

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 3:32 PM  
**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX; Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** RE: Other provinces and birth tourism

Thanks SM!

MB I have re-written as a QA for consideration if you want to paste it into your latest draft:

### Q1. Is birth tourism an increasing problem in British Columbia?

- We are primarily seeing this activity increase in Ontario and Alberta.
- In those provinces non-resident births have increased by about 15 per cent over the last eight years, while B.C.'s rate has increased approximately three per cent.
- The scale in Ontario is ten times what we see in this province – and points again to the importance of a national response to this issue.

J M P

Desk: 236-478-0302  
Cell: 250-886-2154

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 3:05 PM  
**To:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca>; Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** Other provinces and birth tourism

This is from Andrew Griffith – who pulled some CIHI and Discharge Abstract Database stats. B.C.'s increase was 3.3% while other provinces were much greater. Richmond still has the most but Richmond Hill, Ontario is gaining.

Page 02 of 94 to/à Page 03 of 94

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright

**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 3:13 PM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Yeung, Lucinda HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 21 2019 133pm  
**Attachments:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 21 2019 133pm.docx

Revised with out of province stats and missing MSP answers.

Meribeth

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 3:00 PM  
**To:** LeGuilloux, Marg GCPE:EX; Aaron, Sage PREM:EX  
**Subject:** QA draft  
**Attachments:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL (002).DOCX



### Jean-Marc Prevost

COMMUNICATIONS DIRECTOR  
Desk: 236-478-0302  
Cell: 250-886-2154

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 1:10 PM  
**To:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Cc:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

We need a more fulsome response on this JMP

---

**From:** Ryall, Karen HLTH:EX <Karen.Ryall@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 12:44 PM  
**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca>  
**Cc:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Hi Stephen,  
As discussed out response is as follows:  
MoH conducts regular reviews the eligibility of individuals enrolled in MSP to confirm they meet the eligibility requirements for MSP.

Kind Regards,

**Karen Ryall**

Manager, Divisional Operations | Assistant Deputy Minister's Office | Finance and Corporate Services | Ministry of Health Office |  
Office 250-952-1011 | Cell 250-882-4033

---

**From:** Twyford, Philip HLTH:EX <Philip.Twyford@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 21, 2019 12:42 PM  
**To:** Ryall, Karen HLTH:EX <Karen.Ryall@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** Re: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

approved

---

**From:** "Ryall, Karen HLTH:EX" <Karen.Ryall@gov.bc.ca>  
**Date:** Thursday, November 21, 2019 at 12:39 PM  
**To:** Philip Twyford <Philip.Twyford@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Hi Philip,  
For your approval in response to this media request:

Hi Stephen,  
MoH conducts regular reviews the eligibility of individuals enrolled in MSP to confirm they meet the eligibility requirements for MSP.

Kind Regards,

**Karen Ryall**

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 19, 2019 3:12 PM

**To:** Ryall, Karen HLTH:EX <[Karen.Ryall@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Karen.Ryall@gov.bc.ca)>; Power, Stephanie A HLTH:EX <[Stephanie.Power@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephanie.Power@gov.bc.ca)>

**Cc:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>

**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Hi folks – Minister is doing an interview with the 5<sup>th</sup> Estate on Friday about birth tourism – and we suspect they will be asked about the billing practices of the doctors mentioned (we suspect they are all tied to advertisements for birth houses that are marketed in China). Karen – can you check with Marie to see if there have been reviews/audits on the following doctors? Stephanie – this is mostly FYI at this point – but if you have any thoughts – it would be appreciated.

Thanks.

#### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, October 4, 2019 12:00 PM

#### Request

Would you be able to tell me how the following doctors rank in terms of overall MSP billings compared to their family practice peers?

Brenda Patricia Tan  
Florina Tianyi Feng  
Xin-Yong Wang

#### Background

#### Recommendation

Here are the amounts the three physicians have billed to MSP over the past three fiscal year from 2015/16 through 2017/18

Brenda Patricia Tan: 2017/18: \$465,552; 2016/17: \$602,766 ; 2015/16: \$497,786

Florina Tianyi Feng: 2017/18: \$339,042; 2016/17: \$ 391,632; 2015/16: \$389,642

Xin-Yong Wang: 2017/18: \$ 271,773; 2016/17: \$378,205; 2015/16: \$ 396,751

Caroline Ying-Mei Wang: 2017/18: \$37,201; 2016/17: N/A 2015/16: \$27,332

Using [https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm\\_practitioner.pdf](https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm_practitioner.pdf) (Tables 4-1 through 4-3) - it would appear that all of these GPs except Caroline Ting-Mei Wang would be above the median expenditure in billing – with Tan close to the top for 16/17.

It is important to remember that the billings to the Medical Services Plan does not correlate directly to income, as it does not take into account any expenses for running a practice, such as staffing, rent and overhead.

If anyone has concerns about inappropriate billing or extra billing, they can contact B.C.'s billing integrity program which will investigate the concern - <https://www.health.gov.bc.ca/exforms/bip/index.html>

**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** Therrien, Darlene HLTH:EX  
**Sent:** November 21, 2019 11:24 AM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX; Rongve, Ian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** RE: QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL (002)  
**Attachments:** Briefing Richmond Hospital Non Resident Births.docx; QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL (002) DCT.DOCX

Hi Meribeth,

A few comments embedded in document and track changes turned on. The attached BN from VCH done for Penny Ballam in May this year references the cost of a Caesarean Section as \$15,000 - your answers show it at \$16,000 in a number of places (maybe they put the price up recently)?

s.13

Added a safety question at the end...

Let me know if I can be of further assistance.

Darlene

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 21, 2019 9:57 AM  
**To:** Rongve, Ian HLTH:EX; Therrien, Darlene HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL (002)

As discussed

Please let me know if edits required.

Meribeth



## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 20, 2019 4:07 PM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL (002)  
**Attachments:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL (002).DOCX

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

Minister Dix,

Two outstanding answers from MSP folks.

But updated QA including Richmond L & D recovery costs at 92%  
And diversions happen in both direction at Richmond Hospital.

Meribeth

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Loiacono, Catherine [CORP] <catherine.loiacono@vch.ca>  
**Sent:** November 19, 2019 5:23 PM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; May, Stephen GCPE:EX; XT:Stefanson, Carrie GCPE:IN  
**Subject:** RE: fifth estate prep

Hi Meribeth,

Not sure we will be able to answer Q19 and Q21, but I'm looking into it and will get back to you tomorrow am. Will that work?

Q 16 and 17 seem MCFD focused.

Thanks,  
Catherine

**Catherine Loiacono**  
Director of Public Affairs and Stakeholder Relations  
Vancouver Coastal Health  
D: 604 708 5312 M: 604 313 5645  
E: [Catherine.loiacono@vch.ca](mailto:Catherine.loiacono@vch.ca)  
After-Hours: 604 202 2012

---

**From:** Stefanson, Carrie [CORP]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 19, 2019 4:03 PM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth [EX] <[meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca)>; Loiacono, Catherine [CORP] <catherine.loiacono@vch.ca>  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <[Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>; May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Subject:** RE: fifth estate prep

As requested.

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX [<mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 19, 2019 3:39 PM  
**To:** Loiacono, Catherine [CORP] <[catherine.loiacono@vch.ca](mailto:catherine.loiacono@vch.ca)>; Stefanson, Carrie [CORP] <[Carrie.Stefanson@vch.ca](mailto:Carrie.Stefanson@vch.ca)>  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <[Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>; May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Subject:** fifth estate prep

Hi C and C

Please assist with answers where you can.

First two questions are also going to MCFD.

I'll work with college and msp on complaints / discipline, but we can expect to be asked what will moh and ha do.

Meribeth

**Q16.** Do non-resident mothers abandon or surrender babies at Richmond Hospital? Not aware of this.

**Q17.** What about non-resident babies with significant health challenges? Are they left behind? Not aware of this

**Q18.** Are you aware that there are BC doctors advertising birth tourism in China? We've heard about this in the media.

**Q19.** What can the province do to stop doctors from advertising and profiting from birth tourism?

**Q.21** Can you suspend privileges to those doctors at the health authority level?

**Q22.** Is Richmond Hospital relying on birth tourism revenue? How much more do the non-residents pay compared to BC residents and out of town residents? All hospitals and health authorities are accountable to the residents they serve and to government, and expect to be compensated for the services they provide, whether through MSP, private insurance companies, or through direct payment from clients. In terms of how much non-resident pay compared to BC residents, we are fortunate to live in BC and Canada, where our medical premiums are subsidized. If you have properly registered for medical coverage in BC and you have a baby here, you leave the hospital with a new baby. If you are a non-resident of Canada without private medical coverage, you can expect to pay a deposit for your birth. Of course, every birth is different and the deposit amounts may vary slightly from hospital to hospital, but at Richmond Hospital for example, you would pay a deposit of \$10,000 for a normal delivery and \$16,00 for a C-section delivery.

**Meribeth Burton | Manager, Issues and Media Relations, Ministry of Health**

Government Communications & Public Engagement

w: 236-478-1168 | m: 250-818-0293 | [Meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca)

**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 19, 2019 4:37 PM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL  
**Attachments:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL.DOCX

Hi Amanda,

Still a work in process and Qs out to program for answers, but coming together,

Meribeth

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 19, 2019 3:48 PM  
**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL  
**Attachments:** QA\_Birth Tourism\_Nov 8\_2019\_FINAL.DOCX

Updating QA

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 19, 2019 3:02 PM  
**To:** Annie Burns-Pieper  
**Cc:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** Re: interview request

Hi Annie  
Can you give me a call when you have a few minutes?  
I have a couple of items to tidy up before Friday.  
12508180293

Thank you  
Meribeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 14, 2019, at 9:12 AM, Annie Burns-Pieper <annieburnspieper@gmail.com> wrote:

Okay thanks, so you will be at the location if we need anything the day of?

Cheers,  
Annie

On Thu, Nov 14, 2019 at 12:08 PM Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)> wrote:

Yes, I am your contact. Numbers below...

**Meribeth Burton | Manager, Issues and Media Relations, Ministry of Health**  
Government Communications & Public Engagement  
w: 236-478-1168 | m: 250-818-0293 | [Meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca)

**From:** Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)>  
**Sent:** November 14, 2019 9:07 AM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Cc:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <[Jean-](#)

[Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>

**Subject:** Re: interview request

Just checking in. Is there a contact for the day of I can grab a phone number for?

Thanks a lot,

Annie

On Tue, Nov 12, 2019 at 5:42 PM Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)> wrote:

Okay sounds great. If slightly earlier is possible that would also be great as I am trying to get the crew on a flight back to Toronto

Cheers,

Annie

On Tue, Nov 12, 2019 at 5:30 PM Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)> wrote:

Hi Annie

We are holding 1 to 1:30 pm November 22 in the Minister's calendar for your interview. The interview will take place at Minister Dix's community office in Vancouver.

We've let his ministerial staff know that you need access to room to set up - one hour in advance.

Meribeth

**From:** Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** November 11, 2019 8:46 AM

**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>

**Cc:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <[Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>



[Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>

**Subject:** Re: interview request

Thank you. When can you confirm?

Best,

Annie

On Fri, Nov 8, 2019 at 2:34 PM Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)> wrote:

Hi Annie,

I have a tentative date for you – Friday, November 22 in Vancouver.

Adding our Communications Director, Jean-Marc to the thread so there are a few eyes on your request going forward.

Meribeth

**From:** Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** November 7, 2019 10:07 PM

**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>

**Cc:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>

**Subject:** Re: interview request

Hi again, Just checking in on timing.

Thanks a lot,

Annie

On Thu, Nov 7, 2019 at 10:24 AM Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)> wrote:

Hi, Just checking in. How does this timing work for you? We are just lining up travel etc.

Thanks a lot,

Annie

On Tue, Nov 5, 2019 at 1:27 PM Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)> wrote:

Hi Stephen, Sounds good. Thank you for making time for us.

How about the afternoon of Thursday November 21 in Victoria? We could potentially do the Friday as well, not sure if Mr. Dix comes back to Vancouver for the weekends but if he is back on Friday it would be easier for us to do the interview in Vancouver than Victoria.

This is standard timing for us.

1 Hour set up in the room where the interview will be held in advance of interviewee arriving  
1 Hour for the interview, it will not be this long but it allows for sound checks and any stopping and starting needed.

30 minutes for some basic b-roll.

We should probably need him for less than the hour and a half but its a safe window to ensure we can get everything done.

We want to speak about how the issue of birth tourism affects the healthcare system in BC including;

- How the province is studying impacts of birth tourism on health care in British Columbia
- What the ministry has learned about this issue including the impact on resident patients and health care providers.
- The challenges you face in addressing this.
- Next steps on the issue.
- Any requests you might have for assistance from other levels of governance in moving forward.

Let me know if that timing works for you.

Thanks a lot,

Annie

On Tue, Nov 5, 2019 at 3:38 AM Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)> wrote:

Hi Annie

Yes, Minister Dix will give an interview that week.

Can you give me some timing options? Please keep in mind the legislature is in session that week – so Monday and Wednesday afternoon QP and Tuesday and Thursday morning QP.

How much time will you need with the Minister? Is there anything you can share – themes, questions etc – so we can prepare the Minister for your interview?

Meribeth

**From:** Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)>  
**Sent:** November 4, 2019 3:08 AM  
**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Cc:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Subject:** Re: interview request

Hi Stephen, Just following up on my call last week. We are planning our shoot in British Columbia. Is it going to be possible to meet with the Minister the week of the 18th?

Thank you very much,

Annie

On Tue, Oct 29, 2019 at 12:20 PM Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)> wrote:

Hi Stephen, Just following up on this. We will be in BC the week of November 18th. Could the Minister accommodate an interview that week? Will he be in Vancouver or Victoria that week? Our preference would be Vancouver if it were an option.

Thank you,

Annie

On Thu, Oct 24, 2019 at 3:33 PM Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)> wrote:

Hi Stephen, Yes I understand he cannot speak to immigration matters.

Thank you,

Annie

On Wed, Oct 23, 2019 at 10:38 PM May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)> wrote:

Thanks Annie,

We will look into the Minister's availability on this topic – obviously the Minister wouldn't be able to speak on topics such as immigration laws, and citizenship status, as those aren't in his purview.

Are you speaking to other health ministers? Anyone from the federal government?

Thanks.

**From:** Annie Burns-Pieper <[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** October 22, 2019 11:27 PM

**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>; Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>

**Subject:** interview request

Hello Stephen and Meribeth I wanted to send an official request for an interview with the minister.

I am currently working as a producer with CBC The Fifth Estate. I am writing to request an on-camera sit-down interview with the Honourable Adrian Dix, Minister of Health.

We are producing a 25-minute segment for the program on the subject of birth tourism and we would very much like to include an interview with the minister about this subject.

We are seeking to conduct this interview in mid-November but we have some flexibility.

Please let me know if I can answer any questions.

Sincerely,

Annie Burns-Pieper

**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Sent:** November 19, 2019 9:31 AM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Cc:** Yeung, Lucinda HLTH:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** RE: Birth tourism - CBC fifth estate

Hi Meribeth,

Minister would like to take you up on your offer to play reporter.

Are you available from 4:30 to 6:00 on Thursday this week? In the Minister's Office?

Alternatively, if Little House is cancelled, we will also have a couple of afternoon spots to offer. I am just waiting on confirmation about whether it intends to go forward or not.

-A

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 8, 2019 12:48 PM  
**To:** Yeung, Lucinda HLTH:EX <[Lucinda.Yeung@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Lucinda.Yeung@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX <[Amanda.vanBaarsen@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Amanda.vanBaarsen@gov.bc.ca)>; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX <[Thuy.Pham@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Thuy.Pham@gov.bc.ca)>; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <[Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Subject:** FW: Birth tourism - CBC fifth estate

Hi Lucinda,

I was preparing this for the Minister but the QA needs a question about docs benefiting/promoting birth tourism. We are working on that.

In the meantime....

The Fifth Estate is looking to confirm the non-resident birth interview for November 21 or 22. The producer is looking for a firm time for the interview as they are booking flights from Toronto.

Below details of the timing around the interview and some of the questions that will be asked.

Attached is our Birth Tourism QA, Issues Note and a rundown of all responses to the Fifth Estate from MOH and Vancouver Coastal.

If you find it helpful, we could consider a pre-interview to prepare. I am happy to play reporter – like the olden days.

Meribeth

1 Hour set up in the room where the interview will be held in advance of interviewee arriving  
1 Hour for the interview, it will not be this long but it allows for sound checks and any stopping and starting needed.  
30 minutes for some basic b-roll.  
We should probably need him for less than the hour and a half but its a safe window to ensure we can get everything done.

We want to speak about how the issue of birth tourism affects the healthcare system in BC including;

- How the province is studying impacts of birth tourism on health care in British Columbia
- What the ministry has learned about this issue including the impact on resident patients and health care providers.
- The challenges you face in addressing this.
- Next steps on the issue.
- Any requests you might have for assistance from other levels of governance in moving forward.

Let me know if that timing works for you.

Thanks a lot,

Annie

---

**From:** Peaker, Alex GCPE:EX <[Alex.Peaker@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Alex.Peaker@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Sent:** November 8, 2019 12:12 PM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Subject:** Birth tourism - CBC fifth estate

IN, updated QA with the daily pieces and media rollup of our responses and VCH's attached.

Thanks!

Alex Peaker  
GCPE – Health  
Office: 778.698.2381 Mobile: 250.893.5640  
[Alex.Peaker@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Alex.Peaker@gov.bc.ca)

**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** Moulton, Holly HLTH:EX  
**Sent:** November 18, 2019 1:13 PM  
**To:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Cc:** Rongye, Ian HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** Birth Tourism Status Update.docx  
**Attachments:** Birth Tourism Status Update.docx

Is the response at the below in line with GCPE messaging?

Thanks  
Holly



**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 6, 2019 11:15 AM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; May, Stephen GCPE:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** Media Rollup Nov 6 2019  
**Attachments:** Media Rollup Nov 6 2019.docx

Hi Amanda,

Here is media roll-up.

5 outstanding. 2 booking time for interview. We should consider pre-interview on birth tourism – not sure if that's been done before.

We are still on program answer for last Kelly Grant question.

Meribeth

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Larabee, Shawn G GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 4, 2019 9:24 AM  
**To:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** FW: CFD Media Request: non-resident children in care

Hi Jean-Marc,

MCFD doesn't collect the statistics the reporter is looking for.<sup>s.13</sup>  
s.13

It was suggested to me that the Ministry of Health might have more information on these 'birthing homes' or 'birth tourism'. If so, would you be able to pass it on to Annie?

---

**From:** Shawn Larabee <Shawn.G.Larabee@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** October 30, 2019 11:13 AM  
**To:** Larabee, Shawn G GCPE:EX <Shawn.G.Larabee@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** CFD Media Request: non-resident children in care

### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
CBC Fifth Estate  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, November 1, 2019 2:00 PM

### Request

I am researching the topic of non-resident births. I have heard allegations that non-residents have left children in Canada after they cannot afford medical costs.

Do you have any statistics on children surrendered to the province by non-residents?

### Background

### Recommendation

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 2, 2019 3:42 PM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** Fwd: MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis

FYI

I will connect on Monday to set up an interview week of the 18th

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX" <Adrian.Dix@gov.bc.ca>  
**Date:** November 2, 2019 at 3:03:50 PM PDT  
**To:** "Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX" <Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** Re: MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis

Can't remember if I replied to this, but yes, will set up an interview.

Adrian

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** Friday, November 01, 2019 12:11 PM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis

Minister Dix,

As promised yesterday, we pulled together 5<sup>th</sup> Estate requests to MoH and VCH and responses to date for your reference.

The 5<sup>th</sup> Estate would like to interview you during the week of November 18. And given past episodes, it would be likely that they would seek you out at the legislature without a scheduled interview.

If you would like to do an interview – there is a QA in the attached too. Plus we have added your past comments on the issue.

Please let me know if you need anything from me on this,

Meribeth

**Meribeth Burton | Manager, Issues and Media Relations, Ministry of Health**  
Government Communications & Public Engagement  
w: 236-478-1168 | m: 250-818-0293 | [Meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.burton@gov.bc.ca)

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 1, 2019 12:05 PM  
**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** RE: MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis

Perfect. Thank you,

Meribeth

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** November 1, 2019 11:45 AM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** RE: MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** November 1, 2019 10:47 AM  
**To:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX <Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca>  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis

Thanks Stephen for getting this going.

1. We need dates of requests
2. Let's get a QA ready – pull from Daily
3. MD will want to know what he has said in the past – need a round up

Are you concerned that some BC doctors are fuelling and profiting from birth tourism?

What can the province do if they suspect a doctor is benefiting from birth tourism?

Why doesn't the province stop birth tourism? – not immigration officers

\*at some point we should address the xenophobic nature of the inquiry

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** November 1, 2019 10:37 AM  
**To:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis  
**Attachments:** MR\_110119\_Fifth Estate\_Birth Tourism Analysis.docx

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

Give this a quick read and see if this works for you.

Stephen May  
GCPE-Health  
P: 250 952 3401  
C: 250 888 9879

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 31, 2019 4:17 PM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** RE: HLTH Follow-up Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Minister Dix,

Producer has come back to us again.

Let me know if you want more detail on this. I have asked VCH to pull their responses together and we will do the same.

Meribeth

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 29, 2019 11:03 AM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX <Adrian.Dix@gov.bc.ca>  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX <Amanda.vanBaarsen@gov.bc.ca>; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX <Thuy.Pham@gov.bc.ca>; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** HLTH Follow-up Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Minister Dix,

Please see latest draft response to 5<sup>th</sup> Estate inquiry. Let me know if response is approved to send.

Also the producer is asking for a TV interview with you:

We will be in BC the week of November 18th. Could the Minister accommodate an interview that week? In Vancouver or Victoria? Our preference would be Vancouver if it were an option.

### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** ASAP

### Request

A briefing note on the subject of birth tourism was just released to me through FOI (Cliff 1120367). I have a question about it I was hoping you could answer.

It says that the vast majority of non-resident births at the Richmond hospital are from families with a permanent addresses in China. I hadn't seen a nationality breakdown in the past. Can you tell me how the Ministry came to that conclusion?

In that same briefing note it mentioned that B.C's vital statistics keep track of people giving birth here from other places.

Are those statistics you can provide me or would I have to go through FOI?

**Response:**

*Vital Statistics does track the Mother's residential address as provided by the hospital on the Notice of Birth, and the Mother's residential address as it was entered on the Birth Registration completed by the parents. This is not an exact measure, because differences can be caused by things such as residential moves, and it is only something we have started tracking in the past year.*

*The data that Vital Stats has would confirm the statement in the note regarding non-resident births that you have that stated "the vast majority gave a permanent address in China".*

*Going from our data from the past 11 months using information from the Notice of Birth, it appears 409 out of 536 of the births to non-resident mothers were to those from China. That said, this data is preliminary, and as it is from a different source than other methods, so it would not be unusual for differences between this and other data sources. Most sources for foreign mothers giving birth use the Discharge Abstract Database – they define a foreign patient as a patient "who did not have a Canadian healthcare number and self-pay was recorded in the "responsibility for payment field"" – but does not break down information by country of origin*



## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 28, 2019 10:44 AM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; XT:Loiacono, Catherine GCPE:IN  
**Subject:** FW: GCPE Request: HLTH Follow-up Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees  
**Attachments:** Material for Premier and Minister's Briefing on Birth Tourism; 1120367- ibn non-resident births in bc.docx; IN\_Richmond Hospital birth tourism\_Aug 30 2018\_FINAL.doc

The information that the reporter has is from a VCH briefing note from 2018 (attached). The following has been okayed by Vital Stats – want to loop in VCH as they have been dealing with Annie as well – and I suspect they have several other irons in the fire on this looking for different numbers.

### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

### Deadline ASAP

### Request

A briefing note on the subject of birth tourism was just released to me through FOI (Cliff 1120367). I have a question about it I was hoping you could answer.

It says that the vast majority of non-resident births at the Richmond hospital are from families with a permanent addresses in China. I hadn't seen a nationality breakdown in the past. Can you tell me how the Ministry came to that conclusion?

In that same briefing note it mentioned that B.C's vital statistics keep track of people giving birth here from other places. Are those statistics you can provide me or would I have to go through FOI?

### Response:

*Vital Statistics does track the Mother's residential address as provided by the hospital on the Notice of Birth, and the Mother's residential address as it was entered on the Birth Registration completed by the parents. This is not an exact measure, because differences can be caused by things such as residential moves, and it is only something we have started tracking in the past year.*

*The data that Vital Stats has would confirm the statement in the note regarding non-resident births that you have that stated "the vast majority gave a permanent address in China".*

*Going from our data from the past 11 months using information from the Notice of Birth, it appears 409 out of 536 of the births to non-resident mothers were to those from China. That said, this data is preliminary, and as it is from a different source than other methods, so it would not be unusual for differences between this and other data sources. Most sources for foreign mothers giving birth use the Discharge Abstract Database – they define a foreign patient as a patient "who did not have a Canadian healthcare number and self-pay was recorded in the "responsibility for payment field"" – but does not break down information by country of origin*

## **Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 23, 2019 8:37 AM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth Tourism - interview request

Heads-up on this request (She's working for CBC's the Fifth Estate on this one). If the Minister would like to go ahead with this – let us know what he would like as supporting materials. We have some time.

### **Reporter**

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, November 15, 2019 4:00 PM

### **Request**

I wanted to send an official request for an interview with the minister.

I am currently working as a producer with CBC The Fifth Estate. I am writing to request an on-camera sit-down interview with the Honourable Adrian Dix, Minister of Health.

We are producing a 25-minute segment for the program on the subject of birth tourism and we would very much like to include an interview with the minister about this subject.

We are seeking to conduct this interview in mid-November but we have some flexibility.

Please let me know if I can answer any questions.

### **Background**

### **Recommendation**

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 21, 2019 1:29 PM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** RE: Media outstanding

Birth tourism on your list is already approved and out/

Mb

---

**From:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX <Amanda.vanBaarsen@gov.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** October 21, 2019 1:12 PM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca>  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca>; May, Stephen GCPE:EX <Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca>  
**Subject:** RE: Media outstanding



---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX <[Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Meribeth.Burton@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Sent:** October 21, 2019 1:10 PM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX <[Amanda.vanBaarsen@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Amanda.vanBaarsen@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX <[Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Jean-Marc.Prevost@gov.bc.ca)>; May, Stephen GCPE:EX <[Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Stephen.May@gov.bc.ca)>  
**Subject:** Media outstanding

Hi Amanda,

I was just building this when you emailed.

Meribeth

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 9, 2019 11:32 AM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** RE: Media request - CBC Fifth Estate follow-up on birth tourism

Minister Dix and Amanda

VCH is also responding to Fifth Estate.

Please see draft response below and my edit in green.

Let me know if edits are required.

Here is our standard messaging and planned response to the reporter, but we're flagging it with leadership and the hospital before we respond:

- VCH will never deny urgent and emergent care based on ability to pay or where a patient is from, but we do expect to be compensated as we are accountable to BC residents for hospital and health care services. We are committed to collecting compensation from non-residents who use our medical services.
- ~~VCH does not endorse or support marketing of maternity tourism.~~ VCH does not condone any practice that encourages people to deliberately come to Canada to deliver babies as a method of obtaining citizenship nor do we want staff or medical staff acting as immigration officers. Their job is to provide safe medical care.
- We encourage women intending to use Richmond Hospital's maternity services to pre-register with us 6-8 weeks prior to their due date and call Richmond Hospital Birth Centre when they are in early labour. This may not reduce demand on our services but it will help us be more proactive in our planning. Most women pre-register.
- Non-residents are required to make a pre-payment deposit of \$10,000 for a vaginal birth and \$16,000 for a caesarean birth. Non-residents are required to pay all hospital costs and medical care for the mother and baby.
- We cannot comment on specific cases due to patient confidentiality.

Fiscal Year	Total Number of Non-Residents who Delivered at RH	Total Number of Newborns of Non-Residents born at RH	Total twins delivered to non residents	Total Newborns Born at RH	% of Newborns of Non-Resident Parents
2014/15	335	337	s.22	2185	15.4%
2015/16	299	299		1935	15.5%
2016/17	379	383		2228	17.2%
2017/18	469	474		2145	22.1%
2018/19	454	458		1980	23.1%
Total	1936	1951		10,473	18.6%

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 9, 2019 10:51 AM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Minister Dix,

Fifth Estate producer continues to come to us with questions about their series on non-resident births. Please see info below that we plan to share.

Let me know if there are edits or concerns,

Meribeth

### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, October 4, 2019 12:00 PM

### Request

Would you be able to tell me how the following doctors rank in terms of overall MSP billings compared to their family practice peers?

Brenda Patricia Tan  
Florina Tianyi Feng  
Xin-Yong Wang  
Caroline Ying-Me Wang

### Background

### Recommendation

Here are the amounts the three physicians have billed to MSP over the past three fiscal year from 2015/16 through 2017/18

Brenda Patricia Tan: 2017/18: \$465,552; 2016/17: \$602,766 ; 2015/16: \$497,786  
Florina Tianyi Feng: 2017/18: \$339,042; 2016/17: \$ 391,632; 2015/16: \$389,642  
Xin-Yong Wang: 2017/18: \$ 271,773; 2016/17: \$378,205; 2015/16: \$ 396,751  
Caroline Ying-Mei Wang: 2017/18: \$37,201; 2016/17: N/A 2015/16: \$27,332

Using [https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm\\_practitioner.pdf](https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm_practitioner.pdf) (Tables 4-1 through 4-3) - it would appear that all of these GPs except Caroline Ting-Mei Wang would be above the median expenditure in billing – with Tan close to the top for 16/17.

It is important to remember that the billings to the Medical Services Plan does not correlate directly to income, as it does not take into account any expenses for running a practice, such as staffing, rent and overhead.

If anyone has concerns about inappropriate billing or extra billing, they can contact B.C.'s billing integrity program which will investigate the concern - <https://www.health.gov.bc.ca/exforms/bip/index.html>

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Peaker, Alex GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 8, 2019 8:16 AM  
**Subject:** HA Call Summary - Tuesday, October 8, 2019

PLEASE DO NOT FORWARD.

VCH – CBC request re: birth tourism  
FH – Breastfeeding event in Maple Ridge tomorrow  
PHSA – Nothing new  
IH – Flagged that they had no part in Vernon MRI story from clips this morning  
NH – Doctor shortage in Chetwynd is going to result in some ED diversions/closures, issue note coming this morning  
Island – Outstanding request re: contracted bed numbers on the Island  
Prov – Vancouver Sun story ran re: redevelopment fundraising  
FNHA – Nothing new  
MMHA – Nothing new

Alex Peaker  
GCPE – Health  
Office: 778.698.2381 Mobile: 250.893.5640  
[Alex.Peaker@gov.bc.ca](mailto:Alex.Peaker@gov.bc.ca)

## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 7, 2019 9:25 AM  
**To:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

**Signed off from program.**

### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, October 4, 2019 12:00 PM

### Request

Would you be able to tell me how the following doctors rank in terms of overall MSP billings compared to their family practice peers?

Brenda Patricia Tan  
Florina Tianyi Feng  
Xin-Yong Wang

### Background

### Recommendation

Here are the amounts the three physicians have billed to MSP over the past three fiscal year from 2015/16 through 2017/18

Brenda Patricia Tan: 2017/18: \$465,552; 2016/17: \$602,766 ; 2015/16: \$497,786  
Florina Tianyi Feng: 2017/18: \$339,042; 2016/17: \$ 391,632; 2015/16: \$389,642  
Xin-Yong Wang: 2017/18: \$ 271,773; 2016/17: \$378,205; 2015/16: \$ 396,751

Using [https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm\\_practitioner.pdf](https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm_practitioner.pdf) (Tables 4-1 through 4-3) - it would appear that all of these GPs would be above the median expenditure in billing – with Tan close to the top for 16/17.

It is important to remember that the billings to the Medical Services Plan does not correlate directly to income, as it does not take into account any expenses for running a practice, such as staffing, rent and overhead.

If anyone has concerns about inappropriate billing or extra billing, they can contact B.C.'s billing integrity program which will investigate the concern - <https://www.health.gov.bc.ca/exforms/bip/index.html>



## Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX

---

**From:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 9, 2019 10:51 AM  
**To:** Dix, Adrian HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX; Pham, Thuy HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth tourism - doctor fees

Minister Dix,

Fifth Estate producer continues to come to us with questions about their series on non-resident births. Please see info below that we plan to share.

Let me know if there are edits or concerns,

Meribeth

### Reporter

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, October 4, 2019 12:00 PM

### Request

Would you be able to tell me how the following doctors rank in terms of overall MSP billings compared to their family practice peers?

Brenda Patricia Tan  
Florina Tianyi Feng  
Xin-Yong Wang  
Caroline Ying-Me Wang

### Background

### Recommendation

Here are the amounts the three physicians have billed to MSP over the past three fiscal year from 2015/16 through 2017/18

Brenda Patricia Tan: 2017/18: \$465,552; 2016/17: \$602,766 ; 2015/16: \$497,786  
Florina Tianyi Feng: 2017/18: \$339,042; 2016/17: \$ 391,632; 2015/16: \$389,642  
Xin-Yong Wang: 2017/18: \$ 271,773; 2016/17: \$378,205; 2015/16: \$ 396,751  
Caroline Ying-Mei Wang: 2017/18: \$37,201; 2016/17: N/A 2015/16: \$27,332

Using [https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm\\_practitioner.pdf](https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm_practitioner.pdf) (Tables 4-1 through 4-3) - it would appear that all of these GPs except Caroline Ting-Mei Wang would be above the median expenditure in billing – with Tan close to the top for 16/17.

It is important to remember that the billings to the Medical Services Plan does not correlate directly to income, as it does not take into account any expenses for running a practice, such as staffing, rent and overhead.

If anyone has concerns about inappropriate billing or extra billing, they can contact B.C.'s billing integrity program which will investigate the concern - <https://www.health.gov.bc.ca/exforms/bip/index.html>

## **Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** May, Stephen GCPE:EX  
**Sent:** October 23, 2019 8:37 AM  
**To:** van Baarsen, Amanda HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** Burton, Meribeth GCPE:EX; Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX  
**Subject:** FW: HLTH Media Request: Birth Tourism - interview request

Heads-up on this request (She's working for CBC's the Fifth Estate on this one). If the Minister would like to go ahead with this – let us know what he would like as supporting materials. We have some time.

### **Reporter**

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, November 15, 2019 4:00 PM

### **Request**

I wanted to send an official request for an interview with the minister.

I am currently working as a producer with CBC The Fifth Estate. I am writing to request an on-camera sit-down interview with the Honourable Adrian Dix, Minister of Health.

We are producing a 25-minute segment for the program on the subject of birth tourism and we would very much like to include an interview with the minister about this subject.

We are seeking to conduct this interview in mid-November but we have some flexibility.

Please let me know if I can answer any questions.

### **Background**

### **Recommendation**

Page 45 of 94

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

NR

**Prevost, Jean-Marc GCPE:EX**

---

**From:** Moulton, Holly HLTH:EX  
**Sent:** August 29, 2018 4:54 PM  
**To:** Singh, Jasmyrn HLTH:EX; Hansen, Lucy HLTH:EX  
**Cc:** HLTH Corporate Operations HLTH:EX; Andrachuk, Andrea HLTH:EX  
**Subject:** Material for Premier and Minister's Briefing on Birth Tourism  
**Attachments:** Birth by Non-BC Residents\_Aug2018.docx; 1120367- IBN non-resident births in BC.docx

Please find attached material for tomorrow's briefing on Birth Tourism.

Kind regards,

Holly Moulton  
Director of Operations  
Office of the Deputy Minister  
Ministry of Health  
Tel: 250 952 2162

**MINISTRY OF HEALTH  
INFORMATION BRIEFING NOTE**

**CLIFF: 1120367**

**PREPARED FOR:** Honourable John Horgan, Premier of British Columbia - **FOR INFORMATION**

**TITLE:** Non-resident births in British Columbia

**PURPOSE:** To provide information on concerns related to non-resident mothers giving birth in British Columbia hospitals.

**BACKGROUND:**

The impact of non-resident births or so-called “birth tourism” in British Columbia has been the subject of several media reports focusing on immigration issues, access to care for British Columbia residents, and the health care system in general. These media reports also raise concerns over “baby houses”, businesses providing before and after birth care, being marketed to non-residents.

The majority of non-resident births in British Columbia take place at Richmond Hospital in the Vancouver Coastal Health Authority. Richmond Hospital serves a community where over 60 percent of the residents are immigrants, some of whom are at different stages of their immigration/residency process.

Tourists and visitors to British Columbia are not eligible for provincial health care benefits. The baby of a non-resident of Canada would need to be a resident for three months to qualify for Medical Services Plan.

A petition spearheaded by a Richmond woman and sponsored by Richmond Centre Conservative MP Alice Wong that opposed birth tourism was presented to the House of Commons on October 19, 2016, but was dismissed. A second petition by the same Richmond woman, sponsored by Steveston-Richmond East MP Joe Peschisolido, was initiated in March 2018.

**DISCUSSION:**

More than 44,000 babies are born in British Columbia each year, of which non-resident births account for less than 2 percent. In 2016/2017, 378 or 17 percent of women who gave birth at Richmond Hospital’s Birth Centre were non-residents who paid privately for their care. The vast majority gave a permanent address in China.

At Richmond Hospital, non-residents are required to make a pre-payment deposit of \$7,500 for a regular birth and \$13,000 for a caesarean birth. Non-residents are required to pay for any hospital stay costs, including medical care, for the mother and baby, including specialized care such as Neonatal Intensive Care Unit. Urgent and emergent care is not denied based on ability to pay, and health authorities have systems in place to collect compensation from visitors from Canada who use medical services.

In the past, Vancouver Coastal Health Authority has sent Licencing Officers to Birthing Houses to ensure compliance with licensing legislation. In the most recent Officer visit (more than a year ago) the site did not meet criteria for community care licensing under the *Community Care and Assisted Living Act*. The babies were directly cared for by the mothers, rather than by the operator.

All maternity units find themselves at capacity on occasion and have to divert mothers to other hospitals. Diversions due to capacity issues do not often occur, but when they do the decision is based on clinical need, not citizenship or ability to pay. Vancouver Coastal Health Authority has stated that they will continue to monitor the impact of non-resident births at Richmond Hospital and look into ways of better managing the demand.

**ADVICE:**

While the ministry in no way endorses or supports the marketing of maternity tourism, matters relating to immigration are the responsibility of the federal government. The Ministry of Health's priority continues to be supporting the provision of health care services to those in need.

---

**Program ADM/Division:** Ian Rongve, ADM, Hospital, Diagnostic and Clinical Services Division

**Telephone:** 250-952-3008

**Program Contact (for content):** Derek Rains, Director, Acute Care Policy and Access

**Drafter:** Heather Davidson, Manager, Acute Care Access and Planning

**Date:** August 29, 2018

**File Name with Path:**

## **5<sup>th</sup> Estate roll-up for Minister – birth tourism**

### **Requests for interview with Vancouver Coastal**

#### **From reporter:**

I just wanted to reiterate my interest in an interview. As you know I am producing a segment on the issue of birth tourism for The Fifth Estate. Data on this issue has shown that Richmond Hospital has the highest number of non-resident births in the entire country.

This issue is one of increasing interest across the country. When we spoke on the phone Matt highlighted the fact that you respond to all patients who need care regardless of their nationality. This is a fair point and one that we would be happy for you to make in an on-camera interview.

But as you are aware the concerns about the effect of birth tourism on the hospital level go deeper than the issue of treating patients or not. Critics, including nurses from your own hospital who have spoken through the BC Nurses Union, have raised concerns about how this phenomenon is affecting the quality of care, access to health care and workload.

Our program is a national platform for a representative of your health authority to speak to the issues that have been raised on this topic. I think it would be a great opportunity for you to respond. As you know we are a longer-format program which means we have more of an opportunity to go into depth than most news coverage.

As I mentioned to Matt on the phone I am available to speak further about what we are looking to discuss. I am happy to do whatever I can to facilitate this interview including giving your health authority nearly two months to prepare for a sit-down interview with our reporter since my first request in mid-September. As I mentioned to Matt we are looking to potentially shoot this interview in mid-November.

As we are a television show and written statements are unsatisfactory for our format. Since we will be discussing the Richmond hospital in relation to this subject, the absence of representative from the hospital or health authority will be conspicuous. If an interview is declined, we will have to include that fact in our report as well as the efforts we have made to make it possible for your health authority to take part.

Please let me know if I can answer any questions.

#### **Response:**

*Thank you for reaching out to our team regarding participation in the Fifth Estate segment on birth tourism.*

*As previously mentioned, we would be happy to provide you with the most recent statistics on non-resident births at Richmond Hospital, but we will gratefully decline an interview.*



*The role of Vancouver Coastal Health is to provide health care services.*

*I can send along some stats and materials if you like, which show the overall births at Richmond hospital have remained fairly consistent over the years.*

**OF NOTE:** VCH has offered to provide stats for Richmond Hospital – but the Fifth Estate has not taken her up on that.

FOI Request – this went to a media outlet – and we suspect that it went to the Fifth Estate.



HTH-2019-95074.pdf  
f

### **5<sup>th</sup> Estate Requests to Ministry.**

This has not been approved by Minister and not sent (it has been okayed by Vital Stats)

### **Reporter**

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

### **Deadline ASAP**

### **Request**

A briefing note on the subject of birth tourism was just released to me through FOI (Cliff 1120367). I have a question about it I was hoping you could answer.

It says that the vast majority of non-resident births at the Richmond hospital are from families with a permanent addresses in China. I hadn't seen a nationality breakdown in the past. Can you tell me how the Ministry came to that conclusion?

In that same briefing note it mentioned that B.C's vital statistics keep track of people giving birth here from other places. Are those statistics you can provide me or would I have to go through FOI?

### **Response:**

*Vital Statistics does track the Mother's residential address as provided by the hospital on the Notice of Birth, and the Mother's residential address as it was entered on the Birth Registration completed by the parents. This is not an exact measure, because differences can be caused by things such as residential moves, and it is only something we have started tracking in the past year.*

*The data that Vital Stats has would confirm the statement in the note regarding non-resident births that you have that stated “the vast majority gave a permanent address in China”.*

*Going from our data from the past 11 months using information from the Notice of Birth, it appears 409 out of 536 of the births to non-resident mothers were to those from China. That said, this data is preliminary, and as it is from a different source than other methods, so it would not be unusual for differences between this and other data sources. Most sources for foreign mothers giving birth use the Discharge Abstract Database – they define a foreign patient as a patient “who did not have a Canadian healthcare number and self-pay was recorded in the “responsibility for payment field”” – but does not break down information by country of origin*

**She has also asked for billing stats for certain physicians**

### **Reporter**

Annie Burns-Pieper, Reporter  
Freelancer  
[annieburnspieper@gmail.com](mailto:annieburnspieper@gmail.com)  
416-585-5123

**Deadline** Friday, October 4, 2019 12:00 PM

### **Request**

Would you be able to tell me how the following doctors rank in terms of overall MSP billings compared to their family practice peers?

Brenda Patricia Tan  
Florina Tianyi Feng  
Xin-Yong Wang  
Caroline Ying-Me Wang

### **Background**

### **Recommendation**

*Here are the amounts the three physicians have billed to MSP over the past three fiscal year from 2015/16 through 2017/18*

*Brenda Patricia Tan: 2017/18: \$465,552; 2016/17: \$602,766 ; 2015/16: \$497,786  
Florina Tianyi Feng: 2017/18: \$339,042; 2016/17: \$ 391,632; 2015/16: \$389,642  
Xin-Yong Wang: 2017/18: \$ 271,773; 2016/17: \$378,205; 2015/16: \$ 396,751  
Caroline Ying-Mei Wang: 2017/18: \$37,201; 2016/17: N/A 2015/16: \$27,332*

Using [https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm\\_practitioner.pdf](https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/medical-services-plan/irm_practitioner.pdf) (Tables 4-1 through 4-3) - it would appear that all of these GPs except Caroline Ting-Mei Wang would be above the median expenditure in billing – with Tan close to the top for 16/17.

*It is important to remember that the billings to the Medical Services Plan does not correlate directly to income, as it does not take into account any expenses for running a practice, such as staffing, rent and overhead.*

*If anyone has concerns about inappropriate billing or extra billing, they can contact B.C.'s billing integrity program which will investigate the concern - <https://www.health.gov.bc.ca/exforms/bip/index.html>*

She has followed this up with a request for a list of doctors who have been investigated by the Billing Integrity Program or subject to audits? The following is a proposed statement to that:

*"It is important for us at the Ministry to balance people's appropriate curiosity regarding the billing practices of practitioners and the personal privacy of those practitioners. The Billing Integrity Program works through an education and mediation model to work with practitioners so that they stay in compliance. When a situation arises where a practitioner has been proven to not be in compliance, that information will be published. But, similar to the Canada Revenue Agency, it is not appropriate to provide a list of practitioners that are being audited."*

#### **Analysis:**

s.13

The following messaging (provided to the reporter) would then be very important.

*If anyone has concerns about inappropriate billing or extra billing, they can contact B.C.'s billing integrity program which will investigate the concern - <https://www.health.gov.bc.ca/exforms/bip/index.html>*

Page 53 of 94 to/à Page 55 of 94

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright

## STATUS REPORT FOR MINISTER OF HEALTH

Title	Update on Birth Tourism
Reporting Period	As of November 18, 2019
Reporting Branch/Division	Provincial Hospital and Lab Services Division
Key Contact	Ian Rongve

### BACKGROUND

- Birth tourism is not supported by the Ministry of Health; however, hospitals will not deny service to any woman requiring maternity care.
- Concerns have been raised at times regarding hospital occupancy, cost recovery, access to publicly funded services, and a lack of regulation of birth houses.
- The Ministry has undertaken a comprehensive analysis of birth tourism in BC including:
  - Discussions with Vancouver Coastal Health, Medical Director for Obstetrics and Gynecology and Richmond Hospital program staff.
  - An extensive legal review by Legal Services at the Attorney General that involved the *Hospital Act*, the *Hospital Insurance Act* and the *Community Care and Assisted Living Act*. A legal review was also completed with respect to utilizing common law agreements.
  - Internal Ministry consultations with Hospitals, Diagnostic and Workforce Analytics Branch, Community Care Facility Licencing Unit, and the Eligibility, Compliance and Enforcement Unit.
- The analysis and options paper for discussion will be forthcoming to the Minister's Office.
- Birth tourism is an immigration issue that would need to be addressed at the federal level.
- In BC, it would be very difficult to prohibit birth tourism to non-residents through regulatory options. Efforts in this regard risk legitimizing birth houses and are not recommended.

### DISCUSSION

- Under the federal *Citizenship Act*, a person has the right to citizenship if they are born in Canada. Women who are non-residents of Canada give birth in British Columbia (BC) each year for a variety of reasons, including premature/unexpected labour, or to obtain citizenship for their child, which provides entitlement to publicly funded services.
- Based on media reports, Ministry conversations with program staff at Richmond Hospital (RH) and prior investigations of birth houses in Richmond, birth houses appear to offer pregnant non-residents temporary room and board for several months before and after birth, providing limited non-medical care. Birth houses are not currently regulated under any health specific legislation or municipal business licensing.

- Hospital occupancy due to non-resident births does not appear to be impacting the ability to accommodate resident births.
- Non-residents are required to pay for any hospital stay costs, including medical care for the mother and baby, as well as any specialized care costs. They are also required to make a pre-payment deposit of \$10,000 for a regular birth and \$15,000 for a caesarean birth. Any additional clinical service costs incurred by the non-resident (i.e. obstetrician, anesthetist for epidural, pediatrician, etc.) are billed directly to the non-resident patient by the physician.

## **RESPONSE**

- Matters relating to immigration are the responsibility of the federal government.
- The Ministry's priority and the priority of the health authorities and health care providers is to make sure that nobody is denied the care they need at any British Columbia hospital, be it a patient with a broken leg or a pregnant mother and her new baby.

The Ministry in no way endorses or supports the marketing of maternity tourism.

Page 58 of 94 to/à Page 82 of 94

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.13

Page 83 of 94 to/à Page 85 of 94

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright



# QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

## BIRTH TOURISM

November 2019

---

The issue of “birth tourism” may be brought up by the opposition during the spring session at the legislature.

The impact of non-resident births or so-called “birth tourism” at Richmond Hospital has been the subject of media and political discussion regarding immigration issues, access to care for Richmond residents and the costs to individual mothers and the health care system in general.

An April 2018 lawsuit against a non-resident mother for unpaid medical bills sparked further media interest. In August 2018, the federal Conservative Party passed a resolution to end birthright citizenship in Canada.

### **Q1. What is birth tourism?**

- Birth tourism is when pregnant non-residents come to Canada to give birth with the purpose of their baby gaining Canadian citizenship.

### **Q2. Can the Ministry stop birth tourism?**

- Matters of immigration are the responsibility of the federal government and for them to address.
- The Ministry’s role is to make sure that our hospitals deliver the best care to all patients who need their care and services.
- We are not going to turn doctors and nurses and health care workers into immigration officers.

### **Q3. Will the Ministry implement a ban on tourist birth’s in B.C.’s hospitals?**

- We are not going to turn doctors and nurses and health care workers into immigration officers.
- If someone needs care our hospitals will provide that – doing otherwise would not be consistent with our core values.

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

### **Q4. What percentage of births in BC are foreign births?**

- In 2018/2019 there were 454 non-resident births at Richmond Hospital's Birth Centre – down from 469 in 2017/18.
- That's 23% off all births at Richmond Hospital. Provincially, less than 2% of women who gave birth are non-residents.

### **Q5. Where do most of the non-resident births in B.C. occur?**

- Most births of non-resident mothers in British Columbia occur at Richmond Hospital.

### **Q6. What is BC's stance on birthright citizenship?**

- Matters relating to immigration and citizenship are the responsibility of the federal government - the Ministry of Health's priority is to support the provision of health care services to those in need.
- For concerns around immigration and citizenship, individuals must engage in those discussions with the federal government

### **Q7. Are there tax dollar implications for British Columbians?**

- Non-residents of Canada are required to pay for any hospital stay costs, including medical care for the mother and baby, including specialized care such as neonatal intensive care unit (NICU).
- VCH, as an organizational entity invoiced non-residents for approximately \$45 million for all non-resident services in 2017/18 and collected about 80% of that amount.
- For maternity cases at Richmond Hospital, the recovery rates are higher. Last year 93% of non-resident billing was recovered.
- In 2018/19, VCH has invoiced non-residents for approximately \$5.4 million in maternity services at Richmond Hospital (down from \$6.2M in 2017/18), and recovered approximately 95% of that amount. (The larger value maternity cases arising from complications and not paid in full, skew the VCH recovery statistics).
- Effective November 1, 2018, the deposit amounts at VCH were increased to \$10,000 for a vaginal birth and \$16,000 for a caesarean birth. Non-residents are required to pay all hospital costs and medical care for the mother and baby.

### **Q8. Are British Columbians being bumped or re-directed because of non-resident births?**

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

- Diversions due to capacity issues happen in many departments not just labour and delivery. The decision to divert and whom to divert is based on clinical care needs, not citizenship. Sometimes, diversions are for care reasons. In the case of BC Women's – a patient may be transferred for a higher level of care.
- Diversions happen the other way too. Labour and delivery cases are redirected to Richmond Hospital when other sites are at capacity.
- Maternity cases fluctuate greatly, depending on demand, which makes them very different than other hospital units.
- Overall the number of births at Richmond Hospital has remained consistent or declined slightly since 2014.
- Vancouver Coastal Health is continuing to monitor hospital capacity issues and discussing better ways of managing the demand.
- Richmond Hospital serves a community where more than 60% of the residents are immigrants, some of whom are at different stages of their immigration/residency process.
- Women intending to use Richmond Hospital's maternity services are encouraged to pre-register six to eight weeks prior to their due date. This may not reduce demand on services, but it will help the health authority be more proactive in its planning.

### **Q9. What is BC's stance on Birth Houses? Private care provided to patients?**

- The ministry in no way endorses or supports the marketing of birth tourism.
- A "Birth House" often refers to a space (often a residential house) where pregnant non-Canadian resident women stay leading up to the birth of their child and return to prior to their return home.
- Any facility providing a certain level of health care services is required to be licensed under the Community Care and Assisted Living Act to ensure patient care and safety.
- The Ministry is not aware of any of these facilities providing that level of care. Previous visits by Vancouver Coastal to expected birth houses by inspectors found that there was no licensable care as defined under the Community Care and Assisted Living Act being provided at Richmond residences.
- If these residences have business licenses it is a municipal responsibility, and not something the Ministry of Health has authority over.

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

**Q10.** Why are the numbers being reported by Stats Canada, the provincial government and the federal governments different?

- The Ministry of Health is aware of the data discrepancy and is considering possibilities as why this is so.
- The Ministry of Health relies on our provincial data.

**Q11.** Can government stop the marketing of birth tourism?

- The ministry in no way endorses or supports the marketing of birth tourism.
- This is a larger conversation however that must involve the federal government if there is to be proper enforcement.
- In Canada, freedom of speech rights must also be considered regarding government stopping marketing or advertising of any type.

**Q12.** Why don't you make these non-residents pay more?

- Non-residents of Canada are required to pay the costs associated with their care just as we are when we are visiting other countries. Canadian taxpayers are not being asked to pay these costs.
- Non-residents of Canada who present for birth at a Lower Mainland hospital are required to make a pre-payment deposit, except in emergencies. For example, VCH requires a deposit of \$10,000 for a vaginal birth and \$16,000 for a birth by C-section.
- Charges to non-residents of Canada to give birth in a British Columbia hospital are based on rates set annually by the Ministry of Health and the health authorities.
- All revenue related to non-resident of Canada births are put back into the health-care system.

**Q13.** Why don't you just have hospitals refuse service to these people?

- Our job is to provide medical care to people in need.
- The ministry's priority and the priority of health authorities and health-care providers is to make sure that nobody is denied the care they need at any British Columbia hospital, whether the patient has a broken leg or is delivering a baby
- Those are our values. People first. Patients first.

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

- Health care workers are not immigration officers. That is not their role, nor should it ever be.

**Q14.** What about mothers who are diverted from their home hospital because of birth tourism?

- Hospitals in BC act as a network.
- Patients are diverted for a wide variety of reasons and there is no evidence to indicate diversions are due to the number of non-residents giving birth.
- The need for maternity beds fluctuates greatly depending on demand, which makes them different than other hospital units. All maternity units find themselves at capacity from time-to-time and have to divert mothers to other hospitals.
- From April 2018 to August 2019 (17 months), Richmond Hospital diverted 11 patients – seven women who needed a higher level of care and four who diverted because of capacity issues. This is normal practice for maternity hospitals to provide safe care to all patients. Richmond Hospital also regularly accepts patients from other sites such as BC Women's (and again are often transferred where the patient may require a higher level of care), Lions Gate and St. Paul's to assist with their capacity challenges.

**Q15.** But aren't the number of non-resident births increasing in Richmond?

- Actually, there was a slight decrease in the total number of private paying non-residents who gave birth at Richmond Hospital last year.
- Women who gave birth at Richmond Hospital's Birth Centre who were non-residents and who paid privately for their care:
  - 2018/19: 454 (23.1%) of 1,967 women;
  - 2017/18: 469 (22.1%) of 2,126 women;
  - 2016/17: 379 (17.2%) of 2,206 women; and
  - 2015/16: 299 (15.5%) of 1,923 women.

**Q16.** Do non-resident mothers abandon or surrender babies at Richmond Hospital?

We are not aware of this happening.

As you know the Ministry of Children and Family Development is responsible for children in care.

MCFD does not keep statistics on non-resident children in care.

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

**Q17.** What about non-resident babies with significant health challenges? Are they left behind?

We are not aware of this happening.

Any newborn who needs care – receives care. Our health care professionals are highly skilled and trained to provide medical attention. That is what we do.

**Q18.** Are you aware that there are BC doctors advertising birth tourism in China?

I am not.

**Q19.** What can the province do to stop doctors from advertising and profiting from birth tourism?

If there are concerns about the ethics or professionalism of any doctor in B.C., the appropriate place to bring those concerns is the College of Physicians and Surgeons. The College has an open and transparent investigation process and where applicable varying degrees of correction action can be taken – up and including the termination of a license to practice medicine.

**Q20.** What about billing irregularities – are birth tourism doctors double dipping MSP?

BC's Integrity Billing program is independent and conducts random audits, has ongoing monitoring of billing practices and can launch purposeful investigations.

If there are MSP irregularities, program staff work with physicians or other medical professionals to resolve small matters.

More complex investigations may be sent to the Medical Services Commission for hearings or dispute resolution.

Ethics and fairness are critically important for health care providers, so these independent bodies ensure billing standards are being met.

**\*IF pressed about four specific doctors:** We would not be able to speak about individuals as BC privacy laws. Even to confirm or deny a report or investigation or audit underway.

We can only speak in general terms.

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

If someone believes a medical professional is abusing MSP, they can Register a Complaint on our website [health.gov.bc.ca](http://health.gov.bc.ca)

### **Q.21** Can you suspend privileges to those doctors at the health authority level?

Most often action taken against doctors is appropriately meted out by the College of Physicians and Surgeons. But there are avenues for health authorities to suspend or restrict privileges.

Complaints may come from Patient Care Quality Review offices, patients directly, by staff or executive. Investigation of those complaints would go to the Health Authority Board of Directors. A legal process would follow. And appeals could follow that.

### **Q22.** Is Richmond Hospital relying on birth tourism revenue? How much more do the non-residents pay compared to BC residents and out of town residents?

All hospitals and health authorities are accountable to the residents they serve and to government and expect to be compensated for the services they provide, whether through MSP, private insurance companies, or through direct payment from clients. In terms of how much non-resident pay compared to BC residents, we are fortunate to live in BC and Canada, where our medical premiums are subsidized. If you have properly registered for medical coverage in BC and you have a baby here, you leave the hospital with a new baby. If you are a non-resident of Canada without private medical coverage, you can expect to pay a deposit for your birth. Of course, every birth is different and the deposit amounts may vary slightly from hospital to hospital, but at Richmond Hospital for example, you would pay a deposit of \$10,000 for a normal delivery and \$16,00 for a C-section delivery.

### **Q23.** Are doctors having trouble getting paid for non-resident births? Do you know how often it happens that they don't get paid because bills are not paid?

MSP does not track separate bills. Anyone who is a non-beneficiary is not registered in the Medical Services Plan, any billing for these services would be done by the doctors and their offices. Collection efforts would have to be done through their office as well.

Page 93 of 94 to/à Page 94 of 94

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright