



## **Intersection Safety Camera Project 2018**

ICBC – Redflex Negotiation Term Sheet v1.0

### **A. Negotiation Timeline**

s.13,s.14,s.17

### **B. ICBC Negotiation Team**

Road Safety – Jocelyn Purcell

Strategic Sourcing – Martina Lee

Legal Counsel – Janine Jones and Karam Bayrakal

Project Manager – Colin Meyer

Page 02 to/à Page 24

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.14;s.13;s.17

Page 25 to/à Page 29

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.16;s.13;s.17

Page 30 to/à Page 33

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.12;s.15;s.13;s.17

Page 34 to/à Page 42

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.12;s.13;s.17

**A list of individuals currently and previously responsible for developing speed enforcement policy. (Date Range for Record Search: From 08/01/2017 To 07/26/2018).**

s.22

- Patrick Glanc
- Fran Sasvari

This individual is no longer employed with RoadSafetyBC.

**A list of all research conducted and considered concerning the enforcement of speed, speed enforcement policy, or both. (Date Range for Record Search: From 08/01/2017 To 07/26/2018).**

- Speed cameras for the prevention of road traffic injuries and deaths (Authors: Wilson C, Willis C, Hendrikz JK, Le Brocque R, Bellamy N)
- Determining Public Support for an Automated Speed Enforcement Program in British Columbia (Authors: BC Injury Research and Prevention Unit)
- Effects of average speed enforcement on speed compliance and crashes: a review of the literature (Soole, Watson, Fleiter), 2013
- Automatic section speed control evaluation report (Directorate of Public Roads, Norway), 2010
- A concise impact assessment of average speed control (Transportation and Mobility Leuven), 2014
- The effectiveness of average speed cameras in Great Britain (RAC Foundation), 2016
- Section Control: towards a more efficient and better accepted enforcement of speed limits? (ETSC factsheet)
- SECTION CONTROL – AUTOMATIC SPEED ENFORCEMENT IN THE KAISERMÜHLEN TUNNEL (VIENNA, A22 MOTORWAY), 2006
- PHO: Where the Rubber Meets the Road – Reducing the Impact of Motor Vehicle Crashes on Health and Well-being in BC
- EY: ICBC – Affordable and effective auto insurance – a new road forward for British Columbia
- International Transport Forum: Speed and Crash Risk (International Traffic Safety Data and Analysis Group, 2018)

**MINISTRY OF PUBLIC SAFETY AND SOLICITOR GENERAL  
POLICING AND SECURITY BRANCH  
BRIEFING NOTE**

**PURPOSE:** For DECISION, for the Honourable Mike Farnworth, Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, and the Honorable David Eby, Attorney General

**ISSUE:** Expansion of BC's Intersection Safety Camera (ISC) program, including:

1. increasing enforcement activation rate from current 25% to 50%, with the objective of reaching full activation (100%) within one year;
2. s.13
3. conducting analysis from ISC program data to assess levels, locations while identifying issues and opportunities associated with using ISC infrastructure to engage stakeholders and the public on 'speed on green' automated enforcement.

**SUMMARY:**

- On July 24, 2017 the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (ICBC) made public the report by Ernst and Young entitled ICBC: *Affordable and effective auto insurance – A new road forward for British Columbia*.
- The recommendations for solutions included a focus on the need for increasing the effectiveness of BC's overall road safety approach. The report notes that a systemic approach is required to enable sustainable change through the alignment of the three road safety pillars: education, enforcement and engineering.
- One of the road safety interventions identified as an opportunity for increased public safety with the potential to deliver greater benefits to ICBC was BC's Intersection Safety Camera Program, delivered in partnership between the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General (PSSG), the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (ICBC) and the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP).
- BC's ISC program is designed to reduce motor vehicle crashes at intersections and subsequent injuries and fatalities by identifying and penalizing aggressive drivers who disobey red lights. The Ernst and Young report recommended increasing the ISC's current activation rate to 100% and doubling new cameras in order to increase the effectiveness of this road safety initiative and reduce crash rates by changing high-risk driver behaviours, resulting in a material annual net benefit to ICBC. s.13

s.13

s.13

The report also identified an opportunity to explore using the ISC for 'speed on green' automated speed enforcement.

**BACKGROUND:**

- In 1999, British Columbia implemented the ISC program to reduce motor vehicle crashes at intersections and the subsequent injuries and fatalities.

- ICBC reports that 60% of all motor vehicle crashes occur at intersections. In 2011, the ISC program was upgraded and expanded from 120 sites with 30 film cameras rotating among 120 locations, to 140 sites with a dedicated digital camera installed at each of the identified high-risk intersections in 26 communities across BC.
- All ISC existing and new sites were selected based on extensive data analysis of 1,400 intersections, to identify intersections where red light running incidents were most frequent and resulted in serious crashes, and where the road safety benefit would be most effective. The cameras are currently set at 25% (enforcement) activation of six hours/day on a rotating schedule. The 2011 upgrade capital costs and expansion totalled \$22.2 million. ISC locations have not changed since 2011.
- When a person runs a red-light, images from the ISC are securely and remotely transmitted to the ISC processing centre. The processing centre is resourced by: ICBC ticket processing staff; one RCMP civilian member; plus PSB employees, including one Supervisor and six Intersection Safety Camera Officers who are BCGEU members and responsible for the enforcement and prosecution functions associated with red-light running violation tickets.
- The ISC program issues Registered Owner violation tickets that carry no demerit points. In 2016, 34,739 ISC violation tickets were mailed.
- ISC program costs are funded directly from Basic insurance premiums. In 2015, ISC program operating and capital costs were \$3.6 million, including those program elements funded under the *Traffic and Road Safety Law Enforcement Funding Memorandum of Understanding* (MOU).
- The *Motor Vehicle Act* (MVA) provides the legislative authority for the ISC program, while Schedule 3 of the Violation Ticket Administration and Fines Regulation (VTAFR) provides the authority for enforcement. All ticket fine revenue collected by ICBC is remitted to government, who, under the Traffic Fine Revenue Sharing Agreement (TFRSA) distributes net revenue to municipalities. In 2016, ISC ticket fine revenue was approximately \$4 million.
- Studies from ICBC indicate that the ISC program continues to be effective at reducing crashes. A 'new sites' evaluation of the 2011 program expansion found that the expansion contributed to a 5% reduction in severe crashes, a 3% overall crash reduction, and a net annual claims savings of \$2.3 million in 2015. ICBC's 2016 *Road Safety Tracking Study* found that 94% of motorists in BC are aware that intersection cameras exist and 81% support the program; however, only 9% acknowledged ever receiving a red light camera violation ticket.
- Although the cameras are currently set at 25% activation<sup>s.15</sup>  
s.15 According to ICBC's 2015 Activation Level study, an activation level of 25% results in lower operating costs while offering a similar deterrence level as full time activation.
- s.15

s.15 BC's ISC program is the only known red light camera program to operate at less than 100% full activation.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

- A joint inter-ministerial working group is scoping and assessing the road safety considerations. This note summarizes the issues and opportunities associated with implementing the three areas of ISC operations identified in the Ernst and Young Report to optimize this proven and well-supported road safety program.

#### **Full 'Enforcement Mode' Activation of the Current 140 ISC camera sites:**

- Full activation would involve increasing the ISC program's current activation level to 100% activation (up from 25%) for all current 140 cameras. Activation rates would be doubled (from 25% to 50%) within six months of approval/direction to proceed, with full activation (100%) targeted for 12 months following the 'go forward' date.
- Under the Roles and Responsibilities document created in 2011, PSSG and the RCMP are to be involved in all aspects of site selection, technical considerations, legal model review, and public awareness and information planning.
- Increasing activation from 25% to 100% will substantially increase ICBC's operating and capital costs s.13 ICBC notes that it will need to justify its Road Safety investments to its regulator, showing where possible, how these investments benefit basic insurance policy holders.

s.13,s.16,s.17

- 
- This proposal is estimated to increase violation ticket outputs from 32,000 to approximately 64,000-128,000 annually. It is important to note that as increased activation is phased in, workload impacts for ICBC, PSB and RCMP staff and processing turn-around times would need to be closely monitored and assessed for resource capacity implications.
- The increase in violation tickets as a result of ISC program expansion is also likely to increase pressure on the court system to manage additional disputes. The current payment rates for ISC violation tickets is 90% with a dispute rate of only 5%, which is lower than other traffic violation tickets. Court impacts may be mitigated by the future inclusion of ISC violation tickets in online payment efforts through PayBC. There is no immediate timeline for implementation of this approach therefore the impacts to the courts would be consistent with the timing of increased activation.

s.13

•

s.13 The potential annual fine revenue ranges widely due to the challenge of predicting changes in driver behaviour as a result of increased enforcement. Benefits from

expansion are also dependent upon the volume of drivers and changing crash risks at any of the ISC sites.

- Preliminary costs and revenue implications are also provided in Appendix A. A more detailed analysis of fiscal impacts/net benefits will be developed. <sup>s.13</sup>

- 

**Pros:**  
<sup>s.13</sup>

**Cons:**  
<sup>s.13</sup>

**Next Steps:**

- ICBC to develop a detailed business case and project plan within 60 days from receiving approval to proceed, in consultation with PSSG and AG staff.

s.13

s.13

**Analysis to enhance ISC infrastructure through ‘speed on green’ automated enforcement:**

- Speed is the leading cause of death on BC’s roads, and is a significant contributing factor in the number and severity of the injuries that result from crashes. Eighty-nine people were killed in 2015 in speed-related crashes in the province. This represents approximately one third of all road fatalities.

s.13

- A preliminary analysis of the speed data collected by intersection safety cameras in B.C. between 2011 and 2016 shows a minimum of 400,000 excessive speeding incidents (exceeding the posted speed limit by a min of 40 km/h) at B.C.’s ISCs each year.
- s.13  
s.13 A more-detailed analysis to better understand speeding behaviours at high-risk ISC locations is underway.
- Evaluations of automated speed enforcement implementations stress the importance of engaging stakeholders in the development and implementation of automated speed enforcement programs. Public information and outreach should make citizens more aware of the safety consequences of the violation, explain program objectives and results, and provide advanced warning that there will be increased enforcement.

s.13

s.13

**Next steps**

- ICBC to continue analysis of speeding behaviours at ISC locations. This analysis will assist the program partners with development and cost/benefit analysis.
- ICBC to develop comprehensive project plan with PSSG and AG including timelines for analysis and consultation.
- Policy analysis including regulatory changes to be undertaken.
- Subject to approvals, stakeholder and public engagement.

s.13

**OTHER MINISTRIES IMPACTED/CONSULTED:**

- ICBC
- Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing (pending)
- BC Prosecution Service (pending)
- Court Services (pending)
- Police (pending)

**Full 'Enforcement Mode' Activation of the Current 140 ISC camera sites:**

**DECISION APPROVED / NOT APPROVED**

**DATE:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Minister Mike Farnworth

\_\_\_\_\_  
Minister David Eby

s.13

**DECISION APPROVED / NOT APPROVED**

**DATE:**

---

Minister Mike Farnworth

---

Minister David Eby

**Prepared By:**

Jan Staples, Director  
Road Safety Unit  
Police Services Division  
604 775-2108

**Approved September 1, 2017 by:**

Clayton Pecknold  
Assistant Deputy Minister  
and Director of Police Services  
Policing and Security Branch  
250 387-1100

**Reviewed by:**

Sandra Sajko  
Executive Director  
and Deputy Director of Police Services  
Policing and Security Branch  
250 387-1387

**Approved September 1, 2017 via email by:**

Sauna Brouwer  
Assistant Deputy Minister  
Corporate Management Services Branch  
Ministry of Attorney General  
250 387-5258

**Reviewed by:**

Jerome Atherton  
Manager, Road Safety Programs (ICBC)

Attachments: Appendix A - Preliminary Costs and Revenue Estimates Level

Page 09

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.13;s.17

Page 10 to/à Page 11

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.12;s.13;s.17

Page 12 to/à Page 20

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.12;s.13

Page 01 to/à Page 14

Withheld pursuant to/removed as

s.13