

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, December 11, 2015 9:12 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: FW:

Honorable Premier Clark,

I expressed my dissatisfaction regarding foreign property ownership with you and your government in the past.

Now that the down payment requirements will be raised to 10% it will kill any possibility for many young first time buyers even more.

Foreign buyers of Vancouver Homes up by 70%.

Shame on you and your government.

You were supposed to be for the families, which families I wonder.

I'd rather vote NDP than ever again for you and your party.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, December 9, 2015 10:22 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing in Vancouver

>

> As a native Canadian and a resident of British Columbia it is distressing to see the housing situation in Vancouver.

> Pricing is so excessive a single family dwelling is inaccessible for a Canadian family.

s.22

> "Affordable" housing does not only affect Vancouver's poor but hard working young professionals who are now just entering the housing market after their post secondary and graduate education.

> The government has allowed foreign investment in our housing market which in turn has inflated prices.

> We must curtail this influx with a tax structure to prohibit shelter investments.

s.22

> Why does the Canadian federal,provincial,municipal governments not reciprocate?

>

> Please address this housing issue immediately.

Lack of affordable housing affects all Canadians.

>

> Sent from my iPad



From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, December 17, 2015 10:15 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing in Vancouver

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

It is important that any action taken to address this issue be considered carefully, as we want to avoid any unintended consequences in a complex market. It is critical that any potential action must be designed to help first-time buyers enter the market, while at the same time protecting the equity of existing homeowners.

We understand you have some concerns regarding foreign investment and foreign ownership of property. Please be assured we have noted your comments and your input will be included in any related discussions.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, December 8, 2015 7:53 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Vancouver housing prices

Hello Ms. Clark,

s.22  
s.22

However, I am appalled by the ridiculous costs of owning a home in Vancouver (and equally concerned about the costs of renting office space in Vancouver). Many of the other people in my generation are in the same boat. It does not have to be like this. Though many factors are at play, the prices in Vancouver can be directly linked to an influx of capital from foreigners and to rampant speculation. This situation is greatly beneficial for a large number of foreigners, and for the locals who had been able to afford multiple homes as investment, but it is not beneficial for the vast majority of locals who are just looking for a place to call home.

As BC's Premier, you have the power and responsibility to act on this issue. What will you do to help address this issue?

Thanks for your time.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, December 17, 2015 9:50 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver housing prices

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

It is important that any action taken to address this issue be considered carefully, as we want to avoid any unintended consequences in a complex market. It is critical that any potential action must be designed to help first-time buyers enter the market, while at the same time protecting the equity of existing homeowners.

We understand you have some concerns regarding foreign investment and foreign ownership of property. Please be assured we have noted your comments and your input will be included in any related discussions.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, November 20, 2015 11:56 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: What are you doing about the skyrocketing housing prices in Vancouver?

From: s.22  
Sent: November 11, 2015 10:51 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: What are you doing about the skyrocketing housing prices in Vancouver?

Dear Christy Clark:

This housing market in Vancouver has gotten completely out of control. Statistics are showing that the world's wealthiest individuals are buying up our homes and neighborhoods and using them as bank accounts to park their offshore money, often undeclared money. While the citizens of this city, who pay taxes and VOTED YOU IN have been put out of reach and cannot afford to buy a home in their own city for their families to live and grow in.

Young people and professionals are leaving our city because it has become so unaffordable. You have allowed our city to become the 2nd most unaffordable housing market in the world! Statistics also show that many of the multimillion dollar homes that foreign investors are buying up are sitting empty, as many of them do not even occupy or live in the homes. Furthermore, they do pay income taxes or contribute to the communities and neighborhoods of our city!

Your inaction of this issue is deplorable. Other governments around the world have stepped in and have taken action on foreign ownership and housing prices. The Globe and Mail wrote an article on Oct 31, 2015 and provided possible solutions as follows:

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/rob-commentary/mr-trudeau-please-help-vancouver-achieve-a-rational-housing-market/article27051294/>

- Enact foreign-ownership restrictions.
- Tighten loopholes that allow residents to funnel money untaxed from abroad.
- Charge higher taxes to foreign owners (property transfer taxes, annual property taxes and capital gains taxes)
- Strengthen the Canada Revenue Agency's capacity to audit foreign capital and increase penalties for non-compliance.
- Work with Quebec to eliminate or reform its immigrant investor program.
- And finally, work with cities to improve public transportation and unlock more liveable neighbourhoods outside the city core

Which of these solutions, or other alternatives, are you exploring to address this issue?

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, November 27, 2015 3:15 PM  
To: s.22  
Cc: Minister, FIN FIN:EX  
Subject: FW: What are you doing about the skyrocketing housing prices in Vancouver?

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

You have made some specific suggestions regarding foreign investment and taxation, so on your behalf, we are sharing your correspondence with the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance. Please be assured your input will be included in the Minister's ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for writing and hope this response is helpful.

cc: Honourable Mike De Jong

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, November 22, 2015 1:55 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: "families first" and home ownership

Madame Premier

I am greatly disappointed in the fact that no government, local or federal has done anything to limit the purchasing of our residential properties by off shore asians.

When you first came to office, your motto was "families first" Our local canadian families are not able to afford to buy a house mostly because the asian purchasing have caused such increase in prices. At every open house there are many asians showing up and very willing to part with their cash, causing bidding wars. From the realtor's mouth - many of the houses they've sold to asians remain unoccupied (North Delta). Realtors are asked by these asians to make an offer and leave the \$\$\$ blank so it can be filled in after the other offers are known. This is WRONG and our government has done nothing to stop or curb this greed and lawlessness.

It seems that our governments are no longer in the business of governing but rather they behave like big corporations in business for profit.

Your government has done nothing to reduce the burden of the 'property transfer tax' on families who have to bear huge mortgages if they happen to get a home. Your government sees only the \$\$\$\$ signs and reels in the profits. The asians have no problem with this tax. Maybe it's their only contribution to our economy if you can call it that.

I trust that you will recognize this folly and act to do something before our province and country is no longer owned by local canadians. We have already sold so much of our resources to the same ones buying up our homes. Some invasion already !!!

Thank you

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Wednesday, November 18, 2015 5:14 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: ,s.22

Hello Christy,

I want to express my frustrations with you regarding the soaring real estate prices in the lower mainland and Canada as a whole s.22  
s.22

I find it extremely unjust that individuals and corporations are buying multimillion dollar homes and paying little to no income tax / transfer taxes via loopholes. s.22  
s.22

s.22 s.22  
s.22 A home used to mean something to  
people now they are traded like common stocks on the international stage.

Something needs to be done to fix our clearly broken system before it's too late. We are quickly becoming renters in our own country. Please do something before home ownership becomes a fantasy.

Regards,

s.22

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 26, 2015 3:20 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: s.22

Hello<sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investors and the Property Transfer Tax (PTT). Officials in the Ministry of Finance are currently conducting their annual review of existing tax policies in preparation for the provincial budget and the PTT will be part of that review. Please be assured your input will be included in those related discussions.

Again, thank you for writing and hope this response is helpful.



From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 3:15 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Please protect residents from foreign ownership

Dear Premier Clark,

Now that there is proof, can you please tell me what you plan to do about this? Empty neighbourhoods, houses bought to launder money, locals who cannot afford to live here, tax fraud. This is a recipe for social and political disaster. You cannot ignore this any longer and action is urgently needed. Please tell me your plans to address this.

Regards,  
s.22

Vancouver real estate is a Mainland Chinese buyers' market, study says

Groundbreaking study shows 70 per cent of detached homes sold in a six-month period on Vancouver's west side went to Mainland Chinese buyers; many of them housewives or students with little income

<http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html>

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:10 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Please protect residents from foreign ownership

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 9:19 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Foreign Ownership of Vancouver Real Estate

Ms. Clark,

I am writing to communicate my concerns over the residential real estate market in Vancouver S.  
s.22

s.22, the 'anecdotal' evidence of immense amounts of foreign wealth flowing into the market has been overwhelming. Empty homes everywhere serve as parking lots for businessmen from mainland China. Recently released data to adds even more evidence that the high end in Vancouver real estate is dominated by foreign (Chinese) buyers.

It is bad s.22  
s.22

but the home ownership picture out there is to bleak to imagine it for years to come.

s.22

I have watched as you have argued stridently that the impact of foreign speculators on the housing market is minimal, citing data that foreign purchases represent only 5% of investment in Vancouver real estate. I challenge that data and encourage you to bring on people who are capable of following the money trail - as the definition of 'foreign money' in those figures was almost certainly skewed to minimize the impact (as validated in the study above). It was particularly distressing to know that the data you cited in this discussion was provided to you by a real estate firm - how hard do you expect them to dig for evidence that, if uncovered, will ultimately undermine their own business?

There will be many vested interests who will demonize any move to stem the flood of foreign money into our Vancouver's residential real estate market, claiming it will do much more harm than good. However every conversation that I have had leads me to believe that foreign buyers

are not particularly price sensitive (look at the prices they are paying just to leave homes vacant!) and that a sizable tax on foreign purchases of property will do little to stem demand. Such a tax would bring in potentially hundreds of millions of dollars in revenue to mitigate the impacts on the people who are being priced entirely out of the market.

The status quo benefits foreign buyers at the expense of the residents of Vancouver, particularly the young. I challenge you to stand up for your constituents and do something to address this totally unsustainable situation.

I would welcome the opportunity to discuss this proposal further.

Kind regards,  
s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:31 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Foreign Ownership of Vancouver Real Estate

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 12:37 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Regulate foreign real estate ownership

Christy,

Hello and I hope all is well. s.22 I am reaching out to you with trust that you give this subject the serious consideration it deserves.

As the title of this email indicates, as a province it's past time for us to take immediate actions that reduce and restrict the inflow of foreign capital into our housing and agricultural land market. We are approaching, and some might argue are already in, an affordability crisis. The global economy and free market are running against the interests of current and future generation British Columbians with respect to housing and agricultural land affordability.

s.22 BC community where present and future generations of British Columbians who live, work, and contribute taxes and soul to my local economy and community can afford to buy a home as well. The same argument and request applies to agricultural land.

Similar protective measures have been taken in other jurisdictions such as Thailand, Australia, Switzerland, China and with respect to agricultural land Alberta, Saskatchewan, Manitoba and Quebec. So, why not BC?

Please work to put regulations in place to ensure this happens over the next term.

Thank you sincerely,

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:34 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Regulate foreign real estate ownership

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 11:05 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: housing affordability

Dear Premier Clark,

I trust the article below has caught the attention of your office.

<http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html>

s.22

8.22 who has a great income and still find myself unable to afford to enter the housing market, I trust that our elected officials are doing their utmost to represent the interests of their constituents, and not other interest groups. Ignoring this issue is no longer an option. There are several regions around the world that have placed limits or additional taxes on foreign ownership of real estate, without damaging equity of existing home owners. Something must be done about housing affordability in the Lower Mainland - the current model is not sustainable. I trust we will soon see real progress on this issue.

Regards,

s.22



From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 1:54 PM  
To s.22  
Subject: FW: housing affordability

Thank you, s.22, for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Thursday, October 29, 2015 12:36 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Lower mainland housing, immigration, tax policy  
October 29, 2015  
Premier Clark

As I watch housing get increasingly unaffordable if not outright insane I feel compelled to comment. This aberration is probably driven by 3 factors. The lower mainland is a very desirable place to live, although this may change to a degree if the cost of housing is not addressed. Secondly, very accommodative monetary policy (low rates, government incentives via CHMC, RRSP usage to name a couple). Making more funds available in this environment is counter productive, it just pushes prices higher. Third and probably largest, massive unmonitored foreign capitol inflows.

I believe for southwestern BC to be viable and vibrant into the future it must be affordable to the people who live and work in the city, be they entrepreneurs, professionals or other groups vital to a city's wellbeing. Wealthy foreigners who treat our residential real estate as means of money laundering and speculation are detrimental to the long term future. Personally I would like to see BC property ownership limited to Canadian citizens, if you will not do that at least significantly increase the property transfer tax for non Canadians; 50% would be fine and include corporations as well. New arrivals seem to have hundreds of thousands to throw around in bully bids, let it flow into provincial coffers instead.

It is my understanding that the Quebec immigrant investor program is still in place, yet the vast majority of these immigrants come to BC. So Quebec gets the funds and BC provides the services. I don't think we can stop them from living here but under no circumstances should they allowed BC Medicare, drivers licenses etc. If nothing else this may bring enough attention to get it fixed.

Another area where the province is losing revenue is new residents not declaring worldwide income. While the CRA is a federal responsibility as soon the new cabinet is in place BC needs to start lobbying to investigate people not paying their share. I paid \$22 provincial income tax last year and it is infuriating to see new comers in multi million dollar homes that I cannot afford, very expensive cars and very little declared income.

Bringing home prices back to more stable levels is in the long term best interests of British Columbians. Suggesting that every owner is entitled to lottery sized gains on their homes is misguided. If things keep going on the current trajectory the cost of housing will induce many of the best and brightest to seek opportunities where cost of living is better balanced. If your government continues to pretend there is not a problem, any party that will address this issue s.22 s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 1:44 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Lower mainland housing, immigration, tax policy

Thank you, <sup>s.22</sup> for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: October 8, 2015 5:47 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: Illegal housing

Dear Premier Clark,

s.22

Second, the housing issue and the reported illegal activities related to it are essentially driving British Columbians from the province. Please stand up. Call the legislature back for an emergency session and pass the legislation to prevent foreign investors from continuing to put hard working families out of ever being able to own a home. It can be done. The Australians are doing it. BC can do it to.

Third, the electorate is not stupid. We are a well educated electorate who are painfully aware of what is being done to us and the lack of political leadership illustrated thus far to allow this to continue.

Sincerely, s.22

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/globe-debate/vancouver-real-estate-dont-hold-your-breath-for-a-crackdown/article26730192/>

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/economy/housing/the-real-estate-beat/foreign-investors-avoid-taxes-by-buying-real-estate-in-canada/article26683767/>

<http://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2015/may/03/foreign-investors-face-crackdown-on-australian-property-purchases>

<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-3064941/Australia-crack-foreign-investors-buying-property-revealed-Chinese-owner-buyer-forced-sell-one-Australias-expensive-mansions.html>

On Oct 15, 2015, at 3:28 PM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

Thank you for your concern regarding the property transfer tax. We have noted your input and have shared it with our Minister of Finance. Officials in the ministry are including all public feedback in their ongoing discussions as we review existing tax policies and work to prepare for the next provincial budget.

We appreciate the time you have taken to write and hope this response is helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, October 21, 2015 8:02 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Illegal housing

Saskatchewan is enacting legislation that BC needs to stop the sell off of the province to foreign buyers. Please show some leadership.

<http://www.leaderpost.com/business/agriculture/rules+farm+ownership+saskatchewan/11454990/story.html>

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, October 14, 2015 5:16 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign investors avoid taxes by buying real estate in Canada - The Globe and Mail

And you have no intentions of doing anything about this? Shame on you/

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/foreign-investors-avoid-taxes-by-buying-real-estate-in-canada/article26683767/>

[Search]

Login

Register

- Select City

SubscribeHelp

- Home

- News

- Opinion

- Business

- Investing

- Sports

- Life

- Arts

- Technology

- Drive

- Video

- National

- Politics

- British Columbia

- Alberta

- Toronto

- World

- Video

Try Globe Unlimited - 1 month for just 99¢

And get unlimited access on all your devices

See my options!

- Home»

- News»

- British Columbia

HOUSING

Foreign investors avoid taxes through Canadian real estate

A house at 3692 West 33rd Avenue is pictured in Vancouver on Oct. 3.

ALL PHOTOS BY DARRYL DYCK FOR THE GLOBE AND MAIL

Wealthy buyers taking advantage of loopholes by putting homes in the name of relatives or corporations

KATHY TOMLINSON

The Globe and MailLast updated: Wednesday, Oct. 07, 2015 5:22PM EDT

-

-

-

-

-

- 5105 Shares

- [PrintLicense this article](#)

- 149 Comments

Copyright



Page 027 to/à Page 032

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, October 15, 2015 10:38 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca; thomas.mulcair@parl.gc.ca; stephen.harper@parl.gc.ca

Subject: More foreign money coming into Vancouver

Christy Clark,

This is a JOKE!! More foreign money coming in. You got to be kidding me. Stop scoring brownie points saying the econmoy is strong. It is strong based on what??? s.22

s.22 So we are going to be priced out in fraser valley and need to buy an additional vehicle only to have to pay a toll to cross the bridge. Is this the way of punishing familes?? `s.22

See link: <http://www.ctvnews.ca/canada/ugly-downside-to-economic-growth-housing-prices-soar-in-vancouver-1.2610943>

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, October 7, 2015 11:09 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; stephen.harper@parl.gc.ca;  
gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca

Cc: thomas.mulcair@parl.gc.ca; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca

Subject: Foreigners avoid tax while local Vancouverites pay their tax!

Dear Stephen Harper, Christy Clark and Gregor Robertson,

Foreign investors have been avoiding to pay taxes here in Metro Vancouver. I would like to ask you all how is this possible under your 'watch'. Not only are local Vancouverites pay all their hard earn money to your taxes but why do they get a break? To me this is a red flag. How could a person buy a 3 million dollar house and only claim they make \$36k? C'mon. Many don't even pay any income tax. Be reasonable here. This is a joke! This is an embarrassment. Everyday local Vancouver rites are getting screwed as everybody knows foreigners are driving up the prices of houses. You guys are SOLD OUT! How can this happen?? Like seriously....Please read article. There are so many loopholes! We as Canadians are getting screwed and foreigners are laughing at us!

Please see article: <http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/economy/housing/the-real-estate-beat/foreign-investors-avoid-taxes-by-buying-real-estate-in-canada/article26683767/>

<http://www.cknw.com/2015/10/07/many-of-metro-vancouvers-off-shore-buyers-practicing-tax-avoidance-investigation-finds/>

Regards,

s.22

From s.22

Sent: Wednesday, October 7, 2015 10:31 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: [contact@andrewwilkinson.ca](mailto:contact@andrewwilkinson.ca)

Subject: Vancouver home ownership

Dear Premier Clark,

I read with dismay the article in today's Globe and Mail about foreign ownership of Vancouver real estate. s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

Now, as I learn more about what is driving this unprecedented increase in property values, I am angry. First, the loop hole of placing properties in shell companies to escape paying the property purchase tax is egregious. When will you close this loop hole? Second, that many of the new homeowners of these luxury properties are not paying income tax is revolting. This is likely more of a federal issue but I expect provincial leaders to speak out and demand action.

Regards,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, October 15, 2015 3:12 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver home ownership

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We have noted your comments about the property transfer tax and have shared those with our Minister of Finance. Officials are including all public feedback in those related discussions as we review existing tax policies and work to prepare for the next provincial budget.

We appreciate the time you have taken to write and hope this response is helpful.

From s.22  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 11:10 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Escalating Property Values

Hello Premier Clark,

s.22

It now appears that this government has a huge election issue it is facing and from what I can see in the media, very little is being done about it. Escalating Property Values. The rate of property value escalation is historic and unheard of, while it may be very good for people that already own their own homes (as I do), it is not good for those that have yet to enter the market (as in my children). It is well known that offshore money is behind the rapid rise in property values yet nothing is being done to slow the price increases down. On top of that, the recent trade mission that you went on included two real estate agents - from an optics point of view that was a very poor move, regardless if the agents were focusing on commercial property - this will come back in negative ads against the Liberals. I fail to understand why it is so difficult for your government to enact policies to help curb off shore ownership similar to what other countries have done (Australia is one example). Furthermore, something must be done to properly regulate the real estate agents as I feel that they are unable to do it themselves (s.22 s.22 . From an optics point of view - and that is what the electorate will see - it appears that this government is doing very little to "look out" for the public in regards to this pricing pressure. You can guarantee that the NDP will make this a huge election issue as well as they will make promises to help curb the foreign investment.

I am not saying stop all property sales, but what I am saying is that some, but by no means all, guidelines must be put in place such as:

1. offshore buyers must provide verifiable income information
2. offshore buyers must live in the residence for a set period per year (say 4-6 months per year)
3. offshore buyers must file Canadian Income Tax returns
4. Offshore buyers must provide a valid address for their mail that is not "shared" by a multitude of other persons etc
5. Shadow flipping can continue as long as property transfer taxes are paid for each flip
6. No tax shelters for the purchase of business or residential properties - it is my understanding that the Bentall properties were purchased with a tax shelter which avoided property purchase taxes being paid (I am not positive on this though)
7. Restrict offshore ownership of farmland
8. Severe penalties for realtors and the office that they work out of for fraud or misleading on sales (purchases)
9. Offshore buyers must declare where the money to purchase a property came from - help prevent money laundering and use very strict guidelines for this

10. Enforce existing and new regulations with very high fines and penalties - such as forced order of sale of properties etc

11. No offshore advertising of listings - while admittedly this will have a very small effect as anyone can go online and see listings in any areas. This will at least look like a rule has been put in place for realtors to only advertise in BC/Canada. Issue a significant fine to any realtor or agency that advertises outside of Canada. Look to Quebec for how to draft this type of regulation - look at their measures to ensure French language usage as a guideline so as to avoid the freedom of expression or other argument

These are just a few things that could be done to help with the situation and on top of that the government would at least look like they are trying to do something. This may also generate significantly more tax revenue for both the province and federally. While I am not naïve enough to think that this will solve all of the issues with regards to the increases in property values, it would definitely go a long ways towards easing the minds of what the public perceives towards this issue. Please for the sake of optics review this email and use it for helping to find a solution for what will be a major election issue. Optically, the Liberal government must take steps to appear to be responding to these concerns of the public.

Education is a whole other issue and that one I will, for the most part, leave alone, suffice to say that some school districts are in desperate need of additional classroom spaces, and even though the government announced a number of new schools recently, they need to finance far more spaces. I fully agree with the premise of full occupancy at schools (why pay for something not used), but you cannot keep announcing new projects every year and then not deliver them. This is another election issue that the government is coming out badly on - and everything is how the public perceives it, not what the truth may actually be.

Thank you for taking the time to read this and if you wish I am more than willing to further discuss.

Regards,

s.22

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, June 10, 2016 2:31 PM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Escalating Property Values

Hello and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

In May of 2016, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

We see that you have also made some suggestions of your own for addressing this issue and we want to assure you that your input will be included in any upcoming, related discussions.

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.



From s.22

Sent: Friday, June 3, 2016 12:26 PM

To: mayorandcouncil@vancouver.ca; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX;

contact@bcliberals.com; BC Registry Services MTIC:EX

Subject: Idea -- How to reset BC's crazy housing market

Hi Mayor, Council, & Province,

I had a couple idea's to stop the massive price increases in the Vancouver real estate market.

1. Change BC Corporation rules that allow 100% foreign directors and create a site like Corporations Canada that publicly lists all board members. BC corporations are allowed to have 100% foreign board members, and directors, also you will need to travel to Victoria and pay money to find out who runs them. There is no way to do this over the internet. This is different that a Federal Corporation where a percentage of the directors must be Canadian. Foreign Money gets put into BC corps, then the money is invested into the Vancouver (and in some cases other provinces) Real Estate Market. So basically foreigners are making large amounts of cash at the expense of real Vancouver (and other city) residents

Why is this bad. Since no director is Canadian, it would be hard to hold them accountable to Canadian law. Since there is no easily available public record of Directors, their actions can be hidden from public. This is why we don't know much of the ownership information in BC.

FYI These international investors can borrow from japan at 0.8% or the US at 1.5% then put the money into a BC Corp which then can get additional mortgages based on the capital contained in the BC corp bank account from a Canadian Bank. This allows investors to purchase many homes with low cost foreign capital and low cost Canadian mortgages. This is called a carry trade ( borrow from low interests lender, buy high yield investment, pocket the difference ). Think about that. borrow at 0.8% then earn 10 - 17% a year.

2. BC Corporations that own homes and apartments that are vacant in Canada should have a very large monthly fee while the property is empty. ( for example \$1000 dollars a month, or a 0.5% fee yearly on the property value ). This will do two things, First it will not target individuals and Canadians making money in real estate market, but only Corporations which is good for Canadians. Second, it will force the owners of vacant property to rent them out, or not to purchase property that cant be rented. The rental rates should drop back to an affordable amount because of the additional properties on the market. Which is good for Canadians. It will also detract international investors from using Canada's real estate markets as an easy money investment. The revenue generated by the monthly tax could be poured into affordable housing for the poor, or to reduce BC Corporate taxes, so that more companies move here.

When the era of cheap money ends, the world economies will go back to normal (ECB has negative rates, Japan has 0% interest rates, USA has 1.5% interest rate). All of these investors will try and leave the Canadian real estate market, creating massive house price drops. Which will only hurt regular Canadians.

s.22

On Mon, Jun 6, 2016 at 9:09 AM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email and suggestions regarding the Vancouver real estate market. We appreciate your taking the time to share your thoughts on this issue with us. Please be assured we will include your input in any related discussions.

Again, thank you for writing. We do appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 9:24 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: FW: Idea -- How to reset BC's crazy housing market

Thanks..

Again you are welcome.s.22

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 9:04 AM

To: Correspondence Group, City Clerk's Office; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; contact@bcliberals.com; BC Registry Services MTIC:EX

Subject: Re: Idea -- How to reset BC's crazy housing market

Hi Again Mayor, Council, & Province,

You are very welcome for the information I provided you in the last email.

I wanted to respond to some of the information I have read in the media reports about the housing crisis here in BC.( Well Canada )

1. I read that the real estate board of BC is suggesting that high paying jobs are creating the housing prices to go up. This is absolutely wrong. A person earning 160,000 a year ( in the top 5% of income earners in Canada ) could not afford a Vancouver home without help. Please keep in mind that the real estate boards are actually complicit in this. Why would they ever try and stop their golden goose from laying eggs.

2. When banks suggest higher down payments as a way to cool the market, it means they want to protect them selves when the housing prices go down, and it also means they expect housing prices to go down. First this wont work in lowering housing prices since the foreign investors are actually already borrowing the down payments anyway from foreign banks. ( the carry trade that I explained in the last mail ) Second, this only helps the banks protect themselves from losses. Also the bankers know about the carry trade and that most of the foreign investment is borrowed money (Where do you think I learned all this).

3. Look at the US housing prices graph over the last 20 years ( including the 2007 - 2009 crash ). Notice how similar these graphs are. Then look at the graphs of the other overheated markets around the world. You will notice a pattern. This is proof that the housing price increases come from foreign investment and have nothing to do with local economies.

4. The same carry trade I explain in the last mail is happening in many real estate markets around the globe. Some economist call this exporting inflation. This could actually explain why with 0% interest rates that Japanese currency keep appreciating. The inflation is exported to other countries by means of their Real Estate markets.

5. Inflation. Here is the definition from <http://www.dictionary.com/browse/inflation>, "Economics. a persistent, substantial rise in the general level of prices related to an increase in the volume of money and resulting in the loss of value of currency (opposed to deflation )." So as the housing prices are going up so fast across the country is a sign of inflation. For some reason we don't include housing prices in our inflation calculations. But this suggests at some point our currency value is going to drop.

6. We are along for the ride. There is no way to stop the housing crash from happening now. Even by imposing some of the luxury tax or foreign investment taxes, or even changing the BC Corporate registry to match the Federal Canadian Corporate registry rules will only slow our market from going up in value. But the market has now grown too much to stop a crash.

7. Chasing Yield. If you were able to borrow 100 million dollars from a foreign bank at 0.8% , what assets would you invest in. Since Bonds are paying so little, and the markets are doing OK, the best place to invest your 100 million dollars is real estate. Now when you deposit your money into a Canadian corp, you are entitled to Canadian Bank Financing. This allows you to magnify your investment. So you can now buy 250 million dollars worth of Canadian Property, which is earning you 10% of more a year. Then to carry your investment, you just borrow again

against the equity in your properties and pay the loans. All of this money is borrowed. But if you could do this why wouldn't you. There is no laws saying otherwise.

Thoughts,  
s.22

On Fri, Jun 3, 2016 at 2:16 PM, Correspondence Group, City Clerk's Office wrote:

Thank you for your email which has been circulated to the Mayor, Vancouver City Council, and Chief Housing Officer.

Correspondence Group  
City Clerk's I City of Vancouver  
[mayorandcouncil@vancouver.ca](mailto:mayorandcouncil@vancouver.ca)

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, May 30, 2016 10:19 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Housing prices

From: s.22  
Sent: May 28, 2016 1:53 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Cc: Opposition Leader  
Subject: Housing prices

Dear Ms. Clark:

s.22

On a human front, there is an entire generation that will be forced out of the cities they consider home. s.22

s.22

s.22 The meaning of family is lost when we are denied the chance to live and grow old together. You may be oblivious to the situation, given that Hamish will inherit real estate from two parents and hence he will be able to stay in the Lower Mainland. However, that formula does not work for a still-married family blessed with more than one child.

s.22  
s.22 . If 11-14 year olds can figure it out, why are our paid representatives unable to see it, or care about it?

Who do I blame for what is happening? I blame all levels of government. I blame lawyers and real estate agents for turning a blind eye to the situation and even fostering the corruption.

But in the end this is a British Columbia issue and it is the responsibility of the BC Provincial government to remedy the problem. Your government needs to start representing the people of British Columbia, not foreign investors and the narrow slice of the population getting rich. My family has actively supported the BC Liberals in the past, but no longer. You could introduce changes that would cause the market to slowly adjust over a 5-10 year period and hence avoid the market shock that you use as your defence for doing nothing.

In summary, your lack of concern for the plight of the people of British Columbia is a disgrace. It is time to stop the obfuscation and begin to lead in the interests of the people.

s.22

s.22



From: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX [mailto:Premier@gov.bc.ca]  
Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 12:02 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing prices

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 3:06 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Cc: Clark.MLA, Christy LASS:EX; oppositionleader@leg.bc.ca  
Subject: Housing prices

Dear Ms. Clark:

Thank you for having your office send a reply to my comments. However, nothing in your plan would have any measurable effect on the housing market. Below are my thoughts on your argument that the Province of British Columbia is acting on the issue. At the end of my e-mail are ideas that I do think would help solve the crisis.

#### Property Transfer Tax Reduction:

You write:

"One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000."

This measure will have no effect. Wealthy foreign owners clearly can pay the Property Transfer Tax, though many avoid the tax anyway by placing ownership of the house under a company. The minor savings on lower value houses is immaterial compared to the soaring cost of housing. A \$13,000 savings when a property has increased in cost by hundreds of thousands is a meaningless gesture that will do nothing to remedy the situation.

#### Increasing the Supply of Available Housing Units:

You write:

"Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC."

There are 7.1 billion persons in the world, 1.4 billion in China alone. Do you really think that 2000 housing units will magically tip the supply-demand ratio in British Columbia and cause housing prices to return to affordable levels for the 4.6 million British Columbians?

Additionally, how does taking \$355 million from the honest tax payers of BC help those same tax payers buy a home? That is just our money going around in a circle, minus the costs for the government to promote and administer the stupid idea.

## New Regulations to Restrict the Predatory Practice of Real Estate Contract Assignment:

You write:

"Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment."

The real estate industry is central to the corruption fueling the crisis. Allowing the real estate industry to continue to be self-regulated is a complete dereliction of your duties as government. The failings of the real estate industry are well documented, yet you continue to ignore the issue.

## Foreign Investment Study:

You write:

"Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market."

The data is clear and anyone living in the Lower Mainland would have to be a fool or a liar to not acknowledge the extent of the problem. We do not need a study. This is simply another stalling tactic.

## What Can Be Done:

There are numerous measures, taken jointly, that would solve the issue of the people of British Columbia being priced out of the cities in which they live and work. Without explaining exactly how you should do your job, here are some ideas to start putting the people of British Columbia ahead of foreign investors:

- Simply end the right of non-Canadians to own property in British Columbia. Examine the rules employed in PEI. BC could invoke the non-withstanding clause if necessary.
- Government should take over oversight of the real estate industry. Money to run this government office would come from the existing property transfer tax.
- Enforcement of disclosure by real estate agents must be stepped up. Failure to comply should result in heavy fines, a criminal record (fraud), loss of real estate license, and jail time.
- Fight that lawyers are exempt from reporting to Fintrac. The current process allows the laundering of money as long as a lawyer is used in the process. Why does employing a lawyer turn an illegal act into a legal act? If you want to hide behind the asinine decision of the Supreme Court (February 2015), that would be another example of ignoring the issue. Show

some leadership and challenge the ruling of the Supreme Court. A crime is a crime.

- Follow the recommendations of the Simon Fraser University panel.
- Require proof of source of income on mortgages.
- Monitor sale of houses for declared GST on sales and proof of primary residence.
- Set up a tip line to report suspicious behaviour.
- Require that all legal transactions be conducted in English or French.
- Require all real estate agents to pass a test in English.
- Make MLS public information, as is done in the United States. The current monopoly should be challenged by the BC government, or better yet, make the real estate industry fight a ruling by the BC government.
- Do not allow ownership of residential property under a corporation, unless for rental.
- Require that companies owning real estate (rental or commercial) must be registered in BC.
- Require that owners of companies be identified.

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Wednesday, June 1, 2016 2:34 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing prices

Thank you for your follow-up email s.22 We appreciate your feedback on the initiatives already undertaken by government as well as your suggestions for solutions moving forward. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions.

Again, thank you for writing.

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 8:37 AM

To: marty@mikedejong.com; deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; execdirector@greenparty.bc.ca; liz.lilly@greenparty.bc.ca; stephen.harper@parl.gc.ca; thomas.mulcair@parl.gc.ca; franke@frankejames.com; fin.donnelly@parl.gc.ca; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca;

OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; contact@bcliberals.com; secretary@bcconservative.ca; bcndp@bcndp.ca; bcndp@bcndp.ca; Reimer.MLA, Linda LASS:EX; Madoc-Jones, Sian LASS:EX; Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX; bcndp@bcndp.ca; s.22

secretary@bcconservative.ca; contact@bcliberals.com; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Anton.MLA, Suzanne LASS:EX; Bennett.MLA, Bill LASS:EX; Chandra Herbert.MLA, Spencer LASS:EX; Corrigan.MLA, Kathy LASS:EX; Donaldson.MLA, Doug LASS:EX; Fleming.MLA, Rob LASS:EX; Hammell.MLA, Sue LASS:EX; Hunt.MLA, Marvin LASS:EX; Kylo.MLA, Greg LASS:EX; Macdonald.MLA, Norm A LASS:EX; Mungall.MLA, Michelle LASS:EX; Popham.MLA, Lana LASS:EX; Robinson.MLA, Selina LASS:EX; Simons.MLA, Nicholas LASS:EX; Sturdy.MLA, Jordan LASS:EX; Thornthwaite.MLA, Jane LASS:EX; Ashton.MLA, Dan LASS:EX; Bernier.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; Chouhan.MLA, Raj LASS:EX; Dalton.MLA, Marc LASS:EX; Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX; Foster.MLA, Eric LASS:EX; Heyman.MLA, George LASS:EX; Huntington.MLA, Vicki LASS:EX; Lake.MLA, Terry LASS:EX; Mark.MLA, Melanie LASS:EX; Oakes.MLA, Coralee LASS:EX; Ralston.MLA, Bruce H LASS:EX; Routley.MLA, Bill LASS:EX; Sullivan.MLA, Sam LASS:EX; Throness.MLA, Laurie LASS:EX; Wickens.MLA, Jodie LASS:EX; Austin.MLA, Robin D LASS:EX; Bing.MLA, Doug LASS:EX; Darcy.MLA, Judy LASS:EX; Elmore.MLA, Mable LASS:EX; Fraser.MLA, Scott LASS:EX; James.MLA, Carole A LASS:EX; Larson.MLA, Linda LASS:EX; Martin.MLA, John LASS:EX; Pimm.MLA, Pat LASS:EX; Reid.MLA, Linda LASS:EX; Routley.MLA, Douglas G LASS:EX; Stilwell.MLA, Michelle LASS:EX; Sultan.MLA, Ralph LASS:EX; Trevena.MLA, Claire F LASS:EX; Wilkinson.MLA, Andrew LASS:EX; Bains.MLA, Harry LASS:EX; Bond.MLA, Shirley LASS:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX; Karagianis.MLA, Maurine E LASS:EX; Lee.MLA, Richard LASS:EX; McRae.MLA, Don LASS:EX; Plecas.MLA, Darryl LASS:EX; Farnworth.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; Rustad.MLA, John LASS:EX; Stilwell.MLA, Moira LASS:EX; Tegart.MLA, Jackie LASS:EX; Virk.MLA, Amrik LASS:EX; Yamamoto.MLA, Naomi LASS:EX; Barnett.MLA, Donna LASS:EX; Cadieux.MLA, Stephanie LASS:EX; Conroy.MLA, Katrine LASS:EX; Dix.MLA, Adrian LASS:EX; Fassbender.MLA, Peter LASS:EX; Hamilton.MLA, Scott LASS:EX; Horgan.MLA, John LASS:EX; Krog.MLA, Leonard LASS:EX; Letnick.MLA, Norm LASS:EX; Morris.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; Polak.MLA, Mary LASS:EX; Rice.MLA, Jennifer LASS:EX; Shin.MLA, Jane LASS:EX; todd.stone.MLA@leg.bc.ca; Thomson.MLA, Steve LASS:EX; Wat.MLA, Teresa LASS:EX; Yap.MLA, John LASS:EX; John Henderson  
Subject: Premier Clark's real-estate road trip in Asia sparks uproar

- HOW MANY PEOPLE DO YOU REALLY THINK BELIEVE WHAT THE "PREMIER OF B.C." OR THE "B.C. LIBERAL PARTY" SAYS ANYMORE?????????

- EVERYTHING THEY DO LOOKS LIKE IT IS TO PUT MORE MONEY IN "THEIR OWN POCKETS" AND ALSO "THE POCKETS OF THEIR FRIENDS" AND "FUND RAISER BUDDIES"!!!!!!!

- WHAT ARE YOU REALLY PROMOTING ON THIS "ASIA ROAD TRIP" WHAT DO YOU THINK MOST PEOPLE IN B.C SEE AS THE MAIN REASON YOU ARE THERE"

AND TO HELP WHO OUT FOR BEING THERE"??????????

- TAKE BIG MONEY OUT OF POLITICS NOW!!!!!!!!!! OTHER PROVINCES IN CANADA  
HAVE!!! WHAT ARE YOU WAITING FOR?????

Smyth: Premier Clark's real-estate road trip in Asia sparks uproar

BY MICHAEL SMYTH, THE PROVINCE MAY 30, 2016

- STORY
- PHOTOS ( 1 )

Copyright

Page 055

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright



From: s.22  
Sent: Sunday, May 29, 2016 9:39 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: home ownership

Dear Ms. Clark:

s.22

I see a big problem with your lack of attention to home ownership for middle class or upper middle class families. There are bidding wars in home ownership where the foreign buyer is winning cause they pay the \$700K plus in cash! I don't know any Canadian that has that kind of money. s.22 about this and if this continues to happen, then this beautiful lower mainland will be entirely unaffordable for Canadians to live.

What about our children? I believe life will be even harder as a result of your lack of attention to this matter for our children. Why not think about those middle class people like us who really want to own their own home, who have done everything right in their lives but must waste away their money in rent because you have put no restrictions on foreign buyer ownership.

I hope you take this to heart and do something about it. You were elected to be a leader and take care of your people and pay attention to their needs. Please take this matter seriously.

Best Regards,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, May 30, 2016 4:26 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: home ownership

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 22, 2016 3:23 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Former top B.C. political aide says foreign ownership should be put to a vote - British Columbia - CBC News

Premier :

Please act to support this vote. s.22

s.22 . Give young couples and regular people the chance to live in the Lower Mainland, especially Vancouver.

s.22

<http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/foreign-real-estate-ownership-vote-1.3591839>

From: s.22  
Sent: Saturday, May 21, 2016 11:14 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Vancouver's Problem

Honourable Premier

Keep up the good work!

I think the public should be made aware of the fact that Cities are not autonomous beings but are creations of the Province and are at the behest Of Provincial Powers. These powers will be used when it may be in the public interest. Many people do not realize this limit on city powers.

There could be a two pronged approach to deal with housing pricing.

First, Foreign ownership....a six month temporary freeze on foreign investment for housing up to 1.2 million dollars could be made. However, the six months could be extended for additional Six month periods if it appears to work. It would be for cities over 200,000 people. Such is not needed for struggling rural areas and small towns That are still suffering from the 2008 downturn.

Reason for above Is because 1. We do not want to be prevented from purchasing US properties or retaliation by other nations and 2. We may need foreign money If there is a quick and plunging market at some point. Canadians saved the real estate from really crashing in some sun states.

Secondly. Permits to Proceed to quickly to increase supply....The OCP should be completed for each city by outside planning teams hired by the city so that local planning bias are overridden. Approval speeds must be increased doing away with expensive hearings which often are useless exercises....costly in time and money.

The results of OCP must be implemented. (Salt Spring still has not changed the 604 sq. ft. cabins to 990 sq. ft. (approx.) called for in plan of almost A decade ago! Slave families were expected to live in 600 sq. ft under La. law.. We the public are not supposed to be slaves!

The OCP should lay out plans that are proven to be in line with growth rates so that a supply of condos etc. and housing units, if appropriate, keeps up with growth rate. Then criteria for areas delineated for growth are outlined on maps within OCP. All this is hashed out in public meetings. However, unless outside of a growth area outlined, the developer just has to meet the criteria outlined for a permit to proceed. This could allow approvals to be forthcoming within a delineated say two months unless a petition of X names is presented. That is fair, quick, less expensive, democratic and efficient. One could still have public hearings

if a petition of X number of names was presented by the public. There could be a board of four or five citizens in Victoria which could act as an appeal court if developer is turned down after being included within OCP boundaries, yet approvals rejected. Reasons must be included with rejections so such reasoning can be judged.

The best  
s.22

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: s.22  
Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2016 9:05 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Matters of Concern

Hello,

I am gravely disappointed and concerned about the treatment of foreign home ownership in British Columbia and Vancouver area over the last 25 years. s.22

s.22 . However, this seems to be less likely with the obvious over-run of foreign buyers who minimally contribute to the taxes and fabric of the community.

s.22

s.22 Despite these high incomes well above the provincial household average of \$76k we feel as though we cannot live in the community of our choice. We are immensely apprehensive of our savings and using them to buy into this overheated and ridiculous real-estate environment.

I would be interested to hear about your efforts to help correct the situation to enable my peers and I survive in a community that is unwelcoming our national Canadian up-bringing. It is further concerning that such a large portion of the funding to political campaigns is from larger residential real-estate developers. I truly hope you are looking into the steps Australia and the UK have taken to help cool their similar insane markets.

Please help our younger generation succeed where we were born and raised.

A very concerned BC resident,

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Thursday, May 19, 2016 1:46 PM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Matters of Concern

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to us regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 3:43 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: action on foreign ownership NOW!!

How much of this disgusting behaviour do we have to take?

There needs to be a full investigation into this woman. The Real estate board - (self regulating hahahhahha) are in the pockets of the gazillionaires along with the government. This market is out of control. We will have NOTHING left of our city.

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/bc-realtor-accused-of-making-threats/article30024457/>

s.22 . . . . . When is this government going to wake up?

s.22



Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 9:50 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing and foreign buyers

I wish to address the issue of foreign ownership of real estate. It appears a hot topic of late.

Sincerely,  
s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 3:06 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing and foreign buyers

Hello, <sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email regarding foreign ownership of real estate in BC. We appreciate your taking the time to write to us and offer your suggestion on this issue. Please be assured your input will be included in our related discussions.

You may be interested to know that the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you for writing. We do appreciate hearing from you.

-----Original Message-----

> From: <sup>s.22</sup>

> Sent: May 9, 2016 1:10 PM

> To: Clark.MLA, Christy

> Subject: Foreign ownership

>

> Dear Madam Premier;

>

> Surely you must know clearly by now that the pressure of offshore (mostly Chinese) buyers have destroyed the home ownership dreams of most locally born and bred lower mainlanders, and their children and grandchildren. There is no longer a rational and fair market place for homebuyers and renters.

>

> You alone can put a stop to this and if you expect to get re-elected in another short while, you need to take action now. And please don't say this is not a Provincial matter, and pass the buck.

>

> I have always voted the free enterprise party, but this matter is too important, so I won't unless you fix this problem.

>

> Please don't chalk this up as a racist position; although that is an easy claim for the real estate industry and developers to make. It is the fact that our community and lifestyles are being destroyed by offshore owners who have no stake in this place, other than it is a most convenient place to park (launder?) their currencies and there are simply no barriers from them doing so.

>

> Everyone I talk to is angry with the situation, especially the recent onslaught of the Mainland Chinese cohort, and your total lack of action.

>

> I would like to hear from you and what action, if any, you plan to take.

>

> Sincerely,

>

> <sup>s.22</sup>

>

> Sent from my iPhone

On May 13, 2016, at 11:36 AM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

>

> Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

>

> We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

>

> One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

>

> Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

>

> Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

>

> Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

>

> Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 2:22 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Foreign ownership

Office of the Premier

Thank you for your reply and a number of links to press releases related somewhat to my concerns.

However, and very specifically, I am very unhappy with the actions taken by your government: they will not effectively deal with the foreign (i.e. Chinese) ownership issue that you know perfectly well is disrupting the real estate market and destroying our Lower Mainland communities.

The measures introduced by the Minister of Finance seems like: a stalling tactic, kicking the problem down the road, just a fig leaf, or all of the foregoing. No one thinks this is going to do anything to resolve the underlying issue as I see it and, I suspect, neither do you.

You know perfectly well where the problem lies and you don't need to gather much more information to deal with the issue. Please show leadership and get on with it now.

Finally, it is a huge mistake to conflate the problem of foreign ownership with affordable housing. These are two completely different issues. That is why I was so disappointed with your canned responses to my email setting out a shopping list of things related to housing. In fact, the affordable housing matters you brought in will, in my view, simply make it cheaper for the foreign buyers, agents and/or their locally-schooled kids to buy up the new builds.

You don't have much to spare to do something meaningful before this issue could bury you in the next election. There is a lot of anger and the finger is pointed at your Government for help.

Sincerely

s.22

Sent from my iPhone

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 10:45 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: threats, absentee owners, foreign ownership, lack of affordable housing

From: s.22  
Sent: May 15, 2016 3:45 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: threats, absentee owners, foreign ownership, lack of affordable housing

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/bc-realtor-accused-of-making-threats/article30024457/>

I recently received a flyer from REMAX advertising that there are foreign buyers/investors waiting to buy in my area s.22 I live in what was once an affordable area for people who want to get into the market. As of six months ago, that is no longer the case. Houses are now going for over \$200,000 the asking price. Yes, that may be good for me, but I really don't care about me. I would much rather see people who want to live in the community be able to buy in this area. Really, what would an absentee owner bring to our community?

Perhaps you could look into how transactions are done in other countries, such as Australia, Hong Kong etc. I ask that you please think about those in our country who need affordable housing before you think about how the government can make money off of outside interests.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 7:56 PM

To: Minister, MNGD MNGD:EX; Sturdy.MLA, Jordan LASS:EX; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Vancouver housing

I am beneficiary of this housing bubble, having recently sold my West Vancouver house but I am aghast at what this is doing and could do to our City. Our young cannot afford housing having been displaced in many cases by offshore investors who have little concern for our communities. s.22

and have seen the devastating effect of collapsed housing bubbles. IMF studies show that the impact of a collapsed housing bubble has much greater impact than that of a stock market bubble. This is a real economic and social threat.

Moreover I believe that the voters will punish the Liberals for inaction on this file. I have never come lose to voting anything left of centre but will hold my nose and vote NDP next year because of the Liberals woeful response to this crisis. I hear similar rumblings many times in this bastion of Liberal support, West Vancouver.

The response limited just to shadow flipping and small rental support is pitiful. You need more aggressive action including taxes on foreign ownership of residential real estate.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 8:42 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing in BC

Christy Clark,

s.22

s.22

s.22 " So how is it that these people can afford to buy multi million dollar homes sight unseen? Most of us will never own a home because of this.

3. As shown on the news almost daily these, "owners" are registered as student and house wives in order to avoid paying taxes.

s.22

5. Christy Clark, foreign owners are pushing people who live in the community out of it! The house we used to rent in was taken back by the owners son in order to move in, "personal use", well they are still waiting on permits. They lied in order to get all of us out. They will renovate, sell to a foreign owner and it will remain empty.

6. This is not a question of race, it is a fact. We have allowed this artificial economy of Vancouver housing to get out of control. A fair number are laundering their money here with the cooperation of the banks and your government, by all of you turning a blind eye to this for years. It doesn't actually affect you so why would you do anything about it? Oh wait, you are our elected official and you actually have to address our concerns. So why the delay and wait. If it were The British or French buying up the property what would you do?

s.22

s.2 7. Please take a look at Australia and other countries that do not allow foreign ownership.

~

8. By the way in China you cannot buy property unless you are a Chinese citizen. Just FYI.

Sincerely s.22

Sent from my iPhone



On May 16, 2016, at 1:55 PM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:  
Hello, s.<sup>22</sup> , and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Just last week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 2:37 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Re: Housing in BC

Thanks for the response. The idea of gathering information is a little silly given the information which is out there and has been available to anyone willing to look.

s.22 does condo pre sales and 95% of S- sales are to Chinese buyers. That is not conjecture it is fact. 22

Do you and us all a favour, take action. Hope for my generation to own in this town is dead. Face it you have given me a nicely worded letter that says and does very little. How very political of you.

Good luck in the next election, your party is going to need it.

s.22

Sent from my iPhone

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 10:26 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Vancouver Housing Situation

Premier,

I consider Vancouver housing situation, with foreign ownership of real estate and the ensuing record high prices, to be extremely serious.

As a voter this is definitely an election issue. The action or inaction of the present government will have a direct influence on my vote.

Off-shore and speculative buying have to be controlled, the present attitude of laissez-faire is unsustainable.

Respectfully,

s.22

-----Original Message-----

> From: 's.22

> Sent: Monday, April 4, 2016 5:32 PM

> To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

> Subject: Urgent request and solution to the hot real estate market in Vancouver

>

> Dear Premier,

>

> My name is s.22

s.22 It seems that anger of housing price in Vancouver is becoming a dry firewood that will burn up government reputation in some day. I know tons of specialists and economists are giving ideas and solutions to the hot issue. But I am not sure if people realize one real fact, a simple fact causing the problem. "It is our banking policy that encourages the speculations and hot flips in our real estate market!"

>

> All our major banks have very strict requirements to home buyers in our own country, such as our credit history, annual income, and borrowing capability, but very different guidelines, or lose requirements to foreign investors and new immigrants, for instance, a new immigrants can get millions dollars bank loan if they have 25% to 35% down payment without approving income. I just have a client getting 3 millions bridge loan without being asked income. Some of the speculators even take our advantage and borrow our cheap money to make profit offshore (they can get 15% to finance companies and individuals in China, but only pay 2% here to our banks).

>

> I strongly suggest that all our financial institutes should stop approving any house loan over a million dollars to a no income immigrant family. If they want to buy house, it is fine to use their own fund, but no from Canadian banking system.

>

> Tied up our banking regulations to foreign investor and new immigrants right away please. We need safe and stable financial and housing market on our own beautiful land.

>

> Thank you very much for your time.

>

> Best regards,

> s.22

>

>

> Sent from my iPad

> On Apr 8, 2016, at 8:39 AM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:  
>  
> Thank you for your email regarding real estate fraud, s.22  
>  
> Immediately upon hearing about this concern, our Finance ministry staff engaged in discussions with regulatory organizations responsible for overseeing the real estate market - the Real Estate Council of BC and the Superintendent of Real Estate - who are jointly undertaking an independent advisory group to investigate the allegations. We look forward to hearing the results of that investigation. Any provincial regulatory changes that might be required will be brought forward.  
>  
> We've noted your comments regarding banking practices as they relate to mortgages for foreign owners. We can advise that in Canada banking regulation falls under the federal government.  
>  
> Thanks again for writing. On your behalf, we've shared your correspondence with the Honourable Michael de Jong, Minister of Finance, so that he, too, is aware of your views.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Saturday, May 14, 2016 7:53 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Urgent request and solution to the hot real estate market in Vancouver

Please please please regulate mortgage policy. No more loan to foreigners who want to buy property in Canada. s.22

s.22

s.22                   The solution is so obvious, how come our government didn't do anything!

Sent from my iPad

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:07 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: May 11, 2016 8:40 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name  
s.22

Email  
s.22

Riding  
s.22

Comments & Feedback

Forget the stats on home ownership. Try making a bid on a house and you'll find out quick enough who is buying. Curb foreign ownership. Tax foreign ownership 50%. Do something!!!!

Did you know that Chinese pay in cash for everything so that there is no record of income? Even local restaurant employees get paid in cash, everything is off the books so no taxes are due!

s.22

s.22

The houses prices wont drop if there are regulations to ownership (proven BC resident) However it might allow locals who work and pay local taxes to be able to buy.

Treat locals better than foreigners! We are the ones that vote.

From: s.22  
Sent: Saturday, May 14, 2016 12:57 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing policies

Most European countries have attacked this problem with vigor with the goal of protecting their citizens from an unaffordability crisis for both purchasers & tenants.

For example, Denmark, to ensure housing remains tied to the economic health of the community, and cannot become a speculative commodity, imposed a law against foreign ownership. A non-Danish citizen can only purchase a home if they can meet the following:

Prove five years legal residency in the country;  
Permanent employment on an ongoing basis;  
That this home will be their principal residence.

The result of the Danish policy is that 30-year olds in Danish cities aren't concerned that they may never be able to buy a home.

To leave this unresolved only accelerates the current trend of talented university graduates to leave the city for the interior or elsewhere. Tech companies in particular have moved to the interior because, to keep their employees, they must be where home ownership is within reach. Other companies find it is difficult to attract skilled labour for the same reason. Places like Saskatoon are enjoying success at our expense in attracting the tech industry.

If you're going to represent your constituents, you cannot continue to permit off-shore owners who pay little or no taxes, ruin the dreams of so many & contribute to the stagnation of our economy.

s.2

pls cc to associated Ministers



From: s.22  
Sent: Sunday, May 15, 2016 10:28 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: housing crisis

dear christy  
s.22

last year, i started to read about all the issues with foreign ownership, shadow flipping, money laundering, questionable money transfer and so on. it's surprising to know the government, banks and real estate industry are turning a blind eye and allowing this to happen. how's this possible? the process of finding a home has been so discouraging that we finally stopped looking. now, s 22 like so many others have done already. the middle class is being forced out and i can imagine how lower income families feel. this city has changed so quickly. 1s 22  
s.22

s.22 looking at the modest homes that start at \$1.5 million and up. we're not talking about new luxury homes. these are simple homes on small lots that require work. i can't help but feel the city and the politicians have become greedy and don't care about the people that make it a thriving community. our daughter's generation doesn't have a chance. it's so sad.

i feel it's important to share our story with you in hopes the government will start to take actions to protect the local community and citizens before more and more people leave. please take action.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 1:33 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: housing crisis

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Just last week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 1:13 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Stop foreign ownership of residential properties now!!

Ms. Premier!

Please stop the foreign ownership of Canadian residential properties, especially in Vancouver. It is insane that foreign citizen's can buy up Canadian residential properties to such an extent that regular Canadians can no longer even think about home ownership, especially in Vancouver. These foreign owners are paying next to nothing in income tax, and if they are residents, are utilizing the expensive infrastructure, medical and social programs, without contributing anything!

Countries like Australia have enacted legislations and laws to restrict foreign ownership, so why can't Canada? Please address this critical issue!!

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 10:37 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Clark.MLA, Christy LASS:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX

Subject: Housing Affordability

Honourable Clark and Honourable Coleman,

I am writing to express my extreme concern and dissatisfaction over the BC Liberal's lack of action on housing affordability in the Lower Mainland and your belief that no housing affordability crisis exists.

s.22

### Disconnect Between Property Prices and Contribution to the Economy

It is clear that housing in the Lower Mainland has become a 'commodity' good and is no longer being treated as shelter or a place to live.

There is also a clear disconnect between high housing prices and the contribution of individuals purchasing these properties. High housing prices can be OK if individuals purchasing these places are also contributing positively to the local economy (i.e. paying their fair share of income taxes, creating jobs, etc.). However, as evidence by a Government of Canada report<sup>1</sup>, this is not the case.

Another example is the recent purchase of a property in Point Grey for \$31.1 million, where the owner is listed as a student<sup>2</sup>. Other than the property taxes, I really question the amount of income tax this student will be paying to help support local infrastructure, health care, etc. in the province. Clearly the purchase has been structured this way to allow the actual wealthy owner an ability to avoid paying taxes in Canada, therefore contributing nothing to the local economy.

### The Elephant in the Room

While I appreciate the BC Liberals plan to start to collect citizenship data on property purchases, this actually does nothing. There are many ways for prospective purchasers to get around disclosing their actual citizenship, so the collection of this data will actually be useless.

The BC Liberals need to open their eyes that foreign ownership and foreign property purchases are clearly a large contributor to the problem, as evidenced by a recent report by Josh Gordon titled "Vancouver's Housing Affordability Crisis: Causes, Consequences and Solutions"<sup>3</sup>.

While we want to encourage investment in BC, we need to balance this with having a livable city for its residents. I appreciate there are other factors outside of your control (i.e. low interest rates, general public hysteria), but to say that foreign ownership and purchases are not contributing to problem is just naïve.

### Conflict of Interest

I am disappointed with the BC Liberals decision not to ban corporate and union donations, as well as the additional stipend Honourable Clark receives from the BC Liberal Party. While the conflict commissioner has ruled the stipend is not in conflict from a legal perspective, many others and I still believe the Premier to be in conflict in appearance.

It is also clear that when a large portion of the BC Liberals Party donations are from developers and real estate firms, it only further puts the BC Liberals in a greater conflict of interest when it comes to housing affordability. Inaction by the BC Liberals to ban corporate and union donations, only further exaggerates this appearance of a conflict of interest.

### Conclusion

To be clear s.22

s.22

s.22

Inaction by your party today is only going to lead to a much larger problem in the future. I hope and trust your party will take immediate and appropriate actions to solve the housing affordability crisis that is impacting all residents in the Lower Mainland.

Sincerely,

s.22

s.22

### Footnote References:

1. <http://www.scmp.com/comment/blogs/article/1929324/study-reveals-awfulness-canadian->

investor-immigration-income-tax

2. <http://vancouver.sun.com/storyline/student-owns-31-1-million-point-grey-mansion>

3. [http://www.sfu.ca/content/dam/sfu/mpp/pdfs/Vancouver's Housing Affordability Crisis Report 2016 Final Version.pdf](http://www.sfu.ca/content/dam/sfu/mpp/pdfs/Vancouver's%20Housing%20Affordability%20Crisis%20Report%202016%20Final%20Version.pdf)

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 3:47 PM

To: Minister, FIN FIN:EX; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing in Vancouver Region and Fraser Valley

Dear Mr. Mike de Jong - Finance Minister and Premier Christy Clark,

Our property values in the Vancouver Region and Fraser Valley are climbing at an alarming rate, making ownership for the average hard working professional 2 income families working and living in this area impossible.

Who can afford to purchase a home when the average house price is \$2 million where we live in Richmond.

Apartments are listing for \$400,000 and up.

Foreign investors are the ones buying up properties, tearing down great older homes and building giant homes as big as they can get away with. These foreign investors are not just buying 1 home to live in, they are purchasing multiple properties all over the area reaching out to Chilliwack and I don't know about places like Kelowna in the Interior of B.C. are being affected yet. Not just 2 or 3 properties, but even 10 - 20 properties as investments. Homes are going for well over the asking price, driving the market up and up. And they are being encouraged by realtors to buy up farm land in hopes of it being rezoned into housing. Even in Chilliwack these foreign investors are buying up our farm land. Let me assure you that most of them will not be farming the land, or doing anything with it. Your regular professional hardworking Canadians are out of the housing/condo/even apartment market. We can't live here, we are forced to move way out of the area, and find work elsewhere.

s.22

s.22

These foreign investors with multiple properties, who do not live here and do not necessarily work here must be controlled, taxed heavily, stop the insanity. Do something for Canadians!!! So many of our schools are closing because of declining enrollment. s.22

s.22

Our neighborhoods are not communities where you know everybody anymore, even though we try. You never see these people, does anyone live in these homes?

You must take action, change the laws of foreign investment, often foreign illegal money being invested here to get their money out of their own countries. Our kids are doomed to renting for the rest of their lives if they want to live and work in the Vancouver Region, why should they stay? You are going to lose your work force.

Sincerely

s.22

Sent from Mail for Windows 10



From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 9:57 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Please Please do not put a tax or restriction on foreign ownership on rural areas....please.

Greetings Honourable Premier

Keep up the great work!

The press of cities often overrides the voices of rural BC.

THE NEED...seniors housing and need to sell

Salt Spring provides an area the size of Vancouver which due to the Islands Trust which provides no relief to the densities of

nearby Vancouver or Victoria. Yet, it is still difficult to sell your home here and seniors need to sell. They often like

to move close to Grandchildren to help with child sitting. They often are forced to move because the Trust does not

allow condo housing on one floor due to its many restrictions. Now Victoria has a lack of hotel accommodation so prices

increase and going to hospital recovering partly in hotels is not an option. So senior citizens of Salt Spring leave even

though very expensive housing studies point out the needs; but, these needs never addressed by Trust.. Might improve if Trust

had headquarters here. However, after a year next month the Trust is still working on calculations if they will save money

moving or not! Some cannot afford high ferry rates.

ANY RESTRICTIONS ON FOREIGNERS WILL DISABLE THE FRAGILE RURAL ECONOMIES AND SMALL TOWNS

Small towns need the income that foreign visitors and residents and seasonal residents provide to them.

City dwellers need the close by rural experience.

Salt Spring has lost it's traditional markets of many US buyers when dollar was high. Now it has lost

It's Alberta market who used to move here because of low taxes. Chinese are more urban oriented.

So prices have not recovered especially for the waterfront and more desirable properties.

IF GOVT. HAS TO RESTRICT FOREIGN OWNERS THEN PLEASE MAKE IT FOR URBAN CENTERS OVER 200,000 PEOPLE.

Doing anything else would be a total shock to the BC economy and would kill more businesses.

IT IS ENOUGH THAT THE TRUST IS MULLING OVER A MORATORIUM ON ANY  
DEVELOPMENT BECAUSE OF  
A PRECAUTIONARY WATER POLICY

pLEASE NOTE THE HUGE IMPROVEMENTS IN DESALINIZATION. PERHAPS ANY  
TAX ON URBAN AREAS COULD  
FLOW MONEY INTO RESEARCH TO BRING TEST PLANTS OF NEW RESEARCH  
PROJECTS TO RURAL COMMUNITIES  
THAT HAVE WATER PROBLEMS OR PSEUDO POLITICALLY MADE UP CRISIS IN  
WATER!

Surely, with huge increases in urban population that nearby areas should not logically be left  
totally empty  
Of people. Perhaps Salt Spring could even consider reenergizing its urban Ganges so that the  
rest of the  
Island stays rural but keeps Ganges as a Growth area to concentrate population for easier  
infrastructure service  
And to stay with current trends. We would do our part then to help a growing BC and not be  
such a huge economic  
Detractor artificially induced by the Islands Trust and their precautionary principle that  
automatically eliminates facts.  
Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 5:28 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Please Please do not put a tax or restriction on foreign ownership on rural areas....please.

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email regarding foreign investment in BC's real estate market. We appreciate your taking the time to share your suggestions and comments on this issue. Please be assured your input will be included in our related discussions.

Again, thank you for writing and for your kind words to the Premier. It was great to hear from you!

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 6:34 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign ownership

Dear Christy Clark,

As you have no doubt heard, the price of houses in the Lower Mainland is beyond the reach of most Canadian born citizens. Foreign ownership has decimated the market and there is even talk of money laundering. Please change the laws to protect BC/Canadian citizens before everyone who was born here ends up sleeping under a bridge because they can't afford a home. Australia and Singapore have enacted such laws. Please follow suit.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 10:52 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: May 8, 2016 10:01 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name  
s.22  
Email  
s.22

Riding  
s.22

#### Comments & Feedback

Today in the Vancouver Sun an article titled: Foreign Buyers Crushing Home Ownership Dreams of Canadians.

Our children and their children are being SOLD OUT AND BOTH PROVINCIAL AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ARE COMPLICIT in fuelling Canada's housing market as Chinese buyers continue to shut local residents out of the housing market.

YOU CAN NO LONGER DENY OR PRETEND ITS NOT HAPPENING.

We are not stupid. WE WILL REMEMBER YOUR LACK OF LEADERSHIP ON THIS ISSUE IN THE COMING ELECTION AND YOU AND YOUR PARTY WILL BE DECIMATED.

s.22

Your lack of leadership on this important issue and many others is STUNNING TO SAY THE LEAST.

YOU CAN NO LONGER PRETEND ITS NOT HAPPENING. OUR CHILDREN AND THEIR CHILDREN ARE BEING SOLD OUT. DO SOMETHING ABOUT IT!!!!

s.22

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 7:03 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as Canada, BC do zip | Vancouver Sun

Dear Premier Clark,

This article is probably one of the more proactive pieces I've read on the topic of foreign ownership. s.22

You simply cannot own land in those countries like China or Thailand if you're not a citizen. You can only basically rent it from someone that is a citizen.

Those are the serious types of policy choices our governments need to make on top of fees and surcharges.

<http://vancouver.sun.com/business/real-estate/foreign-buyers-crushing-home-dreams-in-vancouver-as-canada-b-c-do-zip-study>

Other ideas for you are:

- if a foreigner wants to buy land here, have title transfer to the government for the life of that foreigner. When they pass away, or perhaps after a period of 60 years, the government can then dispose of the property through public auction.
- the same laws should apply to inheritances so that foreign owned property is eventually transferred back to citizens. It would be a form appropriation over time instead of outright expropriation immediately.

Thank you for your consideration.

Yours truly,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 5:23 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as Canada, BC do zip |  
Vancouver Sun

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email regarding house affordability and foreign investment in BC's real estate market. We appreciate your taking the time to write to us on these issues and offer you suggestions. Please be assured we will included your input in our ongoing related discussions.

Again, thank you for writing. We do appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 9:33 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Plecas.MLA, Darryl LASS:EX; Ed Fast; Gregor Robertson

Subject: Real Estate Questions

Hi. Perhaps you saw the article in the May 9 Province (Chinese homebuyers crush dreams). My impression is that this is an accurate summary of the lack of action by all levels of government in allowing real estate agents and others make large sums of money at the expense of the average citizen. When we hear about plumbers (for example) who are relatively well paid in working in Vancouver but are forced to buy a house in Abbotsford or Chilliwack, I would conclude that some thing is wrong with the system. Or when a lawyer and engineer couple (In the May 9 paper) can't afford a house in the Vancouver area, something is really wrong.

It's not just about dealing with "shadow flipping" and dishonest real estate agents, or even about an affordability fund, it's about changing things to make the system work for everyone. I understand that various countries track foreign buyers. I believe that there should be better control of large sums of money entering the country. Dealing with vacant house is another issue, and I'm sure that you can name other things that need attention.

I think that history will judge you harshly if you take no effective action soon. The results of inaction will be evident soon, but even more so in 10 or 20 years.

s.22



-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, April 27, 2016 1:01 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Fassbender.MLA, Peter LASS:EX; Todd Stone  
MLA

Cc: Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX; Heyman.MLA, George LASS:EX; deJong.MLA, Mike  
LASS:EX; Pam Goldsmith-Jones MP; Simons.MLA, Nicholas LASS:EX; Mayor Gregor  
Robertson; John Horgan; John Horgan Opp. Leader; Yamamoto.MLA, Naomi LASS:EX;  
Bennett.MLA, Bill LASS:EX; Chandra Herbert.MLA, Spencer LASS:EX; Krog.MLA, Leonard  
LASS:EX; Holman.MLA, Gary LASS:EX; Dix.MLA, Adrian LASS:EX; Lana popham MLA;  
Chandra Herbert.MLA, Spencer LASS:EX

Subject: When will the political corruption of your government ever end ?

Dear Christy Clark

This morning I read in the Globe and Mail you are being paid 10s of thousand dollars more by  
the Liberal Party in addition to your stipend as Premier - I suspect you are stashing it all away in  
some off shore bank!

When Ms Clark will you put an end to all this corruption in your government ... See article  
below of more horrors of your administration

s.22

s.22

Vaughn Palmer: David Eby stands out in rookie term

<http://vancouversun.com/opinion/columnists/vaughn-plamer-david-eby-stands-out-in-rookie-term>

VAUGHN PALMER

More from Vaughn Palmer

Copyright

Page 097 to/à Page 098

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, April 22, 2016 12:35 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: It's Time We Restricted Foreign Home Ownership in Vancouver

Dear Ms. Clark,

I write you today in my capacity as a very concerned resident of B.C. There is an opportunity for you to be a hero in the hearts of Canadian citizens in the next election, unlike any politician in decades, and I'm hoping you will take it.

Vancouver is one of the most beautiful cities on the planet. This didn't happen by accident, it happened on the backs of and through the sacrifices and taxes of Canadian citizens since 1886.

We can't blame foreigners for wanting to take advantage of this incredible place. But we can definitely blame ourselves for allowing it to be sold out to them.

This is Canada, yet every day the Canadians who grew up in Vancouver and whose families created this city, are being driven out or into less desirable dwellings by sky-high prices that primarily only foreigners can afford. There is lots of disinformation paid for and distributed by those benefiting from the current situation. However, the unarguable conclusion anyone will come to, who has spoken to even a few realtors or merely opened their eyes to see the shift in demographics, is that Vancouver is being overrun by foreign interests. No studies are needed.

We need to preserve our beautiful city and province for Canadians and it has to happen right now.

We need to adopt a lesson from China, where they have heavily restricted property sales to foreigners for over a decade "in an effort to prevent speculation and cool a real estate market that was seen to be overheating, and in the process pricing many ordinary Chinese citizens out of the centers of major cities" (Source: <http://www.ibtimes.com/china-relaxes-rules-let-foreigners-purchase-more-real-estate-attempt-boost-slowing-2072571> ). This sounds rather familiar.

Many countries, particularly in South East Asia, have done this for decades and it's time we acted for Canadians - but we need your leadership.

Thank you,

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, April 29, 2016 3:43 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: It's Time We Restricted Foreign Home Ownership in Vancouver

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Friday, April 22, 2016 11:31 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing

Dear Ms. Clark,

s.22

s.22  
/, however the  
current situation for housing has gone too far. Very few houses are selling at the asking price,  
and even less are selling with regular conditions.

Much of the housing prices have been driven up as a result of foreign ownership, shadow  
flipping and other forces.

Will the BC Government do any studies or have any actions to help people in this area?

Thanks,  
s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, April 29, 2016 3:34 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Additionally, in delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Finally, the Premier recently announced new measures to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement and further information on actions being taken to address housing affordability, please see the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0025-000427>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Thursday, April 21, 2016 9:56 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Immigrant Investors in Vancouver

From: s.22  
Sent: April 21, 2016 8:34 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Cc: Yamamoto.MLA, Naomi ; 'jonathan.wilkinson@parl.gc.ca' ; 'justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca'  
Subject: Immigrant Investors in Vancouver

Dear Elected representatives: This is a follow-up email to one sent earlier to which I am still waiting for a response. Foreign ownership of residential properties in the Vancouver area has now made the Lower mainland unaffordable for most Canadian working people including professionals. s.22

s.22 . When a cardiologist with an income of \$600,000 is unable to purchase a single family home because he is outbid , multiple times, by several hundred thousands of dollars by Chinese "Student" or "Houswife"-something is clearly wrong. The foreign owners are generally from mainland China and the properties are registered to "housewives" or "students". No income tax is paid and yet the families are all accessing our education and health care systems. I suspect all levels of government do not know how to deal with this so are simply continuing to receive whatever monies they can and simply ignoring the rest of us. For sure the Gov't of BC has lined its coffers with millions of dollars in property transfer tax. Residential real estate should be for homes for working people not vehicles for money laundering and foreign investment. Kind Regards, s.22

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:39 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: British Columbians Demand to Know, HOW the Liberal Government Plans to Stop the Foreign Takeover of Our Land & Housing???

From: s.22  
Sent: April 16, 2016 11:35 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy ; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca  
Cc: Coleman.MLA, Rich ; joyce.murray@parl.gc.ca; Horgan.MLA, John  
Subject: British Columbians Demand to Know, HOW the Liberal Government Plans to Stop the Foreign Takeover of Our Land & Housing???

British Columbians Demand to Know, HOW Does the Liberal Government (Federal & Provincial) Plan to Stop the Foreign Takeover of Our Land & Housing  
This should be both the BC Government's & Federal Government's TOP PRIORITY!

The Real Estate Committee appointed to investigate the shady practices of BC Real Estate Companies & realtors has done little to improve consumer protection and strengthen public confidence in the real estate industry.

A Recent Report by BC Global News Reveals that little progress has been made by Real Estate Council of B.C. Chair Marylou Leslie, who has been appointed to investigate the shady practices of BC realtors and Real Estate Companies:  
<http://globalnews.ca/news/2634976/reports-from-independent-group-looking-into-shadow-flipping-tell-differing-stories/>

Reports reaffirm concerns over shadow flipping, but the report dated April 8, admits the advisory group had met only three times, not enough to make any initial recommendations.

A follow-up report dated April 12 omitted the fact that the advisory group's first two meetings were spent with the real estate council it's supposed to investigate, hearing presentations on how the regulatory system works and where the gaps may be.

There are no names of crooked realty firms in either report, nor are there numbers showing how often shadow flipping really occurs.

"It just doesn't seem like a lot of work is being done," NDP housing critic David Eby said.



"I don't quite understand how they reconcile that independent role with the fact that two out of their three meetings have been briefings by the real estate council," Eby said.

Another report by BC Global News, reveals how Chinese foreign investors are getting first dibs on Vancouver homes:

<http://globalnews.ca/news/2637687/critics-say-new-shanghai-based-website-gives-foreign-buyers-first-dibs-on-vancouver-homes/?sf24332777=1>

Below are viewer's comments on these TV news reports which both the BC Liberal Government & Federal Government MUST pay CLOSE ATTENTION to as these are the comments of Canada's tax paying citizens. - Take heed!

s.22

Taxpayer at Canada Revenue Agency

I take a bit of solice in the fact that the Chinese are starting to run over our real estate industry... just like our real estate industry and government has run most working Canadians out of town.

Soon the land registry for the GVRD will reside in China, the properties will be transferred on paper there (we see this practice already happening through numbered companies), there will be no land transfer tax, nor will our legacy real estate companies be involve. A bit of ironic punishment for selling us out!

Like · Reply · 1 · Apr 14, 2016 10:46am

s.22

As <sup>s.22</sup> said.....it's over. Our politicians have failed us. Other than a general uprising/strike/riot there is no chance of putting the genie back in the bottle. Be prepared to be called 'racists.'

Like · Reply · 3 · Apr 13, 2016 10:05pm

s.22

Vancouver, British Columbia

Christy Clark has really failed us. Makes me wonder if she is being paid off?

Like · Reply · Apr 14, 2016 6:26pm

s.22

As long as the flooding of foreign investors/money continues, the house crisis (skyrocketing prices and shortage of homes) will keep increasing.

The problem is more obvious in Metro Vancouver but it is extending to the suburbs and the Island as well (particularly in the last few months).

Chinese investors are buying several houses at a time with deals arranged from overseas, as I heard from some realtors and sellers.

Suburbs are getting so expensive too (house prices have recently skyrocketed like crazy) and beyond affordability of hundreds of thousands of people.

Unfortunately, I think that at the end, so many British Columbians will have no choice but to look for jobs in other provinces and move out .

The housing crisis has created (or will be creating) negative and damaging impacts on BC society, including:

- The housing dreams of hundreds of thousands of Canadians in BC have been killed;
  - The BC society has been or will be losing a lot of Canadian skilled workers and professionals who can't manage to find homes or afford to buy properties in these areas as a result of the skyrocketing prices. Skilled workers from other places in Canada will not feel encouraged to come to BC because they will not be paid huge salaries that match the cost of housing ;
  - The housing crisis has created negative sensitivity (and possibly hostility) against foreign investors/buyers who are seen now as invaders ;
  - These housing issues will also have bad impact on the diversity of population in BC society, which is to be felt much more in the long term.
- Like · Reply · 3 · Apr 13, 2016 11:23pm · Edited

s.22

Being invaded and taken over without a shot being fired. A takeover without a war. - Curious !

Like · Reply · 2 · Apr 13, 2016 10:07pm

s.22

West Vancouver Secondary School

Yes the "REAL Canadians" are leaving Van quickly now!

Like · Reply · 1 · Apr 14, 2016 9:39am

From: McGaw, Danna R PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 2:26 PM

To: s.22

Cc: Minister, FIN FIN:EX

Subject: RE: British Columbians Demand to Know, HOW the Liberal Government Plans to Stop the Foreign Takeover of Our Land & Housing???

Thank you for your email regarding real estate fraud, s.22. We appreciate that you've expressed your concerns and we have shared them with the Honourable Michael de Jong, Minister of Finance, so that he, too, is aware of them.

You may have an interest in viewing Minister de Jong's comments on this issue during Question Period in the Legislature on the afternoon of April 11th. You can read Hansard's documentation of the exchange during Question Period at <https://www.leg.bc.ca/content/hansard/40th5th/20160411pm-Hansard-v36n9.pdf>.

Thanks again for taking the time to write.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 8:47 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: British Columbians Demand to Know, HOW the Liberal Government Plans to Stop the Foreign Takeover of Our Land & Housing???

Thank you for your reply, however the BC Government's and Minister DeJong's claims that The BC Real Estate Board and the BC Government are addressing this issue is just not good enough. Now that the facts are out and the alleged widespread, repeated fraud by New Coast Realty has been exposed, the people of British Columbia just aren't accepting the Government's and Real Estate Board's excuses and claims to be doing something.

It's clear to see both the BC Government and The Real Estate Board has dropped the ball on this and failed to protect the home owners and citizens of British Columbia.  
It's now time to have the law investigate.

If the claims are proven to be true, the Real Estate Company should lose its license and be closed.

Agents who participated in deceiving clients Must lose their licenses and restitution MUST be made to all clients & home owners who were fraudulently deceived of their money.  
Prison time should also be considered for guilty participants.

It's clear The Real Estate Board does a very poor job regulating its industry. In fact, they appear to do very little, if anything, at all!

Complaints are not responded to in a timely manner. They don't follow-up on reports and investigate complaints. Real Estate Agents who are found guilty of unethical practices don't lose their license and are rarely fined or disciplined.

It's sorely apparent the Real Estate Board is incompetent and it's clearly beyond their capabilities to investigate and police themselves!

David Chen a financial advisor based in Vancouver, spoke to BC Global News.

When asked about government solutions such as preventing shadow flipping and imposing a non-resident tax, David Chen states,

"It's just too little to be effective. There are too many loop holes that are being exploited in real estate investment. We're seeing just the tip of the iceberg in the Canadian Government's inability to close loopholes."

Twelve years in financial advising, his practice is now counselling and warning clients of the high risk Canadian real estate poses, and advising them to stay away from banks.

He fears we may be heading for a financial quake similar to the US in 2008. We're now in a position where real estate has become a commodity for foreign investment and property has been VASTLY over bid.

In an interview with The Globe & Mail, China's Consul General in Vancouver, Liu Fei stated, "It is the Canadian government's lack of oversight behind Vancouver's housing crisis. Don't blame wealthy Chinese investors for Vancouver's unaffordable real estate, blame your government for

permitting this to happen."

She went on to say, "This situation would not be allowed to occur in China. Our government has strict policies with regards to housing and foreign land ownership."

The Canadian Government Must Bring in Strict Rules and Taxes on Foreign Investment.

Remove the profit incentive and this will alleviate the demand by foreign speculators.

RESTRICTIONS and high taxes on real estate speculation is the ONLY VIABLE SOLUTION.  
PERIOD

The citizens of BC demand answers! Tell us, "How is The Real Estate board monitoring, regulating and policing their industry? - Where is the proof? Show us data with numbers of complaints received, number of complaints investigated, prosecuted, number of Real Estate Agents who have lost their licences or been fined!

They can't provide these, because they simply haven't been doing it and the public NOW knows that!

We're seeing plenty examples of how They Are Not Doing their job!

The public now Know the answer. - The Real Estate Council has been Doing Nothing at All!

They get a report card mark of E- Clearly a failing Grade!

We need independent watch dogs, an independent board and financial auditors looking into the Real Estate Industry. It's sorely apparent the Real Estate Board is incompetent and it's clearly beyond their abilities.

The BC Government must assign an independent board to overhaul and oversee the entire Real Estate Industry.

The citizens of BC are angry, and demand action! - No more talk!

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:42 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Real Estate Board and Foreign buyers

From: s.22  
Sent: April 16, 2016 7:47 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy ; Corrigan.MLA, Kathy  
Subject: Real Estate Board and Foreign buyers

It is time to put a stop to the real estate board run amok. What a disgrace that we are letting foreign buyers rule this market, making it unaffordable for all but the affluent. You are permitting this province to be sold out with no effort to make a change. Sooner or later your incompetence and inaction will catch up with all of us who actually live in the province. Construction for out of town buyers is not an industry, it is a disaster waiting to happen. Lack of control over foreign ownership is not acceptable. We have been in the market recently and have looked at places that we haven't been occupied for years.

This is not a way to run the province. First stop foreign ownership for future purchases and get a grip on the real estate board, then investigate and put some reasonable legislation in place.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 7:11 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Australia forces sales of foreign-owned properties after breach of ownership laws

Pay attention Christie Clarke !!!!! Do you even care about this province ?

<http://www.cnn.com/2016/01/17/australia-forces-sales-of-foreign-owned-properties-after-breach-of-ownership-laws.html>

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 11:55 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: June 4, 2016 6:58 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name  
s.22  
Email  
s.22

Riding  
s.22

Comments & Feedback  
Dear Mrs. Clark,

s.22

I'm writing to you because your and your party refusal to realistically consider stepping in and cooling now totally crazy real estate market in GVRD is unforgivable. Until this year mostly Vancouver, Burnaby, Richmond were part of crazy real estate bidding buying market but now since February 2016 even outer suburbs like Surrey, Coquitlam and Langley have price increase about 30-40% in just few months and multiple offers are now standard.

s.22

Your government refuses so far to try to influence and stop this madness and maybe reason for that is apparently all the money real estate developers contribute and control large influence over your decisions as reported many times in media. Of course Bob Rennie doesn't see any problems with market since he's enriching himself and who cares about average working family with average B.C. income which is one of the lowest in country.

The next year we have election and for the first time if nothing changes in regulation to control this totally crazy market in which only winning people are few developers, real estate agents and house flipping investors s.22

s.22

Hopefully you are going to step in with some reasonable action plan before is too late.

s.22



From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 11:58 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Where are we going to live?

From: s.22  
Sent: June 3, 2016 2:39 PM  
To: sunletters@vancouver.com; editor@nsnews.com; letters@globeandmail.com  
Cc: Clark.MLA, Christy ; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca  
Subject: Where are we going to live?

The utterly disturbing rising housing costs(even higher today) begs the question , where is this scenario leading? 6 months ago housing costs were rising at 20%/year, 3 months ago it was 30% and today the average house price is \$2.25M up \$250,000 or 12%in the last quarter or 48%/yr (actually 49% in an outer suburb) Cannot some forecaster examine the future result of the continuing increase in prices and who will live here in Vancouver and its suburbs. Would it do any good when Christy Clark is taking real estate agents overseas along on her current overseas trade mission? Rennie says taxes on foreign buyers will not reduce their inflow but would increase racism. He says we must curb demand and locals would agree or racism will increase significantly if we are overwhelmed by mainland Chinese which is current scenario. It is vital that local Canadians appreciate what the future brings if our governments are short-sighted enough not step in now and stop overseas buyers entering our real estate market. . No one around here can compete, or wants to, against this cash inflow, corrupt or otherwise, except perhaps real estate agents who are flogging our land overseas, so the simple inevitability is that we will be displaced along with commercial businesses. Do we really want to see rich people from overseas living here while we and our children have to live in the outback? NO, so please provide an article(s) telling local Canadians where this insane market is leading us. BCREA, BC real estate, tells us housing will soar another 30% in 2016 and, if you can believe this, will drop to around 5% in 2017. These were the people who originally told us overseas buyers only affected luxury properties! Did the reporter, Dan Fumano, ever ask BCREA how they arrived at this low figure? Even banks are concerned about the rise in house mortgages and are increasing down payment terms and further more Martin Collacott forecasts another million immigrants in Vancouver area by 2040. It is certainly time for some urgent action by our various government levels instead of continued procrastination.

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, June 3, 2016 11:56 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX

Cc: prime minister; bill.morneau@canada.ca

Subject: Brace for more housing shortages, warns Vancouver real estate guru Bob Rennie | Vancouver Sun

So, our elected officials take their lead from a condo real estate salesman? Ah.....isn't that a bit of a conflict of interest? Rennie will make millions more if they do as he directs and keeps razing our city/region to build yet more of his empty condos.

Who the hell is in charge- Rennie or the people who ran for office? I guess all his \$20,000 dinners really did work!

<http://vancouver.sun.com/business/real-estate/brace-for-more-housing-shortages-warns-vancouver-real-estate-guru-bob-rennie>

From: s.22

Sent: Saturday, June 4, 2016 12:31 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX; deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX

Cc: info@reabc.ca

Subject: Complainants puzzled by lack of action on probe of Vancouver realty firm - The Globe and Mail

Not impressed.....

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/no-action-taken-on-vancouvers-new-coast-realty-complainants-report/article30279257/>

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, June 5, 2016 7:48 PM

To: prime minister; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; bill.morneau@canada.ca

Cc: deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX

Subject: Vancouver mayor calls for province and feds to heed warnings on overheated housing | Vancouver Sun

As a commenter says below this article-make it compulsory to have a few years minimum of Canadian income tax returns with real income proven and SIN #'s on ALL RE transactions. Also real names should be compulsory-not #'d companies. The raising of down payments needed does nothing here as the buyers don't even have a mortgage-they pay cash.

This is not rocket science.

s.22

<http://vancouversun.com/business/local-business/vancouver-mayor-calls-for-province-and-feds-to-heed-warnings-on-overheated-housing>

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 9:11 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing un-affordability

Dear Christy Clark,

s.22

seen housing become so un-affordable in our community s.22 a 2 bedroom  
Condo whose asking price was \$459,000 and it sold for \$549,000. \$100,000 over the asking  
price for a 2 bedroom Condo is craziness. \$550,000 for a 2 bedroom Condo could buy you a nice  
4 bedroom house elsewhere in the Country.

What are your plans to solve the spiraling out of control prices of real estate in B.C.? Can you  
please let me know. s.22

s.22

Kind regards,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 3:53 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing un-affordability

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Last month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Saturday, June 4, 2016 2:11 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Re: Real estate 2nd email

Resending as of this date no reply. s.22

Sent from my iPhone

On May 26, 2016, at 8:01 PM, feejeeb wrote:

Hello,

I want to ask you to please let our children to be able to buy homes and to be able to stay in GVRD. You were elected to do the right things for the people. By letting the out of control prices to continue because of China's economical problem's, and/or money laundering has to stop, our citizens are hurting.

You have the power to make positive change here and morally and ethically it is the right thing to do, simple as that.

Thank you for your time and hopefully will see that you correct this major crisis we are in asap.

s.22

Sent from Samsung tablet

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 3:42 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Real estate 2nd email

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Last month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.



-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 12:26 AM

To: John Horgan; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: vancouver house prices

Attn: Premier Clark

The inflow of foreign capital is making Vancouver unaffordable for its residents.

We need a luxury tax and a flipping tax, as well as a tax on unoccupied houses. Please see this statement by Vancouver Mayor Gregor Robertson

We're appalled that your government has done nothing about this until now.

Please take action on this issue

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, February 29, 2016 4:40 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing Affordability in Lower Mainland

Hello,

My name is s.22  
s.22

I would like the government to provide me with some information as to whether anything is begin done in terms of increasing affordability for those who live here. I will not except the excuse that studies are currently being conducted to correlate the foreign funds with increase in home prices. Is it not obvious that, if people who work here can't afford buying a house here, then the money must be coming from elsewhere?

Thanks in advance for your response.

Regards,

s.22

From: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: March 1, 2016 4:04 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing Affordability in Lower Mainland

Hello, <sup>s.22</sup>, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measure we just introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Additionally, in delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Historic investment in affordable housing | BC Gov News  
[news.gov.bc.ca](https://news.gov.bc.ca)

Over the next five years, the Province is committing a total of \$355 million to create upwards of 2,000 new affordable housing units across British Columbia.

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Sunday, June 5, 2016 6:02 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Re: Housing Affordability in Lower Mainland

Hello,

The measures that the BC government is taking, in my point of view, are benefiting the big construction companies more than anybody else. Probably the same companies that are financing the political campaigns. In addition, I don't see any of these measures solving the problem.

What does the government think of investor immigrants using Quebec as a back door to enter BC? According to various articles, more than 90% of these mega wealthy end up living in the Vancouver area, buying property and driving prices up. Please let me know if the government will take any action on this front.

Everybody in Vancouver knows what is driving the prices up. Is it not obvious that if local workers can't afford a home, it must be people bringing funds from elsewhere that are buying???

Regards,

s.22

<http://www.news1130.com/2015/04/01/investor-immigrants-using-quebec-as-back-door-to-vancouver/>

Investor immigrants using Quebec as back door to Vancouver ...

[www.news1130.com](http://www.news1130.com)

VANCOUVER (NEWS1130) - As thousands of temporary foreign workers are faced with having to leave Canada because of changes to the federal jobs program ...

From: s.22  
Sent: Friday, June 3, 2016 12:53 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing

Dear Premier Christy Clark,

Hopefully the subject of this letter didn't instantly make you move it to your junk mail. But that's the attitude I'm getting from Gregor Robertson, you, and Justin Trudeau. That this issue can be simply swept under the rug, and considered junk.

s.22 I have watched as my beloved city has turned from a soulful place full of character and opportunity, where the average working-class person was able to create a life for themselves. This is no longer the case. The opinions of thousands of Vancouverites calling for regulations on foreign investing have been systematically ignored, and you are ALL responsible. Young skilled people are being forced out of the city at an alarming rate, moving to cities where their governments actually have the best interests of their citizens in mind. In 20 years, Vancouver will be a desolate place with no families and no skilled workers. I need to know... what is your final goal here? When almost all world-class cities have introduced strict policies on foreign investing, our government has simply sat back and watched the problem escalate out of control, while returning back to their nice homes at the end of the day to forget that any of it is happening.

Believe me when I say that when the shit hits the fan, our municipal, provincial, and federal governments will be solely to blame, and the people will need explanations.

You must look yourself in the mirror and ask yourself: Do you want to be the premier responsible for facilitating the most catastrophic housing crisis in Canada? Or do you want to be remembered for actually doing something about it?

You probably won't read this. But as a citizen, I am fed up with watching my city sell its soul to countries that have no interest in making Canada a better place.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, June 6, 2016 9:25 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing

Hello and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Last month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, June 2, 2016 6:35 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Sullivan.MLA, Sam LASS:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX

Cc: contact@bcliberals.com

Subject: Vancouver home prices climb almost 30 per cent from a year ago - Vancouver Sun

Hello BC Liberals,

Housing prices have gone up 30% in the last year in Vancouver.

If a home was worth \$1,000,000, the home has gone up \$300,000. How are families and young people supposed to afford this?

Please place Vancouver residents ahead of foreign investors and special interests in the Real Estate industry.

Vancouver home prices climb almost 30 per cent from a year ago - Vancouver Sun

<http://vancouver.sun.com/storyline/vancouver-home-prices-climb-almost-30-per-cent-from-a-year-ago>

Graphic | The story of how Vancouver lost its affordability ... and its mind - Vancouver Sun

<http://vancouver.sun.com/news/local-news/graphic-the-story-of-how-vancouver-lost-its-affordability-and-its-mind>

<http://www.visualcapitalist.com/vancouver-real-estate-mania/>

Regards,

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, June 2, 2016 7:00 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX; Sullivan.MLA, Sam LASS:EX

Cc: contact@bcliberals.com

Subject: Oversight of British Columbia's housing market is a sham - Globe and Mail

Hello BC Liberals,

By all accounts and daily newspaper articles, it appears that the "self regulating" model for the Vancouver Real Estate industry is just not working. Is any action going to be taken to curb unethical practices in this industry?

Please read the following articles:

Oversight of British Columbia's housing market is a sham - Globe and Mail

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/oversight-of-british-columbias-housing-market-is-a-sham/article30227434/>

Realtor says he was targeted after calling out unethical practices - Globe and Mail

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/real-estate/vancouver/realtor-says-he-was-a-target-after-calling-out-unethical-practices/article30215834/>

Public pressures trigger turmoil among Metro Vancouver realtors - Vancouver Sun

<http://vancouversun.com/business/local-business/a-house-divided-public-pressure-triggers-turmoil-among-realtors>

Regards,

s.22





PRESIDENT  
Dan Morrison

PRESIDENT-ELECT  
Jill Oudil

VICE-PRESIDENT  
Phil Moore

PAST PRESIDENT  
J. Darcy McLeod

DIRECTORS  
Taylor Biggar  
Barb Burrows  
Doug Dang  
Lynn Dequanne  
Colette Gerber  
Danny Gerbrandt  
Wendy Hunter  
Keith Liedtke  
Lisa Morris  
Ashley Smith  
Deborah Spicer  
David Yang

ADVISOR  
Catherine Boivie  
Brian Friedrich

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER  
Brad Scott



REALTORS Care®

ORDER OF EXCELLENCE



May 31, 2016

Premier Christy Clark  
Premier of British Columbia  
West Annex, Parliament Buildings  
Victoria, BC V8V 1X4

Dear Premier Clark:

**RE: REALTOR® PROFESSIONALISM AND ETHICS**

Ten Greater Vancouver Realtors were in Victoria meeting with MLAs, from April 25-26, talking about ways to make home ownership more affordable.

The Realtors, some of whom were first-time attendees to the BC Real Estate Association's Government Liaison conference, were encouraged by the response they received from MLAs and cabinet ministers in our region.

MLAs had read our materials. At meetings, MLAs listened and provided thoughtful, reasoned responses. We saw, first hand, our concerns taken seriously and addressed and supported.

It was a terrific example of community building with your constituents – a practice that Realtors value as professionals.

Since 1919, the Real Estate Board of Greater Vancouver (REBGV) has strived to be a leader in community building, both with our members and with the clients our Realtors serve.

Currently, Realtors face persistent challenges. First and foremost are the allegations of Realtor misconduct appearing in the media.

The vast majority of Realtors have high standards – they're ethical, conscientious, accountable, and hard working.

Our members are so distressed by these allegations they voted to triple the maximum fines for those who break our rules, and they also supported a motion to explore more stringent eligibility criteria for new members at our March 2016 annual general meeting.

Consumer protection is paramount to us and our members. We have a long-standing Professional Standards department. Our members follow our Realtor Code of Ethics. Our members follow our Rules of Cooperation. Our members follow the Real Estate Council Rules as well as local, provincial and federal legislation and regulations.

.../2

The Independent Advisory Group (IAG) will release its report in a few weeks. We want to continue to work with you as partners to promote policy initiatives and ethical practices that will strengthen our communities. So, if you have any questions about the report, please contact us.

We're optimistic the IAG report will help our professionals make positive changes and lead toward a better future in our communities.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read "Harriet Permut". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Harriet" and last name "Permut" clearly distinguishable.

Harriet Permut  
Manager, Government Relations

c.c     Hon. Rich Coleman  
         Hon. Michael de Jong, Q.C.  
         Mr. John Horgan  
         Mr. Robert Laing, BCREA

OOP RESPONSE:

June 9, 2016

Harriet Permut  
Real Estate Board of Greater Vancouver  
2433 Spruce Street  
Vancouver, BC V6H 4C8

Dear Ms. Permut:

Thank you for your letter regarding the meetings that took place with local MLAs in late April. We appreciate your keeping in touch.

We will share your letter with the Premier at the earliest opportunity, and we too look forward to the Independent Advisory Group's report.

Thank you, again, for writing.

*Office of the Premier*

*Correspondence Branch*

From: s.22  
Sent: Sunday, May 29, 2016 10:52 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Vancouver's way over-priced real estate market

Dear Madam Premier,

s.22

s.22 Recently, The Walrus, a Canadian publication of which I am sure you are familiar, published an article concerning the high cost of residential real estate in Vancouver and the reasons that situation exists. The link to that article is immediately below this paragraph and, if you have not read the article, I urge you to do so and take the contents very seriously.

<http://thewalrus.ca/the-highest-bidder/>

That article is the most accurate and comprehensive article about what is really happening in Greater Vancouver with respect to the cause of their high real estate prices that I have ever read! It states everything which I have been saying for several years about that housing price crisis, including very accurate, well researched comments illustrating the lack of foresight by all governments in the cause and effect of the policy to encourage unlimited foreign capital investment into B.C. without any sort of conditions that must be met to do so. The result has been Vancouver housing becoming a very real pathway to essentially launder massive amounts of money into a safe area and thereby avoid the very limited and seemingly unenforceable Chinese policy of restricting the outflow of capital from their country. What is even more disturbing, is the misrepresentation, either intentionally or not, of what is really happening in Vancouver and the lack of concern by some government officials about the terrible and real cause and effect of a badly thought out government policy and pursuit of foreign capital for investment in B.C. by all levels of government, including federal, provincial, and municipal. I cannot understand why your government is not properly paying attention to the problem that has been created for whatever reasons. It would seem to me that your ability to be re-elected as a government should be and will be dramatically affected by this problem. I have heard many people who have stated they will never vote for you and your party again! It appears to the citizens of Vancouver and most of B.C. that you are willfully ignoring this increasingly bad situation.

What is really disgusting to me is some politicians calling the attempts of knowledgeable people who are properly concerned about the high prices in Vancouver and who accurately point the

finger at wealthy, foreign, Chinese buyers as creating the problem, as 'being racist'! It has nothing to do with 'racism'!! In my opinion, the inaction of those political leaders to meaningfully regulate, tax, or do anything about the massive, unrestricted, unconditional inflow of 'Chinese' (and other) foreign offshore capital, illustrates either their incompetence or ignorance of what is really happening. Our political leaders seem to acquiescence in this damaging situation and I wonder why? Is it a refusal and inability to admit any errors in judgment and foresight, or is it the just absolute conviction that they are always right and 'egos are running amok'! In my opinion, the failure of politicians to listen attentively to those non-political professionals who know and have thoroughly studied what is happening, and our politicians' continual, political distortion of the real facts behind Greater Vancouver's skyrocketing real estate market, constitutes their failure to live up to their duty to those B.C and Vancouver area residents who put them into their positions of political authority in the first place! Come the next election, many of those voters will remember those politicians at the ballot box. Unfortunately, by that time, we will all regret what will be the eventual result of having parts of such a beautiful city resemble a type of empty, urban ghetto.

Other countries, as the article stated, have at least taken some concrete steps to mitigate the damage that can and will be done to their citizens by allowing this type of situation to continue in an unfettered manner. Even the idea of a huge tax on non-resident owners/purchasers to fund assistance to those who otherwise cannot afford to buy (or even rent!) a home in their own residential area would be a step, at least. Please understand, I have never condoned the interference of government in a free market situation running normally but, in this case, it is the government(s) (Federal, Provincial and Municipal) with their short-sighted policies, misplaced ambitions to pursue foreign investment unconditionally and lack of concern about the result, that have created this mess and it is the average working person or family that is now suffering! On top of everything else, I have noted that your trip to Asia to pursue even more foreign investment includes some representation from two Vancouver real estate companies! What does it take to make your government wake up?? We are concerned citizens of this province and are not 'racists' despite what some politicians are erroneously suggesting!!!

s.22

From: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX [mailto:Premier@gov.bc.ca]  
Sent: May-30-16 4:42 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver's way over-priced real estate market

Hello, <sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Wednesday, June 1, 2016 12:26 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: RE: Vancouver's way over-priced real estate market  
Importance: High

Office of the Premier,

Thank you very much for your reply, below, dated May 30, 2016. First, let me say I applaud the measures your government has taken so far and support all of them outlined in the 'links' included in your message. I especially applaud the legislation to stop the 'flipping for profit' by unscrupulous realtors and/or buyers, and the efforts by Minister Mike DeJong to track and collate the countries of origin/residency for those purchasers who are not Canadian residents in order to determine the extent of non-resident, foreign capital which most of us in the real estate business strongly feel is driving the incredible increases in residential property values, primarily in Greater Vancouver.

However, I have two concerns. First, the penalties against unscrupulous realtors (or buyers) who violate the legislation must absolutely be very large and punitive, and mandatory, to ensure it is viewed by the violators as a proper deterrent. The Real Estate Council's record on enforcing punishment against acts that are illegal is limited by the legislation, and sometimes ineffective, as they are often viewed by the perpetrators as 'a cost of doing business'! s.22  
s.22

If it does not have the desired, deterrent effect, the legislation is worthless and will only serve to require more legislation in the future. Honest, and hardworking Realtors have often remarked on the lack of real, meaningful deterrent for serious violators in our B.C. real estate legislation.

Second, in my opinion, the legislation to collect information on non-resident purchasers will take a fair amount of time to collect, collate and act upon, which does nothing in the short term to halt the incredible pace of rapidly increasing prices in the lower mainland. Further, if it does in fact result in effective legislation being created, will it cover situations where a foreign, non-resident national, either directly themselves, or through a Canadian resident or citizen successfully obscure their purchase through establishing a Canadian registered corporation, or through some private agreement with an individual who meets the legislation's requirements? I doubt it.

s.22  
s.22, and often the punishments for that type of activity do not exist or, are viewed as I said, 'a cost of doing business'. Personally, I have always found that the best and fastest way to limit and/or reduce such activity is through high, non-resident taxes being applied on the purchaser of the property, and strong and enforceable legislation to prevent all attempts by all ways and means, including obvious intent, for such violators to get around that legislation. Also, if there were conditions placed on non-resident buyers to pay a very high (and I mean a very high tax in the range of approximately a few hundred thousand dollars!), on their property purchase, and those funds were deposited into the government's fund for subsidized rental housing, and/or alternatively into a new fund to provide low, government sponsored mortgages to assist local, lower income buyers to purchase, it would help to lessen and offset the

impact on local residents who currently face enormously high prices and who are currently trying desperately and unsuccessfully to find a way to afford to enter into purchasing a first-time home, or even purchase a limited upgrade entry to a larger home when their requirements change due, for example, to an increase in the size of their family, i.e., having children, etc.

I sincerely hope your government will act now on the problem in a manner that can prevent current as well as future non-resident buyers or unscrupulous Realtors from acerbating the problem further. It is already too late in many respects but taking immediate steps that can be amended, reduced or eliminated in the future could still be effective in limiting any ongoing damage currently taking place.

Thank you, again, for taking the time to respond to my emails.

s.22



From:s.22

Sent: Wednesday, June 1, 2016 12:48 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: The best solution

I have seen so far, to taming the Toronto & Vancouver housing markets is cutting off immigration from Asia & China, also putting restrictions on how many Chinese can be employed in the real estate market, many are better suited for the mining sector

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

-----Original Message-----

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]

Sent: Wednesday, June 1, 2016 10:33 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: FW: Homeless in Vancouver

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: June 1, 2016 8:42 AM

To: Clark.MLA, Christy

Subject: Homeless in Vancouver

To Honourable Clark

Your government has allowed the foreign money from Asia to destroy our way of life in this province. This has made it unaffordable to live in the lower mainland for the average joe with a modest income. This problem is creeping north slowly but steadily. If your Government continues to ignore this issue it will put life time tax paying residence in poverty.

This requires drastic action and laws to disallow foreign investors to drive up affordable housing for people with average income or you must increase the wages for ALL BC residence as the problem is now noticeable as far north as Vanderhoof BC. FYI we are already trying to survive on 20% of our earned dollar in the north let alone the south. When is enough for governments? When they get 100% and the rest goes to the rich? We may as well move to North Korea then and follow that model. NOT!!

Your Government has sold us out for short term tax revenue by allowing foreign money to purchase our prime properties and sit vacant. Canadians can not afford to live here. This is unsustainable forcing BC residence further north and allowing Asia to own the lower mainland pushing us out. Nip this in the butt now.

s.22

Sent from my iPad

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, June 1, 2016 8:01 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing Leadership Needed

Dear Premier.

Please act decisively to improve affordable housing in the Lower Mainland.

While I have a house and am benefitting from crazy appreciation, s.22

s.22

s.22

there are 4 houses bought by offshore buyers that have sat empty for over a year. Anybody that takes good housing stock off the market should be penalized through much greater property taxes.

Also, municipal politicians are too sensitive to the lobbying of local residents to meaningfully increase zoning density in Vancouver. This is a crisis that requires Provincial intervention.

Please act.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 8:47 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Realtor says he was targeted after calling out unethical practices - The Globe and Mail

Dear Premier,

Some heads need to roll but not Keith Roy's. The RE Board of Vancouver is so dysfunctional and self-serving they no longer know what ethical behaviour is. Maybe you can help them out?

s.22

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/real-estate/vancouver/realtor-says-he-was-a-target-after-calling-out-unethical-practices/article30215834/>

Realtor says he was targeted after calling out unethical practices

Copyright

Page 141

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 2:16 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Jeffrey Simpson: Why isn't B.C. cracking down on real cause of rising home prices? -  
The Globe and Mail

From The Globe and Mail:

Jeffrey Simpson: Why isn't B.C. cracking down on real cause of rising home prices?

Via The Globe and Mail's iPhone app

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 30, 2016 9:07 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: RE: Housing affordability concern

Hi

I will try to be as concise as possible.

I just wanted to write a follow up email to state that I'm still very unhappy with the lack of leadership and action of this government on the housing affordability problem. I consider the shadow flipping issue a tiny drop in a bucket / political photo op rather than actually dealing with the issue in any significant way. I would suggest that you need to increase the property transfer tax at the top of the real estate market and limit foreign buyers. Use this tax to end the bridge tolls that we shouldn't be paying in the first place. s.22

s.22 Do not wait until the election and then try to make it look like you've done something. I believe this is the biggest issue facing our community and we as the people need our government to take action. It is part of why we are being forced to close schools in Vancouver cause nobody can afford to live here, just to pay to open new spots in Surrey. This is not responsible government spending. The government should also be forcing a better regulatory system onto the real estate industry, as the current one is not working either. s.22

s.22 There are a lot of people in my generation who feel this way and I encourage this government to re-think it's current policies before it's too late, as the government is ultimately supposed to listen to the needs of the public. It's my opinion, that this government has currently lost the ability to hear us, which is why I'm writing this. I doubt this will change anything, but I wish that more people would also explain their thoughts to the government. Thank you for your time.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, May 30, 2016 12:10 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: BC Realestate Prices  
s.22

We are both angry, at the BC government for letting foreign buyers, drive up our real estate prices. s.22  
s.22

If what you wanted is a series of empty condos and foreign investment, and your born and raised citizens forced to leave for work elsewhere, I have to wonder in what wisdom are you running the government, and what loyalty and / care do you really have for your citizens?

In the morning I often follow a Vancouver Bus, with either a Chinese Realestate team placard, in all Chinese script, or a bus that says ' Our Realtors know Luxury'.

It isn't right. This is the biggest, most obviously 'wrong' thing you've allowed to happen in BC. You need to stop. Stop and really think about people, who cannot afford to work here, working professionals, tech, trades, teachers. Who drive hours away to Abbotsford, to 'try' to afford a townhouse. s.22

Please do something to fix this mess. The BC property transfer tax removal on new properties is a small start, but it doesn't fix the fact, that a house even in Langley now is 800 000 +. and a townhouse in Langley is 450 000 +. This is Langley ! More than an hour away and those are the



prices. I can't even list New West, Burnaby, Vancouver s.22

Thanks!  
s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 3:06 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: BC Realestate Prices

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

As you indicated in your email, one of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]

Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 9:33 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: FW: Housing market

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: May 30, 2016 3:18 PM

To: Clark.MLA, Christy

Subject: Housing market

Ms. Clark,

We as Canadians are very concerned about the high cost of real estate in the lower mainland and Victoria. s.22

There should be restrictions for foreign buyers that do not intend to live in the house permanently.

Obviously a small number of people are making a huge amount of money in this real estate situation. It is out of control and needs to be stopped.

Our adult children have lived in the lower mainland all their lives and will never be able to afford any real estate.

Thanking you in advance for your reply,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 3:19 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing market

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 29, 2016 9:05 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Excellent article on housing from today's Vancouver Sun

Dear Christy,

Below is an excellent article on housing from today's Vancouver Sun.

s.22

- 28 May 2016

- The Vancouver Sun

- Herbert Grubel is a professor of economics (emeritus) at Simon Fraser University.

Immigration spurs housing demand 3

ZoomBookmarkSharePrintListenTranslate

Copyright

Page 150

Withheld pursuant to/removal as

Copyright

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 9:53 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: May 26, 2016 11:28 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name  
s.22

Email  
s.22

Riding  
s.22 British Columbia

Comments & Feedback  
Dear Christy Clark,

I'm going to pass on an email I sent to my MP, s.22 regarding my dismay and experiences with looking for housing in Vancouver. I would really appreciate knowing what, if any, plans there are, to limit foreign investment in this city (including Air B & Bs) and to start building much much needed AFFORDABLE housing for the real citizens (meaning not rich) of Vancouver? AFFORDABLE means a single person such as myself should not need to pay \$1600 to live in a suite that is decent and clean. If you believe there are decent and clean suites for less, then you have not been on Craigslist lately. They are very rare and probably get 100 replies in a single day. Please I would really appreciate a meaningful response. s.22  
s.22

What are your plans to help and respond to the obvious housing crisis in Vancouver?

Thank you.  
s.22

Dear s.22

s.22

s.22                         There are many landlords that have no knowledge or respect for our current tenancy laws and express openly that they do not care; they are in the position of power right now as vacancy rates are so low and there is so much competition. Yet I sense also that they feel the victims and wonder why. I feel (at times) like relations and decent human interaction is breaking down in this city.

s.22

s.22 Could it be that people are just not earning enough in this city to pay the rents asked of them? It seems there is an enormous disconnect between what people earn and how much they have to pay to live. Or single mothers, people with mental health issues or disabilities, the elderly, how do they manage? Just two days ago a sweet elderly man on the sky train carrying a garbage bag of items and rolling a suitcase along, looking disbelieved and clearly homeless, said sheepishly to me, "My pension doesn't pay me enough." Is this city becoming more and more heartless? I fear that it is. If I find myself homeless or need to get a short term rental for awhile with my things in storage, though uncomfortable, I can, s.22



s.22

But isn't it crazy that it is so hard to find housing? And what about everybody else in Vancouver who are lower income earners? s.22

s.22

How long has the city been 'discussing' this housing problem or suggesting some stats or research get underway? It seems empty rhetoric. The problem has been happening for years and we know what is coming; it is without a doubt going to get worse if action by the government is not taken. s.22

s.22

s.22

I think, what will Vancouver be like in another 15 or 20 years with thousands more foreign investors buying up the housing and driving up the cost to rent or purchase? I hear that over 50% of Vancouver's population rents. Here is my question: Why is the government not doing anything about what is happening here? Putting restrictions on foreign investments, taxing empty properties, stopping renovations, preventing needless demolitions of perfectly good homes and most importantly, building affordable housing? I have heard many of our wealthy and elite citizens (politicians, policy makers, real estate tycoons, investors, others working in real estate licensed or not) are benefitting from this either illegal or unethical activity, from the soaring value of their property and from the lifestyles they enjoy. Those with high enough salaries in this city perhaps do not yet feel the pinch. I wonder how enjoyable it will be when all the young talent and caring people leave the city. People who are not solely invested in the accumulation of wealth for themselves, but in investing in their communities and doing jobs which matter, but are not necessarily highly paid or even well-paid. Is it right that there are so many people in this city or abroad who own several properties and even leave some empty while others struggle to find places to rent?

So that is my rant, s.22

It is not meant to be directed at you personally, as I see that you seem very invested in solving this problem, but I think that citizens sharing their stories and experiences with their government officials is important in showing the reality of what people are experiencing and you are my MP for my geographical location. s.22

s.22

Please let me know when there will be another housing forum in the city.

Yours truly,

s.22

From: "OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX"  
To: s.22  
Cc: "Minister, MNGD MNGD:EX"  
Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 2:16 PM  
Subject: RE: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Hello, s.22, and thank you for sharing your email to MP Don Davies with us. You've clearly put a lot of thought into your comments and we appreciate your taking the time to share them with us.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing and the extremely low vacancy rate of rental units in the Metro Vancouver area is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

On your behalf, we are sharing your comments with the Honourable Rich Coleman, Minister Responsible for Housing, so he too is aware of your concerns regarding the rental housing market in Vancouver. Please be assured your input will be included in the Minister's related discussions.

Again, thank you writing. We appreciate hearing from you.

cc: Honourable Rich Coleman

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 2:57 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Hello,

Thank you for your response. May I ask some questions?

1) 2000 units over the next five years sounds like next to nothing for what is needed. How do you think this really addresses any true need to meet the demand? And, how will that help anyone in the meantime, as I am now myself applying for jobs in other provinces. I just want to point out that unfortunately this is too little too late, as usual. It really doesn't address the problems of what is happening in this city with real estate, foreign investments, Air B and Bs and unused suites. Does the government have any plans to really do anything effective? This city is becoming a city for the rich; to deny that at this point seems dishonest. With 0.5% vacancy rates, depressing basement suites and insane rents, what do you really believe would be the incentive for smart, committed citizens to stay and invest their talent and caring any further in this city? s.22

s.22

s.22 . We have two kinds of people here now. Those who are rich enough to buy property or were smart or fortunate enough to have the means to get in early, and then all the renters who are like the serfs paying the way for the others, and while rents are so high that just further negates any possibility of renters EVER being able to save money for real estate. And the divide just continues to grow...This is not sustainable!!

2) Also, what will the rents be for affordable housing? And what can one's maximum income be to apply? s.22

s.22

s.22 . People leave this city and will continue to do so. When developments have gone up recently around sky train stations, the cost for a 1-bedroom 450 foot apartment is \$1500. Is that reasonable?

Thanks,

s.22

From: s.22

> Sent: Wednesday, May 25, 2016 1:48 PM

> To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

> Subject: City beyond unaffordable

>

> Dear Hon Premier Christy Clark.

>

> I have been wanting to send this for a long time but have finally decided to end the procrastination.

>

> I have watched the real estate go from being extremely expensive to completely unaffordable in the last two or three years.

> At the same time you have been quoted as saying you do not want to intervene in the housing market and mess with people's home equity.

> Why are you doing that? Never mind this misguided thought, as a resident I would far rather see our youth be able to get into this market.

> My house equity is irrelevant to my daily life. The only thing it is doing is making the entire next generation completely shut out of this market.

> Our children will be displaced by wealthy people; some with no interest in Vancouver other than dumping money and investing.

> We are giving away this city to investors.

>

> Investors love what is going on, and anyone who cares for our next generation and the young children to follow do not.

> How on earth do you expect any young person to buy here? Rental stock is at or below 1% so there are almost no options.

> The average salary in Vancouver is quoted as around \$45,000 while the average house is \$1.7 million or now I hear over \$2 million. Could this be any more out of reach for youth.

> I stress youth but even doctors and other professionals are being squeezed out. What is going to be left?

>

> Are we now just going to sell out to investors? This city is a dumping ground for overseas cash.

> Whether you care to admit that or not the reality is our youth are in dire straights.

>

s.22

> I sadly see the future here of families moving away and leaving behind a city full of investors, empty houses and older people who hang in or sell out and downsize.

>

> Tax overseas buyers. Tax empty houses. Ensure laundered money is not being used to buy houses. Might explain why some houses are selling at considerably more than the listing price.

>

s.22

>

> s.22  
>

> On May 27, 2016, at 2:08 PM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

>

> Hello, <sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

>

> We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

>

> One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

>

> Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

>

> Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

>

> Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

>

> Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 2:30 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: City beyond unaffordable

I much appreciate a reply!

s.22

I appreciate what has been started and I hope more action to curtail foreign investment is implemented very soon. These are smart people or know how to get around rules and regulations.

Many are also using currency tied to the US dollar which has given them a 30-45% savings the past two years.

We need to ensure our youngsters can stay here and it may be too late.

I honestly have no idea how my children will ever find a property. I really hope you have solutions that will cool this market.

I fully understand how much money is coming to the government through property purchase taxes but this short term gain is destroying our future.

Sincerely, s.22

Original Message-----

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]

Sent: Monday, May 30, 2016 9:51 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: FW: Housing

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: May 26, 2016 9:11 PM

To: Clark.MLA, Christy

Subject: Housing

Hey Christy,

It's s.22 here. I didn't hear back from you on the first email I sent you, so here's hoping that the second is going to get through to you.

Just wanted to let you know that I believe that having a roof over one's head is a basic human right, not an investment.

Will you please stop selling out our Province to China? s.22

s.22

s.22, and I see all of the empty houses. When will the people s.22  
s.2 be able to afford a house in this city? Remember that the foreign money you are selling out  
our province to isn't going to vote for you in the next election.

Will your legacy be that your government created the 3rd most expensive city in the entire world  
to live in?

I would appreciate a response.

Hope all is well with you.

Best,

s.22

--



From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2016 11:53 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your emails. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Sunday, May 29, 2016 7:40 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Cc: s.22  
Subject: REaltors to asia.

s.22 and have been witnessing the pricing in Vancouver being driven up by wealthy Asians so that locals can no longer afford to Live in Vancouver..  
And you take realtors with you to stimulate more wealthy Asians to come and buy in Vancouver. I have spoken to many realtors in Vancouver and they all admit that it is the wealthy Asians who are making housing unaffordable for the locals.

s.22

Even Victoria is now being affected.  
Thank you for receiving my concerns.

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Thursday, May 26, 2016 2:56 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Fwd: May 25th 2016 News - Vancouver Housing Prices, Down Payments & Saving Money By Cycling.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: s.22  
Date: Thu, May 26, 2016 at 1:52 PM  
Subject: May 25th 2016 News - Vancouver Housing Prices, Down Payments & Saving Money By Cycling.  
To: viewers@globalnational.com  
Cc: "news@ctv.ca"

Good afternoon.

s.22

s.22 ! Some new condo towers have grown into place here and there and many new homes have been built as always since Expo 86 ended and the real estate boom really began. The prices of real estate however being the exception! They are now through the roof and into clouds above where many of the younger generation will simply have to dream of what once was possible.

It has been a hot topic of late and yesterday the information you presented on the Global and CTV on how long it would take to save for a down payment was almost enough to send all people between 20 and 30 years of age out of province to look for an affordable future elsewhere. Yes giving up a personal vehicle is one way of saving however be well aware that in our cities here in the Lower Mainland you do so at a very high risk of personal injury or even death. s.22

s.22

s.22

Before we encourage people to take to cycling for commuting understand that many new visitors to Vancouver have no idea about what and how these cycling lanes work. Even with cycling lanes dedicated we ride at the risk of being injured simply to save dollars. Risk = Reward sometimes and only for so long!

I would really encourage our younger local people to consider building small <http://grow.wealthsimple.com/how-to-buy-a-tiny-house/> on their parents property where and if possible? Lobby local government for rezoning so that we whom have grown up here in the Vancouver area can continue to live and raise our families. Younger people will then be able to manage their finances in a way that will serve their interests and give them back the quality of life their parents had available to them prior to Expo 86 when life was affordable. In the meanwhile developers can continue to build for the off shore

and foreign market that seemingly have no problem with paying \$ Millions.

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, May 24, 2016 4:30 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: First Time Home Buyer - Vancouver housing crisis

Hello Christy,

I am trying to appeal to your sense of reason. s.22

s.22

There has to be an incentive introduced on the sell-side to entice a seller to want to sell to a first time home buyer. With real estate agents and foreign investors pushing hard for the "no condition" bid, someone who has not yet received financing can never and will never be able to compete in this market. I appreciate the incentives that allow first time home buyers to withdraw from the RRSP and avoid paying transfer taxes, but that still does not make anyone want to sell to us.

I have lost any hope of ever being able to own in the Lower Mainland. s.22, \_\_\_\_\_  
s.22 I cannot imagine what the struggle must be for those who's circumstances differ from mine. If there was an incentive to the seller to consider bids with conditions such as financing, or a home inspection (who buys a home without this type of due diligence?), it would really level the playing field a bit for those like myself who are currently struggling.

Thank you for your consideration.

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 2:06 PM

To: s.22\_

Subject: RE: First Time Home Buyer - Vancouver housing crisis

Hello, s.22\_, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

We see that you've made some suggestions for incentives in the real estate market. Please be assured that your input will be included in any upcoming discussions.

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

Original-recipient: rfc822;rich.coleman.MLA@leg.bc.ca  
Final-recipient: rfc822;rich.coleman.MLA@leg.bc.ca  
Action: failed  
Status: 5.7.1 (SMTP transmission failure has occurred)  
Remote-MTA: dns;mail.leg.bc.ca (TCP|24.224.136.13|62139|207.194.253.17|25)  
Diagnostic-code: smtp;550 5.7.1 24.207.66.159 listed at  
ydcswr3b3khq5sokx4gwkkjmuy.zen.dq.spamhaus.net  
From: s.22  
Subject: Martyn Brown: An essay on B.C.'s housing crisis and what to do about it | Georgia  
Straight Vancouver's News & Entertainment Weekly  
Date: 23 May, 2016 1:57:56 PM PDT  
To: premier@gov.bc.ca, rich.coleman.MLA@leg.bc.ca  
Cc: mike.dejong.mla@leg.bc.ca

Hello-paying attention yet?

The people of the province you profess to represent are getting increasingly livid. You claim you don't want to "affect the free market" but the market isn't "free" or "supply and demand" it is being gobbled up by offshore "investors" who as you know, get first dibs in many cases. The old housing that gets taken down, often is "affordable" to average working or retired people of average or modest means yet it almost universally gets replaced by "luxury" condos/townhomes etc. Look at "Marina Gardens" at Marine and Cambie for one example. The older homes with cheaper bsmt suites and older low rise apt buildings with basic apartments are never replaced with anything the former tenants could dream of affording. Where in hell do you expect the working class and even better paid to live? Hairdressers, daycare workers, teaching assistants, retail and restaurant workers, construction, ALL the people who keep a city working in other words!

Why are people from Communist China or anywhere other than Canada allowed to buy any and as many properties as they wish? This is simply not sustainable-you cannot be in such deep denial that you don't see this.

If you want the support of most residents of the lower mainland, Victoria, Nanaimo, etc etc you better snap out of it. We aren't buying your feeble excuses.

s.22

<http://www.straight.com/news/702206/martyn-brown-essay-bcs-housing-crisis-and-what-do-about-it>



From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 22, 2016 11:17 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX; XT:HLTH Ramsay, Shayne; gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca; mayor@victoria.ca; Holman.MLA, Gary LASS:EX; James.MLA, Carole A LASS:EX; Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX; Hamilton.MLA, Scott LASS:EX; Larson.MLA, Linda LASS:EX; Krog.MLA, Leonard LASS:EX  
Subject: Regarding Housing Crisis in British Columbia

Dear Premier Clark, Minister Coleman, Mr. Ramsay, Mayors, and Members of the Legislative Assembly,

s.22 who is growing increasingly concerned with the blatant lack of regulation of the housing industry in our region. Please read the attached letter outlining my concerns.

I feel that this issue is out of my hands, and I am genuinely fearful of what will happen to our communities over the next decade if things continue as they are. I am turning to you, the leaders of our communities and our province, to please act on our behalf.

Our communities need your coordinated action.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

s.22

--

s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 2:08 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Regarding Housing Crisis in British Columbia

Hello, <sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email and attached letter. We appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing is of deep concern and we want to work with the various municipalities across the province to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 23, 2016 10:50 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: housing in vancouver

Dear Premier Clark,

I have read and thought about articles in the Globe and Mail about shadow real estate dealings in Vancouver. These dealings have to do with money laundering associated with gang lords in China. These stories seem rather sensational and unfortunately true. You probably know the details better than I do, in fact better than all of your constituents do.

I assume that you were born and bred in Canada and understand, and at one time respected, the responsibility that elected representatives in a democracy have towards the people and actively upholding the law. Your action and inaction demonstrate that you are an anomaly in a democratic system that adheres to the rule of law. Now, you not only represent, but also knowingly contribute to the degradation of democracy. What a loss you are.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 24, 2016 7:43 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Thornthwaite.MLA, Jane LASS:EX

Subject: Let's fix Vancouver's broken housing market

BC Premier Christy Clark

Jane Thornthwaite MLA

Please, take into consideration some solutions provided for Vancouver "broken housing market"

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/bc-groups-rally-to-prioritize-housing-crisis-in-provincial-election/article30072991/>

We all know Metro Vancouver's housing market is broken. More and more, houses are seen as investments instead of homes - empty houses and luxury condos are all too common, while people who live and work here struggle to find affordable places to live.

But this can all change.

My latest report looks at the causes of the housing affordability crisis, and shows there is no shortage of solutions. I've outlined a multi-pronged approach that would restrict absentee ownership, increase the affordable housing supply, and make property taxes fair. Taken together, these solutions create a framework for more sensible management of housing in the interests of the people who live and work in our region.

Want to find out more? The report was all over the media yesterday - see links to some great stories below. Or read the report to learn more.

Marc Lee, Senior Economist, CCPA-BC  
& Author, Getting Serious About Affordable Housing

Check out the coverage

We anticipated some strong pushback against the proposals outlined in the report. After all, they're pretty radical in today's context where private sector development is taken for granted, and global capital flows into local real estate go largely unquestioned-but clearly we've reached a point where people are ready for action and solutions. Check out some of the coverage:

- The Globe and Mail: B.C. groups rally to prioritize housing crisis in provincial election
- The Tyee: CCPA Unveils Plan for 'Getting Serious about Affordable Housing'
- Vancouver Sun: Housing costs 'clear and present danger' to Metro's economy
- CBC News: Metro Vancouver real estate is like the lottery, says study
- CBC's Early Edition (audio): Interview with Marc Lee (begins at 2:40:00)

For more, you can also check out my recent op-ed on the subject.

Be sure to share

Retweet us or share our Facebook post.

CCPA BC Office - 1400-207 West Hastings St, Vancouver, BC V6B 1H7

Tel: 604-801-5121 - Fax: 604-801-5122

This email was sent to s.22 . To stop receiving emails, click here.

You can also keep up with CCPA-BC on Twitter.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: May 14, 2016 9:57 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: Lower Mainland Real Estate Affordability

Dear Premier Clark,

I am writing you to express my concern around the affordability of housing in the lower mainland. s.22

s.22

ty

s.22 Our expectations are that a concrete action plan to correct this issue is brought forward and executed in a timely manner. To date, I have not seen this from the BC Liberal government. I urge you to put forward a plan regarding this issue.

Regards,  
s.22

--

s.22

s.22

On 17 May 2016 at 14:47, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

Hello <sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Just last week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful

From: s.22  
Sent: Saturday, May 21, 2016 12:15 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Re: FW: Lower Mainland Real Estate Affordability

Hi,

Thank you for your response.  
I am familiar with these items that have been mentioned in the email.

However, my opinion is that the actions to date have not been effective as observed by the fact that market prices continue to escalate higher and higher. This has even spilled over to the rental market, where bidding wars are occurring for families that need to rent as they cannot afford to buy. From an economic perspective, we all know this is not sustainable, the market pricing is ridiculous.

To give this some perspective, s.22 and I firmly believe in economic growth from business with minimal government intervention. But this has gotten way out of hand, and not something that I think the market can address on its own. It is time for firm government intervention. Those that are participating in speculative investment in the real estate market can take their money to Vegas.

The reality is that I am not concerned for myself. I have been in the market for a long time and I own a home, so for me it is all relative. My concern is for the young families in this province as there is no possible way that their wages are sufficient for them to buy a home in this market. They will vote with their feet. It would be a shame to see the young highly educated, trained, and talented walk away from the province because they cannot afford to live here. This is not sustainable, especially with an aging population in BC.

I believe this issue is going to be the number one hot button for the election, it certainly is for me. Going forward with your current plan as real estate prices continue to spiral out of control will not convince me, and I cannot imagine it will convince many, that the Liberal government is adequately dealing with this issue.

So, I again urge you come up with a concrete action plan, implement that plan, and effectively address this issue.

Regards,  
s.22



From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, May 20, 2016 10:03 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Where are we going to live?

For you. Not our constituent.

From: s.22  
Sent: May 20, 2016 10:00 AM  
To: sunletters@vancouver.com; editor@nsnews.com  
Cc: Clark.MLA, Christy ; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca  
Subject: Where are we going to live?

While it is interesting to read all the figures and problems about housing in the media today the key issue is, where is this scenario going? Cannot some forecaster (say in the Urban Land Institute or university) examine the future result of the continuing increase in prices and who will live here in Vancouver and its suburbs. It is vital that local Canadians appreciate what the future brings if our governments are short-sighted enough not step in now and stop overseas buyers entering our real estate market. 6 months ago housing costs were rising at 20%/year, 3 months ago it was 30% and today the average house price is \$2.25M up \$250,000 or 12% in the last quarter or 48%/yr. No one around here can compete, or wants to, against this cash inflow, corrupt or otherwise, except perhaps real estate agents who are flogging our land overseas, so the simple inevitability is that we will be displaced along with commercial businesses. Do we really want to see rich people from overseas living here while we and our children have to live in the outback? NO, so please provide an article(s) telling local Canadians where this insane market is leading us.

s.22

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2016 2:28 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Vancouver's housing crisis

From: s.22  
Sent: May 18, 2016 2:00 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: Vancouver's housing crisis

Hi Christy,

I've been meaning to write to you for some time now to let you know s.22  
s.22 I have never before written to the  
government (of any level) but feel the need to do so now.

s.22

s.22

s.22 A number of young professionals I know have actually left Vancouver for other places in Canada due to the fact that they want to raise their family in a home and don't want to be completely house-poor in order to be able to do so. On the other hand, I know people who have maxed out their credit in order to buy a home and they are miserable as they have no extra income for anything. That is not the way to live life. I can only imagine how tough it must be to work a low income job in this city. The standard of living in Vancouver is horrible and is only getting worse. While this is happening, the people we've elected to serve us are doing exactly zero about it.

I am tired of hearing denials that the housing crisis is caused by foreign investment. It is quite clear that it is and absolutely nothing is being done to stop/slow it by our current government. s.  
s.22

s.22

Why not create a little bit of disincentive to

foreign investment (so that those of us who actually live here can actually afford to own here)? Why not ask them to put a bit of money back into our system, upon which we all depend so much, and to which foreign owners contribute almost nothing? I feel that we are complete fools for allowing this to have gone on, completely unimpeded and in fact, encouraged, for as long as it has.

I heard you make a comment, that was reported on the CBC sometime ago, that we need to protect people's equity. I felt nauseated by that comment. The majority of the people who have equity are baby boomers who are about to retire. It is well known that my generation is going to have to pay for them in retirement as many of them have not saved nearly enough for their retirements. This lack of savings comes despite the fact that they could pay their mortgage on one income while working at Safeway. Our housing market has increased by 21% this year alone. It is staggering and certainly, some people are getting very wealthy from it. However protecting the equity for the baby boomers (so that they actually have some retirement funds) on the backs of generation x and millennials is simply wrong. A friend of mine just this morning called it unconscionable. I agree.

It is nice to see that the government is now going to track the number of foreign purchases in BC. This, in my opinion, is simply too little, much too late. I also note that the government has put into place a PTT exemption for new residential units under \$750,000. Please tell me exactly what benefit this creates as what can you buy, brand new, for \$750,000? We need some real action in this Province. I am hopeful that the NDP will take these steps as you and your government have made it completely clear that short term gains are all that matters. Those of us in the younger generations, who are left holding the proverbial bag, evidently don't count.

Thanks very much for your time. I do hope to hear back from you regarding some measures that your government intends to take before Vancouver becomes a ghost town of foreign owned buildings in which no one actually resides (these actually exist in China if you think I am joking: <http://www.cbc.ca/radio/thecurrent/the-current-for-november-9-2015-1.3310323/china-s-deserted-ghost-cities-appeal-to-new-residents-1.3310388>; <http://www.forbes.com/sites/kenrapoza/2015/07/20/what-will-become-of-chinas-ghost-cities/#5ceff8bf751b> ).

From: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX [mailto:Premier@gov.bc.ca]  
Sent: Thursday, May 19, 2016 1:59 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: RE: Vancouver's housing crisis

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write about housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Friday, May 20, 2016 11:09 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: RE: Vancouver's housing crisis

Hi there,

Thanks very much for your prompt response. I was already aware of the three initiatives that the Provincial Government has recently put into place. In my opinion, they are all band-aid solutions that accomplish far too little, much too late.

Funding new affordable housing is great. Evidently this is a positive step that will hopefully give people who work low paying jobs (that are so necessary to our economy) somewhere to live. Hopefully they can afford the rental rates at these affordable new developments. I am guessing that there will likely be an income cap on applicants like there are at so many of the housing co-operatives in Vancouver? If so, the result of this is that those who make a decent income, but not enough of an income to spend over \$1million on a house, will be left in the cold, literally.

Re the new shadow flipping laws, evidently that is a positive step. It seems to me though that shadow flipping is simply symptomatic of the larger issue, which is foreign capital flooding our province's real estate market that our local citizens simply cannot compete with. If something was done to calm the fierce competition in our housing market, no shadow flipping would be happening. I also query whether the Real Estate Council has received additional funding/resources to prosecute those found to be violating the new rules. A law without any teeth behind it is not much of a law at all.

Our housing issues have been considered a 'crisis' for many years now and it is stunning that it is only now that the number of foreign home buyers is going to be tracked. That should have started in 2005 - 2006 when this mess started. There are numerous other methods for getting the data we need in order to fully canvass the issue and make a determination of next steps that could be done in months, not years. I view keeping track of the number of foreign home buyers as a delay tactic. No meaningful action will have to be taken for years to come, while we slowly gather the data. I query whether the average home in Vancouver will be over \$2million before the government actually takes any meaningful steps to do anything about this crisis? Our market is on track for that, with no signs of slowing down. I am happy for the baby boomers that they are all becoming rich but it is too bad that it is directly at the expense of the younger generations. We are being left with a complete mess (economically, environmentally, socially etc). It is infuriating because it would be fully preventable if there wasn't so much greed and short sightedness.

Thank you for your time.

From: s.22

Sent: May 18, 2016 2:09 PM

To: Clark.MLA, Christy

Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name

s.22

Email

s.22

Riding

s.22

Comments & Feedback

Dear Ms. Clark,

As we all know the Vancouver real estate market is completely foreign driven and artificial. It has nothing to do with normal supply and demand in a functioning community. s.22

s.22

I now live in a 'community' where the surrounding buildings are more than half empty. I can see the lights in the evening, or more precisely, the lack of them every night. I see the facts. Some of the buildings I see every night are max 5-10% occupied! The occupancy numbers I see published in papers are grossly inaccurate guesses. The situation is much worse.

Why are you not doing anything about this already disastrous situation? It is only getting worse. Australia, New Zealand, London and other wiser places have reacted in similar situations. They have introduced restrictions to foreign buyers as any sane place should and would. Just adding an extra tax is not what I am talking about. This is not a revenue play for the city, at least it should not be. We need restrictions, not just extra taxes.

For doing nothing you are creating a resort ghost town for the rich Chinese to visit. In any other industry money laundering is taken very seriously, but obviously not in the Vancouver real estate market. The market is completely speculative as there is no real natural community component in it. A young doctor couple cannot afford to buy a decent place in Vancouver. Can that be right?

For these current day real estate buyers the price means nothing. When you have lot of wealth, no matter how it was acquired, it does not matter whether a house costs \$8M or 10M when your main goal is to get the assets out of your country and into Canada. For the same reason it does not matter to them if they leave a Coal Harbour condo (or several condos) empty year round.

That does not create a functioning community with surviving cafes and stores. s.22

s.22

Your job as the Premier is not to cater only to the people who currently own real estate in Vancouver and who only want this absolute craziness to continue as long as possible, for selfish reasons, no matter what it means and how it changes the city. Or are you not doing anything for personal reasons? Whatever the motive, it is wrong not to act and act now!

Do your job, please.

Thanks,  
s.22

From: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX [mailto:Premier@gov.bc.ca]  
Sent: 19-May-16 1:56 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: RE: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write about housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.



From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 19, 2016 4:32 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: RE: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

With all due respect, a study will do nothing to address the urgent problem. It is incredible that this kind of basic data has not already been collected. Regardless, we already know what the main issue is. It is not magically any different than in Australia or New Zealand. Both of them have already reacted.

You should also be aware that the same foreign buyer could easily have several different names they use for various transactions. We already know that at our voting booths the officials see and accept all kinds of names and ID's especially from Chinese persons. They just say that one is their Chinese name and the other their English name. How could you argue that is not the case?

The same problem applies to many other nationalities/languages as well, we just seem to have a predominantly strong Chinese purchasing power issue here in Vancouver. And if you have not noticed, there are a few more people in China ready to come over and buy the city. I do not need any study to be able to see what is going on in Metro Vancouver, and any realtor could easily confirm where most of the buyers hail from (unless they want to downplay it to keep the craziness going for their own gain).

Unfortunately none of the below measures goes to the core of the problem. \$13,000 tax is not the problem. \$1M one bedroom condo is. Meanwhile, as we study, the situation only gets worse and the real estate bubble bigger. In the end too many (who can't afford it!) will get caught in this crazy net because we are doing nothing to prevent it.

Thanks,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Thursday, May 19, 2016 7:42 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing Affordability

Hi Premier,

RE: Housing Affordability

Could you please consider the following to reduce the cost of housing in Metro Vancouver as it has skyrocketed and does not reflect Canadian inflation:

- a) Increase the Provincial Property Tax to 25% on buyers of real property who are not Canadian Citizens.
- b) Audit all Realtors to see if they have declared the profits made from shadow pricing and if any are found to have not declared the profits, remove their Realtor licence immediately. Provide all results to the Canada Revenue Agency.
- c) Track all violations of the \$10,000 cash limit that realtor and buyers have ignored and put a 50% fraud charge on them.
- d) Put a surtax on all property taxes on non-resident owners of 10 times the property taxes of residents.
- e) Provide funding for provincial enforcement officers to cities and towns to enforce illegal suite bylaws to ensure that single family homes are just that, for single families.
- f) Allow towns and cities to put a surcharge on Development Cost Fees for rapid transit corridors to fund the TransLink wish list of transportation along with the wish list of the GVRD to expand water and sewage treatment.

On Taxation:

- i) Do not support road pricing.
- ii) Eliminate all tolls and do not implement any more (reduce the ones you have or eliminate them).
- iii) Stop increasing our Hydro bills.
- iv) Stop increasing our ICBC bills.
- v) Stop increasing our MSP premiums.

If you would like to write to me, my address is:

s.22

Thank you for your time and consideration.

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 27, 2016 1:45 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing Affordability

Hello and thank you for your email regarding housing affordability in BC. We appreciate your taking the time to write on this issue and offer your suggestions. Please be assured your input will be included in our discussions on these related issues.

Again, thank you for writing. We do appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 10:55 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing Disaster

Premier Clark,

I saw on the news on what you and your Finance Minister is going to do about the crisis, we have here in the Lower Mainland which is the high cost of buying a home and affordable housing.

You have proven to me and my friends and family that you truly do not care about us Canadians who work hard to make a living, so we can live here.

Your in action to the housing crisis for the past years has been shameful. We elected you and your party to care about our lives and well being and yet the most fundamental thing to all families to a place to live.

Your solution to the housing crisis, is to start tracking who are buying all the homes in the Lower Mainland. It does not take a genius to figure out that this will not solve the problem of rising home prices. We all know why the prices are going up and it is not because of Canadians buying homes in their own country.

You do not need a survey to find the cause of this problem. TALK TO ALL THE REALTORS. THEY ARE THE ONES SELLING THE HOMES. THEY KNOW WHO THEIR BUYERS ARE AND WHY THE PRICES ARE GOING OUTRAGEOUS UP.

Your Minister Fong said that he does not want to scare away investors, however, the jobs that are created does not cover the high cost of housing. The average worker wage cannot pay for a house in Vancouver. This is common knowledge.

The best way to curb this disaster/crisis is do like what the United States and other countries do, TAX the investors at a high rate and non Canadians who buy homes here. Use the tax to build affordable housing. That simple!!

Premier Clark, because of your in actions the cost of a home will now be out of reach for the majority of Canadians. Only the rich can afford a home here. The average Canadians who deserve the opportunity to buy a home for themselves has been squashed, especially the younger generation.

FYI. I am not looking to buy a home but I care about my fellow Canadians to write this email to you in hopes you take this issue very seriously because it has become a disaster.

s.22

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2016 8:10 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign Demand for Domestic Real Estate

Dear Premier Clark:

Please consider... A good solution to the controversial matter with respect to the consequence of Foreign Investment in Vancouver Real Estate might be, as I understand they are doing in Australia; allow foreigners' to purchase Canadian real estate with the strict stipulation that in order to do so it MUST be newly constructed for their specific use. In doing so it would alleviate that increased demand that causes prices to increase beyond residents ability to compete, add to inventory (more inventory = more stable prices) and stimulate domestic employment.

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Thursday, May 19, 2016 1:49 PM

To: s.22

Cc: Minister, FIN FIN:EX

Subject: RE: Foreign Demand for Domestic Real Estate

Dear s.22

Thank you for your recommendations about foreign investment in real estate. We have shared a copy of your message with the Honourable Mike de Jong, Minister of Finance. His staff will ensure that your comments are included in any upcoming discussions.

Thank you, again, for writing. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:01 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Message from a concerned mom

From: s.22  
Sent: May 13, 2016 11:34 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: Message from a concerned mom

Ms. Clark,

You should be ashamed of yourself.

Things are coming to a head. People are very unhappy. It's the word on the street and on everyone's tongues at the moment.

s.22

s.22 Families all over the province are living with growing frustrations over the state of Real Estate and sorry state of aging and insufficient infrastructure, among other things. Thank goodness the landscape of Vancouver is as lovely as it is - for if it weren't, Vancouver wouldn't have a thing going for it as things are going.

s.22

Not that you seem to care in the least. You flash your botoxed smile all over the media any chance you get and appear to shove it to the honest hard working people of the province. Your greed will consume you until you have nothing and are nothing.

s.22



From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:05 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: housing/rentals in Vancouver

From: s.22  
Sent: May 12, 2016 7:25 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: housing/rentals in Vancouver

s.22 I can't believe what is happening to the people in Vancouver regarding rental accommodations. Condo owners who rent their property out, are giving tenants 30-60 day notices to vacate so they can raise the rent. s.22  
s.22

s.22 When I look on line I see Vancouver is WAY over priced, although I was somewhat aware through mass media, I was still shocked at how far it had gone. It has even been suggested to me that the housing market is extremely hot because of fraudulent practices. I would like to know if your government is going to do anything about this situation. If you would like I can send you blogs etc. that the young people are writing explaining that it is a conundrum when a person can find work in a city but cannot afford to live there. What do they do?

I thank you in advance for your speedy reply.

Regards,  
s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 3:36 PM  
To: s.22  
Cc: Minister, MNGD MNGD:EX  
Subject: FW: housing/rentals in Vancouver

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding rental housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for owners and renters in British Columbia is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this month, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

On the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

You've made several comments about BC's rental housing market so, on your behalf, we are sharing your feedback with the Honourable Rich Coleman, Minister Responsible for Housing, so that he too is aware of your concerns.

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

cc: Honourable Rich Coleman

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 11:51 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign Home Buyers

Dear Premier,

Neither China nor any other Asian country would allow their citizens to be displaced by foreign buyers, yet you are allowing these people to come to Vancouver and other BC cities with wealth not taxed as ours is taxed and to buy property displacing local citizens, even though these foreign buyers will structure their affairs to avoid paying even small amounts of income tax. BC people can not and should not be required to compete with this. The result is that local people must pay for MSP and other services provided to these people even as they are driven farther from their work in search of affordable housing. We are giving away our housing, our schools, our hospitals, and, obviously, our culture is changing to what these foreigners want. The future in Vancouver and elsewhere in BC is going to be for the foreigners who did not put anything in place here and who will not pay income tax in BC as local must pay. You must help protect the society we have built.

From: s.22  
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 9:06 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Vancouver housing and 2017 Election

s.22 due to the selling out of the people  
of Vancouver to Mainland China and their money. Your recent  
changes on shadow flipping and identifying country of origin of buyer are weak to say the  
least. Meaningful out of country taxes have to be brought in. For a few  
million dollars you will be remembered for ruining a beautiful city and the lives of the people  
who live in it.

s.22

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Thursday, May 5, 2016 7:00 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Real estate prices

Dear Christy,

s.22 I find it un believable that you and your office are doing nothing to address the real estate prices in the province, particularly the lower mainland. Further studies are not required. There is enough information in hand to know it is being driven by offshore sources, and the relentless escalating prices putting our own families out of the market.

You and your hand-off cabinet have jeopardized opportunities for our children and grandchildren to remain here because they simply can't afford it. You have enabled this and seem to fully embrace this. The legacy you are leaving is unconscionable.

I have zero confidence in the real estate council. It is entirely self serving for the real estate board to continue supporting ever increasing prices as very simply It lines their pockets and pockets of their ever increasing number of agents. I see absolutely no incentive for them to police themselves in a meaningful way or to administer penalties that are a pittance relative to the value of the properties being sold. Oversight from the government are just platitudes - nothing meaningful.

The election is a year away s.22  
s.22 As I've said, you've had lots of time to deal with this and if there was a true will, it would have been dealt with.

s.22

s.22

s.22

From: "OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX"

Date: Thursday, May 12, 2016 at 3:37 PM

To: s.22

Subject: FW: Real estate prices

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 4:07 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Real estate prices

Thank you for getting back. With respect to foreign investment - I believe most of us are already aware and there have been enough studies done and made public through various institutions, Mr. DeJong has also categorically stated they have no intention of doing anything about this.

So while the \$13K is nice and closing the loophole on the shadow flipping is good, it does nothing to address the root cause.

I don't see these measures changing anything significant until you address the root cause which the general public, like myself, my family and friends understands this to be unfettered foreign buying policies that will continue to drive prices up. The \$355M for the 2000 new affordable housing units comes directly out of our tax dollars so I'm paying for the government's lenient policies that contribute to the need for these sorts of programs.

I just don't see the political will in your party to address this.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 5:48 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: Simons.MLA, Nicholas LASS:EX

Subject: Foreign Investors

CBC radio provided me with some interesting information on Wednesday May 11th. It seems that we are enabling foreign investors to buy up Canada bit by bit. This may seem trivial to some but the impacts are far reaching:

1. Prices in Vancouver have been driven so high that the average Canadian can no longer afford to buy and in some cases cannot even afford to rent.
2. Many of these foreign investors pay NO tax, as they leave Canada and are not listed as residents of Canada.
3. Canadians who have been born in Vancouver continue to pay massive taxes. WHY? We must look ridiculous in these foreign investors eyes. In fact I'm sure they are laughing at us behind our backs.
4. Many jobs have left Vancouver because companies have left Vancouver because they only can afford to pay minimum wage. People cannot live on minimum wage.
5. What about the elderly who have been driven from their homes because they can no longer afford their taxes. This has all been driven by higher home values These are the people who built this city and have called it home all their lives.
6. I hope you can sleep at night Christy Clark. Your decisions to allow all these foreign investors to buy up Vancouver have created havoc and misery for many
7. Very few are benefiting and many have been made miserable.

**STOP ALLOWING FOREIGN INVESTING IN BRITISH COLUMBIA**

s.22



From: s.22  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 12:34 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: A Chinese student bought a 31.1M mansion

As a BC resident, I don't know if you are aware of the insane real estate market at the lower mainland and I don't know whether you know that waves of non resident Chinese is coming to buy properties at Vancouver thus pushing the price up to the sky. If you think building more condos can solve the affordability issue, you are truly naive. You can not make a right judgement, not to say taking a right action to protect the local residents. Probably you are holding several properties and waiting to sell at a higher price.... Collection of property tax can not help BC financial situation because the housing market are kicking skilled workers and business investments out of the region. You are not creating jobs, you are killing jobs and give the land to foreign owners. Your pathetic minimum wage increase can not change anything, only a political show...

Regards,  
s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 8:23 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: Sultan.MLA, Ralph LASS:EX

Subject: congratulations!

Dear Ms. Clark,

Congratulations!

On your government's watch (under your leadership, and that of Mr. Campbell) you have had much success:

- you have single-handedly ruined our public school system, and created the proliferation of private schools (most of these schools did not exist when schools were adequately funded, did not rely on adopt-a-school programs, and students with special needs were supported and not left for a classroom teacher to manage, along with the rest of the class trying to work through curriculum. s.22  
s.22

- you allowed our province (especially the Lower Mainland) to be decimated by overseas buyers (some of whom send their wives to live here with their children who go to our schools (public and private), using our infrastructure and medical services without contributing to the cost - unless, of course, you think a one-time property tax allows for that privilege in perpetuity. You continue to wait for data - lovely! - this is not a new phenomenon, just one you have chosen to ignore.....

s.22

s.22

- What I would like to see is my children and grandchildren, nieces and nephews able to live in this economy (where they have grown up, studied and earn their money), as well as our colleagues - s.22 - be able to afford to live in our neighbourhoods. I don't need more empty homes on my street - and I don't need Chinese neighbours who don't pay their fair share to use our amenities. This is not an issue of 'supply and demand' - this is an issue of a local economy based on local people paying fairly to live in this beautiful city - it is becoming an issue of a city built on shady money and lies (other cultures have different value systems, especially around truth telling).

s.22

s.22

so perhaps this letter is just more ash on your fire - however, I am so very angry, I just had to think that perhaps at least, my little voice could be heard.

Very sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 2:49 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: House price in Lower Mainland

Hi .

Just wondering if you actually read these emails coming through to your office?

Thanks

From: s.22  
Sent: April-22-16 8:32 AM  
To: 'premier@gov.bc.ca'  
Subject: House price in Lower Mainland

Hello Honourable Christy Clark.

s.22

s.22 The market here in the Lower Mainland (Abbotsford specifically) is getting out of control. The days of being able to but a decent Single family home with a bit of property for your children to play on is gone. s.2

s.22  
s.22 It seems these days, that kind of neighborhood atmosphere is unattainable now in this market. We find ourselves having to look at undesirable locations for our children to grow up because of ridiculous House costs. This is not only my present fear , but also a fear for my children who will be even worse off than we are come 15-20 years from now.

We have seen over a 10% increase in Townhome and Single Family home pricing and for what reasons??? There are constant "bidding wars" happening with already inflated house prices...some \$340k properties selling for \$50k over asking price?? How can any young family compete with this kind of madness. I am not sure if Realtors are driving the prices up or buying properties and flipping them to potential buyers they know of.

I have found a few properties that would suit our family, only to find out they are "40+" or "19+" properties...This is helping the market in some ways from preventing flipping....but how about having some Townhome complexes for "Young families only" ?? Why should a complex discriminate against young people and prevent families from buying these properties. If there were complexes that were "for young families only", families like ours might have a fighting chance in getting these Homes without entering a bidding war with other Realtors or investors.

I would hope that you and your office, s.22 would consider a bylaw for "Young Family" oriented properties , so that first time home buying, young families like ours can actually start a life in a home , not a condo.

Thanks .

s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

From: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX [mailto:Premier@gov.bc.ca]  
Sent: May-10-16 9:52 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: House price in Lower Mainland

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your emails. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Additionally, in delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Finally, the Premier recently announced new measures to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement and further information on actions being taken to address housing affordability, please see the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0025-000427>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 1:28 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: RE: House price in Lower Mainland

Hi .

Thanks for the response. My question is ? Why is there only one MP standing up for the Middle class earners. Michael De Jong was asked about the Foreign Investment killing our market today in the House, and he completely dodges the question. Why is the government turning a Blind eye to whats going on??? It is an insult to those who have lived and supported this Province, Country , for years. We have all worked hard to save and build families, paid taxes and contributed only to find out we can't even afford a house in a Province we grew up in for over 20-30 years?

I am not sure the government is actually dealing with the issue of Foreign Investors driving the market up. Australia and Singapore have put measures in to deter foreign investors from buying our Houses at a premium and they have seen a huge change in their housing market. I don't understand how an Asian citizen can LEGALLY launder their money into Canada, BC, and get away with it ? Is the government playing dumb? Because it is clear to see what is going on, and what they are doing is illegal. It's a way for them to dump huge amounts of money into Canada without being penalized , a loophole that needs to be fixed.

So please tell me how the Provincial Government intends to stop Foreign Investors from driving up our markets , and paying 20-30% more on an asking price, that is already inflated to begin with??

I am curious to know what your response is. This isn't about shadow flippers, that is a scapegoat to the real issue of Foreign Investors laundering money into our Country, Province.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 2:02 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Vancouver housing crisis

Dear Ms. Clark,

s.22

I am dismayed at the effect that foreign money has had on the real estate values in Vancouver. Our Canadian families cannot compete with wealth from countries where there are weak controls on earnings, taxation, and money leaving the country. Consequently, they not able to afford a house in their own city any more. Why are we punishing our own citizens, and handing our valuable residential properties to foreign money, real estate agents, and developers who are raking in the profits? We need to limit overseas investment in residential properties and put our own citizens first. That is not racist, it is fair. Many other countries have moved to regulate this problem. Vancouverites are the ones who have built up these good communities, supported the schools and local businesses, and tried to conserve some architectural heritage in our beautiful city. As baby boomers, we have never counted on selling our house for a sky high price, we just want to see good communities for our young families.

I think it is high time your government worked on curtailing this problem with strong taxation, limits on foreign buying, and elimination of contract flipping and other amoral real estate practices. If you are looking for an election issue, this is it. Vancouverites will thank you for it. We want to be a green, progressive city of all levels of resident citizens, not a resort city in which rich people park their money.

Sincerely,

s.22



-----Original Message-----

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 11:39 AM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Vancouver housing crisis

Hello, s.22, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 12:41 PM

To: justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Mayorandcouncil

Cc: Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX

Subject: Save Canadian Sovereignty, Fix the Vancouver Housing Crisis, Stop Greed

Save Canadian Sovereignty, Fix the Vancouver Housing Crisis, Stop Greed

To the so called "Leaders of our Country":

s.22

s.22

I know what it takes to be a professional, to live and to act in accordance with a high moral and ethical standard, not only for oneself but as a beacon for others.

This once great country, which opened its doors to immigrants and refugees to work and play amongst its citizens, which once modelled values of tolerance, justice, freedom and respect for all nations, has now belittled itself to become a haven for greed and corruption, notably but not exclusively, from China. Indeed, all three levels of government (Federal, Provincial and Municipal) are complicit, having enabled foreign investors to buy up everything Canadian from real estate to industry to agricultural land to resources.

We are seriously at risk of losing our Sovereignty. Foreign investor millionaires appear to have more rights than hard working citizens and sincere immigrants. Money is king, chaos reigns and average citizens fear for their future. All the world is watching while nothing is being done by government. I am no longer proud to be Canadian.

I am sure that you are all aware of the explosion of articles, comments, university studies, TV and newspaper articles with plenty of facts, graphs and history explaining the crisis we find ourselves in today. They abound on social media, not only locally but all around the world. If you need the links, I can compile a list.

It is time for sincere and authentic leadership to bring the lights of hope and justice back into Canadian politics. Put a stop to this sell out now! Do the right thing. Act with honour and integrity. Put Trust back into government. Dig deep. You can do it. We are all in this together. s.22

All responses are welcome.

Sincerely,

s.22

Page 212

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 11:34 AM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Save Canadian Sovereignty, Fix the Vancouver Housing Crisis, Stop Greed

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22  
Sent: Sunday, May 8, 2016 7:02 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver: study

Hi,

How much longer are you going to turn a blind eye on this issue? Maybe when local employers cannot find any ordinary Canadians because no one can afford a home in Vancouver?

I thought you'd like this:  
<http://ctv.news/SBYY7cd>

Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver: study  
The Canadian and British Columbia governments are complicit in fuelling Vancouver's housing crisis as foreign Chinese buyers continue to shut local residents out of the market, a new study says.

To unsubscribe click [here](#).

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 12:53 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Takeover

Its time to take action on this problem. Protect the citizens of the Province.  
THE ELECTION IS ONLY 1YEAR AWAY!

VANCOUVER - The Canadian and British Columbia governments are complicit in fuelling Vancouver's housing crisis as foreign Chinese buyers continue to shut local residents out of the market, a new study says.

Josh Gordon is the study's author and an assistant professor in the School of Public Policy at Simon Fraser University. He said people whose dreams of owning a home are being crushed because they can't compete with foreign investors no longer accept "distraction" excuses such as low interest rates for the state of the super-heated market.

"People recognize what's going on, and they're willing to call a spade a spade," he said, stressing that such views are based on reality, not racism.



-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 8, 2016 2:28 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign buyers crushing Vancouver home dreams as governments do little: study - British Columbia - CBC News

Goodbye Liberals - you'll be voted out next March. So out of touch with people who actually work for a living. What a joke.

<http://www.cbc.ca/beta/news/canada/british-columbia/sfu-real-estate-study-foreign-buyers-1.3572499>

s.22

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 12:10 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Anton.MLA, Suzanne LASS:EX

Subject: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as gov't does nothing

Dear Christy,

s.22 I don't know how much longer you plan on ignoring the obvious, but I will remind you once again that while you continue to bury your head into the sand on Vancouver's home affordability issue, an SFU assistant prof has conducted a study that directly calls on foreign buyers, particularly those from China, as the culprit for our home affordability crisis.

If you care to spare a few minutes in reading up on some facts instead of denying the truth, feel free to refer to the following news article:

<http://www.news1130.com/2016/05/08/foreign-buyers-crushing-home-dreams-in-vancouver-as-govt-does-nothing-study/>

I honestly don't think I should need to educate you on why an out of reach real estate market is bad for BC, but since you are dense enough to continue ignoring the truth, I will spell it out in some rather simple terms for you again:

- high RE prices deter young adults from setting and taking root in Vancouver; few young adult settling in BC's biggest city means the province cannot attract talent to grow its economy
- high RE prices means young couples cannot afford to purchase a home to start a family
- high RE prices means young families are less willing to and less capable of having children; less children means more schools closing (which is already happening in Metro Vancouver); more school closing means more public sector workers lose their jobs; more public sector workers losing their jobs means bad news for the economy and for the provincial government
- as houses sit empty, nearby businesses don't benefit from any economic activities

I will also remind you that the provincial election is set to take place about a year from now.

s.22

s.22 I trust that a last ditch measure to legislate some stringent foreign real estate buyer legislations might still earn you some votes from some portions of the ignorant voting public.

For your own political sake as well as for the good of the BC, stop burying your tiny head in the sand.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 4:19 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as gov't does nothing

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 7:03 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as Canada, BC do zip | Vancouver Sun

Dear Premier Clark,

This article is probably one of the more proactive pieces I've read on the topic of foreign ownership. s.22

You simply cannot own land in those countries like China or Thailand if you're not a citizen. You can only basically rent it from someone that is a citizen.

Those are the serious types of policy choices our governments need to make on top of fees and surcharges.

<http://vancouver.sun.com/business/real-estate/foreign-buyers-crushing-home-dreams-in-vancouver-as-canada-b-c-do-zip-study>

Other ideas for you are:

- if a foreigner wants to buy land here, have title transfer to the government for the life of that foreigner. When they pass away, or perhaps after a period of 60 years, the government can then dispose of the property through public auction.
- the same laws should apply to inheritances so that foreign owned property is eventually transferred back to citizens. It would be a form appropriation over time instead of outright expropriation immediately.

Thank you for your consideration.

Yours truly,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 5:23 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as Canada, BC do zip |  
Vancouver Sun

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email regarding house affordability and foreign investment in BC's real estate market. We appreciate your taking the time to write to us on these issues and offer you suggestions. Please be assured we will included your input in our ongoing related discussions.

Again, thank you for writing. We do appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 9:33 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Plecas.MLA, Darryl LASS:EX; Ed Fast; Gregor Robertson

Subject: Real Estate Questions

Hi. Perhaps you saw the article in the May 9 Province (Chinese homebuyers crush dreams). My impression is that this is an accurate summary of the lack of action by all levels of government in allowing real estate agents and others make large sums of money at the expense of the average citizen. When we hear about plumbers (for example) who are relatively well paid in working in Vancouver but are forced to buy a house in Abbotsford or Chilliwack, I would conclude that some thing is wrong with the system. Or when a lawyer and engineer couple (In the May 9 paper) can't afford a house in the Vancouver area, something is really wrong.

It's not just about dealing with "shadow flipping" and dishonest real estate agents, or even about an affordability fund, it's about changing things to make the system work for everyone. I understand that various countries track foreign buyers. I believe that there should be better control of large sums of money entering the country. Dealing with vacant house is another issue, and I'm sure that you can name other things that need attention.

I think that history will judge you harshly if you take no effective action soon. The results of inaction will be evident soon, but even more so in 10 or 20 years.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 8, 2016 10:33 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Vancouver Sun: Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as Canada, B.C. do zip: study

Christy Clarke,

Where are you? Why are you allowing Vancouver to be bought out by foreign investors? Young people are desperate to buy/rent housing and paying more money than they can afford if they do find it. You are standing by and closing your eyes to the problem. Where will people live????

s.22

s.22

I wanted to share a story with you from Vancouver Sun:

Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as Canada, B.C. do zip: study The Canadian and British Columbia governments are complicit in fuelling Vancouver's housing crisis as foreign Chinese buyers continue to shut local residents out of the market, a new study says.  
<http://vancouversun.com/business/real-estate/foreign-buyers-crushing-home-dreams-in-vancouver-as-canada-b-c-do-zip-study>

From: s.22

> Sent: Friday, April 22, 2016 9:15 AM

> To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

> Subject: Concern for our community

>

> Hello Ms. Clark,

>

> s.22 who is concerned about what I'm seeing in our local housing market. I'm seeing our city being completely taken advantage of by foreign buyers, ineffective real estate regulations, shadow flipping, money laundering, and lack of action by politicians.

>

> The evidence from local real estate agents on the amount of foreign capital used to buy homes is astounding, shocking, and undeniable. This leads to a trickle down effect which effects everyone in the GVRD. Home prices are rising faster than anywhere in the world by a huge margin.

>

> This type of activity detracts from our sense of community by turning previously vibrant areas into hollow shells of what they once were. Families are being driven out to areas far east of where they currently live and forced to endure longer commutes, spend less time with their families due to their commute, and manage higher levels of mortgage debt.

>

> s.22

s.22 We have seen the future amount of debt we will take on grow exponentially over the past few years as housing prices are growing much faster than our home equity. s.22

s.22

>

> Another by product is many of the people purchasing homes are not contributing to our communities in a productive way after their home purchase. Our Immigrant Investor Program appears to be a huge disaster as one in three immigrant investors did not file a tax return - claiming zero income in Canada. After a decade, these millionaire investors paid on average only \$1,400 in annual taxes. They are not declaring taxes which will support our community. They are also eligible for income assistance and not required to pay MSP premiums s.22

s.22

>

> A study by the University of British Columbia points out the high level of welfare dependency among those living in Vancouver's wealthiest neighbourhoods. Upwards of 30% of adults in these upscale communities report poverty-level incomes.

>

> Taking up housing inventory and not paying their fair share is completely unacceptable and is a slap in the face to hard working Canadians who follow the system. From the government's viewpoint, this is a huge untapped tax revenue source which could pay for healthcare, schools, or community programs. It's like someone renting a room in your house but never pays rent and drives a Bentley.



>

> And now we hear that licensed realtors are speculating and flipping million dollar properties with their insider information. <http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/investigations/the-real-estate-technique-fuelling-vancouvers-housing-market/article28634868/> The real estate industry cannot be trusted to regulate itself. Only strong government oversight can prevent the sort of abuses described in this article.

>

> What makes me and my wife most upset is how this has happened entirely on your watch with absolutely no acknowledgement of a trend or it being an issue. In fact you just said it's Albertans fleeing their Province! People have been laughing at that comment because it's completely false.

>

> There is an uprising within the citizens of this great city and people feel their government has let them down. People are upset and sooner or later there will be tipping point where we can take no more.

>

> Look forward to your response,

>

> s.22

>

> On May 2, 2016, at 1:32 PM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

>

> Hello, <sup>s.22</sup> and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

>

> We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

>

> One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

>

> In delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

>

> Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

>

> Finally, the Premier recently announced new measures to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement and further information on actions being taken to address housing affordability, please see the following news release:

>

> <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0025-000427>

>

> Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 5, 2016 9:39 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Concern for our community

Thank you for replying and I know you hope this response would be helpful, but it really isn't the damage has been done.

These problems have been happening for at least 5 years now and the only action implemented has been in the last four months!

Our Premier's complete inaction on the issue has put all young Metro Vancouver families in higher debt and forced them to decide between their city and their families. Total shame.

s.22

s.22

From: s.22  
s.22

Sent: Wednesday, May 4, 2016 12:32 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Foreign competition vs local economy

Is equal opportunity lost on Canada? We currently allow foreign economies to come and grossly displace Canadian citizens who have been paying into Canada their entire lives. s.22  
s.22

s.22 Some would say "that's how it goes", but feel this is really unfair, when people not contributing to our social system, are welcomed with open arms, in disrupting/ruining lower-middle class economy. I realize, anyone already in the market, on the receiving end of this chaos, feels no sympathy, but what's happening, isn't right. The Canadian government, clearly supports heavy speculating borrowers (via preventing interest rate increases), and foreigners (by letting them compete 'equally' alongside middle-lower class economy); I don't feel entitlement, I've long given up the dream of living in the home I grew up in; I live within my means but penalized all the way. Everything I was taught to do, in being financially responsible is being used against me. (Almost like; "this group is going to behave this way; let's allow this to happen so we can capitalize on them"). Please help me to understand how the nickel & diming foreigner, can roll up to my local community center, via luxury BMW-Mercedes 'variant' automobile, requesting low income assistance for accessing the facility, and be allowed to compete with me as an 'equal', come time when bidding on a town home? (That's right, just a town home is my gripe; now a town home is upwards of 400-500k, a 150-200k increase over 5 months? A town house with rental restrictions that prohibit me from capitalizing; keep me in my place) I've only seen their exploitation at the community center level; how far can they go? (I've heard many rumors)  
s.22

This is an attack on my way of life; I do not feel this is anyway fair and am extremely displeased how my gov, continues to support this assault on me and many others like me. I guess China doesn't need to start a war in taking over Canada; they'll just be welcomed with open arms in buying it from under us?? What's your advice?

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 11:45 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Foreign competition vs local economy

Hello and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Just yesterday, Minister De Jong announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, April 29, 2016 10:19 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Vancouver Housing

Dear Ms. Clark,

I am writing to add my voice to those calling for drastic measures to curb the housing crisis in the Vancouver area. s.22, and I watch with disgust and dismay as foreign people with lots of money park it here in the form of an investment and/or a place to launder funds. Ms. Clark, I cannot stress enough how important this issue is. It is ruining communities from the inside out. Houses, apartments and buildings are snapped up at ridiculous prices and then left to rot, with no community involvement. Many good properties are torn down so that an oversized status symbol can be built - still vacant. I am utterly furious, disgusted and horrified, and I feel so powerless. The information is available for the offshore buyers, the statistics and information needed to track and stop this practice are there - all that's needed is the political will. The 'shadow flipping' is the tip of the iceberg - PLEASE go further with laws to stop this and hefty fines levied against those who violate basic rules and guidelines for residency. You must know that they think we are idiots, to have not dealt with this by now. Empty houses and having our land owned by foreign investors is not at all acceptable. Our taxes rise ridiculously with our inflated assessment; our children can't afford to live here; people can't afford to live close to where they work, even nurses, police officers, teachers and similar; apartment vacancy rates are at record lows - something must be done.

I fear that your government is underestimating the impact this is having on all Metro Vancouver residents and how angry we are about it. Please do something.

Sincerely,

s.22

s.22

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, May 9, 2016 10:44 AM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver Housing

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Additionally, in delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Finally, the Premier recently announced new measures to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement and further information on actions being taken to address housing affordability, please see the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0025-000427>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

-----Original Message-----

> From: s.22

> Sent: Thursday, April 21, 2016 3:46 PM

> To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

> Subject: Very large realestate transactions that don't pay land transfer tax

>

> Premier Clark, Could you please explain to me why some very large realestate transactions by some foreign investors are not paying land transfer tax. If there is a legal loophole, it must be stopped. I strongly object to the fact that a foreign investor can come to BC and not have the same rules apply to them, that apply to a born in BC resident. If this is not rectified very soon s.22

To have foreign investors drive up the realestate so far beyond what even above average wage earners can afford, is one thing, then to have them not paying tax on their purchases is wrong. I trust I will hear that a change is being made very soon. s.22

I will also make it my business to make sure the rest of BC is aware that BC taxpayers must adhere to the tax rules, foreigners don't, that's discrimination. s.22



On Apr 22, 2016, at 10:24 AM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:

>

> Thank you for your email, s.22 . We appreciate that you've expressed your concerns and we have shared them with the Honourable Michael de Jong, Minister of Finance, so that he, too, is aware of them.

>

> We encourage you to take a look at Minister de Jong's comments on this issue during Question Period in the Legislature on the afternoon of April 11th. You can read the transcript at <https://www.leg.bc.ca/content/hansard/40th5th/20160411pm-Hansard-v36n9.pdf>, starting on page 13 of the 65-page document.

>

> Thank you again for writing.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Saturday, April 30, 2016 8:08 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Very large realestate transactions that don't pay land transfer tax

Premier Clarke, Your reply does not answer my questions to my satisfaction. Investigating one realestate company and to expect the realestate board to properly police itself does nothing to solve the problem. Foreign investors have come to BC , grossly overpaid for many property resulting in prices that are far beyond what the average person can afford. That is the market place. A desirable location and supply and demand prices will go up, I understand that. Many of these investors don't live in the properties they purchased, they have not paid land transfer tax and they don't contribute anything to BC. BC has missed out on millions of dollars which is sorely needed obviously, if you can't afford to put money into the education and health systems for example, those missed dollars become very valuable. What I want hear is that a major change is in the works that will force some sort of tax contribution from every single foreign investor on every single transaction. As a taxpayer I'm sick and tired of being considered the never ending supply of money for all the levels of government. Thank you s.22

From:s.22

Sent: Tuesday, April 26, 2016 3:40 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: Fassbender.MLA, Peter LASS:EX; todd.stone.MLA@leg.bc.ca; Anton.MLA, Suzanne LASS:EX; Lake.MLA, Terry LASS:EX; deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX; Bond.MLA, Shirley LASS:EX

Subject: Affordable housing for British Columbians who actually contribute to the economy

Dear Mrs. Clark,

Im sure you are sick to death of hearing this, but I feel the need to have my voice heard on this subject. s.22

s.22

s.22 . Vancouver is being sold off to foreign investors who don't live here, who don't contribute here, only to earn further prophets at the expense of people like me. Not only that the social implications of empty houses, condos leaves neighborhoods feeling closed, and lacking a true sense of community. Measures need to be taken to curb this. s.22

s.22

s.22 I pay my taxes which enables me to say to you, that you guys are doing a poor job protecting the future of British Columbians. I urge you to actually tackle this issue, or you will start loosing more and more hard working Canadians to other regions of the country.

Please do the right thing and allow hard working British Columbians a chance to belong, allow us to have a piece of the place we love. Make a lasting mark on your tenure in office and do the right thing.

Thanks for listening,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 6, 2016 4:07 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Affordable housing for British Columbians who actually contribute to the economy

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Additionally, in delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Finally, the Premier recently announced new measures to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement and further information on actions being taken to address housing affordability, please see the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0025-000427>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, April 25, 2016 10:23 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Please help us with housing!

From: s.22  
Sent: April 21, 2016 10:48 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: Please help us with housing!

Dear Ms. Clark,  
My name is s.22

I used to listen to your radio show all the time at work and I really liked your wittiness. When you became our premier, I was so excited and felt you would do BC good. But you failed alot of people like me over the years...

s.22

I read this article today and was very angry.

<http://www.vancouversun.com/news/Douglas+Todd+Thousands+Metro+>

This article about rich home owners declaring poverty levels income and receive most or all the benefits that a true low income family would receive. It is very disheartening to see our social safety network is being abused while hard working Canadians like myself and many more who see Vancouver as our homes to take on the burden of paying for these benefits.

s.22 I heard stories like this time and time after. I heard of stories of how astronaut family having their kids taking out student loans because they are "poor" and after graduation, they just leave the country and never repay the loans.

Stories like these break out more and more frequently in recent years. I hope all levels of government would take some action to protect the well being of those who pay their fair share of taxes, live and raise their families here. We want to see our country thrive and Canadians to live well. We don't just want to survive but to enjoy life. We don't want to spend more than 70% of our income on housing just so our kids would have a backyard to play in.

Please do SOMETHING.

Thank you

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Friday, May 6, 2016 3:52 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Please help us with housing!

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Additionally, in delivering the budget speech, Finance Minister Mike De Jong announced new measures to collect data on foreign investment in real estate: "One of the ways we can better understand what's actually driving property prices in the province, is to collect additional data on purchasers. The government stopped collecting data that specifically identified foreign purchasers in 1998. We believe there is a legitimate need to resume that process again. Therefore, beginning in the summer, individuals who purchase property will need to disclose if they are citizens or permanent residents of Canada, and, if they are not, their citizenship and country of residence."

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Finally, the Premier recently announced new measures to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement and further information on actions being taken to address housing affordability, please see the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0025-000427>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, November 13, 2015 2:17 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca

Subject: Vancouver Housing

Dear Premier:

Until your government addresses the housing issue in the lower mainland s.22  
s.22

s.22 The lower  
mainland needs young working people s.22 more than wealthy offshore owners and real  
estate agents.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 19, 2015 3:28 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver Housing

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

It is important that any action taken to address this issue be considered carefully, as we want to avoid any unintended consequences in a complex market. It is critical that any potential action must be designed to help first-time buyers enter the market, while at the same time protecting the equity of existing homeowners.

We appreciate hearing from you on this matter and we can assure you that your input will be included in our ongoing discussions.

Again, thank you for writing. It was good to hear from you.



From: s.22  
Sent: Wednesday, November 11, 2015 11:57 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Not Happy with your government

You have far to many incompetents in your Cabinet

1. You must have greater controls on foreign investors from China in Vancouver Real Estate discussed on BNN
2. Data must created on these Chinese immigrants in BC, they must provide proof how they their made their money, being wealthy is not good enough, are these communists that skipped out of China with Chinas money
3. Yuan bank must be shut down just a source of money laundering Chinese money
4. Current properties own by Chinese foreign investors must tripled taxed, with a portion going affordable housing, these do not provide any benefits to us.
5. Do not like doing business with China they cannot be trusted as long as communists in power, have you even did a survey of how Chinese communist
6. We want to see results from your trip to china not just talk Clark

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, October 12, 2015 12:58 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Vancouver's Real Estate: A Hostile Environment

Dear Mrs. Clark,

My name is s.22

s.22 I am writing to express my displeasure with some of the recent responses you and the Liberal party have made regarding the matter. My objective is not for you to sympathize for me, but for you to understand the extremities of the situation.

Vancouver is losing its identity to offshore property developers and foreign investors. It may sound cruel, but it's the truth -- rich Chinese foreigners are directly to blame. It's obvious to say that there is no data; the facts are there. For whatever reason it seems like the BC government has turned a blind eye to it. Evidence has moved beyond personal anecdotes, and word-of-mouth. I'm sure you're aware of the recent claim by Remax and Macdonald Realty stating that 70% of its clients are foreign Chinese. Let's not forget a recent report from the Globe exposing numerous tax loopholes allowing Chinese investors to scoop up property without paying taxes. Open your eyes. Take a stroll through Richmond and you'll see a new generation of Chinese foreigners in their early 20s parading around in exotic cars without a care in the world. Ask yourselves, where is this money coming from?

Let's look at the facts surrounding the area:

- Any "shortage" of land is artificial. If you lived here, you would know that much of Vancouver is comprised of large lots of land that shouldn't be that big to begin with. Realistically, a 7200sqft lot can be subdivided into 4 separate houses of 1800 sqft each (see Toronto and San Francisco). Instead, flippers are turning them into large mansions built to capacity. Why does anyone need a house that big to begin with, especially if they're not living in them?
- High rises are cropping up left, right, and center with the government promising "affordable" living. I would hardly say a \$500,000 1 bedroom condo is affordable. How is anyone expected to start a family here? There is now a record debt among millennials aged 18-34 because we're borrowing obscene amounts to race into the real estate market. Fact.
- Vancouver has become a playground for Chinese criminals (see Operation Skynet and the multiple articles on Chinese money laundering). Why aren't we cracking down on this? Take a hardline stance -- send them back.
- Cultural impacts have become a concern. The climate of Vancouver's real estate has created hostility towards Chinese ethnic groups. s.22

s.22

s.22

- Vancouver currently ranks lowest for life satisfaction. Clearly that means something. Locals are unhappy because they can't afford homes. A majority of locals (a whopping 64%) blame foreign investment as the direct cause.

It's time for you to take action. Enough with the wait-and-see approach. Vancouverites are frustrated with government inaction. Take a page from Australia, or even Singapore. Impose

foreign investment taxes, launch a crackdown on tax evaders and criminals, limit property buying on existing houses, just do something.

Sincerely,  
s.22

Sent: Thursday, October 15, 2015 at 2:33 PM  
From: "OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX"  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver's Real Estate: A Hostile Environment  
Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We have noted your concern regarding the property transfer tax and have shared your input with our Minister of Finance. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing review of existing tax policies in preparation for the next provincial budget.

We appreciate the time you have taken to write and hope this response is helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, November 9, 2015 10:18 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca

Subject: Re: FW: Vancouver's Real Estate: A Hostile Environment

Hello,

I have added Mayor Gregor Robertson to this thread as I believe this is a key concern and should be addressed in as many levels of government as possible. While i believe a reply is a nice gesture, I don't feel like it's enough. Policy meetings are not getting us anywhere at a fast enough rate. Millenials are drowning in this city. It's clear this market is in an artificial bubble being propped up by foreign money. The average household income in Vancouver isn't nearly enough to sustain the abnormally high real estate prices. It's simple math.

I'm sure you've read about the recent shoe-string analysis conducted by Andy Yan. While his methods have many shortcomings, I agree that it's no coincidence a majority of recent home buyers have non-anglicized Chinese names. We don't need to point at a specific race. This is not a race issue as Mr. Robertson has stated in the media. ☹ ☹

s.22

As it stands, s.22

s.22 . The situation has gone from bad to worse. My solution? I propose we let the public decide. Hold a referendum on foreign investment and property flipping polices. At least this way things would get done.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 11:47 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: pm@pm.gc.ca; fin.donnelly@parl.gc.ca; rstewart@coquitlam.ca; Robinson.MLA, Selina

LASS:EX; gregor.robinson@vancouver.ca

Subject: The Sale of British Columbia

s.22

November 5, 2015

Honourable Christy Clark

Premier of British Columbia

Legislative Assembly of British Columbia

P.O Box 9041, Station. Provincial Government, Victoria BC V8W 9E1

Dear Premier Clark,

This letter is prompted by a news article in the Metro dated Nov 3, 2015 regarding the purchase of Greater Vancouver houses with offshore money. The article refers specifically to Chinese money, stating that the BC government has estimated this type of funding accounts for only 5% of the real estate transactions in Greater Vancouver and that the BC government has no plans to investigate or act on this information. Although the Chinese are only one of many nationalities making this type of purchase, I believe that to put a 5% figure on this type of transaction is ridiculously under estimated.

My personal response to this information, accurate or not, is one of anger. In my opinion, the BC government has promoted a sale of British Columbia since about the year 2000 when public planning for the 2010 winter games began.

We need to stop the open sale of British Columbia to offshore buyers and it needs to be done immediately. Enough is enough! I ask you to immediately begin a publicly reported tracking and action plan with respect to this issue.

At the very least there could be an immediate permit required for non-resident, not citizen applicants of perhaps, two million dollars per residential purchase. This permit would have to be put into place without any public notice to avoid the wholesale buying spree that would otherwise result. The two million dollars may seem initially high, but is not out of line in my opinion and could be set higher.

Obviously there are other issues connected to this that include non-occupied residences in Greater Vancouver, related homelessness and highly inflated Greater Vancouver house prices.

This permit fee money, only one possible and partial remedy, could be put to use for the good of the citizens of BC: Specifically to upgrade and repair our shamefully run-down Sky train system; It might slow down the sale of British Columbia; would pay for tracking and policing of

this system and improve the appearance of the BC government which is currently tarnished.

Sincerely,

s.22

cc The Right Honorable Justin Trudeau, Prime Minister of Canada, - pm@pm.gc.ca

cc Mr. Fin Donnelly MP elect, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada - fin.donnelly@part.gc.ca

cc Ms. Selina Robinson MLA Coquitlam Maillardville- Selina.robinson.MLA@leg.bc.ca

cc Mayor Richard Stewart, City of Coquitlam, 3000 Guildford Way - rstewart@coquitlam.ca

cc Mayor Gregor Robertson, City of Vancouver - gregor.robinson@vancouver.ca

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, November 10, 2015 11:57 AM  
To: s.22  
Cc: Minister, FIN FIN:EX  
Subject: FW: The Sale of British Columbia

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize that keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

You have made some specific suggestions regarding foreign investment in the real estate market so on your behalf, we are sharing your comments with the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

cc: Honourable Mike De Jong



From: s.22

Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 2:23 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing

Hello,

I would like to know why we do not stop this? If you do not have Canadian citizenship or landed immigrant status then why are we allowing you to buy property? I have no hope of ever owning a home in my own city. Please put an end to this.

News Link:

<http://www.nationalpost.com/m/wp/blog.html?b=news.nationalpost.com//news/canada/in-a-six-month-period-70-of-detached-homes-sold-in-vancouvers-west-side-went-to-mainland-china-buyers>

s.22

From: Premier@gov.bc.ca

To: s.22

Subject: FW: Housing

Date: Thu, 5 Nov 2015 22:06:35 +0000

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 3:24 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: RE: Housing

Dear Premier's office,

s.22

s.22, in their opinion that have all stated that 2/3 of the housing being sold to foreigners is understated, they think it is much higher, most especially when it comes to detached homes. Anyone who lives in Vancouver can clearly see the amount of empty homes and empty waterfront apartments, the incredible skyrocketing costs of housing despite no real upturn in the economy or wages to warrant it. It is a sham and shame on you for ignoring it. Simply walk around the waterfront of coal harbour at night and see how many lights never come on in any of the apartments or around the streets of Vancouver with overgrown lawns.

To continuously play dumb to what is common knowledge is an absolute disgrace. Every single person I work with and know personally talks about this and has the same view point. I wonder how a government can be so out of touch with its citizens? How many rallies need to take place in this city over this subject before something is done? How many articles need to be written? I can guarantee you that if you do not take a hard stance on this you will not make it through the next election cycle.

s.22 but you will see a downfall very similar to what we just saw federally with the Conservative party if you don't do something soon. Be known as the provincial government that did what was needed to make housing affordable for its citizens and not the one that made the educated youth in this city leave because they could not raise a family here. I expect a real answer to what is being done.

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, November 4, 2015 8:09 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Chinese illegal Cash flowing into BC

To:

The BC Premier, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mayor of Vancouver.

Last night I watched a segment on Bloomberg news on the outflow of money from Mainland China by Bloomberg reporter Sheridan Prasso.

What caught my attention was the scale of the money being moved out of China despite a \$50,000 limit by the Chinese Authorities and the fact that while it is flowing to various countries, Vancouver was the only City they mentioned as foremost in the report that this illegal money was flowing, causing widespread disruption in our housing market.

The report concluded that in 2014 - 324 Billion dollars was shifted out of China. After China devalued its currency in August 200 billions dollars in that month alone was shifted out of China.

The report outlines how they were doing this - Hong Kong money changes - Underground Banks - and other means, including suitcases of cash..

Why am I telling you this? Because nothing by the Provincial Government or the Official opposition or the Mayor and Council of Vancouver, seems to be doing anything about this. As for the Real Estate Board they are of course delighted to receive the huge amounts of cash when they sell property to Chinese buyers and to expect them to give an unbiased report of what is happening is naiveté at it worse.

Who cares about young people unable to afford a house, or houses left unoccupied and neighborhoods almost empty by absentee landlords? and the fact the majority of this money is in this country illegally.

Are BC politicians so corrupted by the scale of this money, they are prepared to ignore the problems it has caused?. It seems so.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 3:18 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Chinese illegal Cash flowing into BC

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 6:29 AM

To: Vancouver Mayor & Council

Cc: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Floor #s: 4 and 13

It's about time that you stopped pandering to Chinese buyers and residents.

If other races imposed special demands on developers, merchants, and others, we'd be hauled before the Human Rights Commission.

Canada, especially BC, is becoming a nation of tribes; much like Sunnis and Shiites in countries in the Middle East. Only a matter of time before we have real problems with our so-called diversity. Bragging rights will only go so far.

Vancouver

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 12:39 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing sellout in Vancouver

Vancouver, BC  
3 Nov 2015

Honourable Christy Clark  
Premier of British Columbia  
BC Legislature  
Victoria, BC

Dear Premier Clark:

Re: The tragedy of government deliberately depriving Vancouverites of our right to housing

This phenomenon has been blatantly in our face for so many years while your government and the one in Ottawa refuse to regulate it even as we watch its destruction for locals, who should have first dibs instead of last, and none at all. The great wonder is that both you and Stephen Harper look us all in the eye as if you had done something for constituents when you have, in fact, taken the necessary steps to take it away. Haven't we all worked enough to gift the wealthy, depriving ourselves? Haven't we all had enough of the neoliberal ideology, and aren't we all incredibly relieved to get rid of the Harper regime, the source of this and so many other deprivations to all Canadians?

As if it were untouchable to officials, we painfully watch other nationals play games with each other, bidding property values up to increase their wealth while protecting it from a dicey home-regime where their new wealth may not be as safe as in a democracy. After many, many years of governments handing this injustice to us over to strangers by allowing this to happen, indeed by encouraging it, we have outrageous artificial prices that have nothing to do with reality, gifted to foreigners who have no civic interest and take no responsibility in this province or, indeed, in this country.

How do you face your constituents knowing what you have done to the very essence of our nationhood: a place to live, deliberately denying us a home while eagerly inviting unprincipled opportunists to take our homes from us? When this era of horrible waste and squandering of our resources in Canada has finally ended this will be the phenomenon writ large at the top of the list of devastation, which your brand will carry the A Letter for, at least, the next two generations...and who will have the pathetic job of righting the great wrong, of giving us back our right: a home.

Yours truly,

Page 256

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.22



-----Original Message-----

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]

Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 1:42 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: FW:

[www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html?google\\_editors\\_picks=true](http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html?google_editors_picks=true)

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: November 3, 2015 9:04 AM

To: Clark.MLA, Christy

Subject:

[www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html?google\\_editors\\_picks=true](http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html?google_editors_picks=true)

Dear Premier Clark:

Your inaction re this issue unacceptable.

Sincerely,

s.22

[http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html?google\\_editors\\_picks=true](http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html?google_editors_picks=true)

Sent from my iPad\

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 2:20 PM

To: Gregor robertson Van. mayor; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Asian home buyers

s.22 it has been obvious for many years that it is  
Orientals buying most of the houses on the westside of Vancouver. It has been obvious to all  
living on the westside s.22 It is  
digusting and has changed the whole atmosphere of the s.22

The majority of the fathers/husbands do not live in the home and it is only mothers and children.  
Sometimes it is only the children. However, they are all using facilities, schools, etc. and yet pay  
very little taxes. One doesn't need to be a rocket scientist, or need any studies done, to know this.  
They are all here to take advantage of all Canada has to offer and do very little for this country.

Vancouver & area is selling out to Asians and it should be stopped. It is already a huge problem.

It disgusts me every time I go there to visit.

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 8:56 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Lower Mainland Housing Affordability

Dear Premier Clark,

As you are aware, home prices in the Greater Vancouver area are pretty well out of reach of most people who have resided here most of their lives.

A recent study has shown that a majority of homes in Vancouver's west side (66%) have been purchased by buyers from mainland China and to make matters worse, The Royal Bank has removed the "cap" on extending mortgages from off shore buyers who have no credit history here. This means the frenzied buying will increase making it even worse for long term BC residents to afford to own their home.

I would like to propose a suggestion, that would help BC residents afford to purchase their home.

The Glen Clark NDP government brought in the Capital Transfer tax, which was typical of socialist ideology to 'redistribute wealth'. Unfortunately, the Liberal government which did not support this, did nothing to remove it when they formed the government.

My suggestion is to remove the capital transfer tax "on personal residences". Families who need to sell and purchase a larger home to meet family needs should not be penalized by being taxed. If someone sells their personal residence and buys a new personal residence within 1 year, they should not have to pay the transfer tax.

Investors and speculators should pay a larger tax, which will make up for the revenue lost from BC homeowners.

This tax is a major obstacle to homeowners and needs to be remedied.

Thank you for listening.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 3:05 PM

To: s.22

Cc: Minister, FIN FIN:EX

Subject: FW: Lower Mainland Housing Affordability

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

You have made some specific suggestions regarding the property transfer tax so, on your behalf, we are sharing your comments with the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance. Please be assured your input will be included in the Minister's ongoing review of taxation policies in preparation for the 2016 Budget.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

Cc: Honourable Mike De Jong

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 9:28 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Fwd: In a six-month period, 70% of detached homes sold in Vancouver's west side went to Mainland China buyers

Dear Premier Clark,

There is no denying this now is there? Please look after your citizens and their children and protect our interests. Even in the face of short terms gains, now is the time to do what we elected you to do.

Thank you.

s.22

Subject: In a six-month period, 70% of detached homes sold in Vancouver's west side went to Mainland China buyers

<http://www.nationalpost.com/m/wp/blog.html?b=news.nationalpost.com//news/canada/in-a-six-month-period-70-of-detached-homes-sold-in-vancouvers-west-side-went-to-mainland-china-buyers>

s.22

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, November 4, 2015 8:59 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Affordable Housing

Dear Premier/Premier's Staff,

As you know, studies have shown that rich investors have been snapping up and flipping properties in Vancouver, as well as leaving them vacant, and that the younger generation (including young families and young professionals) has been leaving Vancouver. Studies have also shown that the price of a house in Vancouver has increased by over 100% in the last 10 years while the median annual income of its residents has stayed at around \$65,000.

Can you please explain why your government not willing to acknowledge, let alone address, the affordable housing issue. You are doing a detriment to those who have elected you into office. There is a need for your government to both acknowledge that there's an affordable housing crisis and to take action on it. The data is there. The damage has already been done.

My main questions:

Do you not understand that rich investors (doesn't matter where they're from) are driving up the housing prices in Vancouver and how this is negatively affecting the middle class - those who actually work and live full-time in the city?

Can you please explain why you are not looking at what's happening across the world when global wealth is influencing regional commodities like housing in comparison to what's happening here? Could you not have a chat with Australia who has the same housing problems as Vancouver?

By the way, there are two problems linked with this issue - housing affordability and homelessness. For the time being, I'm only referring to housing affordability.

It really seems like this government is out of touch or so inexperienced it does not know how to properly handle this issue.

s.22

s.22 If you continue to let this happen in this province, Victoria and other cities will ultimately be affected as well.

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 3:13 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Affordable Housing

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 2:03 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Nonresident home buyers

Dear Premier,

Have you seen the article in the Province newspaper on nonresident home purchasers? I live in s.22 and have been alarmed for some time about the purchasing of residential

property by people without either a work permit or permanent residency. s.22

s.22 Not only that but as the property price increases so does rent for homes!!!!

s.22

Where I live I see van loads of people cruising our neighbourhood looking at houses. Some properties are selling for \$100,000 over the asking price.

If you do not do something about this situation our neighbourhoods will consist of absentee landlords and the elderly as families cannot afford the rents or mortgage.

A solution to this situation is to implement the same rules as Australia. That is nonresidential people cannot buy property and people with work permits have to sell the homes they have bought if they leave the country. You may say how can we check to see if people have permanent residency. That is easy as notary publics or lawyers have to do the land transfers and monies for purchase of property. You should include pertinent questionnaires for all people buying homes. Should I sell mine I would not mind questions in regard to my citizenship.

Remember, Madam Premier, these buyers are not part of your electorate and most people are getting sick of seeing their neighbourhoods destroyed!!!

I hope that you will give my letter some consideration.

Respectfully,

s.22

s.22



From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:03 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Nonresident home buyers

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 2:23 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing

Hello,

I would like to know why we do not stop this? If you do not have Canadian citizenship or landed immigrant status then why are we allowing you to buy property? I have no hope of ever owning a home in my own city. Please put an end to this.

News Link:

<http://www.nationalpost.com/m/wp/blog.html?b=news.nationalpost.com//news/canada/in-a-six-month-period-70-of-detached-homes-sold-in-vancouvers-west-side-went-to-mainland-china-buyers>

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:07 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 3:15 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Please protect residents from foreign ownership

Dear Premier Clark,

Now that there is proof, can you please tell me what you plan to do about this? Empty neighbourhoods, houses bought to launder money, locals who cannot afford to live here, tax fraud. This is a recipe for social and political disaster. You cannot ignore this any longer and action is urgently needed. Please tell me your plans to address this.

Regards,  
s.22

Vancouver real estate is a Mainland Chinese buyers' market, study says

Groundbreaking study shows 70 per cent of detached homes sold in a six-month period on Vancouver's west side went to Mainland Chinese buyers; many of them housewives or students with little income

<http://www.theprovince.com/business/vancouver+real+estate+mainland+chinese+buyers+market+study/11485289/story.html>

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:10 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Please protect residents from foreign ownership

Thank you, s.22, for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 6:11 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: housing costs

As a citizen of BC, I would like to know what you are going to do about the housing market? The study just released shows what everyone that lives and works in Vancouver already knows; Mainland China owns Vancouver and is starting to own the suburbs as well.

There are several issues here.

1stThe first is that housing costs are hugely out of reach of most hard working BCers.s.22

s.22

s.22

Secondly, homemakers and students do not afford multimillion dollar homes when making less than \$36000 a year. Obviously there is some tax avoidance happening. I pay income tax, a lot of it. I pay your salary. What are you doing to close the loopholes that these buyers are using to avoid income, and capital gains tax? Thirdly, those in mainland China are not supposed to remove over \$50000 from China and yet somehow it ends up here in our housing market. Who is cracking down on the banks allowing this to happen and who is NOT supporting international agreements?

I am holding you personally responsible for this abysmal state of affairs in the real estate market.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:18 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: housing costs

Thank you, s.22, for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 8:39 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Cc: James.MLA, Carole A LASS:EX  
Subject: Vancouver Housing Market

Dear Premier Clark,

s.22

s.22

However, it saddens me to read of the current runaway escalation of home prices, the wholesale demolition of sound housing stock and the increasing lack of affordability which faces the young people in Vancouver looking forward. Also, examples of empty and rarely occupied homes purchased by investors, whether new or existing, appear to abound which contributes to a deteriorating sense of community in many affected neighbourhoods.

Data recently collected shows that, to a significant extent, the real estate hyper-inflation in Vancouver is being caused by international investors. Today's Globe and Mail newspaper featured an article on this topic at:

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/vancouver-housing-market-fuelled-by-chinese-buyers-study/article27064577/>

Therefore I believe your government, in concert with the municipal council in Vancouver, needs to take action and create financial disincentives or other regulatory measures to discourage such unsustainable practices and to restore some balance and sanity to the city's housing market. I suggest such action, if implemented in a fair and considered manner, would be met favourably by a significant majority of Vancouver residents.

In addition, it appears at least some of the new investors are avoiding tax obligations including capital gains and GST sums payable on real estate transactions by falsely claiming investment properties as their principal residence. I would urge you to crack down on any such violations in order to set a clear example and discourage others from doing the same.

Thank you for your consideration,  
s.22



From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:22 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver Housing Market

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 9:02 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign investment in vancouver homes

Will the BC liberals do anything about this?

"In a recent six-month period about 70 per cent of all detached homes sold on Vancouver's west side were purchased by Mainland China buyers, an academic case study shows"

It's all over the news. Time to tell the citizens what you will or will not do.

s.22

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Tuesday, November 3, 2015 8:46 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: November 2, 2015 9:29 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name

s.22

Email

s.22

Riding

s.22

Comments & Feedback

Hello Christy,

I read an article in the Globe and mail today about foreign investment in Vancouver, the link is below and I hope you will take the time to attempt to understand the issues. Your colleague, David Eby (MLA), has done a substantial amount of work on this issue. It is also an important topic in the tri-cities real estate markets which desperately needs attention. I'm hoping you are already making plans to implement restrictions or at least much higher taxes for foreign investors/owners (much like most other major cities in the world do in order to protect their citizens). If your not, please do your home work and start listening to British Columbians.

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/vancouvers-housing-market-fuelled-by-chinese-buyers-study/article27064577/>

s.22

and am certain that if you were to conduct a similar study in Coquitlam (formerly a family oriented suburb at least 40 minutes from Vancouver), you would find very shocking results. Homes in Coquitlam which last year would have been fixer-ups (opportunities for young families) at about \$550-\$700K are now selling for \$1 mill+ in no more than a few days and with NO subjects to Foreign buyers. How can tax paying residents compete with the apparent wealth, tax advantages and carelessness of these buyers? This type of speculative behaviour is putting our entire real estate market at risk for a crash and the reality is that your lack of policy will be to blame.

If you question the validity of this study, please take the time to go to a random detached open house on the weekend in West Coquitlam, Central Coquitlam or Westwood plateau. You will quickly get a realistic sense of what's really going on.

I'm hoping you can provide some information on what your doing to make sure contributing Canadians are put first when it comes to housing, as well as ensuring loopholes which allow people to evade property taxes gets fixed asap? The current situation is not sustainable and will lead to many more problems for our communities in the near and distant future.

Regards,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 2:40 PM

To: s.22

Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, November 1, 2015 12:28 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca; Elmore.MLA, Mable LASS:EX; Davies.D@parl.gc.ca

Subject: Please collaboarte to address the distorting influence of foreign capital in Vancouver housing--it's urgent!

Premier Christy Clark  
Mayor Gregor Robertson  
Mable Elmore, MLA  
Don Davies, MP

You will have seen this plea in the Globe and Mail (addressed to Prime Minister designate, Justin Trudeau): <http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/rob-commentary/mr-trudeau-please-help-vancouver-achieve-a-rational-housing-market/article27051294/> .

Titled "Mr. Trudeau, please help Vancouver achieve a rational housing market", it articulates the frustration Vancouver residents feel as well as anything I've seen.

The premise of the plea to the federal government is that the province and the municipality have not been effective. The writer acknowledges that the solution will not be easy, but we desperately need all of our governments, from their different perspectives and jurisdictional roles, to get it done.

Deterrents must be put in place to ensure that residential housing is not treated as an investment opportunity--a safe haven for foreign cash. Any use for housing stock other than to provide places for local residents to live must be actively discouraged.

The solution requires collaboration--something that apparently doesn't come naturally to various levels of government and political affiliation. No name-calling or blaming, please. Sit down together and solve it for the benefit of the community and people who want to make their home here.

Thank you.

s.22

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 1:50 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Please collaboarte to address the distorting influence of foreign capital in Vancouver housing--it's urgent!

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, November 1, 2015 7:37 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/vancouver-house-buying-frenzy-leaves-half-empty-neighbourhoods/article27056534/>

Still planning on doing absolutely nothing about this? It's becoming a joke; s.22

s.22

It should be for BC taxpayers who have

built Vancouver, not rich foreign investors.

s.22



From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 9:23 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

For your consideration. s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: November 2, 2015 7:38 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name

s.22

Email

s.22

Riding

s.22

Comments & Feedback

Christy,

You are nothing but an uneducated, lying and deceiving, politician.

Over and over you justify your position with respect to families, but all the while destroying that very same dream for many.

Your lack of ability to properly govern policy and administration has been clearly demonstrated by scandle after scandle after scandle. Really Christy, do you think people are so stupid to think that government records just disappear?

And now, more hard evidence that you do not know what you are doing.

<http://news.nationalpost.com/news/canada/in-a-six-month-period-70-of-detached-homes-sold-in-vancouvers-west-side-went-to-mainland-china-buyers>

When will you admit you have been a complete failure. When will you finally do step aside and admit you have turned BC into a haven for corrupt and illicit business. Your legacy will go down in history as the leader who sold out to everyone and anyone who had a dollar.

Congratulations and making families last.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, November 2, 2015 11:08 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing affordability concern

Hello Premier Clark

I wanted to write you to express my frustration and concern over the housing affordability problem in the lower mainland. I am frustrated about the current real estate bubble that in my opinion is being driven by foreign wealth and laundered money. It has and is driving out the people who live here, grew up here and want to raise a family here, such as myself. I understand that the increased housing sales have brought more tax money to the government but I'd encourage you to look at some of the problems it has brought.

I am writing to ask you to start to take action to improve the current problem. In my opinion, we should be gathering more information about this issue so that we can make an informed decision about what to do about it. Secondly, we need to take action, to ensure that we stop having empty houses, owned by foreign investors, while all of us, the people who want to live here are forced to leave. Please stop listening to the real estate industry. They have a vested interest to keep this bubble going bigger and bigger as they continue to make more on their commissions.

s.22 I have heard many stories from friends of how when they go to buy, they are constantly out bid, above asking by foreign investors with no subjects. This is a reality. I have been saving money for my whole life with a dream of one day owning a home. However, we have reached a place where the price of homes are not linked to people's incomes here but people's wealth somewhere else. Our homes are not foreign investment properties, but places that allow our communities to thrive.

Please take some action before any more of my generation is forced to leave town, as I have already seen happen. Meanwhile, the rest of us, are left to live in basement suites or with our parents with no end in sight as half a million dollars isn't even enough to buy a tear down house.

I just want to be clear. s.22

s.22

s.22

not wait until the next election to take action.

Please do

Thanks for your time,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, November 5, 2015 1:59 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Housing affordability concern

Thank you, s.22 for your email. We appreciate the time you have taken to write.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We understand you have some specific concerns regarding foreign investment and we have noted your comments. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing discussions on this issue.

Again, thank you for taking the time to write. We appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, October 13, 2015 9:22 PM

To: ktomlinson@globeandmail.com; gmason@globeandmail.com; elizabeth.may@parl.gc.ca; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; thomas.mulcair@parl.gc.ca; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca; stephen.harper@parl.gc.ca

Subject: Foreign investors avoid taxes through Canadian real estate (KATHY TOMLINSON The Globe and Mail Last updated: Wednesday, Oct. 07, 2015)

Dear all,

In case you had not seen it, I wanted to bring to your attention the article published by Kathy Tomlinson of the Globe and Mail (Oct 7), that exposes what everyone already knew - that many, so-called "foreign investors" are able to launder their money (whether obtained illicitly or not) in the Canadian real estate market. These folks bring money from overseas, buy real estate and put it in the name of a relative or a corporation, and pay no taxes to the CRA. This game has been going on for at least two decades, and no politician has been willing to do anything about it. That is why, today you have many zip codes in Vancouver where the reported household income does not even cover the carrying cost of \$1million plus homes, and the kids go to \$30,000 per year private schools and drive around in Mercedes, Ferraris, etc. s.22

s.22

s.22

If the CRA bothered to do even a modest amount of homework, they would uncover tens of thousands, if not hundreds of thousands of tax cheats and money launderers. Of course, it is much easier to nickel and dime the "dumb" locals for any extra cash that can be easily extracted to meet the requisite quotas. Of course, nobody would want to do anything to upset the current status quo, as it would be too politically incorrect, would offend certain parts of the population, and would impact the crooked realtors, accountants and lawyers who are complicit in these schemes. What do the politicians want to do? Christy Clark thinks there is no problem. Stephen Harper wants to "study" the issue. What a farce. This is a real public policy issue, and no one wants to do a damn thing about it. It is not even an election issue, as the politicians are too afraid to touch the subject. All Mulcair and Trudeau want to talk about is how they can continue to fleece the "dumb" locals for more tax revenue to fund their public spending schemes. I ask them, Who Will Pay? Personally I am getting sick of paying taxes so others can freeloader on education, roads, health care, old age security, etc., etc., etc. The system is broken, and believe me, there is MASSIVE tax fraud going on.

I suspect that no politician will address any of these issues and this e-mail will be deleted as another inconvenient truth. On the contrary, if you are doing something about it, please feel free to respond.

Regards, s.22

On Thu, Oct 15, 2015 at 3:40 PM, OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX wrote:  
Hello, s.22 , and thank you for your email.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

We have noted your concern regarding the property transfer tax and have shared your comments with our Minister of Finance. Please be assured your input will be included in our ongoing review of existing tax policies in preparation for the next provincial budget.

We appreciate the time you have taken to write and hope this response is helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Saturday, October 17, 2015 11:45 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: FW: Foreign investors avoid taxes through Canadian real estate (KATHY TOMLINSON The Globe and Mail Last updated: Wednesday, Oct. 07, 2015)

Thank you for your response.

Per my e-mail, I did not specifically single out the property transfer tax (as a solution), which if increased, would only increase government coffers and unfairly hit law abiding citizens in this province (as usual) - while completely missing the real issue and the real culprits.

What I am concerned about is tax avoidance, tax fraud and money laundering as outlined in the referenced Globe and Mail article. What I would like to see is taxation fairness that does not allow people to pay no taxes in this country yet take advantage of all public services and drive up the price of housing to ridiculous levels. What I would like to see is the CRA go after the massive tax fraud that is going on, go after the cheaters and their enablers. I recognize that this is not necessarily a provincial matter, but is directly related to the housing Ponzi scheme that has been unleashed in Vancouver (never mind all the bogus excuses and platitudes usually quoted: "we don't have data", "there is insufficient land", etc.).

If you are a resident of this province or this country, you should pay taxes like everyone else; if this is no longer the case, all bets are off. Why should I pay for someone else's government programs, health care, OAS, etc., while they cheat the system. This is becoming endemic. This is the fundamental issue we are facing...

Perhaps you should be required, if holding a Canadian passport, to file taxes on your worldwide income, even if claiming to be residing outside of Canada (like the law in the United States). I am sure this solution would bring in hundreds of millions to government coffers. This is a real solution that would restore tax fairness, however, one that no politician in Victoria or Ottawa would touch with a ten foot pole.

Regards, s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, October 5, 2015 8:28 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Cc: joyce.murray.c1@parl.gc.ca  
Subject: Shame on You Chistry Clark

Dear Ms Clark:

Vancouver Sun editorial 1 October 2015: "....BC has been reluctant to intervene  
.....and because it DOES NOT WISH TO APPEAR TO TARGET BUYERS FROM CHINA"

Sooner or later, the the vast amount of wealth pouring in to Vancouver housing from China was bound to affect public policy....and so it has. Why is it that other governments around the world have taken action on this matter, but BC does not? Has our government been bought? Shame on you!

Sincerely,

s.22



From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, December 8, 2015 12:11 AM

To: justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: john.mccallum@parl.gc.ca; bill.morneau@parl.gc.ca; gregor.robertson@vancouver.ca

Subject: Why is there no intervention for housing market?

Mr. Justin Trudeau and Christy Clark,

I would like to ask you why is there no government intervention in the housing market like other countries? Why are we as locals are being treated unfairly. If we were to buy a home in another country, we would need to follow yet foreigners can come to Canada and park their money and make big money off of us. Why is that? Is that fair? Do you call that fair?!? Quite frankly, this angers me. It is time to put some intervention in the housing market. Christy, Clark, you need to stop being so greedy and take money for families in the form of PTT.

THIS IS A JOKE! Foreigners can come to Canada and screw the locals. And our govt doesn't protect us. Yet, if we were to buy property in other countries, we have to go through all kinds of restrictions. This is not right. FIX IT!!

Regards,

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, November 17, 2015 2:03 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: RE: Time to restrict oversea investors

Are you still in the tenure of your office? I think you might have already got the research report from some institute about the oversea investors status. How do you think now?

Regards,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Friday, October 16, 2015 1:38 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Cc: s.22  
Subject: Re: Illegal housing

Dear Premier Clark,

Thank you for the response. The legislation is in place to prevent this type of thing from continuing. Regrettably, the municipal, provincial and federal governments appear to lack the intestinal fortitude to actually enforce the current laws.

s.22

Fast forward, directly from  
Gary Mason's recent Globe and Mail article:

"I urge everyone to read Ms. Tomlinson's articles. But in a nutshell, I can tell you that, among other things, she found that investors have been lying about their income to Canadian authorities (one person claimed to make only \$19,000 a year in China, while sending payments of \$260,000 a year to his wife in Vancouver). In fact, investors have been moving millions into Canada while claiming to be impoverished.

The Globe looked at 250 properties that had sold recently in Vancouver for \$2-million or more; 85 per cent of the purchasers had Chinese names. One-third of the properties were registered to homemakers, students or corporations, which clouds the real buyers' identity and helps them to avoid paying income or capital gains taxes."

Please take my concerns seriously. This is a serious issue that has been raised by the press, and your government appears to be doing absolutely nothing. Contact the press, they have done the government's research.

Regards, s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Saturday, October 31, 2015 6:30 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Cc: oppositionleader@leg.bc.ca; s.22  
Subject: Re: Illegal housing

And as Christy Clark does nothing common folk are going to pay the price. I have always voted right of centre, but if the NDP seizes this issue I will be voting for them. Again, Saskatchewan is addressing this issue and YOU are not. Most other developed countries are addressing this issue and YOU are not. This is shameful!

<http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/vancouver-house-buying-frenzy-leaves-half-empty-neighbourhoods/article27056534/>

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, September 28, 2015 12:28 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Chinese Immigrants

To pay before and after next election, causing high prices in real estate market causing Canadian citizens from not getting mortgage. Will not support any Chinese candidates period, Chinese immigrants must pay triple property taxes retroactive to 2003, or such time they become Canadian citizens and yuan bank to be shut down for bringing filthy, tainted, corrupt Chinese money from China. Chinese who are Canadian citizens will lose their brokerage and real estate licenses, future exams in English only

The battle ground has now been set

If you think we are just going to sit back and do nothing think again, your current caucus is dysfunctional at best

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: s.22  
Sent: Saturday, May 14, 2016 8:13 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Please Help Your Millennials Stay in BC

Dear Christy Clark,

s.22

The bank would never give us a \$600,000 mortgage for a single-family dwelling, nevertheless that extra \$100,000+ amount that we'd have to offer to outbid the other eager buyers. Just last week,

s.22

because the rest of BC agrees that this is all so ridiculous. From where I stand, the current situation is unacceptable.

I'm not an expert on foreign investment, so I'm turning to you to help me understand how you are planning to manage the foreign buyers that will continue to drive up our housing prices. What do you expect my generation to do moving forward? And what's your plan to stop us being further "priced out of the city" - as Ian Young calls it.

It's not a rhetorical question - I would actually like an answer, please.

In my life,

s.22

retire. I don't think that these are unreasonable requests, so why do they feel impossible.

If somethings don't change, s.22  
years. And I predict that the rest of the s.22  
follow.

will be soon to

I look forward to your response.

Respectfully,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 3:53 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Re: FW: Please Help Your Millennials Stay in BC

Thank you your prompt and detailed reply.

I'm glad you recognize that this is a growing concern and I completely agree. If you'd like to keep the economy thriving, it is essential to keep the young population - that are a contributing factor - in the province. I completely understand that government changes and policies can take time, but you can understand why we're all feeling the crunch.

I heard about the Property Tax Transfer, although to be honest in the grand scheme of things \$13,000 on a \$600,000 mortgage barely tips the scale. (TD Canada Trust tells me that I'd be paying \$3300 a month for 25 years in order to buy my \$600,000 home versus my \$3294 a month for my \$587,000 home). And realistically, if I ever wanted a single family dwelling, (which is guaranteed to be over \$750,000 in most places in the Metro Vancouver and Fraser Valley area) this Property Tax Transfer isn't going to help me at all.

As for your affordable housing initiative, I feel this is only a temporary solution to the much deeper problem. Firstly, where are you planning on building these 2000 affordable housing units? I wouldn't want to take away any of our agricultural or green-space.

I don't think the concern is the physical number of available home - I have s.22

s.22

And

according to Financial Post, 10% of Vancouver's condo are in a similar vacant state. I also read your links you sent me and read up more on affordable housing. On housingmattersbc.ca, which clearly breaks down the types of affordable housing and all the options (Emergency shelters, transitional living, independent social housing, and rent assistance), all of these don't encourage and assist young Vancouverites in purchasing property, building assets, and ultimately contributing to the economy.

<http://business.financialpost.com/personal-finance/mortgages-real-estate/more-than-one-in-10-vancouver-condos-sit-empty-in-city-desperate-for-affordable-housing>

I was very surprised when I read your link on predatory practice of real estate, it's actually quite disgusting and I'm glad that the new requirements mandates that "one that requires the seller's consent to transfer the contract; and one that requires any resulting profit to be returned to the seller." This seems to protect the seller, but seems to do very little for the buyer. The seller and the assignor are now on the same page, but it doesn't seem to stop either of them from selling the assignee (the new owner) a more expensive home and driving up the real estate value.

I did here about the new measures to collect information on the country of origin with the Land Title Office. I think this a positive step forward. My only concern is the phrasing in the article you provided does not reassure me of the changes tied with this process. In the article, it says, "by collecting this data, the Province will be in a better position to assess the volume of foreign investment and prevalence of bare trusts in B.C.'s real estate market and determine whether any further action is required." Not "what further action is required," but "whether." Now I know this may just be a PR ploy of avoiding "undocumented" accusations, but after the latest ridiculous

news story of the West Van student owning the \$31.1 million dollar home, I can't imagine how you can turn a blind eye on the fact that foreign buyers are clearly abusing our real estate market and by claiming student status are contributing minimal tax contribution to the economy.

And this isn't a one-time anomaly. Andy Yan publish a well documented study that showcased that "homemakers and, to a lesser extent, students, are often the listed occupations of the owners of many newly purchased multi-million dollar Vancouver properties." This was made public last November and the government only just reacted 6 days ago by announcing to "explore the data" through a study in the Land Title Office. How long will that study take to produce results that satisfy you? How much longer after that will it take for you to take action and make change? And when you do finally implement action, how far will our housing have risen?

[http://www.theprovince.com/business/real-](http://www.theprovince.com/business/real-estate/million+point+grey+mansion+owned+student/11912936/story.html)

[estate/million+point+grey+mansion+owned+student/11912936/story.html](http://www.theprovince.com/business/real-estate/million+point+grey+mansion+owned+student/11912936/story.html)

<http://www.slideshare.net/ayan604/ownership-patterns-of-single-family-homes-sales-on-the-west-side-neighborhoods-of-the-city-of-vancouver-a-case-study>

Looking forward to your reply! And Happy Monday!

Thank you,

s.22



From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 1:15 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Please Help Your Millennials Stay in BC

Hello, Anna, and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Just last week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 3:33 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: FW: Please Help Your Millennials Stay in BC

Hello again, Anna, and thank you for your follow-up email. We appreciate your feedback on the various initiatives our government has undertaken to address housing affordability. Please be assured your input will be included in our related discussions.

Thank you, again, for writing. We do appreciate hearing from you.

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 6:54 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: FW: FW: Please Help Your Millennials Stay in BC

Hello,

Lovely, I would very much like to hear from you again, and because of your reassurance that my input will be included in related discussions, I expect to hear back regarding your resulting conclusions. If I do not hear back more from you on this subject, either through near-future public action or continued in our private discussions here, please do know that I will be following up again.

I feel out discussion has been very well timed with the recent study put forth by Vancity.  
<http://www.cknw.com/2016/05/16/millennials-making-trade-offs-to-afford-living-in-metro-vancouver-survey/>

I will not be as easily brushed away or deterred by your cut-and-paste PR responses. And neither are the 181,000 young people (ages 20-34) living in Vancouver - 68% who have recently report similar thoughts on relocation.

However, as I mentioned previously, I do understand government change is never instant. If I see no public changes that meet my satisfaction and needs, or if I do not hear back from your "related discussions" on the matter, I will check back in 2 months time to learn more about your progress on this matter.

Thank you,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 1:22 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: China

We do not need agreements with these corrupted Chinese and corrupted China, after next election they will be torn up and put in the garbage bin. We cannot stand these corrupted Chinese in our province, foreign Chinese must pay quadruple property taxes  
Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: s.22  
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 10:59 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Reminder Again

This is your doing in the first place, I and we do not want Chinese foreigners in our real estate market, a tax must be imposed on these violators, De Jong is the worst finance ministers in years for BC, pandering to corrupt, dishonest foreign Chinese from China, this will be reflected in the next election, foreign restrictions will be imposed on BC real estate market, we do not them investing in BC either

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:03 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: May 12, 2016 6:40 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name  
s.22

Email  
s.22

Riding  
s.22

#### Comments & Feedback

All non resident hunters and fisherman are charge a higher non resident fee if they are out of province and even more if out of the country  
Yet we sell of our land to whoever wants it and has the most money  
Many of these people do not pay taxes in Canada

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 10:50 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: Message From a Liberal Voter

From: s.22  
Sent: May 16, 2016 10:12 AM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Cc: contact@bcliberals.com  
Subject: Message From a Liberal Voter

Dear Christie Clark,

I am writing you to let you know that we are very disappointed in the current Provincial Government's inaction on limiting the effects of speculation in the Lower Mainland and BC housing market. Back in 2010

s.22

Specially, the reason is the irresponsibility of you and your government in allowing Vancouver to become a hub of speculation for International buyers of our real estate without any legislation and controls to try and curb this .

London has introduced a special levy on homes left vacant. Hong Kong, Singapore, and Sydney have all enacted tax or legal barriers to property purchases by foreigners. Yet the British Columbia has sat back and done nothing. This is an issue that needs to be handled by the Provincial and Federal Governments and yet I have heard nothing from either. You are responsible to represent the people's interests by leading. Don't blame it on the Feds.

We are home owners and find your comments about existing owners "losing equity" ridiculous. Great for the "haves" and too bad for the "have-nots". What you are saying is "Let's build a Province for the Wealthy".

Over the past couple of years you have commented that you didn't have the facts and the statistics to make any changes. You used the excuse that the Government needed to "gather" information before any changes could be made and did nothing to gather any statistics while the prices continued to climb at a speculative rate . Yet later when the information about "shadow flipping" surfaced, the comment from the Government was "Damn for the reports and will announce something shortly". I would call this a political maneuver.

Back in June of 2015 you responded to local governments concerns this way:..

"Mayor Robertson argued that wealthy investors in luxury housing and property speculators are a driving force behind the escalation in housing prices. He asked the province to consider a tax on luxury homes, to penalize speculators who flip properties for profit and to give the city tools to fine property owners who keep units empty for investment purposes.

While saying she wants to work with the city to find solutions, the premier rejected Robertson's

requests. She attached an analysis done by the Ministry of Finance and the B.C. Real Estate Association that said the key factors driving the real estate market have little to do with rich investors or speculators.

"There is a perception that foreign investors and speculators are driving an affordability crisis in residential real estate - particularly in Greater Vancouver. The data we have does not support this perception," the Finance Ministry analysis said. "However, industry experts estimate that foreign buyers likely make up less than five per cent of home sales activity in Greater Vancouver."

I would say you underestimated the effect of that "so called" 5% pushing up all prices as it has clearly done. And now that it is too late you are proposing to collect some data, again doing nothing. This is called being reactive (to voters) and not pro-active.

I would encourage you to read Josh Gordon's new report:

<http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/sfu-real-estate-study-foreign-buyers-1.3572499>

Somehow I believe, like local governments with taxes from developers, you are "hooked" on the \$1.15Billion collected annually through the Property Purchase Tax.

After seeing a poll released last night showing the increase in Liberal voters not supporting the party in the next Provincial Election specifically because of these inactions, I would say that we are in that camp.

Any changes the current government plans to make between now and the Provincial Election will not change our decision. As they say "The horse has already left the barn". Congratulations!

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 9:09 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Coleman.MLA, Rich LASS:EX

Subject: The Housing Market

Your effort to intervene in the the ``house flipping`` mess in the Lower Mainland is appreciated. Kindly strengthen your measures by closing an important loophole and forbidding side agreements.

The recent spate of reports and information makes it clear that foreign investment is the main driver in our parabolic real estate market. There is insufficient capital in the market itself to drive prices so far upward so quickly - it can only be shocked this way by the flow of outside capital.

The latest issue in our market is the lack of sellers - largely driven by the fact that locals have nowhere to go in their home region to buy another property at bloated prices. Listen to your constituents and you will learn that even the so-called winners - property owners - are now angry and fearful about our out of control housing market that is transforming the communities they once loved. The rental market is now inflated and congested and people with reasonable means cannot find a home in Vancouver. In other words, the people your government reportedly has been trying to protect are turning on you. You have already lost the young prospective buyer, the so-called losers, who you have willingly sacrificed to enrich government coffers and to claim to be the healthiest economy in Canada.

At the same time you have allowed foreign buyers, who are breaking Canadian laws, to make Vancouver a money laundering capital now populated by resentful, angry people with little sense of community. No one has any security in this market.

Your economy is rife with risk - 37% of the economy is tied to real estate and another 17% to construction. These numbers are extraordinary. The people who make Vancouver work, retail and service workers even professionals, cannot afford to live here anymore. Vancouver has the highest cost of living in Canada with the lowest threshold wage - what does that say about the government's values and the future of Vancouver.

Other jurisdictions around the world have made serious efforts to deal with these issues. Still, the Liberal Party of BC only makes half-baked gestures, pitting winners against losers. The election is coming, the pressures for foreign buyers to get their money out of their country is mounting, the crisis is not going away.

Think about the legacy you are leaving. Take serious action now or risk an unceremonious loss in the next election.

s.22

Last updated on 2016/05/17 09:52:36 by tuzdavin [Correspondence]



From: s.22  
Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 6:41 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Housing stock

I support stopping foreign money from buying up the residential housing stock of BC as this is the theft of the dreams of our own young people who will never afford a home.

From: s.22  
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 1:37 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Vancouver real-estate crazy market

Dear Mrs. Christy Clarke!

So far after 3+ years of your government I would like to thank you for mostly good job for B.C.

Hopefully you and your government will be able to proceed with LNG developments soon to the benefit of all British Columbians.

I understand that you and your finance minister are aware of crazy Greater Vancouver real estate market, but it seems that so far you are not ready to step in with taxation or other methods to cool it down with provision that you just changed rules for assignment selling profits. Recently there were very good points from Simon Frazer professor but totally ignored and denied by finance minister.

s.22

were few small groups of 3 - 5 people visiting all Chinese origin, most of them not speaking English at all and it looked that they have one English translator withy them maybe realtor. Realtor told us that probably more than 75% of visitors to the open house were Chinese decent. The asking price for 1500 sq.ft. was \$675,000. That same townhouse was selling 3 years ago at \$450,000 - \$460,000 range.

I checked today with realtor and was told that he received 5 firm no subject offers in \$750,000 range. This is entry point size townhouse development in South Surrey.

It seems to me that out of country investors are driving our real estate price to huge bubble territory and how this will end I'm afraid to think especially for young middle class families. My example is from South Surrey I cant imagine what is price for housing in Vancouver, N. & W. Vancouver, Burnaby, Richmond....

Your government with support of federal and local governments must step in with some form of restriction and taxation for foreign investors because if you don't I don't know where are people making average wages going to afford to live but NOT here for sure. I understand that Australia and Singapore had same kind of problems until they changed foreign real estate investments regulations and rules.

Nest year we have elections and I hear from NDP leader that real estate prices are going to be major part of their platform. If you decide to ignore this huge problem I think that NDP might get back in power.

Please do not reply with some FORM reply.

Regards,

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2016 3:00 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: Vancouver real-estate crazy market

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email and kind words to the Premier. We appreciate your support and we also appreciate your taking the time to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Just last week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 10:13 AM

To: Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: RE election 2017

Absolutely yes it is time to tax foriegn off shore purchasers who pay little tax in Canada if any and have little or no income here as well. The tax needs to be set relatively high 50% to 100% so that these people do not impact the market. House pricing should be primary driven by Canadian economics, issues like Canadian supply and demand and Canadian affordability. Not purchasers coming in and impacting the market for ulterior motives. There are a number of problems with Foreign purchases by non residents in Canada:

- 1) A lot of these purchases are made with the primary consideration of getting money out of another country and value of what is being purchased or impact on people in that market does not matter a lot.
- 2) Our population base and housing stock is very small compared to a lot of high population countries and as such prices can be easily distorted by large amounts by foriegn buyers.
- 3) I suspect that a lot of this money is dirty money looking for a place to hide from home governments and Canada is an easy target.

Canada is being played big time here by external forces outside of our control and it is time for the government to stop this dead in its tracks as it will only get worse otherwise.

Housing in any country should be primarily for the population of that country and not some kind of a speculative game or tool for others to use at their whim and for uncanny/ illegal purposes.

I am sure that those who profit from the industry and can't see past their next commission check or sale will think differently but then, they will not be the bag holders when the party crashes will they?? No they will have lined their pockets and be smiling!! The government needs to stop this and fast!

Absolutely yes it is time to tax foriegn off shore purchasers who pay little tax in Canada if any and have little or no income here as well. The tax needs to be set relatively high 50% to 100% so that these people do not impact the market. House pricing should be primary driven by Canadian economics, issues like Canadian supply and demand and Canadian affordability. Not purchasers coming in and impacting the market for ulterior motives. There are a number of problems with Foreign purchases by non residents in Canada:

- 1) A lot of these purchases are made with the primary consideration of getting money out of another country and value of what is being purchased or impact on people in that market does not matter a lot.
- 2) Our population base and housing stock is very small compared to a lot of high population countries and as such prices can be easily distorted by large amounts by foriegn buyers.
- 3) I suspect that a lot of this money is dirty money looking for a place to hide from home governments and Canada is an easy target.

Canada is being played big time here by external forces outside of our control and it is time for the government to stop this dead in its tracks as it will only get worse otherwise.

Housing in any country should be primarily for the population of that country and not some kind of a speculative game or tool for others to use at their whim and for uncanny/ illegal purposes.

I am sure that those who profit from the industry and can't see past their next commission check or sale will think differently but then, they will not be the bag holders when the party crashes will they?? No they will have lined their pockets and be smiling!! The government needs to stop this and fast!

Absolutely yes it is time to tax foreign off shore purchasers who pay little tax in Canada if any and have little or no income here as well. The tax needs to be set relatively high 50% to 100% so that these people do not impact the market. House pricing should be primarily driven by Canadian economics, issues like Canadian supply and demand and Canadian affordability. Not purchasers coming in and impacting the market for ulterior motives. There are a number of problems with Foreign purchases by non residents in Canada:

- 1) A lot of these purchases are made with the primary consideration of getting money out of another country and value of what is being purchased or impact on people in that market does not matter a lot.
- 2) Our population base and housing stock is very small compared to a lot of high population countries and as such prices can be easily distorted by large amounts by foreign buyers.
- 3) I suspect that a lot of this money is dirty money looking for a place to hide from home governments and Canada is an easy target.

Canada is being played big time here by external forces outside of our control and it is time for the government to stop this dead in its tracks as it will only get worse otherwise.

Housing in any country should be primarily for the population of that country and not some kind of a speculative game or tool for others to use at their whim and for uncanny/ illegal purposes.

I am sure that those who profit from the industry and can't see past their next commission check or sale will think differently but then, they will not be the bag holders when the party crashes will they?? No they will have lined their pockets and be smiling!! The government needs to stop this and fast!

From: s.22

Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 9:56 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: re

Gee, it is so challenging and difficult for reasonable readers to figure out for themselves what is causing high house prices in Vancouver (yes that is sarcasm).

Because look, we have conflicting information in the newspapers.

In the Globe and Mail, we have people interviewed in the Vancouver real estate industry, real estate tycoons and real estate shills whose high incomes rely on skyrocketing house prices. And they assure us that foreign investment likely is not as big an issue as believed, they promise us that overseas money is not making the impact that silly local laypersons believe, they caution that a lot of laypeople in Vancouver are basically racists and so that makes them delusional about what is going on.

But then, on the other hand, in online newspapers like the Chilliwack Times, readers can see headlines such as "Foreign buyers crushing home dreams in Vancouver as governments do little", and read there about a research professor at a public university whose extensive scientific studies have led to the following sentence in the article: "The professor's report blames Vancouver's housing crisis on foreign buyers, particularly from China, because "this is where the evidence points".

Gee, it is so challenging and difficult for reasonable readers to figure out for themselves what is causing high house prices in Vancouver. I mean, who do you believe? The research professor at a university who uses the scientific method, or do you believe real estate shills who line their bulging wallets with cash derived from skyrocketing house prices?

So hard to figure out who to believe...



Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 3:57 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Vancouver housing crisis

Thank you for your response and your efforts on this issue so far. Much more needs to be done, so we will be eagerly awaiting your further actions to rectify this problem.

Thanks again,

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 11:29 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Real estate crisis in Vancouver.

Good morning

I may be reinventing the wheel but why aren't foreign purchasers charged a purchase tax on homes. If they can afford to pay ridiculous prices I am sure BC could impose a 20% to 30% purchase tax on the sale price by foreign purchasers. This would raise large sums of money that could be used to build affordable housing for BC residents and may put a natural lid on escalating prices. This would be in addition to the transfer tax.

There are many countries that impose restrictions to foreign purchase of their prime real estate. Why not us.

Thank you

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: May 12, 2016 2:02 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Email  
s.22

## Comments & Feedback

Page 27 of 56 OOP-2016-62308 s.2

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 10:37 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Housing prices in Victoria

Dear Premier Clark,

A home in the Victoria neighbourhood of Fernwood listed for \$729,000 sold, after a five-day bidding war, for \$960,000. The home in question an ordinary 1940s bungalow. Two years ago that same house would have been on the market for half a year and sold for \$550,000 - 600,000.

I have watched, in horror, as the real estate market in Vancouver has spun out of control over the past decade. Middle class families cannot afford to purchase housing. Rental prices are rising. Multi-child families are now living in apartments, inner-city schools are crowded, and previously vibrant neighbourhoods (like Point Grey) are empty.

Our beautiful province is made up of many nationalities and cultures. It is what makes us special, diverse and unique. People who move their families here from abroad and choose to make British Columbia their home are welcome. Foreign investors who speculate in the BC real estate market and purchase homes from abroad (leaving them empty) are not.

Our communities need you, as our Premier, to protect them. It is our citizens and workers living in these communities who keep them safe, patronize the local businesses, and volunteer on the school PAC. It is the connection amongst neighbours that makes BC's communities vibrant, healthy and strong.

Please stop this madness. Help to limit the real estate that non-residents can purchase. Enact policy measures that discourage foreign investment in our homes. Help the citizens and workers of BC (of today and tomorrow) to be able to afford housing and successfully raise their families in community.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:17 PM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Housing prices in Victoria

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing is of deep concern and we want to work with the various municipalities across the province to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 2:06 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: Housing prices in Victoria

Thank-you for the prompt response to my email; and I appreciate you telling me about the work that is currently being undertaken to capture the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This is an important first step at analyzing the housing situation.

I encourage the government to conduct the research quickly and follow it with swift action, should the data reflects the anecdotal evidence. I have attached a flyer for your reference that reflects the kind of practice that we are witnessing in community.

Best regards,

s.22

---

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 11:15 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX; Anton.MLA, Suzanne LASS:EX; Chandra Herbert.MLA, Spencer LASS:EX; Elmore.MLA, Mable LASS:EX; Dix.MLA, Adrian LASS:EX; James.MLA, Carole A LASS:EX; Eby.MLA, David LASS:EX; hedy.fry@parl.gc.ca; don.davies@parl.gc.ca; Jenny.Kwan@parl.gc.ca; Murray.Rankin@parl.gc.ca; justin.trudeau@parl.gc.ca

Subject: Housing and community crisis

Hello to all levels of government:

There is indeed a housing and community crisis in Vancouver: I will lose 70% of my neighbours by the end of this month.

s.22

ALL 3 of the families with children will have to move out of Vancouver.

One family is

rental competition is brutal -- and prices are around \$3000 for crappy housing. All these parents are professionals:

s.22

So, we are not only losing the families, we are losing the workers.

And another 4-dwelling rental down the street is being sold; the sign just went up.

I'm not sure if I can afford to keep my house; my assessment is through the roof and I just,just manage to get by. s.22 and we love this hood.

But it is being destroyed. Please help: stop the investment; make sure people who plan to live in the houses can buy them; do not just tax foreign investors -- block them. These are drastic measures, but other countries have enacted laws to protect the residents of their cities. (See article below). Find another source of revenue! Everyone I know says the government is complicit because you are making so much money; and I suppose it makes no difference to you who pays -- your citizens or a foreign investor. But it is morally bankrupt to drive out citizens to bankroll sunny economic forecasts. Here is the bottom line: your citizens are now aware of how they are being used and exploited by those who control the housing market.

I know Vancouver city has made rental and social housing programs available, but they in no way of address the problem. This city is emptying and everyone knows this.

s.22

and this is the only way I get by. But I foresee a time when my tiny house (that needs tons of repairs) is worth 2 million. This could happen in a few years. What this means is my property tax will be close to



\$600 a month (from \$200 a few years ago). There is no way I can sustain paying an extra \$400 a month -- and I will not s.22

s.22

s.22 and I can't imagine leaving it. My home is not an "investment." I have no idea how I would support myself anywhere else, and I would have to leave behind a hood that supports my children and schools that they are connected to. It's a terrifying prospect, but my all neighbours are telling me to get ready: house owners like me -- who are just getting by -- are next.

And I think all this fear and all the warnings are interesting: very few people feel safe in their homes anymore. I already know people in West Van and West Side who are reeling at the losses of their hoods: East Van is next. And my lane community is already gone.

So, I am asking everyone at every level of government to please think about measures that could fix the root cause of the housing crisis. I do applaud the measures that will help a few renters, but I can guarantee you, home owners like me will soon be forced to leave the city too. What then?

Please feel free to share this letter with whomever you think can use it. I'm thinking of joining a group to help fight this scourge, but I know it is really up to you and the rest of the government to step up. I've been to many protests, but I know we need people with control over laws and policies to really change anything.

Can you help?

We don't have much time left.

<http://vancouver.sun.com/business/real-estate/foreign-buyers-crushing-home-dreams-in-vancouver-as-canada-b-c-do-zip-study>

Sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22  
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 2:51 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: Re: Housing and community crisis

Thank you so much for your reply.

I think these measures are a good start,

s.22

-- and I cannot stomach paying \$3000-\$4000 for a crappy rental, especially after being a home owner for over 12 years.

So, final question: Do you have any plans for property tax relief? The burden the middle class home owner must bear for this "hot" market is not bearable. Those who can invest in real estate don't feel an extra \$300 a month, but I do, and so does my family.

At the moment, I've taken on extra work (at the expense of s.22 weekends) and put off much-needed repairs in order to meet my property tax payments. As I noted in my previous letter, I don't know how I can meet tax payments when assessment reaches 2 million. s.22, so I imagine my assessment for next year will increase again, and the 2 million mark for s.22 is approaching faster than anyone anticipated.

One final note: My bank will not let me defer tax payments either, so deferral is not always an option for home owners. Perhaps your government could talk to the banks about letting homeowners defer?

Sincerely,  
s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:09 PM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Housing and community crisis

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

May 10, 2016

To the Premier of B.C.  
Christy Clark

Hello Ms. Clark:

I am concerned about the ever escalating price wars and ridiculous price increases in our Province.

Once again, I believe your government really doesn't care about this, because you do nothing to stop or even suggest that we have too much foreign money coming in, that is made of the backs of poor people in other countries.

I feel for your government its all about a balanced budget and to hell with those of us who have worked hard, paid our taxes and now are being overrun with Asian money. If you think about it , what other country or place in the world does not support their young families. Our kids have worked hard and saved hard to buy a place for their young families, but this is now impossible.

Do you have any idea what this does to the morale of our communities? On our street alone we have seen 4 houses bought by Asians.

s.22 I will vote for the party that actually has the guts to do something about the madness of real estate and does not cater to developers, and people with money that cannot possibly be honest money. I have also had this conversation with many work colleagues and friends. They all feel the same way, very frustrated with not being able to ever catch up or buy anything in their community.

I guess ultimately we are digging our own grave because of greed. In a few years from now our community as we know it know will be mostly Asian, no English and no one occupying the huge houses that are coming up around us.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 11:57 AM

To: Gregor Robertson; OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Please do something about the lack of affordable housing

Dear Ms Clark and Mr Robertson,

Re: Vancouver mansion sold by Canaccord founder for record \$31.1 million now owned by 'student,' records show | Financial Post

<http://business.financialpost.com/personal-finance/mortgages-real-estate/vancouver-mansion-sold-by-canaccord-founder-for-record-31-1-million-now-owned-by-student-records-show>

I am so disturbed by Vancouver's housing and lack of affordable housing situation. It is completely unfair that millionaires are able to buy houses and avoid the taxes on them by lying about who actually owns the home. I find it repugnant that offshore owners are able to buy a place and not live in it or rent it out when the rental market and buyers market are so out of sync with the average person's income.

I do not mean that I do not want people from other countries to come here. I simply mean that everyone needs to contribute to society and all of us need to pay our fair share of taxes so: a) the taxes go towards increasing Vancouver's affordable rental stock, or b) real estate prices reflect the average person's income. If foreign owners are buying property and no one is living in that housing, or at least paying taxes that actually offset the cost of affordable housing, then local people who play by the rules are left homeless, or struggling to afford housing.

The situation right now, with homelessness rates off the charts, people renting being renovicted, rental market at less than 1% vacancy and housing prices out of the reach of the average buyer is absolutely disgusting. Please do something to fix this and quickly or the next generation will choose to live elsewhere and our city will become a desert full of only rich people.

Sincerely,

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:14 PM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: Please do something about the lack of affordable housing

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.



From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 4:36 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign Housing

May 9, 2016

Dear Minister,

I'm writing to you to express my concern about what I perceive to be a great lack of protection for our housing against the foreign investment invasion. This article <http://www.theprovince.com/business/Canada+subsidizing+foreign+millionaires/11868132/story.html> alleges some pretty disturbing and distasteful activities. If these allegations are true our MLA's /MP's should be showing leadership and stopping it. If people with these means are able to collect Welfare, BC Hydro rebates, GST credits etc. while living in \$2-\$6 million dollar homes our citizens are being ripped off. I don't know if government cutbacks are at such a point that we have no investigative resources to look into these matters. I believe that our MLA's and MP's should be standing up for our laws and integrity. Another article out of SFU (they appear regularly in the domestic and international press) on the weekend talking about foreign investment "crushing" the aspirations of Canadians discusses the same theme. If these allegations are false the journalists should be pursued. If not, our weak leaders need to act as many appear timid and paralyzed. The only MLA who seems to be speaking honestly and in a principled manner on the issue is David Eby. The governing provincial Liberals are totally hands off and appear to be following from the Realtor playbook. The Federal Liberals have taken tepid steps that are totally ineffective in YVR and GTA and are no different from Harper's Conservatives on this issue.

I believe it's time to adopt Foreign investment rules, as many advanced countries do, that are fair and reasonable and offer some form of protection for our citizens. In the meantime I feel a dangerous bubble is building that will have negative results in the end. The longer that our leaders fail to do what should be done, I even find myself secretly cheering for that inevitable eventuality, to get it over with so as to begin the rebuilding process.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 7:44 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: housing & foreign investors

Please act now about our real estate crisis. Our communities are becoming ruined and unaffordable to the very people that are OUR society. It is mind boggling that you have not acted YET.

It is it is the province's responsibility to curb "unwarranted speculation" by "the world's wealthiest citizens" who are behind Vancouver's worst-ever housing affordability crisis. Please listen to & help the people you were ELECTED to represent. You are decimating our society by letting this financial take over go on and on and on. It is ridiculous!!  
Sincerely, s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 9:52 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: re foreign buyers

regarding foreign buyers coming to BC and helping to drive up our prices to the point that our own people can not afford homes,yet the government seems to favour these buyers over the locals,it makes me wonder just whats behind the hesitation on charging these buyers more money in the form of tax???. With a election coming I will vote for the party who is willing to stop this catering to the buying up of our real estate by the wealthy who have not payed anything to BC economy,and in some cases they are using our social services and health care , I know people in the health care field who see this every day, so its a very real misuse.

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 9:45 AM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

From: s.22  
Sent: May 10, 2016 9:47 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Subject: New submission from Contact Your Constituency Office

Name  
s.22

Email  
s.22

Riding  
s.22

Comments & Feedback  
Hi Premier Clark,

Please do something about the housing affordability issue in the Lower Mainland. We cannot continue to deny the fact that foreign buyers are not increasing the prices of our homes. I am sure a small subgroup of people benefit from this (i.e. realtors, developers, brokers), but this will eventually become a big problem in our community. We have to protect our own citizens that work and contribute in our community and I (and many many others that I've talked to) feel this is not happening right now.

Last updated on 2016/05/11 11:43:41 by tuzdavin [Correspondence]

From: Clark.MLA, Christy [mailto:Christy.Clark.MLA@leg.bc.ca]  
Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 2:05 PM  
To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Subject: FW: housing in Vancouver with contact information

From: s.22  
Sent: May 10, 2016 1:01 PM  
To: Clark.MLA, Christy  
Cc: s.22  
Subject: FW: housing in Vancouver with contact information

Dear Premier Clark,

I am writing to ask what you are doing to protect citizens from the burden of skyrocketing real estate prices, fueled by a striking increase of foreign homebuyers taking over the Vancouver real estate markets.

There appears to be glaring inaction from government officials, those who have been elected to protect and support Canadian citizens.

WHY have POLICIES not been CREATED to PROTECT Canadian citizens, as has been done in other countries? Home prices have now become unaffordable for the average citizen in Vancouver as a result. Why has this been allowed to happen?

I look forward to your response.

Sincerely,

s.22

From: Rochon, Jake PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Sent: Friday, May 13, 2016 1:12 PM

To: s.22

Subject: RE: housing in Vancouver with contact information

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 11:50 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Cc: deJong.MLA, Mike LASS:EX

Subject: Fwd: Foreign buyers crushing Vancouver home dreams as governments do little: study - British Columbia - CBC News

Dear Premier and Mr DeJong,

We all understand that you and your family are property owners and for Mr DeJong own multiple properties. This factor may be impairing your vision about what is happening to thousands of our BC born and working young people and families who can not compete with wealthy off shore buyers. Many of these buyers come from a country where there are few human rights, no freedom of speech and no rules the rich can not flout. Their wealth may have been attained illegally and certainly in a corrupted system.

Why on earth are you allowing this to happen? Many countries have decided not to allow this to happen. Only political action can slow or stop this tide of foreign buying which is rapidly subordinating our young people into a generation with no hope of ever owning a house or having any form of a home other than as tenants. Is this what you have decided to allow by doing nothing?

I would appreciate a response.

s.22

Begin forwarded message:

From:

Subject: Foreign buyers crushing Vancouver home dreams as governments do little: study - British Columbia - CBC News

Date: May 9, 2016 at 6:53:31 AM PDT

To: s.22

<http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/sfu-real-estate-study-foreign-buyers-1.3572499>



-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 8, 2016 11:59 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: B.C. Real Estate a Canadian Dream no more

Dear Christy Clark,

I'm sure you've received plenty of emails concerning the state of the B.C. real estate market. I'm writing you today because in the last two years I've made the most money I've ever made in my life and I can't buy a home. I'm priced out. If I did manage to get into the market I would be house poor. s.22 I contribute to our community. I, along with other citizens that have lived here for many years are the reason Vancouver is the best place to live in the world. We built this city and now we can't afford it.

The influx of foreign investment is enticing for many but for many more it is a road block to the Canadian Dream. I believe it is a direct contradiction to the values of Canadians. Where is this money coming from? How was this money made? Does the government have answers to these questions? I don't believe we should welcome investment without understanding how to come to be.

It's clear to most people I speak with that in many cases we are a tax haven and a place for money laundering. Who would have thought such a thing. I'm sure you will have a political spin on such a bold statement but spare me. I don't believe you.

We are cutting education and health care all the while we allow foreign investment to take advantage of the system we built! To take advantage Canadians hard work!

Why is real estate a commodity? Why is the Federal and Provincial Government allowing this? How are you going to help Canadians have homes to raise families?

It's saddens me that I have to write this email. You are our leaders. We elected you to look out for our communities but it's clear to me and many more that you are doing a terrible job.

Thank you for hopefully reading this.

s.22

From: Westcott, William PREM:EX On Behalf Of OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX  
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 3:44 PM  
To: s.22  
Subject: FW: B.C. Real Estate a Canadian Dream no more

Hello, s.22 and thank you for your email. We appreciate your taking the time to write to express your concerns regarding housing affordability.

We want to take this opportunity to assure you that our government is committed to our efforts to grow and strengthen the economy, and we recognize keeping housing affordable and accessible for British Columbians is essential to these efforts. The rising cost of housing, especially in the Metro Vancouver area, is of deep concern and we want to work with the city to address this challenge.

One of the measures we introduced in Balanced Budget 2016 is a change to the Property Transfer Tax. Effective February 17, 2016, the purchase of a qualifying new home valued at up to \$750,000 is totally exempt from the Tax, representing a saving to the purchaser of that new home of up to \$13,000.

Part of the solution to the problem of affordability is increasing the supply of available housing units. To that end, our government recently announced \$355 million will be invested to help build 2000 new affordable housing units across BC. It is the single largest affordable housing investment in our province's history. For more details, we recommend you take a look at the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016PREM0017-000200>

Earlier this week, the Honourable Mike De Jong, Minister of Finance, announced new regulations to restrict the predatory practice of real estate contract assignment. For more details on this announcement, we encourage you to consult the following news release:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2016FIN0018-000756>

Finally, on the topic of foreign investment in the real estate market, Minister De Jong has announced new measures to collect information on the country of origin of an owner registering a property with the Land Title Office. This measure will put the Province in better position to assess the volume of foreign investment in B.C.'s real estate market. For more information, please see the following factsheet:

<https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/province-to-begin-real-estate-data-collection>

Again, thank you writing and we hope you find this response helpful.

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, May 8, 2016 9:48 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: housing crisis

Where are you during that crisis? You are an invisible leader too busy doing backroom deals. How can our young people afford a house in this market? You do nothing while criminals are buying houses and leaving them empty and people are struggling finding housing. What kind of government are you? You have done nothing for regular folks during your term. I hope this is your last term, invisible leader... Money is not everything. BC is becoming a province full of greedy people with no sense of community. Other countries like Australia have done something about the problem. Show some leadership for once and stand up for something. We are Canadians after all and we stand for equality. This bubble will burst one day just like in the US if nothing is done. Can't wait for your government to be replaced.

s.22

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, April 21, 2016 8:04 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Foreign Investor Tax

Here's what they're doing in Australia to start to level the playing field:

<http://www.macrobusiness.com.au/2016/04/victoria-doubles-foreign-buyer-stamp-duty/>

Still a drop in the bucket, but I'd take that over whatever you guys are doing, pandering to all this money.

Sell out. You used to be middle-class. You would never stand for all this if you still were. Don't forget where you came from.

s.22

From: s.22

Sent: Saturday, April 16, 2016 12:42 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: hope you read this latest: 'the highest bidder' from the walrus.ca

can't say i've read a more dire, sad and shameful depiction of the ongoing fragmentation of  
vancouver  
due to the influx of foreign cash and our RE situation.

co written by a globe and mail reporter.

<http://thewalrus.ca/the-highest-bidder/>

-----Original Message-----

From: s.22

Sent: Sunday, April 17, 2016 2:22 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Escalating House prices in the lower Mainland

To Christy Clark,

I am very concerned re the escalation of house prices in the Lower Mainland, s.22 are having to look further and further afield. We all know the reason is the influx of Offshore investors as this is happening worldwide.

Why can we not do something as in Australia where they have a law that restricts foreign buyers to only buying new residential properties. That would at least take some of the pressure off, and allow s.22 to purchase in their own home area and province,

s.22

Sent from my iPad

From: s.22

Sent: Thursday, May 19, 2016 9:31 AM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: On Affordable Housing

On Affordable housing and the hollowing-out of our neighborhoods

Stop focussing solely on 'density'. Recognize that, while both are essential, 'affordable housing' and 'supportive housing' are two different things. Try using policy and tax/credit to bias the market back to being used as 'homes' rather than as 'speculative investments'. Try limiting build size so entry-level properties don't become teardowns. Reset the homeowners grant to its original intent: so it applies to 95% of homeowners, and results in speculators paying double the tax (or maybe more :-). Adjust property transfer taxes and capital gains tax credits (Principle Residence Exemption), making speculation punitive.

Further tools available to government: Eliminate the first-time buyer tax credit as it biases for non-residents; converting it to a day-care tax credit that would be consumed by actual residents. Recognize that the 'investor immigrant' program hurts more than it helps. Address international money laundering. Tax overseas income.

Balancing the advantages to those who have paid taxes for many years and the loss of community, as whole sections of town are demolished and replaced by tiny units at an enormous increase in cost per square metre.

--  
s.22