

OOP FOI PREM:EX

From: Smith, George PREM:EX
Sent: February 6, 2020 11:55 AM
Subject: ICBC QMKA - Kit for MOs
Attachments: 20200206_KM_QA_ACE Kit.docx

Hello friends,

Please see attached KMs and QA regarding today's announcement to decrease ICBC rates and enhance care.

George Smith, Deputy Communications Director
Office of the Premier | Government of BC
British Columbia Parliament Buildings | 250-208-6794

ICBC – Enhanced Care Model MLA Kit

Key Messages

s.13

- That's why we're making major changes to ICBC to save you 20% on your insurance and to take better care of you when you're injured in a crash.
- We're going to reduce your rates by removing expensive lawyers and legal costs from the system – saving you 20% on your insurance - an average of \$400.
- And we're going to provide better care so anyone injured in a crash gets the care they need – without having to hire a lawyer to get the benefits they paid for.

Questions and Answers

s.13

PRIVATIZATION

Q3: Why won't you open ICBC up to competition?

s.13

- Insurance rates are going through the roof in provinces where they have private insurance:
 - In Alberta, private insurance companies are raising rates by 30%.
 - In New Brunswick, some companies are raising premiums by 50%.
 - Ontario has the highest insurance rates in the country.
- We're going to save drivers in B.C an average of 20% on their insurance, while improving care – by removing expensive lawyers and legal fees from the system.
- Saskatchewan and Manitoba have systems similar to what we're introducing and have been keeping rate changes very steady near 0%.
- Alberta is actually looking at moving to this type of model too.

s.13

Q5: The Opposition has called for a full review of insurance in other jurisdictions. How can people have confidence in this when some may claim it was developed behind closed doors?

- The Opposition did a review. They looked at privatization in 2001 and decided against it, admitting it would cause 'double digit' rate hikes for people.
- We've been listening to British Columbians. People told us that they're paying too much for car insurance and want better care.
- We looked at options in other jurisdictions and what we're announcing today is the only option that will make a real difference to bring costs down for people and improve care.
- Privatization like the Opposition and their friends are proposing would mean more expensive insurance and less care for people.

LOWER RATES

Q6: How do I know I'll get savings? Will everyone see a \$400 decrease in their premiums?

- All drivers will see savings. People will save approximately 20% on their insurance - an average of \$400 per driver.
- These estimates are based on the existing systems in Saskatchewan and Manitoba, and they have been carefully audited by Ernst and Young.
- By eliminating \$1.5 billion in expensive lawyers and legal costs from the system, it frees up money that will go towards driving rates down by \$400 on average.
- Now, if you cause crashes - your premiums will still go up - but everyone will be paying 20% less than they otherwise would.

s.13

BETTER BENEFITS

Q8: How can we trust ICBC to deliver all the benefits that those injured are entitled to?

- ICBC will be required by law to assist each claimant and ensure they receive all of the care and benefits to which they are entitled.
- Instead of court battles over lump sum payments, ICBC will now pay for care and cover wage loss benefits based on your needs and the determinations of your own doctor.
- Customers who still have complaints or disputes about their claim, benefit payments or fairness issues won't need a lawyer to have them resolved.
- They will have recourse through: the Civil Resolution Tribunal, which is fully independent of ICBC; the BC Ombudsperson; and the new ICBC Fairness Officer, who will be appointed directly by government to ensure greater independence from ICBC.

Q9: Who determines what benefit I will be entitled to? Will ICBC be my doctor?

- No. Your doctor and your health care providers that you choose will decide on the care and treatment you need.
- Your doctor will work with you and ICBC to ensure you have access to all the care benefits needed.

Q10: Will there be a 'meat chart'?

- We're moving away from a system where you have to fight for lump sum payments to a system where people are taken care of – no matter what kind of injury they have.
- ICBC will pay for care and cover wage loss benefits based on your needs and your own doctor's determinations – up to \$7.5M no matter what kind of injury you have.
- Then on top of all the care that will provide for your needs, those who are permanently impaired will also get some additional financial compensation.
- As we work out the regulations, we will be consulting extensively with health care providers and the disability community to make sure we're providing the care British Columbians need.

ACCOUNTABILITY

Q11: Does this model hold bad drivers accountable?

- Yes. Drivers who cause crashes will still be found at fault and will face serious consequences.
- If a driver causes a crash, their premiums will go up - just like now.
- Those injured by dangerous drivers convicted of a Criminal Code offence, such as impaired driving, will still be able to sue for additional compensation.

Q12: Why should good drivers be paying for the care of someone who has caused a crash – potentially while impaired?

- If someone causes a crash they will be held accountable – that doesn't change.
- Their rates will go up, and if they committed a crime, they can still be sued in the courts.
- But Canadians believe in a system where people who get hurt get the healthcare they need.
- We're getting people the care they need to recover faster, while continuing to make sure there are serious penalties to hold drivers who cause accidents accountable.

Q13: Are you taking away people's legal right to sue wrongdoers?

- Not at all. We're saying that no one should need a lawyer to access the benefits they've paid for.
- Right now, people have to fight in court to get compensation. Then they see their settlement eaten up by lawyers and legal fees.
- This Enhanced care coverage holds bad drivers accountable and gets people the care they need – for a lifetime if they've been severely injured.
- There will still be the ability to sue those who are convicted of Criminal Code offences, such as impaired driving, for additional compensation.

Q14: If I can't sue ICBC, how can I be compensated for pain and suffering? For future earnings capacity?

- No one should need a lawyer to access the benefits you've paid for and deserve.
- Instead of making people gamble in court hoping that their settlement will be enough to care for them, we're just going to get them the care they need and make sure their needs are taken care of – for the rest of their life if needed.
- On top of all that care, there will be some financial compensation, including wage-loss payments, and permanent impairment compensation.

0% RATE CHANGE

Q15: How was Government able to hold the basic insurance rate change to 0%? Why are you making this move if you've already delivered a 0% rate change?

- We managed to wrestle the needed rate change down this year through our hard work to clean up the old government's mess (e.g. limits on expert reports, reducing crashes and minor injury changes).
- But that's only this year. ICBC is still under a lot of pressure from legal costs. Without this change, rates would need to increase 35% over the next 5 years.
- We know we need to bring rates down for British Columbians. This new Enhanced Care model does that by reducing the cost of insurance by 20%, putting \$400 back in your pocket.

Wensink, Alison PREM:EX

From: Joshi, Shruti GCPE:EX
Sent: December 13, 2019 4:12 PM
To: Girn, Naveen PREM:EX; Aaron, Sage PREM:EX; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX
Subject: Fwd: Issues Scan for Monday
Attachments: 2019.12.16 Issues Scan - Surrey Media Roundtable & Chinese Media.docx; ATT00001.htm

Here is the Issues scan for the roundtable.

There are some items pertaining to the Chinese media interviews as well.

Shruti Prakash Joshi
Director, Community & Media Relations
GCPE
778-587-4521

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Howlett, Tim GCPE:EX"
Date: December 13, 2019 at 3:41:25 PM PST
To: "Joshi, Shruti GCPE:EX"
Subject: Issues Scan for Monday

Hi Shruti – here is the Issues Scan for Monday's roundtable. It also includes a few items for his Chinese media interviews later in the afternoon.

Issues Scan

South Asian Media Roundtable

December 16, 2019

Contents

Surrey Portables	2
ALR Bill.....	3
George Massey Tunnel.....	4
Relationship with India.....	5
International Students	6
New Surrey Hospital - Timelines & Budget	7
ICBC - General	8
ICBC - International Driving Student Permits	9
Background:	9
Message:	9
Special Prosecutor - MLA Sims	10
Ride Hailing	11
Surrey Skytrain	13
Progress on Housing Goals & Support for Renters.....	14
Surrey Police Budget	15
New Horizons Village Society Controversy (Media Waves Q)	17
Forestry	18
Coastal Forestry and Western Forest Products Strike.....	20
Tax Competitiveness	21
Price of Gas.....	22
Housing Construction	23
Chinese Media Issues Scan	24

ICBC - General

Background:

- Media may ask about calls for government to offer “choice” in auto insurance.
- They may also ask about examples of large rate increases, tied to changes to ICBC premium calculations that came into effect on September 1, 2019.
- Generally speaking, experienced drivers without at-fault crashes will enjoy premium savings, while drivers who have caused crashes or are inexperienced will pay more.

Message:

- Because of the old government’s mismanagement of ICBC, people are paying too much for car insurance. We have a lot of work ahead to get these costs down.

s.13

- We’re going to keep working to clean up the old government’s mess and make auto insurance rates more affordable for all drivers in B.C.

Will you be bringing in legislation to prevent future government’s from raiding ICBC as the Attorney General promised?

- Our government will never take money from ICBC. We believe that any future profits from ICBC should go to making people’s insurance cheaper.

s.13

ICBC - International Driving Student Permits

Background:

- Surrey media has noted there is speculation among the public that traffic accidents are being caused by international students and there is concern about these students being granted BC driving permits.
- In order to drive, international students from India or China who are enrolled full-time at a designated educational institution need to take and pass a knowledge and road test - because India and China do not have reciprocal licence exchange agreements.
- However, generally when people move to BC from another jurisdiction, they have 90 days to switch their valid license to a B.C. driver's license and don't have to take a test.
- Therefore, students from other countries, part-time students or those who aren't at a designated institution, have 90 days to apply for a licence by providing proof of their driving experience, paying the fee and surrendering their previous licence - and would not have to take a test.

Message:

- All of us want people to be safe on BC's roads.
- That's why we have strict rules in place for people who move to BC and want to get their BC licence.
- I'll also note that full-time international students from India and China must pass a written and road test before they receive a BC licence and can drive.

Wensink, Alison PREM:EX

From: Howlett, Tim GCPE:EX
Sent: December 13, 2019 3:38 PM
To: Hagglund, Jarrett PREM:EX; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX; Aaron, Sage PREM:EX; Smith, George PREM:EX; McKinnon, Michael PREM:EX
Subject: Scan to Print - Jen?
Attachments: 2019.12.16 Issues Scan - Surrey Media Roundtable & Chinese Media.docx

Jen – can you print for Premier?

Items for Chinese Media interviews in the last 3 pages

Tim Howlett
Executive Director of Issues Management
250.208.4828

Wensink, Alison PREM:EX

From: Finn, Heather GCPE:EX
Sent: November 26, 2019 11:02 AM
To: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX; McGregor, Cara GCPE:EX; Kouri, Rosa GCPE:EX
Subject: FW: Q2 materials
Attachments: DRAFT.pdf; QA Q2 Report_Nov 26 2019_FINAL.docx; Q2 2019 Report Presentation_FINAL without notes.pdf; Q2 2019 Report Presentation_FINAL with NOTES -2.pptx; SN_MCJ_Q2 Report_Opening and Closing FINAL.doc

Heather Finn
778-679-2104

From: Youngs, Kirsten R GCPE:EX
Sent: November 26, 2019 8:49 AM
To: Zadravec, Don GCPE:EX ; Iliffe, Liam GCPE:EX ; Finn, Heather GCPE:EX
Cc: Leslie, Lisa GCPE:EX
Subject: Q2 materials

Good morning!

Q2 is ready to roll at noon today.

For your reading pleasure – NR, QA, SN and PPTs attached – both with and without MCJ's notes for her presentation.

Kirsten Youngs | Communications Manager
Ministry of Finance - Government Communications and Public Engagement
T: (250) 356-0543 | C: (250) 858-0555

NEWS RELEASE

Not Approved
Nov. 26, 2019

Ministry of Finance

B.C.'s economy resilient, finances on track

s.13

Contact:

Ministry of Finance
Media Relations
778 974-3341

Connect with the Province of B.C. at: news.gov.bc.ca/connect

MAKING LIFE BETTER MAKING LIFE BETTER MAKING LIFE BETTER

Second Quarterly Report

November 26, 2019



Risks

- **Financial results of ICBC**
- **Ongoing trade tensions**
- **Weaker global economic growth**
- **Lower commodity prices**
- **Slower domestic growth**

Questions and Answers

Key Messages

- British Columbia's economy remains resilient against a backdrop of economic volatility and global uncertainty.
- Our government continues to show that investing in people while balancing the budget is not only possible – it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- With careful planning and foresight built into every stage of our fiscal plan, we are building up our contingencies while making sure that every dollar possible is going to people.
- This will help B.C. weather the global storm, while delivering on our commitments to balance the books and make life better for people.
- B.C. is an economic leader in Canada. We are the only province with triple-A credit ratings from the three major international rating agencies, the lowest unemployment rate in the country, a balanced budget, and zero operating debt.

Top Questions

1. **The Q2 results show that ICBC continues to lose money. Last week, the Attorney General confirmed the Province won't be appealing the Crowder decision, and the courts are set to rule on another two cases brought forward by the Trial Lawyers Association. To top it off, ICBC's financial results released last week are abysmal. How do you plan on making up for that financial loss?**
 - As we signaled at Q1, ICBC is a significant financial risk to the Province.
 - Today's results show that ICBC's net loss forecast has deteriorated by \$41 million.
 - This is mainly due to continuing increased claims costs that include higher-than-expected large bodily injury claims from prior years.
 - The forecast does not yet reflect the effect on ICBC finances of the BC Supreme Court decision which struck down a provincial court rule that limited the number of expert reports in vehicle actions.
 - The Office of the Attorney General is reviewing details of the court decision, the effect on ICBC finances, as well as available responsive actions including potential amendments to the Evidence Act.

7. Is the \$100 million added to contingencies from the savings ministries were able to find?

- No – savings from ministries are not ‘added’ to contingencies.
- However, ministry efforts to manage cost pressures means there is more funding reserved in contingencies to address unexpected risks and costs down the road.
- Our priority is to make sure that every dollar possible is going to people, that is why we are looking to reduce discretionary spending for items that do not impact services and programs for British Columbians.

8. Why have you increased contingencies if wildfire and management spending has gone down?

- Yes, statutory spending for wildfire and emergency management has declined since Q1.
- However, we face an uncertain global economy – contingencies are a financial buffer that helps British Columbia respond and adapt to financial pressures.
- We are also managing risks that are closer to home, particularly ICBC.
- As a result, we have increased contingencies from \$450 million at Q1 to \$550 million in the second quarterly report.

9. Why are you giving away hundreds of millions of dollars in fossil fuel subsidies?

- With CleanBC, our government is fighting climate change and building a cleaner economy for people across BC.
- It’s unfortunate that a number of our CleanBC initiatives have been inaccurately characterized in the report.
- For instance, our CleanBC Program for Industry will reduce emissions by 2.5 million tonnes CO2 equivalent per year by 2030.
- We regularly review royalty programs and are currently reviewing the deep well royalty credit.
- Our government will keep working hard to keep BC on the path to a cleaner, better future that creates opportunities for all.

10. You're posting a \$31M decreased, lower-than-forecast operating surplus. With a total surplus of \$148M, are you on the verge of posting a deficit?

- No. The Q2 results show that our plan to invest in people while balancing the budget is not only possible – it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- Deliberate and prudent long-term planning will help B.C. weather the global storm, while delivering on our commitments to balance the books and make life better for people.
- We are the only province with triple-A credit ratings from the major international rating agencies, a balanced budget with years of prudence built in, the lowest unemployment rate in the country, and zero operating debt.
- However, our approach is to be fiscally prudent as we adjust to slowing global growth and risks surrounding global trade.
- B.C. is on solid footing – we are working from a balanced budget with generous prudence built-in that will allow us to plan for and respond to the changing global environment.
- Our level of prudence remains high with \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance for this year.

11. The reason we're not in deficit right now is because \$300 million was taken from contingencies in Q1. If the global economy continues to slow, or ICBC suffers another financial blow in the courts, what are you going to do? Will you go into deficit to deliver on your promises, or maintain the razor thin surplus by raising taxes and cutting programs?

- It does not come down to a choice between balancing the books and investing in people – we can and must do both.
- In fact, our government continues to show that investing in people while balancing the budget is not only possible, it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- The Q2 results show that B.C.'s economy is stable. We are working from a balanced budget with generous prudence built-in that will allow us to plan for and respond to the changing global environment.
- With careful planning and foresight built into every stage of our fiscal plan, we are building up our contingencies while making sure that every dollar possible is going to people.
- As Finance Minister, I will continue my fiscally responsible approach as we adjust to slowing global growth and risks surrounding global trade.

12. If the economy takes a serious downturn, or ICBC's finances don't improve, what are you going to do? Raise taxes or cut programs?

- From day one, we set clear priorities to make life more affordable, improve services and build a strong, sustainable economy.
- We've been measured and responsible in our approach, and that's why we have a healthy \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance built into our fiscal plan for this year.
- We will continue to tackle the messes left by the last government, like ICBC, while investing in the people who power our province.
- Let me remind you of the historic levels of investments we've made in people and services since taking office – a \$1 billion investment in transforming B.C.'s child care system, \$7 billion for affordable housing initiatives, eliminating student loan debt, eliminating MSP – the biggest middle-class tax cut in a generation – and record levels of investments in health care, education and capital infrastructure, just to name a few.
- We can't fix all the problems overnight, but that hasn't stopped us from rolling up our sleeves and getting to work for the people of B.C.

13. Are you pointing to a recession on the horizon?

- British Columbia's economy is stable and resilient. We continue to lead the country as the only province with a triple-A credit rating, one of the lowest unemployment rates, a balanced budget and zero operating debt.
- However, as Finance Minister, I'm taking a measured and responsible approach in response to risks on the horizon with the potential to impact B.C.'s economy, like trade tensions and slowing global growth.
- Our plan is working - we are on solid fiscal footing and our economy is expected to continue being a national leader.
- We're standing up for British Columbians by taking a strong approach that will allow us to continue investing in people first to make B.C. a good place to live.

ICBC

14. In October, the Province's attempts to limit the number of medical experts allowed in auto insurance lawsuits was found to be unconstitutional by the B.C. Supreme Court. This came with a half a million-dollar hit to ICBC. Why is this not reflected in the Q2 report? Are you ignoring the problem?

- No. Government is reviewing details of the court decision, the effect on ICBC finances, as well as available responsive actions including potential amendments to the Evidence Act.
- The Q2 results show ICBC's net loss forecast has deteriorated by \$41 million.
- This is mainly due to continuing increased claims costs that include higher-than-expected large bodily injury claims from prior years.

15. Why don't the financial impacts of the Crowder decision show up in the Q2 report?

- Government continues to review details of the recent court decision and its subsequent impact on ICBC finances.
- We need to further analyze any financial impact in the context of our planned reforms to the Evidence Act.
- I don't expect that it will be reflected in fiscal projections until we have time to do that work.

16. If ICBC's finances are still in the red, why are employee salaries going up?

- I understand the concerns that British Columbians have around compensation at Crown Corporations.
- This is something our government has been working very hard to address.
- ICBC saw a minor increase in overall remuneration due to the payment of negotiated Bargaining Unit wage adjustments, increased payments for CPP & EI to the Receiver General and the increased number of claims staff hired to respond to increased claims.
- However, the number of employees making the most, that is, over \$150,000, has decreased by 37.6 per cent.
- ICBC management and confidential employees have been without a general across the board salary increase since 2012 in accordance with the B.C. Public Sector Employer policy and guidelines.

17. The Crown corporation continues to pose huge risk to the B.C. government's finances and is hardly in the clear. At what point will government consider a bail-out?

- Unlike the previous government, we've chosen to confront tough challenges head-on instead of taking the easy road by ignoring the serious issues at ICBC.
- We've been measured and responsible in our approach, and that's why we have a healthy \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance built into our fiscal plan for this year.
- As Minister of Finance, I continue to monitor the situation at ICBC closely. We are taking a responsible approach and working hard to get ICBC back on the right track.

Discretionary Spending

18. The RCMP are being forced to make cuts across B.C. due to a funding shortfall of \$10 million. Is this related to the cuts your government ordered to discretionary spending? Are you jeopardizing public safety with these cuts?

- To be clear, the projected deficit has been communicated to the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General by the RCMP. This is not a budget cut, it's a projected deficit.
- It's important to remember that all public service organizations have budgets to manage—and that's what the RCMP is doing.
- The RCMP has stated they will be working to address the deficit first through discretionary spending such as travel expenses, overtime, non-mandatory training and new equipment.
- Public safety is our shared top priority and will be our focus as we continue to work with the RCMP to assess provincial resource levels, while developing short- and long-term plans to address the budget deficit.

Full-time Equivalent Employees

19. You say you are responsible budget managers looking to tighten government spending, and yet your government can't keep track of how many full-time equivalent (FTEs) employees are in the public service? In Budget 2019 you predicted 31,350 FTEs. And now with Q2, you're predicting 31,800, an increase of 450 FTEs. Why were your projections so far off?

- It is not out of the ordinary for the Ministry of Finance to updated FTE projections.
- The Q2 adjusted FTE forecast is consistent with updates made in previous years, which are typically adjusted at Q2 when more accurate forecast data is available.
- The increase in FTEs reflects increased staffing needs for the Civil Resolution Tribunal, road safety initiatives, cannabis legalization, taxi modernization, emergency preparedness and ongoing emergency response to help communities recovering from fires and floods.

SPEAKING NOTES FOR

Second Quarterly Report

**HON. CAROLE JAMES
MINISTER OF FINANCE**

**PRESS THEATRE
BC LEGISLATURE**

**TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 26, 2019
12:00 p.m.
VICTORIA, BC**

- **We will not turn our backs on the people who have helped power our province for so long.**
- **And, for all British Columbians, we will continue working hard to fix the messes we inherited.**
- **It will come as no surprise that ICBC remains a significant financial risk.**
- **Government continues to review details of the recent court decision and its subsequent impact on ICBC finances.**

- **We are considering available responsive actions to get ICBC back on solid fiscal footing.**
- **These are the kind of risks that we have planned and accounted for...**
- **With a fiscal plan that has layers of prudence, including our contingency fund and forecast allowance.**
- **We are preparing for any global economic uncertainty ahead as well, by continuing our work as responsible fiscal managers and looking proactively at spending across government.**

Wensink, Alison PREM:EX

From: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Sent: November 26, 2019 10:26 AM
To: LP PREM Directors; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX; McKinnon, Michael PREM:EX; Smith, George PREM:EX
Subject: Q2 material & messages
Attachments: Q2 2019 Report Presentation_draft7.pptx; NR_Q2 Report_Nov 26_v4.docx; QA Q2 Report_Nov 26 2019_v6.docx; SN_MCJ_Q2 Report_Opening and Closing - DRAFT7.doc

For those who've seen this material already, only slight changes.

- One change to slide 8 (PPT) in the notes section.
- Updated Q&A: includes slight modified language to Q7.
- One added question on the fossil fuel piece from this morning.

Sage Aaron, Communications Director
Office of the Premier | Government of BC
501 Belleville St, Victoria, BC V8V 2L8 | 778-678-0832

Questions and Answers

Key Messages

- British Columbia's economy remains resilient against a backdrop of economic volatility and global uncertainty.
- Our government continues to show that investing in people while balancing the budget is not only possible – it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- With careful planning and foresight built into every stage of our fiscal plan, we are building up our contingencies while making sure that every dollar possible is going to people.
- This will help B.C. weather the global storm, while delivering on our commitments to balance the books and make life better for people.
- B.C. is an economic leader in Canada. We are the only province with triple-A credit ratings from the three major international rating agencies, the lowest unemployment rate in the country, a balanced budget, and zero operating debt.

Top Questions

1. **The Q2 results show that ICBC continues to lose money. Last week, the Attorney General confirmed the Province won't be appealing the Crowder decision, and the courts are set to rule on another two cases brought forward by the Trial Lawyers Association. To top it off, ICBC's financial results released last week are abysmal. How do you plan on making up for that financial loss?**
 - As we signaled at Q1, ICBC is a significant financial risk to the Province.
 - Today's results show that ICBC's net loss forecast has deteriorated by \$41 million.
 - This is mainly due to continuing increased claims costs that include higher-than-expected large bodily injury claims from prior years.
 - The forecast does not yet reflect the effect on ICBC finances of the BC Supreme Court decision which struck down a provincial court rule that limited the number of expert reports in vehicle actions.
 - The Office of the Attorney General is reviewing details of the court decision, the effect on ICBC finances, as well as available responsive actions including potential amendments to the Evidence Act.

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

- Our priority is to make sure that every dollar possible going to people, that is why we are looking to reduce discretionary spending for items that do not impact services and programs for British Columbians.

8. Why have you increased contingencies if wildfire and management spending has gone down?

- Yes, statutory spending for wildfire and emergency management has declined since Q1.
- However, we face an uncertain global economy – contingencies are a financial buffer that helps British Columbia respond and adapt to financial pressures.
- We are also managing risks that are closer to home, particularly ICBC.
- As a result, we have increased contingencies from \$450 million at Q1 to \$550 million in the second quarterly report.

9. You're posting a \$31M decreased, lower-than-forecast operating surplus. With a total surplus of \$148M, are you on the verge of posting a deficit?

- No. The Q2 results show that our plan to invest in people while balancing the budget is not only possible – it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- Deliberate and prudent long-term planning will help B.C. weather the global storm, while delivering on our commitments to balance the books and make life better for people.
- We are the only province with triple-A credit ratings from the major international rating agencies, a balanced budget with years of prudence built in, the lowest unemployment rate in the country, and zero operating debt.
- However, our approach is to be fiscally prudent as we adjust to slowing global growth and risks surrounding global trade.
- B.C. is on solid footing – we are working from a balanced budget with generous prudence built-in that will allow us to plan for and respond to the changing global environment.
- Our level of prudence remains high with \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance for this year.

10. The reason we're not in deficit right now is because \$300 million was taken from contingencies in Q1. If the global economy continues to slow, or ICBC suffers another financial blow in the courts, what are you going to do? Will you go into deficit to deliver on your promises, or maintain the razor thin surplus by raising taxes and cutting programs?

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

- It does not come down to a choice between balancing the books and investing in people – we can and must do both.
- In fact, our government continues to show that investing in people while balancing the budget is not only possible, it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- The Q2 results show that B.C.'s economy is stable. We are working from a balanced budget with generous prudence built-in that will allow us to plan for and respond to the changing global environment.
- With careful planning and foresight built into every stage of our fiscal plan, we are building up our contingencies while making sure that every dollar possible is going to people.
- As Finance Minister, I will continue my fiscally responsible approach as we adjust to slowing global growth and risks surrounding global trade.

11. If the economy takes a serious downturn, or ICBC's finances don't improve, what are you going to do? Raise taxes or cut programs?

- From day one, we set clear priorities to make life more affordable, improve services and build a strong, sustainable economy.
- We've been measured and responsible in our approach, and that's why we have a healthy \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance built into our fiscal plan for this year.
- We will continue to tackle the messes left by the last government, like ICBC, while investing in the people who power our province.
- Let me remind you of the historic levels of investments we've made in people and services since taking office – a \$1 billion investment in transforming B.C.'s child care system, \$7 billion for affordable housing initiatives, eliminating student loan debt, eliminating MSP – the biggest middle-class tax cut in a generation – and record levels of investments in health care, education and capital infrastructure, just to name a few.
- We can't fix all the problems overnight, but that hasn't stopped us from rolling up our sleeves and getting to work for the people of B.C.

12. Are you pointing to a recession on the horizon?

- British Columbia's economy is stable and resilient. We continue to lead the country as the only province with a triple-A credit rating, one of the lowest unemployment rates, a balanced budget and zero operating debt.

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

- However, as Finance Minister, I'm taking a measured and responsible approach in response to risks on the horizon with the potential to impact B.C.'s economy, like trade tensions and slowing global growth.
- Our plan is working - we are on solid fiscal footing and our economy is expected to continue being a national leader.
- We're standing up for British Columbians by taking a strong approach that will allow us to continue investing in people first to make B.C. a good place to live.

ICBC

13. In October, the Province's attempts to limit the number of medical experts allowed in auto insurance lawsuits was found to be unconstitutional by the B.C. Supreme Court. This came with a half a million-dollar hit to ICBC. Why is this not reflected in the Q2 report? Are you ignoring the problem?

- No. Government is reviewing details of the court decision, the effect on ICBC finances, as well as available responsive actions including potential amendments to the Evidence Act.
- The Q2 results show ICBC's net loss forecast has deteriorated by \$41 million.
- This is mainly due to continuing increased claims costs that include higher-than-expected large bodily injury claims from prior years.

14. Why don't the financial impacts of the Crowder decision show up in the Q2 report?

- Government continues to review details of the recent court decision and its subsequent impact on ICBC finances.
- We need to further analyze any financial impact in the context of our planned reforms to the Evidence Act.
- I don't expect that it will be reflected in fiscal projections until we have time to do that work.

15. If ICBC's finances are still in the red, why are employee salaries going up?

- I understand the concerns that British Columbians have around compensation at Crown Corporations.
- This is something our government has been working very hard to address.

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

- ICBC saw a minor increase in overall remuneration due to the payment of negotiated Bargaining Unit wage adjustments, increased payments for CPP & EI to the Receiver General and the increased number of claims staff hired to respond to increased claims.
- However, the number of employees making the most, that is, over \$150,000, has decreased by 37.6 per cent.
- ICBC management and confidential employees have been without a general across the board salary increase since 2012 in accordance with the B.C. Public Sector Employer policy and guidelines.

16. The Crown corporation continues to pose huge risk to the B.C. government's finances and is hardly in the clear. At what point will government consider a bail-out?

- Unlike the previous government, we've chosen to confront tough challenges head-on instead of taking the easy road by ignoring the serious issues at ICBC.
- We've been measured and responsible in our approach, and that's why we have a healthy \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance built into our fiscal plan for this year.
- As Minister of Finance, I continue to monitor the situation at ICBC closely. We are taking a responsible approach and working hard to get ICBC back on the right track.

Discretionary Spending

- 17. The RCMP are being forced to make cuts across B.C. due to a funding shortfall of \$10 million. Is this related to the cuts your government ordered to discretionary spending? Are you jeopardizing public safety with these cuts?**

SPEAKING NOTES FOR

Second Quarterly Report

**HON. CAROLE JAMES
MINISTER OF FINANCE**

**PRESS THEATRE
BC LEGISLATURE**

**TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 26, 2019
11:15 a.m.
VICTORIA, BC**

- ***[Prompt: speak to family's connection to Burns Lake]***
- **I want people to know that we hear you and we are taking action.**
- **Our government is working hard to make sure forestry workers, contractors, and communities get the support they need and deserve.**
- **We will not turn our backs on the people who have helped power our province for so long.**
- **And, we will continue working hard to fix the messes we inherited.**
- **It will come as no surprise that ICBC remains a significant financial risk.**

- **Government continues to review details of the recent court decision and its subsequent impact on ICBC finances.**
- **We are considering available responsive actions to get ICBC back on solid fiscal footing.**
- **These are the kind of risks that we have planned and accounted for...**
- **With a fiscal plan that has layers of prudence, including our contingency fund and forecast allowance.**
- **We are preparing for global economic uncertainty ahead...**

NEWS RELEASE

For Immediate Release
[release number]
Nov. 26, 2019

Ministry of Finance

B.C.'s economy resilient, finances on track

s.13

s.13

Contact:
Media Relations
Ministry of Finance
778 974-3341

Wensink, Alison PREM:EX

From: Finn, Heather GCPE:EX
Sent: November 22, 2019 3:30 PM
To: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Cc: McGregor, Cara GCPE:EX
Subject: Fwd: Q2 Communications Materials
Attachments: NR_Q2 Report_Nov 26_v4.docx; ATT00001.htm; SN_MCJ_Q2 Report_Opening and Closing - DRAFT7.doc; ATT00002.htm; Q2 2019 Report Presentation_draft4.pptx; ATT00003.htm; QA Q2 Report_Nov 26 2019_v4.docx; ATT00004.htm

Q2 drafts. Lisa said she is still expecting some changes from MO.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Leslie, Lisa GCPE:EX" <Lisa.Leslie@gov.bc.ca>
Date: November 22, 2019 at 1:46:14 PM PST
To: "Lawson, Liam FIN:EX" <Liam.Lawson@gov.bc.ca>, "Bretscher, Paul FIN:EX" <Paul.Bretscher@gov.bc.ca>, "Spilker, Robyn FIN:EX" <Robyn.Spilker@gov.bc.ca>
Cc: "Finn, Heather GCPE:EX" <Heather.Finn@gov.bc.ca>, "Youngs, Kirsten R GCPE:EX" <Kirsten.Youngs@gov.bc.ca>, "Reid, Heidi FIN:EX" <Heidi.Reid@gov.bc.ca>
Subject: Q2 Communications Materials

Hi there,

Attached are the latest Q2 drafts from GCPE, plus the revised presentation deck with revised SNs. We happily await more feedback.

Thank you.

- NR
- Intro SNs
- Presentation SNs
- QA

Lisa Leslie
Communications Director
Ministry of Finance
250-213-7724

Questions and Answers

Key Messages

- British Columbia's economy remains resilient against a backdrop of economic volatility and global uncertainty.
- Our government continues to show that investing in people while balancing the budget is not only possible – it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- With careful planning and foresight built into every stage of our fiscal plan, we are building up our contingencies while making sure that every dollar possible is going to people.
- This will help B.C. weather the global storm, while delivering on our commitments to balance the books and make life better for people.
- B.C. is an economic leader in Canada. We are the only province with triple-A credit ratings from the three major international rating agencies, the lowest unemployment rate in the country, a balanced budget, and zero operating debt.

Top Questions

1. **The Q2 results show that ICBC continues to lose money. Last week, the Attorney General confirmed the Province won't be appealing the Crowder decision, and the courts are set to rule on another two cases brought forward by the Trial Lawyers Association. To top it off, ICBC's financial results released last week are abysmal. How do you plan on making up for that financial loss?**
 - As we signaled at Q1, ICBC is a significant financial risk to the Province.
 - Today's results show that ICBC's net loss forecast has deteriorated by \$41 million.
 - This is mainly due to continuing increased claims costs that include higher-than-expected large bodily injury claims from prior years.
 - The forecast does not yet reflect the effect on ICBC finances of the BC Supreme Court decision which struck down a provincial court rule that limited the number of expert reports in vehicle actions.
 - The Office of the Attorney General is reviewing details of the court decision, the effect on ICBC finances, as well as available responsive actions including potential amendments to the Evidence Act.

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

11. The reason we're not in deficit right now is because \$300 million was taken from contingencies in Q1. If the global economy continues to slow, or ICBC suffers another financial blow in the courts, what are you going to do? Will you go into deficit to deliver on your promises, or maintain the razor thin surplus by raising taxes and cutting programs?

- It does not come down to a choice between balancing the books and investing in people – we can and must do both.
- In fact, our government continues to show that investing in people while balancing the budget is not only possible, it is fundamental to building a resilient economy.
- The Q2 results show that B.C.'s economy is stable. We are working from a balanced budget with generous prudence built-in that will allow us to plan for and respond to the changing global environment.
- With careful planning and foresight built into every stage of our fiscal plan, we are building up our contingencies while making sure that every dollar possible is going to people.
- As Finance Minister, I will continue my fiscally responsible approach as we adjust to slowing global growth and risks surrounding global trade.

12. If the economy takes a serious downturn, or ICBC's finances don't improve, what are you going to do? Raise taxes or cut programs?

- From day one, we set clear priorities to make life more affordable, improve services and build a strong, sustainable economy.
- We've been measured and responsible in our approach, and that's why we have a healthy \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance built into our fiscal plan for this year.
- We will continue to tackle the messes left by the last government, like ICBC, while investing in the people who power our province.
- Let me remind you of the historic levels of investments we've made in people and services since taking office – a \$1 billion investment in transforming B.C.'s child care system, \$7 billion for affordable housing initiatives, eliminating student loan debt, eliminating MSP – the biggest middle-class tax cut in a generation – and record levels of investments in health care, education and capital infrastructure, just to name a few.
- We can't fix all the problems overnight, but that hasn't stopped us from rolling up our sleeves and getting to work for the people of B.C.

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

13. Are you pointing to a recession on the horizon?

- British Columbia's economy is stable and resilient. We continue to lead the country as the only province with a triple-A credit rating, one of the lowest unemployment rates, a balanced budget and zero operating debt.
- However, as Finance Minister, I'm taking a measured and responsible approach in response to risks on the horizon with the potential to impact B.C.'s economy, like trade tensions and slowing global growth.
- Our plan is working - we are on solid fiscal footing and our economy is expected to continue being a national leader.
- We're standing up for British Columbians by taking a strong approach that will allow us to continue investing in people first to make B.C. a good place to live.

ICBC

14. In October, the Province's attempts to limit the number of medical experts allowed in auto insurance lawsuits was found to be unconstitutional by the B.C. Supreme Court. This came with a half a million-dollar hit to ICBC. Why is this not reflected in the Q2 report? Are you ignoring the problem?

- No. Government is reviewing details of the court decision, the effect on ICBC finances, as well as available responsive actions including potential amendments to the Evidence Act.
- The Q2 results show ICBC's net loss forecast has deteriorated by \$41 million.
- This is mainly due to continuing increased claims costs that include higher-than-expected large bodily injury claims from prior years.

15. Why don't the financial impacts of the Crowder decision show up in the Q2 report?

- Government continues to review details of the recent court decision and its subsequent impact on ICBC finances.
- We need to further analyze any financial impact in the context of our planned reforms to the Evidence Act.
- I don't expect that it will be reflected in fiscal projections until we have time to do that work.

Q2 Report 2019-20
Confidential – Advice to Minister

16. If ICBC's finances are still in the red, why are employee salaries going up?

- I understand the concerns that British Columbians have around compensation at Crown Corporations.
- This is something our government has been working very hard to address.
- ICBC saw a minor increase in overall remuneration due to the payment of negotiated Bargaining Unit wage adjustments, increased payments for CPP & EI to the Receiver General and the increased number of claims staff hired to respond to increased claims.
- However, the number of employees making the most, that is, over \$150,000, has decreased by 37.6 per cent.
- ICBC management and confidential employees have been without a general across the board salary increase since 2012 in accordance with the B.C. Public Sector Employer policy and guidelines.

17. The Crown corporation continues to pose huge risk to the B.C. government's finances and is hardly in the clear. At what point will government consider a bail-out?

- Unlike the previous government, we've chosen to confront tough challenges head-on instead of taking the easy road by ignoring the serious issues at ICBC.
- We've been measured and responsible in our approach, and that's why we have a healthy \$1.05 billion in contingencies and forecast allowance built into our fiscal plan for this year.
- As Minister of Finance, I continue to monitor the situation at ICBC closely. We are taking a responsible approach and working hard to get ICBC back on the right track.

Shortt, Amanda PREM:EX

From: Poorooshasb, Nammi GCPE:EX
Sent: November 25, 2019 12:10 PM
To: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX; Smith, George PREM:EX; Evans, Donna GCPE:EX; Zadravec, Don GCPE:EX
Subject: FW: [Test] NEW POLL: Horgan and the NDP ending 2019 on high note, but challengers in pursuit according to "Government of British Columbia Report Card"

FYI

From: Steve Mossop
Date: Monday, November 25, 2019 at 11:45 AM
To: "Stewart, Dawn M GCPE:EX" , "LeSueur, Kathryn GCPE:EX" , "Poorooshasb, Nammi GCPE:EX"
Subject: FW: [Test] NEW POLL: Horgan and the NDP ending 2019 on high note, but challengers in pursuit according to "Government of British Columbia Report Card"

Hi Dawn/Kathryn and Nammi:

Here's an advance copy of the press release we are issuing to the media tomorrow at 7AM.

Sincerely,

Steve Mossop

President



778.891.4762



stevemossop@insightswest.com



Suite 304, 1140 Homer St. | Vancouver, BC | V6B 2X6




From: Steve Mossop
Reply-To: "us5-ad55763fc2-6701035d74@inbound.mailchimp.com"
Date: Monday, November 25, 2019 at 11:44 AM
To: Steve Mossop
Subject: [Test] NEW POLL: Horgan and the NDP ending 2019 on high note, but challengers in pursuit according to "Government of British Columbia Report Card"

This email was sent from outside your organisation, yet is displaying the name of someone from your organisation. This often happens in phishing attempts. Please only interact with this email if you know its source and that the content is safe.

[New Insights West report on BC government.](#)

[View this email in your browser](#)

Insights West 

Premier Horgan and the NDP ending the year on high note in the “Government of British Columbia Report Card,” but BC Liberals and Conservatives making incremental gains

For Immediate Release

November 26, 2019 — [View this release on our website.](#)

Copyright

Page 44 of 75 to/à Page 47 of 75

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

Copyright

For further information, please contact:

Steve Mossop
President
Insights West
778.891.4762

stevemossop@insightswest.com



[Share](#)



[Tweet](#)



[Forward](#)

Copyright © 2019 Insights West, All rights reserved.

You are receiving this email because, as a member of the press, you are entitled to view our latest public opinion polling results.

Our mailing address is:

Insights West
304 - 1140 Homer Street
Vancouver, BC V6B 2X6
Canada

[Add us to your address book](#)

Want to change how you receive these emails?

You can [update your preferences](#) or [unsubscribe from this list](#).

Shortt, Amanda PREM:EX

From: Smith, George PREM:EX
Sent: November 21, 2019 1:43 PM
To: 'Palmer, Vaughn'
Subject: PJH Scrum transcript

As requested:

Media Availability
Horgan media availability
21-Nov-2019 11:30

Quoted: Reporter, John Horgan

Reporter: [inaudible] on your watch [inaudible]

John Horgan: Well, the context of those comments, Keith, were in relation to the leader of the opposition giving advice to the government on how they should manage labour relations. It was with that in mind that I said I would take no advice from BC Liberals on how to address disruptions and disputes in the marketplace.

Having said that, I'm encouraging the parties to get back to the table. They've got the whole weekend to hammer out a deal. I think that's the best course for not just for the transit community but also for BC.

Reporter: As a follow-up [inaudible] considering designating transit operations in some form of essential service, considering a lot of people rely on transit to access health care?

Horgan: Certainly, I appreciate and understand the concerns that people would have that use transit. We've seen a 20% increase in ridership in the Lower Mainland. That speaks to the importance of this sector. Having said that, the best way forward, the best way to get an agreement is at the bargaining table. I'm encouraging the parties to be there all weekend long, if that's what it takes.

Reporter: Premier, how did the attorney general's ministry get into a place where they're refusing the representative for children's access to information, choosing court, suing them and winning? How did that argument get to that point, considering your caucus used to be very enthusiastic about that right that she's saying she has?

Horgan: We continue to be extremely supportive of the independent officers of the Legislature. They've done outstanding work over the years, going back to Stephen Owen as ombudsman, when they were the ombuddy back in the day. I have a high regard for the independent officers of the Legislature.

There is also process questions -- that's why the attorney general is there. We need to guard those issues as government and encourage the parties -- the commissioner, in this case, or the children's advocate -- to work with the government to find a way forward. That's what I'm hoping will happen.

Reporter: I'm trying to figure out what I want to ask you. I have so many things I want to ask you --

Horgan: You're still on holiday.

Reporter: On the transit strike, are there steps you believe should be done? One suggestion, possibly, is to get your Transportation minister to write a letter to the Passenger Transportation Board saying to speed up approvals for

ridesharing. You have companies who have already said they're interested in operating here. They could be on the road next week to help alleviate some of the pressure. Is it worth considering at this point, a week away from a potential strike, measures to try to get as many resources on the road as possible to limit the disruption?

Horgan: That's the transit-slash-ride-hailing-slash... what? Certainly, I appreciate the thinking outside the box on the question of ride-hailing. I'm very encouraged by the number of companies that have expressed an interest in operating in BC.

I also respect the Passenger Transportation Board taking the time to make sure that all parties have a fair hearing. They've extended, as you know, or have extended the period to review the feedback they got when they asked for more comment and consultation. I'm hopeful that that will be resolved quickly and we'll have ride-hailing up and running in BC very, very soon.

When it comes, again, to issues around public transit in the Lower Mainland, the best place to be is at the bargaining table. We are back here again next week. I'm hopeful that by next week, the parties have spent the weekend working hard on getting a collective agreement.

Reporter: Alberta announced this week that they're launching public consultation around Daylight Saving Time. Legislation's just been passed here. California now seemingly has gone back towards permanent Daylight Saving Time. Is there anything that's unfolded? Can you give us an update in the conversations -- last time we were here, you mentioned that you were going to bring it up with the other Premiers. Is there any update for what we've seen in terms of a buy-in Canada-wide for permanent Daylight Saving Time?

Horgan: I did raise it in the COF -- Council of the Federation -- conference call that we had recently, I don't know when it was, since the federal election. I encouraged my colleagues to take a look at this issue because of the overwhelming response we had here in BC. I'm repeating this for you but it's almost 250,000 people took the time to tell us how they felt about that. That's not to mention the many, many, potentially hundreds of thousands of other people who were nodding their head in support when those numbers came out.

I encouraged my colleagues at the Premiers' table to take a look at this. Since then, Premier Kenney has agreed to go back. Premier Notley had started that process on her term. Now Mr Kenney is going to look at it again. Saskatchewan's already on a stable time. I don't know what Ontario, Quebec will do.

Someone suggested that perhaps the solution to Standard Time and Daylight Saving Time is to have a Sooke Time that's a half-hour ahead of everybody else like Newfoundland, but I don't think we're going to do that.

Reporter: Premier, at a press conference yesterday with David Eby, he said after studying the courtroom defeat for his ICBC effort to rein in the use of experts in court, he concluded that an appeal was either not likely to succeed or probably wouldn't accomplish the goals. He also said that because of this, there's now a question mark, again, over ICBC reaching -- it was supposed to almost reach the break-even point on its finances this year. You're probably going to have to do legislation and another attempt next year.

Does all this add up to the whole plan for dealing with the problems at ICBC not working very well? Are you still sure the government's on the right track with its efforts?

Horgan: Certainly, we'll go back in time a little bit, Vaughn. We inherited a significant challenge at ICBC, as has been well covered by all of the people here. We've been taking a variety of steps to try to rein in costs to ensure that we can keep costs down for the travelling public. Our attempts to reduce court costs was a significant part of that, but not the only part of that. Minister Eby is now going back to his colleagues at ICBC and we're working through how we proceed from here.

I don't think it's fair to say that we were on the wrong track, or that all of our options have been exhausted. I think it is fair say that the attempt to reduce the court costs was unsuccessful in this round. There's more that we can do and Minister Eby's looking at that.

Reporter: When do you think you're going to hit the break-even point with ICBC? It was supposed to be pretty much this year.

Horgan: Yeah, well, Minister James is looking at the second quarterly numbers coming out shortly. She would be the best person, Vaughn, to ask that question. Our concern has been from the beginning that were just absolutely runaway costs that were hidden, quite frankly, by the last crew that were in here.

We had not anticipated as we planned our platform for the election campaign, nor did we anticipate until early days of our time in government the magnitude of the problem and how it was not just a one-time issue. It was one that was going to be escalating and growing year-over-year. Those are issues that we've had to look at with renewed focus on trying to get back to the important part, which is to keep costs down for the people of BC.

Reporter: Good morning, Premier. You and the Finance minister have been very cautious in terms of your spending and wanting to maintain a surplus. Obviously, given the ICBC case, it at least makes that more difficult. Federally, we've seen that there seems to be more of an appetite for deficit spending. Does that play into your thinking at all?

Horgan: Oh, dear. Good question. We pride ourselves -- certainly, I pride myself on having the good judgement to appoint Carole James as the Finance minister. She has been working very, very hard to maintain the highest credit rating in the country, to continue to see significant job growth in every corner of the province.

We're optimistic that we can continue to balance our budgets. The three-year plan is in place. The previous question and the issues around ICBC are certainly part of that. The crashing commodity prices, another challenge, of course. I'm confident that the prudent woman that I put in charge of the books for the people of BC is going to manage those as effectively as anybody I know.

I have to say, I had breakfast with my second-favourite Carole Finance minister, Carole Taylor, yesterday. She gave me a thumbs-up on how we're doing. I'm going to take that to the bank, for sure.

Reporter: Premier, going back to the transit strike, of course, everyone's concerned about a looming shutdown potentially. At would point would the province appoint a mediator?

Horgan: Again, timing is everything on labour disputes. There is a mediator, Vince Ready, a very accomplished mediator, in place on the coastal forestry challenges. There's a mediator in place with respect to bargaining with the BC Teachers' Federation. I'm confident that the best way to go forward is at the bargaining table. Until such time as the parties have an understanding of how close they can get, mediation may not be the right answer. I want the parties back at the table.

I understand the importance of transit to the travelling public. The employer does. The workers do. I think everybody wants a resolution. They've got the opportunity over the weekend to get that done.

Reporter: Regarding the Fuel Price Transparency Act introduced this week, I think the big question everyone had after that is, will this lead to cheaper gas? If so, how?

Horgan: The day before the bill was introduced, I was in Vancouver. I went into a meeting and gas was \$1.50 a litre. When I came out, it was \$1.27. That's not a tax question, for those who continue to make the argument that gas prices are driven by taxation. That's a market issue.

I believe the Transparency Act is a step in the right direction. I've been following this issue as a critic and as Premier for some time. I'm very, very encouraged that we've seen a levelling of prices in the Lower Mainland. We've got anomalies. It's, again, the media have covered this very well. Places like Powell River -- why is there still a spike in costs there?

This bill will help us. We need to work to ensure the Utilities Commission has the tools they need to analyze the data as it comes in. There are other tools at our disposal as well. Most importantly, I've talked to the Prime Minister. I've talked to the Premier of Alberta. More refined product coming to BC will help us keep prices down.

Reporter: Over here, in the corner, sorry.

Horgan: I've got good peripheral. I can see you. I don't want to take my eyes off Chris (sp).

Reporter: Spoken to some advocacy groups who've talked about changes that were made by the prior government to provide supports for extended families taking care of children were changed and, as a result, a number of families were left without supports. I'm wondering if your government would be willing to revisit that change that was made in 2010 and consider trying to make sure that families are supported when they take care of children in those situations?

Horgan: I'm not sure of the details, Justine, of that question. I will say that we have taken steps with respect to children in Indigenous families to make sure that extended families are redefined so that children aren't taken away from those extended families. Similarly, when care has been given for a long period of time, to have that disrupted is inappropriate, in my mind. I would suggest that the Minister of Children & Families is a better person to answer that question.

I would support any initiative that ensures that we're doing our best to make sure that when families are in difficulty and children are faced with being taken away from the only family they've known, that we do everything we can to preserve that unit in the interests of everybody.

Reporter: Just another transit --

Horgan: I can see you, Rob.

Reporter: Okay, good, good. If the transit dispute is still going on mid-next week, do you consider extending the session before all the MLAs go home and you might have to reconvene them?

Horgan: Again, as I said, never has there been a labour dispute resolved in question period. Never has there been a labour dispute resolved in a scrum with the media. I'm hopeful that the parties, the people that have seen, as I said, a 20% increase in ridership over the past three years, strains on the system, a lack of investment in infrastructure capital over the past number of years, there's a whole bunch of stuff at play with respect to transit.

Key to that is making sure the employer and the union have a working understanding of where they can get to together. That's best done at the bargaining table. We've got the weekend ahead of us. I'm hopeful that they'll take advantage of that.

Reporter: Speaking of the 2001 transit strike, what were you doing back then? Do you recall that? What are your memories of that?

Horgan: I was working in the private sector at that time. I was amazed that it carried on throughout the summer. Again, I'm a transit user. I have been. I haven't used transit, obviously, as much as Premier as I used to in my own community. When I'm in Vancouver, I'm on SeaBus. I'm on SkyTrain. I know how pivotal it is to moving people around, taking pressures off the roads and congestion there.

The comment that I made was with that in mind, Mike, that I can't imagine how our system and the people of BC could be put through that. That was my thinking in 2001. It's my thinking today. My thinking is shaped by my absolute

understanding that free collective bargaining has worked around the world for a long, long time. The best way to resolve this dispute is to have the parties mindful that the people that they serve as desperate to have that service. Let's find a way forward at the table. I'm confident they'll be able to do that.

Reporter: In the House today, Andrew Wilkinson, I heard him heckling at one point, saying you guys don't want to do anything bad to your buddies. He just said to me in the hallways, suggested maybe this government is very close to the union movement and you're taking orders from the unions. How would you respond to that?

Horgan: It's difficult to respond to questions from the leader of the opposition. Again, I take no lessons from BC Liberals whose finest hour when it comes to labour relations was ripping up collective agreements, and to oversee a four-month strike in transit in the Lower Mainland.

I appreciate Mr Wilkinson and the challenge of being a leader of the opposition. It's not easy work. He's got nothing to offer on this question, quite frankly, and I'm hopeful that the parties, the people that really matter in this instance, the employer and the drivers and the union, are going to get this done. That's my fervent hope and I'm going to encourage them throughout the weekend to get it done.

Reporter: Hello, Premier. There's a private member's bill sitting on the order paper at the moment, introduced by Andrew Weaver, that would ban conversion therapy in BC. People who are advocating it say that, despite the fact that the Health minister and the MLA for Vancouver-West End have said it would basically be a symbolic move. Conversation therapy is already not funded here in BC. Advocates are saying that it would be a significant gesture by the government to pass that legislation. The federal government is now indicating that they may take that step themselves. Would BC be interested in being first on that issue?

Horgan: I'll await action by the federal action. I have to confess I've heard about action on a range of fronts over the years, so we'll wait and see on that. On the substance of the question, Shannon, I believe that the Minister of Health is correct, as is my colleague Spencer Chandra Herbert, that that would be largely symbolic because it's not something that we fund in BC.

Should that become a more divisive public issue, then we would certainly intervene. I think at this point in time -- and I spoke with Andrew Weaver about this very thing yesterday in our weekly meeting. He's not clamouring for immediate action. He understands that we wanted -- he wanted to have a statement by all members that they were opposed to this type of activity.

My view and the view of the Minister of Health is the correct one. This is not something that's funded. Let's move on to other more substantial issues.

Reporter: Symbolism can be a powerful thing, though. Yesterday, we stood on the lawn of the Legislature and watched the trans flag be raised for the first time. That's a symbolic gesture in a lot of ways. What's the difference between doing something like that to signal sort of support for a community, and passing a piece of relatively simple legislation?

Horgan: Well, nothing's simple in the Legislature. You will know that there are members of the Legislature, not in my party, but in the other major party, who have a different point of view on that. So that symbolism would in essence become divisive and my attempts from the beginning, largely because of the circumstances I found myself in -- a minority situation -- but I think despite evidence to the contrary, perhaps, before 2017, my role and my approach to things is to try and find a way forward that meets everyone's needs. So rather than be symbolic and create division within my opponents' ranks, why not have a categorical statement from the Minister of Health saying that's not going to happen here. I think that's sufficient as a symbol and rather than create discontent within the opposition. They have the challenge here. We don't. We stand with those who reject this type of therapy or this approach to people's orientation and so I think that's a sufficient symbolic statement by the leader of the government.

I don't want to -- you can go and ask the Liberals how they feel about it and you'll get the answer as to why I wouldn't want to introduce legislation. I don't believe that's helpful.

Reporter: You ticked another box this week from the throne speech when you assigned Bob D'Eith to the mobile phones file, to go to talk to Ottawa about that. Your powers in that respect are limited and there are other aspects of the throne speech that you haven't moved upon. Specifically the [inaudible] commissioner, ombudsperson, and most importantly the information privacy commissioner all lobbied for there to be new accountability and transparency measures at the Legislature [inaudible] including adding the Legislature to the information privacy laws. You've got four days left next week in the session. Why is it taking so long to get those measures enacted?

Horgan: Going back to the first part of your question, Bob, the piece around cell phones, cell phone bills are fundamental to just about every (audio dropout) whether they're young or old and the federal parties, during the last election campaign, all made passing reference to doing something about that. We've done a consultation -- you've seen that. Bob D'Eith has been tasked by me to be the liaison with Ottawa to make sure that we get progress, not just lip service during an election campaign.

When it comes to the more substantive issues about independent officers of the Legislature, we're continuing to work on all of those issues. We've had, as you know and have covered, some challenges when it comes to the LAMC. I think it's a year since we had what can only be described as an extraordinary day here at the Legislature. So with that backdrop the challenges of coming to a place where all members of the Legislature are comfortable with changes we'd make to the role and function of independent officers is a work in progress.

Reporter: What do you say to voters or members of your own party who'll be meeting this weekend after you ran on the promise in 2017 to reform the very antiquated information and privacy laws, not just improving transparency, but also the controls and privacy of recording any data leaks, for instance? You haven't moved upon that. You haven't moved upon what was in the throne speech this year. Does it not get to a point where the public starts to wonder and why should they believe politicians who do promise transparency -- when they get into office they don't deliver?

Horgan: I think that the vast majority of the public are more interested in transparency when it comes to gas prices and cell phone billing than they are about independent officers of the Legislature and that's meaning no disrespect to the independent officers, but I encourage you, Bob, to do some street (audio dropout) outside of Victoria and ask people if they even know those offices exist.

I'm focusing on the things that matter to people. We've been here two years. We've addressed almost 80% of the commitments we made. We've got another two years left on the mandate so be patient and we'll clean up that last 20%.

Reporter: [inaudible]

Horgan: Whenever there's a labour dispute it has an impact on the public, particularly when it's something -- a public service like transit. And that's why I've encouraged the parties -- I appreciate I'm a broken record on this -- but timing is everything when there's a labour dispute in play and I believe the time right now is for free collective bargaining to run its course. The weekend is available to the parties, into next week, and I'm confident that if they roll up their sleeves they can get a freely bargained agreement that will meet the needs of the employer, employees, and most importantly the people that depend on public transit.

Reporter: [inaudible]

Horgan: I agree with your statement, but I also believe that free collective bargaining is the best way forward. It has served not just BCers and Canadians, but people around the world for a long, long time and that's cold comfort when you reflect on how you're going to get around should there be [inaudible]. That's not the case today so we're focusing on making sure the parties are talking about where they can find a way forward and that's my focus right now.

Reporter: I just wanted to get your thoughts on Ed John who was just here a few weeks ago being charged with sexual assault.

Horgan: I don't know the substance of the allegations. I know they're serious and I certainly believe that law enforcement would have taken appropriate steps and that Mr John has been made -- accusations have been made. He'll get representation and they'll be discussed in a court of law and justice will prevail.

Reporter: Along the same lines, sexual assault supporters point out that when it comes to [inaudible] supports outside of the justice system there are very few teams around BC. The Victoria Sexual Assault Centre has to apply for funding each year to try and get that support in place, and wondering does your government and how you're approaching that and the patchwork of funding -- is there any thought to perhaps give permanent funding to groups like that?

Horgan: I remember Vaughn writing a column about me walking a mile in women's shoes as I clip-clopped down (audio dropout) corridors to raise money for the Victoria Sexual Assault Centre, and it has been a philanthropic exercise, largely, and grant driven. Our ministers -- half are women, half are men -- my caucus -- half women, half men -- raise these issues all the time and we're looking at ways to institutionalize supports. One way is having more transition housing so that women who are fleeing sexual violence in the home, domestic sexual violence, or otherwise, have a place to go.

Those are institutional solutions to some of the challenges. But there's much, much more work to do and we're committed to this -- my colleagues, men and women.

Reporter: There's been a young Guatemalan in BC this last week talking about a mine in his community that's owned by a Vancouver company -- Pan American Silver. Essentially he says the company doesn't respect his community's right to say no and I'm wondering if you think they should have a right to say no or if they do under international agreements and what role there might be for the province in regulating what a BC company does elsewhere.

Horgan: I have no knowledge of that file, Andrew. You want to have another -- I can't even offer up a surmise. So perhaps I could get back to you on that and you can ask another question because I honestly don't know what the issue is. I don't want to speculate without more facts.

Reporter: I think it was more that principle around the discussion we've had with UNDRIP about consultation, free, prior, and informed consent, and does that include a right to say no.

Horgan: I will say that what we're doing in BC is we've introduced and are debating the (audio dropout) bill to provide clarity on the landbase for investors and also to ensure that the stack of case law that will go almost to the ceiling in this room is adhered to. Right and title exist. How do we work to ensure that everyone benefits from economic activity in BC? Outside of BC companies that are located in BC, what they do, again, I'll leave that to other jurisdictions. I'm sorry I can't be more focused on it.

But the principles that are embedded in the UN declaration are being adopted here in BC. That, I guess, is my answer to the question. [sss, zpz, pjhh, lbrr, tran, translink, mjag, mcf, ctz, maz, fin]

Shortt, Amanda PREM:EX

From: Smith, George PREM:EX
Sent: November 12, 2019 11:28 AM
To: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Subject: RE: messages for tanner intvw

Tanner's angle is the last NDP government in power – s.13
s.13

From: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Sent: November 12, 2019 11:14 AM
To: Smith, George PREM:EX
Subject: messages for tanner intvw

Can you take a look at this? See anything that's missing?

Key Messages

- **I'm proud of the choices our government has made to make life better for everyone in BC, not just the few at the top.**
- **We've accomplished a lot and in two and a half years. We've got to work cleaning up the BC Liberals' messes, invested in much-needed public services while keeping our economy strong and sustainable – but there's still much more to do.**
- **The problems facing people in B.C. developed over 16 years of BC Liberals putting themselves and wealthy insiders first. We're working on the problems, but they won't be fixed overnight.**
- **British Columbians have seen our government roll up its sleeves and work hard for everyday families.**
- **We're going to keep working hard to make life more affordable and build a strong, sustainable province that works for everyone.**

Questions and Answers

Accomplishments

- Saving families money: our child care initiatives have helped save families hundreds of dollars each month, with over 19,000 kids in child care that costs their parents \$10-a-day or less.
- Eliminating unfair MSP premiums: we're now in the last pay period for MSP premiums. After cutting the fee in half, it will be eliminated altogether starting Jan 1, 2020, saving families up to \$1,800 every year.
- Helping more people find an affordable place to live: more than 20,000 affordable housing units built or under construction.
- Creating good-paying, sustainable jobs: lowest unemployment in Canada 24 months in a row.

Q1: What are your biggest challenges right now?

- The problems facing BC families didn't appear overnight and they won't be fixed overnight, but our government has never been afraid to roll up our sleeves and get to work.
- Example: housing. Too many people in BC still can't find affordable place to live. That's why we took strong steps to tackle the housing crisis by taking on the fraudsters in the real estate market and – unlike the previous government – not just promising affordable housing, but actually building it.

Q2: How do you tackle challenges around Surrey given their importance? (Particularly South Asian community – ride hailing, ICBC)

- People in Surrey are facing the challenges of many people in the province – s.13
s.13
- We're putting people first and working to clean up that mess by making life more affordable.

Ride hailing

- British Columbians have made it clear they want ride hailing services.
- s.13 . we've worked to bring in ride hailing alongside the taxi industry in a fair and responsible way. And we're getting it done.
- s.13
-

- We're committed to a responsible approach that works with both the taxi and ride hail industries to address concerns, including safety, and we will have ride hailing in B.C. this year.

ICBC costs

- People in Surrey and across BC just want to be able to afford insurance for driving to work or taking their kids to hockey practice – and our government has their backs.

s.13

- We're working hard to clean up that mess – and we're focused on making auto insurance rates more affordable for all drivers in B.C.

Q3: How do you manage slim minority government situation/relationship with Green Party caucus? With Weaver stepping down, will it stay intact for a full four years?

- I'm grateful for all we've accomplished together for the people of BC, and I credit Andrew Weaver for his dedication to climate action and our work together on CleanBC.
- We have a good working relationship with all the members of the Green caucus and we continue to have a strong framework with the Confidence and Supply Agreement that puts people first.
- Our focus will continue to be on building a better future for British Columbians.

Q4: What do you think about being the last NDP government standing in Canada?

- Our focus as New Democrats is on people and working to make life better for everyone, not just the few at the very top.
- Making life more affordable, protecting the services families rely on, building a stronger and more sustainable economy – those are the hallmarks of an NDP government. These are also values that British Columbians share, and a great many Canadians as well.
- We keep our focus on serving the people of this great province, and in doing so, I think we've set a good example across the country.
- I've spoken to political leaders and everyday folks in other provinces, with a variety of political stripes, and when they look at our list of accomplishments, they say "good job."
- Governments of different stripes come and go, but at the end of the day we must put people first. New Democrats have always done that and always will.

Sage Aaron, Communications Director
Office of the Premier | Government of BC
501 Belleville St, Victoria, BC V8V 2L8 | 778-678-0832

OOP FOI PREM:EX

From: Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX
Sent: November 22, 2019 1:48 PM
To: Bob Mackin
Subject: RE: media request
Attachments: Horgan scrum audio.MP4

Hi Bob,
Just got it.

Jen

From: Bob Mackin <bob@thebreaker.news>
Sent: Thursday, November 21, 2019 5:02 PM
To: Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX <Jen.Holmwood@gov.bc.ca>
Subject: Re: media request

Can't I get the recording, too? It's for this weekend's podcast. Thanks

On Thu, Nov 21, 2019 at 5:00 PM Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX <Jen.Holmwood@gov.bc.ca> wrote:

Here's the transcript. Hope that helps.

21-Nov-2019, 11:30

Horgan - CMBC transit strike/DST/ICBC

By Horgan media availability

Reporter: [inaudible] on your watch [inaudible]

John Horgan: Well, the context of those comments, Keith, were in relation to the leader of the opposition giving advice to the government on how they should manage labour relations. It was with that in mind that I said I would take no advice from BC Liberals on how to address disruptions and disputes in the marketplace.

Having said that, I'm encouraging the parties to get back to the table. They've got the whole weekend to hammer out a deal. I think that's the best course for not just for the transit community but also for BC.

Reporter: As a follow-up [inaudible] considering designating transit operations in some form of essential service, considering a lot of people rely on transit to access health care?

Horgan: Certainly, I appreciate and understand the concerns that people would have that use transit. We've seen a 20% increase in ridership in the Lower Mainland. That speaks to the importance of this sector. Having said that, the best way forward, the best way to get an agreement is at the bargaining table. I'm encouraging the parties to be there all weekend long, if that's what it takes.

Reporter: Premier, how did the attorney general's ministry get into a place where they're refusing the representative for children's access to information, choosing court, suing them and winning? How did that argument get to that point, considering your caucus used to be very enthusiastic about that right that she's saying she has?

Horgan: We continue to be extremely supportive of the independent officers of the Legislature. They've done outstanding work over the years, going back to Stephen Owen as ombudsman, when they were the ombuddy back in the day. I have a high regard for the independent officers of the Legislature.

There is also process questions -- that's why the attorney general is there. We need to guard those issues as government and encourage the parties -- the commissioner, in this case, or the children's advocate -- to work with the government to find a way forward. That's what I'm hoping will happen.

Reporter: I'm trying to figure out what I want to ask you. I have so many things I want to ask you --

Horgan: You're still on holiday.

Reporter: On the transit strike, are there steps you believe should be done? One suggestion, possibly, is to get your Transportation minister to write a letter to the Passenger Transportation Board saying to speed up approvals for ridesharing. You have companies who have already said they're interested in operating here. They could be on the road next week to help alleviate some of the pressure. Is it worth considering at this point, a week away from a potential strike, measures to try to get as many resources on the road as possible to limit the disruption?

Horgan: That's the transit-slash-ride-hailing-slash... what? Certainly, I appreciate the thinking outside the box on the question of ride-hailing. I'm very encouraged by the number of companies that have expressed an interest in operating in BC.

I also respect the Passenger Transportation Board taking the time to make sure that all parties have a fair hearing. They've extended, as you know, or have extended the period to review the feedback they got when they asked for more comment and consultation. I'm hopeful that that will be resolved quickly and we'll have ride-hailing up and running in BC very, very soon.

When it comes, again, to issues around public transit in the Lower Mainland, the best place to be is at the bargaining table. We are back here again next week. I'm hopeful that by next week, the parties have spent the weekend working hard on getting a collective agreement.

Reporter: Alberta announced this week that they're launching public consultation around Daylight Saving Time. Legislation's just been passed here. California now seemingly has gone back towards

permanent Daylight Saving Time. Is there anything that's unfolded? Can you give us an update in the conversations -- last time we were here, you mentioned that you were going to bring it up with the other Premiers. Is there any update for what we've seen in terms of a buy-in Canada-wide for permanent Daylight Saving Time?

Horgan: I did raise it in the COF -- Council of the Federation -- conference call that we had recently, I don't know when it was, since the federal election. I encouraged my colleagues to take a look at this issue because of the overwhelming response we had here in BC. I'm repeating this for you but it's almost 250,000 people took the time to tell us how they felt about that. That's not to mention the many, many, potentially hundreds of thousands of other people who were nodding their head in support when those numbers came out.

I encouraged my colleagues at the Premiers' table to take a look at this. Since then, Premier Kenney has agreed to go back. Premier Notley had started that process on her term. Now Mr Kenney is going to look at it again. Saskatchewan's already on a stable time. I don't know what Ontario, Quebec will do.

Someone suggested that perhaps the solution to Standard Time and Daylight Saving Time is to have a Sooke Time that's a half-hour ahead of everybody else like Newfoundland, but I don't think we're going to do that.

Reporter: Premier, at a press conference yesterday with David Eby, he said after studying the courtroom defeat for his ICBC effort to rein in the use of experts in court, he concluded that an appeal was either not likely to succeed or probably wouldn't accomplish the goals. He also said that because of this, there's now a question mark, again, over ICBC reaching -- it was supposed to almost reach the break-even point on its finances this year. You're probably going to have to do legislation and another attempt next year.

Does all this add up to the whole plan for dealing with the problems at ICBC not working very well? Are you still sure the government's on the right track with its efforts?

Horgan: Certainly, we'll go back in time a little bit, Vaughn. We inherited a significant challenge at ICBC, as has been well covered by all of the people here. We've been taking a variety of steps to try to rein in costs to ensure that we can keep costs down for the travelling public. Our attempts to reduce court costs was a significant part of that, but not the only part of that. Minister Eby is now going back to his colleagues at ICBC and we're working through how we proceed from here.

I don't think it's fair to say that we were on the wrong track, or that all of our options have been exhausted. I think it is fair say that the attempt to reduce the court costs was unsuccessful in this round. There's more that we can do and Minister Eby's looking at that.

Reporter: When do you think you're going to hit the break-even point with ICBC? It was supposed to be pretty much this year.

Horgan: Yeah, well, Minister James is looking at the second quarterly numbers coming out shortly. She would be the best person, Vaughn, to ask that question. Our concern has been from the beginning that were just absolutely runaway costs that were hidden, quite frankly, by the last crew that were in here.

We had not anticipated as we planned our platform for the election campaign, nor did we anticipate until early days of our time in government the magnitude of the problem and how it was not just a one-time issue. It was one that was going to be escalating and growing year-over-year. Those are issues that we've had to look at with renewed focus on trying to get back to the important part, which is to keep costs down for the people of BC.

Reporter: Good morning, Premier. You and the Finance minister have been very cautious in terms of your spending and wanting to maintain a surplus. Obviously, given the ICBC case, it at least makes that more difficult. Federally, we've seen that there seems to be more of an appetite for deficit spending. Does that play into your thinking at all?

Horgan: Oh, dear. Good question. We pride ourselves -- certainly, I pride myself on having the good judgement to appoint Carole James as the Finance minister. She has been working very, very hard to maintain the highest credit rating in the country, to continue to see significant job growth in every corner of the province.

We're optimistic that we can continue to balance our budgets. The three-year plan is in place. The previous question and the issues around ICBC are certainly part of that. The crashing commodity prices, another challenge, of course. I'm confident that the prudent woman that I put in charge of the books for the people of BC is going to manage those as effectively as anybody I know.

I have to say, I had breakfast with my second-favourite Carole Finance minister, Carole Taylor, yesterday. She gave me a thumbs-up on how we're doing. I'm going to take that to the bank, for sure.

Reporter: Premier, going back to the transit strike, of course, everyone's concerned about a looming shutdown potentially. At what point would the province appoint a mediator?

Horgan: Again, timing is everything on labour disputes. There is a mediator, Vince Ready, a very accomplished mediator, in place on the coastal forestry challenges. There's a mediator in place with respect to bargaining with the BC Teachers' Federation. I'm confident that the best way to go forward is at the bargaining table. Until such time as the parties have an understanding of how close they can get, mediation may not be the right answer. I want the parties back at the table.

I understand the importance of transit to the travelling public. The employer does. The workers do. I think everybody wants a resolution. They've got the opportunity over the weekend to get that done.

Reporter: Regarding the Fuel Price Transparency Act introduced this week, I think the big question everyone had after that is, will this lead to cheaper gas? If so, how?

Horgan: The day before the bill was introduced, I was in Vancouver. I went into a meeting and gas was \$1.50 a litre. When I came out, it was \$1.27. That's not a tax question, for those who continue to make the argument that gas prices are driven by taxation. That's a market issue.

I believe the Transparency Act is a step in the right direction. I've been following this issue as a critic and as Premier for some time. I'm very, very encouraged that we've seen a levelling of prices in the Lower Mainland. We've got anomalies. It's, again, the media have covered this very well. Places like Powell River -- why is there still a spike in costs there?

This bill will help us. We need to work to ensure the Utilities Commission has the tools they need to analyze the data as it comes in. There are other tools at our disposal as well. Most importantly, I've talked to the Prime Minister. I've talked to the Premier of Alberta. More refined product coming to BC will help us keep prices down.

Reporter: Over here, in the corner, sorry.

Horgan: I've got good peripheral. I can see you. I don't want to take my eyes off Chris (sp).

Reporter: Spoken to some advocacy groups who've talked about changes that were made by the prior government to provide supports for extended families taking care of children were changed and, as a result, a number of families were left without supports. I'm wondering if your government would be willing to revisit that change that was made in 2010 and consider trying to make sure that families are supported when they take care of children in those situations?

Horgan: I'm not sure of the details, Justine, of that question. I will say that we have taken steps with respect to children in Indigenous families to make sure that extended families are redefined so that children aren't taken away from those extended families. Similarly, when care has been given for a long period of time, to have that disrupted is inappropriate, in my mind. I would suggest that the Minister of Children & Families is a better person to answer that question.

I would support any initiative that ensures that we're doing our best to make sure that when families are in difficulty and children are faced with being taken away from the only family they've known, that we do everything we can to preserve that unit in the interests of everybody.

Reporter: Just another transit --

Horgan: I can see you, Rob.

Reporter: Okay, good, good. If the transit dispute is still going on mid-next week, do you consider extending the session before all the MLAs go home and you might have to reconvene them?

Horgan: Again, as I said, never has there been a labour dispute resolved in question period. Never has there been a labour dispute resolved in a scrum with the media. I'm hopeful that the parties, the people that have seen, as I said, a 20% increase in ridership over the past three years, strains on the

system, a lack of investment in infrastructure capital over the past number of years, there's a whole bunch of stuff at play with respect to transit.

Key to that is making sure the employer and the union have a working understanding of where they can get to together. That's best done at the bargaining table. We've got the weekend ahead of us. I'm hopeful that they'll take advantage of that.

Reporter: Speaking of the 2001 transit strike, what were you doing back then? Do you recall that? What are your memories of that?

Horgan: I was working in the private sector at that time. I was amazed that it carried on throughout the summer. Again, I'm a transit user. I have been. I haven't used transit, obviously, as much as Premier as I used to in my own community. When I'm in Vancouver, I'm on SeaBus. I'm on SkyTrain. I know how pivotal it is to moving people around, taking pressures off the roads and congestion there.

The comment that I made was with that in mind, Mike, that I can't imagine how our system and the people of BC could be put through that. That was my thinking in 2001. It's my thinking today. My thinking is shaped by my absolute understanding that free collective bargaining has worked around the world for a long, long time. The best way to resolve this dispute is to have the parties mindful that the people that they serve as desperate to have that service. Let's find a way forward at the table. I'm confident they'll be able to do that.

Reporter: In the House today, Andrew Wilkinson, I heard him heckling at one point, saying you guys don't want to do anything bad to your buddies. He just said to me in the hallways, suggested maybe this government is very close to the union movement and you're taking orders from the unions. How would you respond to that?

Horgan: It's difficult to respond to questions from the leader of the opposition. Again, I take no lessons from BC Liberals whose finest hour when it comes to labour relations was ripping up collective agreements, and to oversee a four-month strike in transit in the Lower Mainland.

I appreciate Mr Wilkinson and the challenge of being a leader of the opposition. It's not easy work. He's got nothing to offer on this question, quite frankly, and I'm hopeful that the parties, the people that really matter in this instance, the employer and the drivers and the union, are going to get this done. That's my fervent hope and I'm going to encourage them throughout the weekend to get it done.

Reporter: Hello, Premier. There's a private member's bill sitting on the order paper at the moment, introduced by Andrew Weaver, that would ban conversion therapy in BC. People who are advocating it say that, despite the fact that the Health minister and the MLA for Vancouver-West End have said it would basically be a symbolic move. Conversation therapy is already not funded here in BC. Advocates are saying that it would be a significant gesture by the government to pass that legislation. The federal government is now indicating that they may take that step themselves. Would BC be interested in being first on that issue?

Horgan: I'll await action by the federal action. I have to confess I've heard about action on a range of fronts over the years, so we'll wait and see on that. On the substance of the question, Shannon, I believe that the Minister of Health is correct, as is my colleague Spencer Chandra Herbert, that that would be largely symbolic because it's not something that we fund in BC.

Should that become a more divisive public issue, then we would certainly intervene. I think at this point in time -- and I spoke with Andrew Weaver about this very thing yesterday in our weekly meeting. He's not clamouring for immediate action. He understands that we wanted -- he wanted to have a statement by all members that they were opposed to this type of activity.

My view and the view of the Minister of Health is the correct one. This is not something that's funded. Let's move on to other more substantial issues.

Reporter: Symbolism can be a powerful thing, though. Yesterday, we stood on the lawn of the Legislature and watched the trans flag be raised for the first time. That's a symbolic gesture in a lot of ways. What's the difference between doing something like that to signal sort of support for a community, and passing a piece of relatively simple legislation?

Horgan: Well, nothing's simple in the Legislature. You will know that there are members of the Legislature, not in my party, but in the other major party, who have a different point of view on that. So that symbolism would in essence become divisive and my attempts from the beginning, largely because of the circumstances I found myself in -- a minority situation -- but I think despite evidence to the contrary, perhaps, before 2017, my role and my approach to things is to try and find a way forward that meets everyone's needs. So rather than be symbolic and create division within my opponents' ranks, why not have a categorical statement from the Minister of Health saying that's not going to happen here. I think that's sufficient as a symbol and rather than create discontent within the opposition. They have the challenge here. We don't. We stand with those who reject this type of therapy or this approach to people's orientation and so I think that's a sufficient symbolic statement by the leader of the government.

I don't want to -- you can go and ask the Liberals how they feel about it and you'll get the answer as to why I wouldn't want to introduce legislation. I don't believe that's helpful.

Reporter: You ticked another box this week from the throne speech when you assigned Bob D'Eith to the mobile phones file, to go to talk to Ottawa about that. Your powers in that respect are limited and there are other aspects of the throne speech that you haven't moved upon. Specifically the [inaudible] commissioner, ombudsperson, and most importantly the information privacy commissioner all lobbied for there to be new accountability and transparency measures at the Legislature [inaudible] including adding the Legislature to the information privacy laws. You've got four days left next week in the session. Why is it taking so long to get those measures enacted?

Horgan: Going back to the first part of your question, Bob, the piece around cell phones, cell phone bills are fundamental to just about every (audio dropout) whether they're young or old and the federal parties, during the last election campaign, all made passing reference to doing something about that. We've done a consultation -- you've seen that. Bob D'Eith has been tasked by me to be

the liaison with Ottawa to make sure that we get progress, not just lip service during an election campaign.

When it comes to the more substantive issues about independent officers of the Legislature, we're continuing to work on all of those issues. We've had, as you know and have covered, some challenges when it comes to the LAMC. I think it's a year since we had what can only be described as an extraordinary day here at the Legislature. So with that backdrop the challenges of coming to a place where all members of the Legislature are comfortable with changes we'd make to the role and function of independent officers is a work in progress.

Reporter: What do you say to voters or members of your own party who'll be meeting this weekend after you ran on the promise in 2017 to reform the very antiquated information and privacy laws, not just improving transparency, but also the controls and privacy of recording any data leaks, for instance? You haven't moved upon that. You haven't moved upon what was in the throne speech this year. Does it not get to a point where the public starts to wonder and why should they believe politicians who do promise transparency -- when they get into office they don't deliver?

Horgan: I think that the vast majority of the public are more interested in transparency when it comes to gas prices and cell phone billing than they are about independent officers of the Legislature and that's meaning no disrespect to the independent officers, but I encourage you, Bob, to do some street (audio dropout) outside of Victoria and ask people if they even know those offices exist.

I'm focusing on the things that matter to people. We've been here two years. We've addressed almost 80% of the commitments we made. We've got another two years left on the mandate so be patient and we'll clean up that last 20%.

Reporter: [inaudible]

Horgan: Whenever there's a labour dispute it has an impact on the public, particularly when it's something -- a public service like transit. And that's why I've encouraged the parties -- I appreciate I'm a broken record on this -- but timing is everything when there's a labour dispute in play and I believe the time right now is for free collective bargaining to run its course. The weekend is available to the parties, into next week, and I'm confident that if they roll up their sleeves they can get a freely bargained agreement that will meet the needs of the employer, employees, and most importantly the people that depend on public transit.

Reporter: [inaudible]

Horgan: I agree with your statement, but I also believe that free collective bargaining is the best way forward. It has served not just BCers and Canadians, but people around the world for a long, long time and that's cold comfort when you reflect on how you're going to get around should there be [inaudible]. That's not the case today so we're focusing on making sure the parties are talking about where they can find a way forward and that's my focus right now.

Reporter: I just wanted to get your thoughts on Ed John who was just here a few weeks ago being charged with sexual assault.

Horgan: I don't know the substance of the allegations. I know they're serious and I certainly believe that law enforcement would have taken appropriate steps and that Mr John has been made -- accusations have been made. He'll get representation and they'll be discussed in a court of law and justice will prevail.

Reporter: Along the same lines, sexual assault supporters point out that when it comes to [inaudible] supports outside of the justice system there are very few teams around BC. The Victoria Sexual Assault Centre has to apply for funding each year to try and get that support in place, and wondering does your government and how you're approaching that and the patchwork of funding - is there any thought to perhaps give permanent funding to groups like that?

Horgan: I remember Vaughn writing a column about me walking a mile in women's shoes as I clip-clopped down (audio dropout) corridors to raise money for the Victoria Sexual Assault Centre, and it has been a philanthropic exercise, largely, and grant driven. Our ministers -- half are women, half are men -- my caucus -- half women, half men -- raise these issues all the time and we're looking at ways to institutionalize supports. One way is having more transition housing so that women who are fleeing sexual violence in the home, domestic sexual violence, or otherwise, have a place to go.

Those are institutional solutions to some of the challenges. But there's much, much more work to do and we're committed to this -- my colleagues, men and women.

Reporter: There's been a young Guatemalen in BC this last week talking about a mine in his community that's owned by a Vancouver company -- Pan American Silver. Essentially he says the company doesn't respect his community's right to say no and I'm wondering if you think they should have a right to say no or if they do under international agreements and what role there might for the province in regulating what a BC company does elsewhere.

Horgan: I have no knowledge of that file, Andrew. You want to have another -- I can't even offer up a surmise. So perhaps I could get back to you on that and you can ask another question because I honestly don't know what the issue is. I don't want to speculate without more facts.

Reporter: I think it was more that principle around the discussion we've had with UNDRIP about consultation, free, prior, and informed consent, and does that include a right to say no.

Horgan: I will say that what we're doing in BC is we've introduced and are debating the (audio dropout) bill to provide clarity on the landbase for investors and also to ensure that the stack of case law that will go almost to the ceiling in this room is adhered to. Right and title exist. How do we work to ensure that everyone benefits from economic activity in BC? Outside of BC companies that are located in BC, what they do, again, I'll leave that to other jurisdictions. I'm sorry I can't be more focused on it.

But the principles that are embedded in the UN declaration are being adopted here in BC. That, I guess, is my answer to the question. [sss, zpz, pjjh, lbrr, tran, translink, mjag, mcfd, ctz, maz, fin]

From: Bob Mackin <bob@thebreaker.news>
Sent: Thursday, November 21, 2019 3:39 PM
To: Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX <Jen.Holmwood@gov.bc.ca>
Subject: media request

Hi,

I had a minor technical problem and not all the recording of the Premier's news conference captured. Could you please send me the audio file? WAV would be best, thanks.

—bob

--

Read [theBreaker.news](#)

[Listen to the theBreaker.news Podcast](#)

[Subscribe to the newsletter](#)

--

Read [theBreaker.news](#)

[Listen to the theBreaker.news Podcast](#)

[Subscribe to the newsletter](#)

OOP FOI PREM:EX

From: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Sent: November 11, 2019 5:18 PM
To: Brown, Evan PREM:EX; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX
Subject: RE: refreshed note on gas prices
Attachments: Wilkinson backs gas companies.docx

He should also get this caucus release as an FYI. To go tomorrow at 9 am.

Sage
778-678-0832

From: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Sent: November 11, 2019 4:04 PM
To: Brown, Evan PREM:EX ; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX
Subject: refreshed note on gas prices

Hi both,
Refreshed the message note on gas prices following Friday's conversation with PJH. Attached here.

Sage Aaron, Communications Director
Office of the Premier | Government of BC
501 Belleville St, Victoria, BC V8V 2L8 | 778-678-0832

712,122 reasons why Andrew Wilkinson opposes inquiry into gas price gouging

Copyright

--

OOP FOI PREM:EX

From: Aaron, Sage PREM:EX
Sent: November 11, 2019 4:04 PM
To: Brown, Evan PREM:EX; Holmwood, Jen PREM:EX
Subject: refreshed note on gas prices
Attachments: Gas Prices Note.docx

Hi both,

Refreshed the message note on gas prices following Friday's conversation with PJH. Attached here.

Sage Aaron, Communications Director
Office of the Premier | Government of BC
501 Belleville St, Victoria, BC V8V 2L8 | 778-678-0832

Gas Prices

Background:

- In its supplementary report on gasoline and diesel prices, the B.C. Utilities Commission reconfirmed that there's as much as 13 cents per liter in costs unexplained by any factor within the wholesale gasoline market.
- The unexplained 13 cents per litre results in almost \$490 million/year for drivers in B.C.
- The Commission also highlighted its finding that 95% of the total gasoline in B.C. receive significant price markups, this is in addition to the 13-cent premium.
- These additional markups are due to the practice of oil companies setting their wholesale prices based upon the most expensive product sold in B.C.
- Andrew Wilkinson has opposed the BCUC review and any attempt to increase transparency into gas prices, instead accusing the Premier of "making up these demons that they like to invent in the NDP. Some bad guys are causing this." (CKNW, April 25, 2019)
- Wilkinson has also been pushing to slash motor fuel taxes, a plan that UBC Professor Werner Antweiler says "would boost the profits of the oil companies and it would do absolutely nothing for consumers." (CBC, April 26, 2019)
- From 2005 to 2017, the BC Liberals received over \$700,000 in political donations from major oil and gas companies. (Suncor: \$48,189, Chevron: \$180,443, Imperial Oil \$134,790, Super Save Gas \$348,700)

Key Message:

- People feel like they're being ripped off when they fill up at the gas station. And once again the BC Utilities Commission has said they are right.
- The BCUC confirmed that as much as 13 cents per litre cannot be explained by normal market forces, resulting in about \$490 million/year in additional costs for drivers.
- The Commission also found that the vast majority of gasoline is significantly marked up – that's in addition to the unexplained 13-cent premium.
- s.13
- The only plan Mr. Wilkinson has put forward is one that would reward oil and gas companies with a subsidy worth millions of dollars and do nothing for consumers.
- We are ready to stand up to the big oil and gas companies
- It's time drivers in British Columbia started to see some transparency and fairness when it comes to gas prices, because people are tired of being ripped off.

From: s.22

Sent: November 3, 2019 11:35 PM

To: OfficeofthePremier, Office PREM:EX

Subject: Re: **EMAIL CONFIRMATION / RECEIPT - From John Horgan, MLA,Langford-Juan de Fuca CONSTITUENCY OFFICE

s.22

Sent from my iPhone

On Oct 30, 2019, at 14:22, s.22 wrote:

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: Horgan.MLA, John

Sent: October 30, 2019 2:18 PM

To: s.22

Subject: **EMAIL CONFIRMATION / RECEIPT - From John Horgan, MLA,Langford-Juan de Fuca CONSTITUENCY OFFICE

MLA Constituency Office hours - Monday thru Friday - 10 am to 4 pm

EMAIL CONFIRMATION / RECEIPT (this is not a response to your email) - From John Horgan, MLA, Langford-Juan de Fuca CONSTITUENCY OFFICE - for my office to contact you, please provide a daytime phone number and your address.

Dear Langford-Juan de Fuca Riding Constituents - Thank you for taking the time to write to my community office in Langford. My office staff (Hans, Lynn, Sheldon or Maureen) will be pleased to assist you with your questions and/or concerns that pertain to a British Columbia provincial government ministry or agency. Please ensure your email included your full name, mailing address, postal code, telephone number and the particulars about your situation. If it doesn't, please resend that information and my staff will follow up with you. If your matter is time-sensitive, please contact my office at 250-391-2801. While all emails to my office are reviewed, due to the extremely high volume, I may not be able to respond to you personally.

If you are a LJF constituent and have provided your day-time contact information and postal code you have not heard from my office within three (3) business days, please call direct to 250-391-2801. Thank you!

If you are writing to me as the Premier of British Columbia, and do not reside in the riding of

Langford-Juan de Fuca, my office will not be able to respond to you, please redirect your email to: Premier John Horgan or Premier@gov.bc.ca. To reach my office at the Victoria Legislature, please call 1-250-387-1715 or by mail please direct to Premier John Horgan, Province of British Columbia, West Annex Parliament Buildings, Victoria, BC V8V 1X4.

To contact your local Member of the Legislature (MLA) using your postal code via the MLA finder website ([Click Here](#)).

If your issue falls under the federal government and it would be your federal Member of Parliament (MP) who would be able to best address this issue on your behalf. You can locate your MP by clicking on the following link and putting in your postal code:

<http://www.ourcommons.ca/Parliamentarians/en/members>

IMPORTANT PRIVACY NOTE - If your email requires my constituency office staff to seek assistance or general information from other provincial government offices/ministries, we will reach out to them on your behalf. If you have **PERSONAL CONCERNS** about your privacy, please contact our office immediately with instructions.

Due to the extremely high day to day volume of emails received, my MLA office is unable to respond to emails without daytime phone numbers and addresses. Also, my MLA office can't reply to emails with multiple email addresses or are forwarded to/from multiple writers.

Thank you again for your email, and for taking the time to share your ideas, concerns and insights with me.

Sincerely,
John

John Horgan, MLA
Langford-Juan de Fuca
122 - 2806 Jacklin Road
Langford, BC V9B 5A4
250-391-2801

****Except for Staff and STAT Holidays - My MLA Constituency Office is open Monday thru Friday - 10 am to 4 pm****