAGES:

- Trinity Western University is a private university in British Columbia, which receives no operating or capital funding from government
- The Advanced Education Minister considered the Degree Quality Assessment Board's recommendation and findings, as well as the Federation of Law Societies of Canada reports.
- As a result, he gave consent for a new law school program at Trinity Western University.

If asked about the B.C. Law Society's motion:

- The BC Law Society is the independent regulator for lawyers and they have the authority to determine who can practice law.
- I am not going to speculate on any outcome.

SUPPORTING FACTS:

- Government's review was based solely on the academic quality of Trinity Western's program.
- The community covenant at Trinity Western is outside of the mandate of our review under the Degree Quality Review Act

Trinity Western University: Proposed Law Degree

B.C. Law Society vote

BACKGROUND:

TWU's community covenant. TWU students must sign and agree to abide by a Community Covenant. The Community Covenant Agreement includes a prohibition on "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman."

TWU, a faith-based private university located in Langley, wants to offer a Juris Doctor degree, a professional degree required to practice law in Canada. It hopes to launch the program in September 2015.

Law Society Meeting: At an upcoming meeting **April 11, 2014,** the BC Law Society may vote on a resolution concerning Trinity Western University law school [may be moved to a later date].

On Dec. 16, 2013, the Federation of Law Societies of Canada granted preliminary approval to a proposed new law school program at TWU. The Federation of Law Societies undertakes a review of proposed new law programs on whether the learning outcomes of the program enable graduates to meet the competencies to practice law. This is done on behalf of the provincial regulatory body, the Law Society of BC. If the Federation had not approved the program, graduates would not have been able to write the bar exams.

Minister Virk of Advanced Education approved the Juris Doctor degree Dec. 17/13.

The Law Society of BC has the authority to review the proposal independently of the Federation of Law Societies, and has indicated that it will take the time necessary to properly review and reflect on the issue, stressing that the decision requires procedural fairness. Canada has recognized same-sex marriages since 2005. In 2001, the Supreme Court of Canada ruled in Trinity Western University v. British Columbia College of Teachers following a similar issue. It is possible that irrespective of the decision of the Law Society of BC, persons seeking to challenge the community covenant will commence a legal action in an effort to have it struck down.

Program Area	Deputy / ADM	GCPE
Andrea Buzbuzian - March 4,	Jay Chalke – March 4, 2014	PAO – Richelle D. Funk
2014		L Mulholland – March 4, 2014
		Carolyn Heiman – March 4, 2014
		AVED CD: Rodney Porter



March 18, 2014

Law Society of Upper Canada 130 Queen Street West Toronto, ON M5H 2N6

Dear Treasurer and Members of Convocation:

Out On Bay Street is a non-profit organization that provides lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and queer (LGBTQ) law students and young professionals with career development, educational, and networking opportunities, working to help them transition from school to the workplace. It is integral to our mandate to promote inclusive and pro-diversity workplaces and schools for LGBTQ individuals.

We are writing to register our concerns regarding Trinity Western University's (TWU's) proposed law school, given its impacts on our service community and student membership across Canada. TWU's program is currently seeking the approval of the provincial law societies for admission to the bar of each jurisdiction. In Ontario, this is a decision that falls to the Law Society of Upper Canada (LSUC). We have serious reservations about TWU's discriminatory policies towards LGBTQ students and the suitability of TWU as a forum to train future lawyers. We urge you to refuse or qualify TWU's accreditation. We also encourage you to advance an accreditation requirement in Ontario that prevents any accredited law school from discriminating on a constitutionally protected ground, such as sexual orientation.

Central to our concerns is the fact that TWU forces its students to sign a 'Community Covenant Agreement' requiring the student to abstain from "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman". Students who do not comply with the agreement may be removed from the university without readmission. The Community Covenant Agreement is inconsistent with the *Charter of Rights and Freedoms* and provincial human rights legislation. Accrediting a legal studies program that operates under this policy fetters the profession's obligation to serve the public interest.

Over the past year, a number of prominent stakeholders have echoed this sentiment. These include the Canadian Council of Law Deans,³ the Canadian Bar Association,⁴ the Canadian Federation of Students,⁵ numerous prominent lawyers and academics, law school faculty councils,⁶ editorial

¹ Trinity Western University Community Covenant Agreement at page 3, available online: < http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/twu community_covenant_agreement.pdf>

² Trinity Western University Student Handbook, Student Accountability Process, available online:

http://twu.ca/studenthandbook/university policies/student accountability process.html>

³ Canadian Council of Law Deans Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, November 20, 2012, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156263670/CCLD Letter to FLSC>

⁴ Canadian Bar Association Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265274/CBA Letter to FLSC>

⁵ Canadian Federation of Students Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, December 19, 2013, available online: < http://cfs_fcee.ca/open letter reconsider approval of law school at trinity western university/>

boards,⁷ and over one thousand law students.⁸ They have rightly pointed out that TWU's policies place a de facto quota on the number of law school places available to LGBTQ students. More broadly, they assert that given these discriminatory operating policies, TWU is not an appropriate venue for teaching constitutional law, nurturing legal ethics, or promoting academic freedom. Our agreement with these views is underscored by the fact that many of our LGBTQ student members and colleagues have been subjected to systemic discrimination, exclusion, and hatred related to their sexual orientation. It would be tremendously disheartening to see the legal profession's leadership support policies which perpetuate these unfortunate experiences and constrain access to legal education and the legal profession for LGBTQ individuals. We are confident that our membership base and corporate partners would agree that institutionalizing the targeted humiliation of LGBTQ individuals is unacceptable.

The legal profession turns to the law society for leadership and governance on these important issues. To date, it has been disappointing to see some law societies remain silent on this issue - deferring to Federation of Law Societies of Canada (FLSC). In December, it was with profound disbelief that we learned of the FLSC's recommendation that their provincial members approve TWU's law school. This was, in effect, a rubber stamp for discrimination: TWU's discriminatory covenant stands in direct opposition to the significant progress that has been made in the recognition of the rights of LGBTQ individuals over the past decade.

Further, the FLSC's protracted and closed-door process was patently not in the public interest contrary to LSUC's mandate. Notably, there was no opportunity for anyone to present evidence of discrimination by TWU, or the effect of its covenant on LGBTQ faculty or students, even though the absence of such evidence was a key finding on which the committee relied to recommend that the proposed law school be recognized by the FLSC's members. Perpetuating the flawed process, B.C.'s Minister of Advanced Education relied heavily on the FLSC's decision to justify his own, approving the degree-granting program the day after the FLSC report was released.

In 2014, the FLSC's decision offends more than contemporary Canadian sensibilities. Our understanding is that it is also legally incorrect:

• First, the FLSC relies heavily on a 2001 Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) judgment in a case involving TWU and the B.C. College of Teachers. Although this precedent cannot be ignored, over the last 12 years the law has transformed. The 2013 case of Whatcott departs from the 2001 Trinity Western decision in important ways, notably by wholly rejecting the "hate the sin, love the sinner" excuse adopted by TWU to continue its discrimination in 2001. An institution cannot ban "sexual intimacy that violates the sacredness of marriage between a man and a woman" (i.e., sex between LGBTQ individuals) without effectively banning LGBTQ individuals. The effect of the covenant is to exclude anyone who lives in a committed same-sex relationship, which is an issue that was completely overlooked in the 2001 SCC decision.

⁶ Four law school faculty councils have passed motions condemning the Community Covenant Agreement: Osgoode (http://bit.ly/1lCEL16), Queen's (http://bit.ly/1e7xLri), UBC (http://bit.ly/1flQgX2). Faculty from Alberta's 2 law schools have also expressed their concerns in an open letter (http://bit.ly/1flYkL6).

⁷ The Globe and Mail, *Trinity Western should emulate its U.S. equivalents*, July 25, 2013, available online: http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe-debate/editorials/trinity-western-should-emulate-its-us-equivalents/article13441598/

⁸ Osgoode Hall Law School Students' Letter to the Federation of Law Societies of Canada, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>; Media Release from Canadian Law Students, March 18, 2013, available online: http://www.scribd.com/doc/156265623/Letter from Osgoode Law Students to the FLSC>

⁹ Trinity Western University v British Columbia College of Teachers, 2001 SCC 31, available online: <a href="http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisiascc csc/scc csc

¹⁰ Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v Whatcott, 2013 SCC 11, available online: http://scc csc.lexum.com/decisia scc csc/scc csc/scc csc/en/12876/1/document.do

Second, the 2012 SCC decision in Doré¹¹ now imposes an obligation on law societies to apply the Charter and provincial and territorial human rights codes every time they make a decision. The B.C. College of Teachers was under no such obligation in 2001. In practice, this means that private religious organizations can adopt membership rules that reflect their beliefs, but the government and other organizations operating in the public interest are not bound to approve such rules if they discriminate against individuals.

Such significant inconsistencies should prompt LSUC to heavily scrutinize the FLSC recommendation.

Current Canadian law schools have made a priority of making legal education more accessible, practical, and representative of society. The leadership of the Ontario profession should demonstrate the same interests in rendering their decision on TWU's accreditation. At the most basic level, it is unjust to open a law school that openly discriminates against a vulnerable segment of the Canadian public. We strongly recommend that you oppose or place conditions on TWU's LSUC accreditation. We look forward to a properly balanced and progressive decision from the law society on this important issue, and appreciate this opportunity to provide input to the process.

Sincerely,

Paul Marai

Chair, Board of Directors paul.marai@outonbayst.org

Japut Kun

Japneet Kaur
President
japneet.kaur@outonbayst.org

/dj

c. Matt Petersen, Chair, Pride At Work Canada; Matt.Petersen@cibc.com

Melissa Kennedy, Chair, Legal Leaders for Diversity, OTPP, 3rd floor, 5650 Yonge Street, Toronto, ON M2M 4H5; melissa_kennedy@otpp.com

Helen Kennedy, Executive Director, Egale, 185 Carlton Street, Toronto ON, M5A 2K7; hkennedy@egale.ca

Ross Johnstone, Director of Education, Out In Schools; ross@outinschools.com

Craig Daniel & Andrea Love, Co-Chairs, Community One Foundation, PO Box 760 – Station F, Toronto, ON, M4Y 2N6; info@communityone.ca

Lorne Sossin, Dean, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University, Ignat Kaneff Building, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON, M3J 1P3; lawdean@osgoode.yorku.ca

Mayo Moran, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, 84 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C5; mayo.moran@utoronto.ca

Camille Cameron, Dean of Law, University of Windsor, 401 Sunset Avenue, Windsor, ON, N9B 3P4; ccameron@uwindsor.ca

Nathalie Des Rosiers, Dean, Common Law Section, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Fauteux Hall, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 6N5; nathalie.desrosiers@uOttawa.ca

¹¹ Doré v Barreau du Québec, 2012 SCC 12, available online: http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/scc/doc/2012/2012scc12/2012scc12.pdf

Bill Flanagan, Dean, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, Macdonald Hall, 128 Union Street, Kingston, ON, K7L 3N6; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

W. Iain Scott, Dean, Faculty of Law, Western University, 151 Richmond Street, London, ON, N6A 3K7; iain.scott@uwo.ca

Daniel Jutras, Dean, Faculty of Law, McGill University, Room 15, Chancellor Day Hall, 3644 Peel Street, Montreal, QC, H3A 1W9; dean.law@mcgill.ca

Kimberley Brooks, Dean, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Weldon Law Building, 6061 University Avenue, P.O. Box 15000, Halifax, NS, B3H 4R2; lawdean@dal.ca

John R. Williamson, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Room 220, Ludlow Hall, P.O. Box 4400, Fredericton, NB, E3B 5A3; jrw@unb.ca

Lorna Turnbull, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Manitoba, Room 301A, Robson Hall, 224 Dysart Road, Winnipeg, MB, R3T 2N2; Lorna.Turnbull@umanitoba.ca

Jeremy Webber, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, STN CSC, Victoria, BC, V8W 2Y2; lawdean@uvic.ca

Mary Anne Bobinski, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Allard Hall, 1822 East Mall, Vancouver, BC, V6T 1Z1; bobinski@law.ubc.ca

Anne N. Pappas, Interim Dean, Faculty of Law, Thompson Rivers University, 900 McGill Road, Kamloops, BC V2C 0C8; apappas@tru.ca

Philip Bryden, Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Room 487, Law Centre, 111 - 89 Avenue, Edmonton, AB, T6H 2H5; deanoflaw@ualberta.ca

Sanjeev Anand, Dean, College of Law, University of Saskatchewan, Room 250, Law Building, 15 Campus Drive, Saskatoon, SK, S7N 5A6; s.anand@usask.ca

Fred W. Headon, President, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; president@cba.org

Pascale Daigneault, President, Ontario Bar Association, 20 Toronto Street, Suite 300, Toronto, ON, M5C 2B8; president@oba.org

Robert A. Peterson, Co-Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Canadian Bar Association, 500-865 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, ON, K1S 5S8; robert.peterson@govlaw.ca

James Edward Merrigan, Chair, Constitutional & Human Rights Section, Canadian Bar Association, Poole Althouse, 49-51 Park Street, PO Box 812 Stn Main, Corner Brook, NL, A2H 6H7; jmerrigan@poolealthouse.ca

Bill Flanagan, President, Canadian Council of Law Deans, 57 Louis Pasteur Street, Ottawa, ON, K1N 5N5; w.flanagan@queensu.ca

The Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education (BC), Room 133, Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC, V8V 1X4; aved.minister@gov.bc.ca

Thomas G. Conway, Law Society Treasurer, Law Society of Upper Canada, Osgoode Hall, 130 Queen Street West, Toronto, ON, M5H 2N6; tconway@cavanagh.ca

The Honourable Brad Duguid, Minister of Training, Colleges and Universities, 3rd Floor, Mowat Block, 900 Bay Street, Toronto, ON, M7A 1L2; bduguid.mpp@liberal.ola.org

The Honourable John Gerretsen, Attorney General of Ontario, 11th Floor, 720 Bay Street, Toronto, ON, M5G 2K1; jgerretsen.mpp@liberal.ola.org

Jonathan M. Richardson, Chair, Young Lawyers' Division (East), Ontario Bar Association, Augustine Bater Binks LLP, Suite 1100, 141 Laurier Avenue West, Ottawa, ON, K1P 5J3; jmr@abblaw.ca

Sarah L. Kirshin-Neilans, Chair, Young Lawyers' Division (Southwest), Ontario Bar Association, Nicholson Smith & Partners LLP, 295 Central Avenue, London, ON, N6B 2C9; skneilans@nicholsonsmith.com

Omar Ha-Redeye, Co-Chair, Young Lawyers' Division (Toronto), Ontario Bar Association, 20 Carlton Street, Unit 126, Toronto, ON, M5B 1J2; Omar@FleetStreetLaw.com

Christine A. Jackson, Co-Chair, Young Lawyers' Division (Toronto), Ontario Bar Association, Osler, Hoskin & Harcourt LLP, 100 King Street West,1 First Canadian Place, Suite 4600, P.O. Box 50, Toronto, ON, M5X 1B8; cjackson@osler.com

Lisa Marie Barnet, President, Young Lawyers' Division, Canadian Bar Association, Ontario Power Authority, 1600-120 Adelaide St W, Toronto, ON, M5H 1T1; lisa barnet@hotmail.com

Blake Jones, Chair, Student Division, Ontario Bar Association, 20 Toronto Street, Suite 300, Toronto, ON, M5C 2B8; bjones44@uwo.ca

Janet Whitehead, President, Country and District Law Presidents' Association, 731 9th Street West, Owen Sound, ON, N4K 3P5; jwhitehead@sarnialaw.com

Paul Jonathan Saguil, Chair, Sexual Orientation & Gender Identity Conference, Ontario Bar Association, 20 Toronto Street, Suite 300, Toronto, ON, M5C 2B8; paul.jonathan.saguil@gmail.com

Secretariat, OUTlaws Canada, Osgoode Hall Law School, York University, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, ON M3J 1P3; outlawscanada@gmail.com

From: Minister, AVED AVED:EX

Sent: Monday, March 31, 2014 2:34 PM

To: AVED MCRU Incoming Corresp Working Box AVED:EX Subject: Cliff 96876 - FOR RESPONSE: TWU law school

Categories: Minister

Please prepare response for ED signature as follows:

Branch: Gov & QA Issue: TWU

Judy Shaw

Manager, Business Services & Ministerial Correspondence

and Research Unit

Office of the Deputy Minister Ministry of Advanced Education Telephone: 250 356-6284

Fax: 250 356-5468

This message may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you have received this message in error, please notify me immediately and delete the original transmission without making a copy.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, March 31, 2014 1:13 PM

To: Minister, AVED AVED:EX **Subject:** Fwd: TWU law school

Begin forwarded message:

From s.22

Subject: TWU law school

Date: March 31, 2014 at 4:10:42 PM EDT

To: amrik.virk.mla@leg.bc.ca

Dear Amrik Virk,

doing research for LEAF (Women's Legal Aid and Action Fund) into

Trinity Western University's application to open a law school in Alberta. LEAF is looking for ways to contribute to the dialogue around this proposed law school, both provincially and nationally.

I was wondering if there were any meetings or events planned by the Ministry of Advanced Education in which the issues raised by the proposed TWU law school will be discussed.

We would like to keep abreast of such events and would be grateful for any information in this regard.

With many thanks in advance, Regards,

Page 54 redacted for the following reason: s.22

From: AVED Governance and Quality Assurance AVED:EX

Sent: Thursday, April 24, 2014 9:03 AM

To: s.22

Cc: Minister, AVED AVED:EX

Subject: Our Ref. 96876 - Re: Trinity Western University's proposed law degree

April 24, 2014 Our Ref. 96876

s.22

Thank you for your e-mail sent to the Honourable Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education, requesting information about whether the Ministry of Advanced Education has any meetings or events planned to discuss Trinity Western University's proposed law degree. Your e-mail has been forwarded to me for response on the Minister's behalf.

The Minister of Advanced Education gave consent for the proposed law degree under the *Degree Authorization Act* on December 17, 2013. There are no meetings or events planned by the Ministry of Advanced Education relating to this degree proposal.

For further information regarding British Columbia's degree review process, please visit the Degree Authorization website at: www.aved.gov.bc.ca/degreeauthorization/welcome.htm.

I trust this information is helpful to you.

Sincerely,

Mary Shaw Executive Director Governance and Quality Assurance Branch Ministry of Advanced Education

pc: Honourable Amrik Virk

Minister of Advanced Education

From s.22

Sent: Monday, March 31, 2014 1:13 PM

To: Minister, AVED AVED:EX **Subject:** Fwd: TWU law school

Begin forwarded message:

s.22

From

Subject: TWU law school

Date: March 31, 2014 at 4:10:42 PM EDT

To: amrik.virk.mla@leg.bc.ca

Dear Amrik Virk,

doing research for LEAF (Women's Legal Aid and Action Fund) into Trinity Western University's application to open a law school in Alberta. LEAF is looking for ways to contribute to the dialogue around this proposed law school, both provincially and nationally.

I was wondering if there were any meetings or events planned by the Ministry of Advanced Education in which the issues raised by the proposed TWU law school will be discussed.

We would like to keep abreast of such events and would be grateful for any information in this regard.

With many thanks in advance, Regards,

s.22

Subject: Cliff 97107 - INFO/FILE - Loke v. Minister of Advanced Education of British Columbia

Attachments: Petition.pdf; Sworn Affidavit of Trevor Loke April 11 (body only).PDF

Importance: High

From: Cheryl McKinnon [mailto:cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com]

Sent: Monday, April 14, 2014 4:51 AM

To: Minister, AVED AVED:EX; emeehan@supremeadvocacy.ca; president@twu.ca

Cc: Gerald Chan; Clayton Ruby; Angela Chaisson; KBrooks@jfklaw.ca; ESigurdson@jfklaw.ca

Subject: Re: Loke v. Minister of Advanced Education of British Columbia

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please be advised that Clayton Ruby and the law firm of Janes Freedman Kyle in Vancouver have been retained by Trevor Loke to challenge the decision of the Minister of Advanced Education to consent to Trinity Western University's Law School. Please find enclosed an electronic copy of the Petition and Affidavit of the Petitioner, Trevor Loke (without the exhibits). Our materials will be filed by the end of the day today, upon which hard copies will be served on you.

Yours truly,

Cheryl McKinnon Law Clerk

RUBY SHILLER CHAN HASAN

BARRISTERS

11 Prince Arthur Avenue Toronto Ontario M5R 1B2

T: 416 964 9664 • F: 416 964 8305 • Web: www.rubyshiller.com

E: cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com

"The information contained in this electronic message is legally privileged and confidential information that is exempt from disclosure under applicable law and is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by telephoning (416) 964-9664 or by email at cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com Thank you for your cooperation."

Pages 58 through 90 redacted for the following reasons: s.3

Subject: Cliff 97107 - INFO/FILE FW: Re: Loke v. Minister of Advanced Education of British

Columbia

Attachments: Affidavit of Jill Bishop SWORN.pdf; Sworn Affidavit of Cheryl McKinnon.pdf

Importance: High

From: Cheryl McKinnon [mailto:cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com]

Sent: Monday, April 14, 2014 9:23 AM

To: president@twu.ca; emeehan@supremeadvocacy.ca; Minister, AVED AVED:EX

Cc: Gerald Chan; Clayton Ruby; Angela Chaisson; KBrooks@jfklaw.ca; ESigurdson@jfklaw.ca; Mandy Machin

Subject: FW: Re: Loke v. Minister of Advanced Education of British Columbia

Dear Sir/Madam:

Further to my email of this morning, please find attached the following materials:

- 1. Affidavit of Catherine Taylor
- 2. Affidavit of Barry Adam
- 3. Affidavit of Ellen Faulkner
- 4. Affidavit of Jill Bishop
- 5. Affidavit Cheryl McKinnon

Additional materials will be forwarded to you throughout the day as we are able to scan them. As indicated in my email earlier this morning, a hard copy of all our materials will be served on you shortly.

Yours truly,

Cheryl McKinnon Law Clerk

RUBY

SHILLER

CHAN

HASAN

BARRISTERS

11 Prince Arthur Avenue Toronto Ontario M5R 1B2

T: 416 964 9664 • F: 416 964 8305 • Web: www.rubyshiller.com

E: cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com

From: Cheryl McKinnon **Sent:** April 14 14 7:51 AM

To: 'aved.minister@gov.bc.ca'; 'emeehan@supremeadvocacy.ca'; 'president@twu.ca'

Cc: Gerald Chan; Clayton Ruby; Angela Chaisson; 'KBrooks@jfklaw.ca'; 'ESigurdson@jfklaw.ca'

Subject: Re: Loke v. Minister of Advanced Education of British Columbia

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please be advised that Clayton Ruby and the law firm of Janes Freedman Kyle in Vancouver have been retained by Trevor Loke to challenge the decision of the Minister of Advanced Education to consent to Trinity Western University's Law School. Please find enclosed an electronic copy of the Petition and Affidavit of the Petitioner, Trevor Loke (without the exhibits). Our materials will be filed by the end of the day today, upon which hard copies will be served on you.

Yours truly,

Cheryl McKinnon Law Clerk

RUBY SHILLER CHAN HASAN

BARRISTERS

11 Prince Arthur Avenue Toronto Ontario M5R 1B2

T: 416 964 9664 • F: 416 964 8305 • Web: www.rubyshiller.com

E: cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com

"The information contained in this electronic message is legally privileged and confidential information that is exempt from disclosure under applicable law and is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by telephoning (416) 964-9664 or by email at cmckinnon@rubyshiller.com Thank you for your cooperation."

Pages 93 through 243 redacted for the following reasons: s.3

From: Minister, AVED AVED:EX

Sent: Tuesday, May 20, 2014 10:34 AM

To: AVED MCRU Incoming Corresp Working Box AVED:EX
Cc: Facey, Nick AVED:EX; Carey, Linda J AVED:EX
Subject: Cliff 97298 - INFO/FILE: Discriminatory TWU Covenant

Categories: Info/File, Minister

Please info/file as follows:

Branch: Gov & QA

Issue: TWU

Judy Shaw

Manager, Business Services & Ministerial Correspondence and Research Unit

Office of the Deputy Minister Ministry of Advanced Education Telephone: 250 356-6284

Fax: 250 356-5468

This message may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you have received this message in error, please notify me immediately and delete the original transmission without making a copy.

s.22

From:

Sent: Monday, May 19, 2014 1:36 PM

To: info@flsc.ca; AVED Degree Quality Assessment Board Secretariat AVED:EX; Minister, AVED AVED:EX;

david.eby.mla@leg.bc.ca

Subject: Discriminatory TWU Covenant

To:

Federation of Law Societies of Canada Special Advisory Committee on TWU's Proposed School of Law – info@flsc.ca

Degree Quality Assessment Board, Government of British Columbia – <u>DQABsecretariat@gov.bc.ca</u>

Amrik Virk, Minister of Advanced Education, Government of British Columbia – <u>AVED.Minister@gov.bc.ca</u>

David Eby, Opposition Critic for Advanced Education – <u>david.eby.mla@leg.bc.ca</u>

Because of its discriminatory admittance and hiring policies, the BC Humanist Association calls for the proposed School of Law at Trinity Western University to be rejected.

TWU's policies violate the fundamental notion of equality. Approving their law school would create an extra path to becoming a lawyer in Canada that is not available to students who do not fit with TWU's vision of heterosexual Christians.

It is well documented that TWU's Community Covenant discriminates against gay and lesbian students. The Covenant also requires that students adopt an anti-choice stance (students must "uphold...worth from conception") contrary to Canada's ongoing commitment to women's reproductive freedoms. Furthermore, the mandatory Statement of Faith for faculty and staff discriminates against the non-religious and others who are not Christian. These restrictions threaten academic freedom at TWU.

Our Board of Directors, in solidarity with numerous other organizations, have taken a strong stance against this proposal and urge the FLSC and Government of British Columbia to stand up for prospective LGBT and non-Christian lawyers by rejecting this discriminatory law school.

Sincerely,

s.22