

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Monday, October 26, 2015 11:05 PM
To: Mills, Shane LASS:EX
Cc: Sauder, Kit TRAN:EX
Subject: HWY 16

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Shane - let me know if this covers you off. jb

- I want to acknowledge the history and the pain that the families of the victims along Highway 16 have suffered.
- I cannot overstate the sincerity of this government and the commitment of the Ministry of Transportation specifically to do everything possible to find further solutions that will make Highway 16 safer.
- This is why we've worked so hard to identify practical, affordable and sustainable transportation solutions with First Nations and Local Government partners.
- Government has already invested overall in new services to address the challenges. To date, this includes:
 - o Since 2009, new cellular coverage – 200 kilometers – to Highway 16 = 70% of highway.
 - o \$100,000 civil forfeiture grant to Prince George New Hope Society drop-in centre to help women and youth stay safe.
 - o B.C. transit services = \$1.5 million per year for local bus service throughout the corridor:
 - Smithers and Telkwa;
 - the Hazeltons and both Smithers and Kispiox;
 - Terrace and Kitimat; and
 - Prince Rupert and Port Edward;
 - o Northern Health operates a round trip subsidized shuttle service for British Columbians in the region who have medical appointments outside their communities. (Govt funds it at over \$2m/year)
 - o New web portal that consolidates existing transportation options.
 - o \$75,000 to Carrier Sekani Family Services for driver education, safe driver, and driver licensing programs for First Nations
- Work continues which is why we are partnering with the First Nations Health Authority, hosting a transportation symposium on November 24th in Smithers, with local governments and the 23 First Nation communities along the Hwy 16 corridor to support this work.

- There isn't an easy fix for transportation services in the region. (distance between Prince George and Prince Rupert is 718 km, 8 hour drive – that's further than from Vancouver to Revelstoke or Nelson).
- However, we are going to continue to work hard with First Nations and communities to do all we can to make Highway 16 safer for all.

Sent from my mobile device.

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 1:22 PM
To: Stone, Todd TRAN:EX
Subject: FYI: OIPC Media Responses

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Minister – heads up on the below two media requests that Rob Shaw has put in. The first relates to the indemnity and will be provided by Finance and the second relates to the recommendations in the OIPC report. This one will be provided by MTICS.

Jordan

Date/Time: 23/October/8:45

Deadline @ **ASAP**

Media: Vancouver Sun

Reporter: Rob Shaw, rshaw@vancouversun.com,^{s.21}

Topic: Indemnity

Background: The reporter is following up on yesterday's release of the OIPC report. The reporter has a number of questions related to indemnity of former Employee George Gretes. FIN will provide JAG with a response to question 1.

Questions:

George Gretes resigned. However, he has been paid for the past five months on suspension with pay, because he told the government he didn't delete the emails. Then, he later admitted he did. So, is government intended to use legal means to recover the salary he obtained by lying?

An employer can't retroactively go back and take away an employee's pay.

When allegations of wrongdoing are brought forward, we respect due process for the person against whom allegations are made.

In this case, government opted to suspend him with pay at the time, as we did not have a clear picture of the facts until the Denham report was released.

Had the government prior to Gretes resignation agreed to any indemnification of legal fees? And if so, why? Now that he's resigned, has the government agreed to any indemnification?

Indemnity coverage is provided following advice from senior legal officials in government (specifically, the Assistant Deputy Attorney General of Legal Services Branch). There is no political involvement in these decisions.

Indemnity is a personnel matter and subject to solicitor client privilege, and as such, we are unable to discuss the provision of indemnities for any individuals.

Indemnification is available to employees in certain kinds of legal proceedings. That includes employees who may be subject to criminal proceedings.

If it is determined that an individual has committed wrongdoing – for example found guilty in court of an offence, there are provisions in the regulation for the repayment of the legal fees.

Deadline @ 2:30pm

Media: Vancouver Sun

Reporter: Rob Shaw,^{s.21} rshaw@vancouver.sun.com

Topic: OIPC Report – Triple Delete Function

Background: Reporter seeking responses to the questions below as a follow-up to the OIPC's report issued yesterday.

Suggested Response:

Does government intend to end the practice of triple-deleting by, as Denham recommended, barring employees from access to the 'recover' folder in their email program? And if so, when will this change be implemented?

Does government intend to change the automatic delete time of the the recover folder to 30 days before it is automatically emptied, thereby allowing the monthly government backup system to backup the contents of the recovery folder? And if so, when will this change be implemented?

We will require more time to review these recommendations. As per the direction of the Premier, David Loukidelis, the former Information and Privacy Commissioner of British Columbia, has agreed to advise government on how to address the recommendations. Mr. Loukidelis will also provide advice and direction on how we can enhance Freedom of Information training for staff.

Does the government agree with Commissioner Denham's description of triple-delete, in that if it is done quickly enough it can permanently erase an email from the government system before it can be backed up by monthly government backup procedures? Or, is there another way government technicians have found to recover emails that are triple-deleted even if they aren't backed up? I've had some computer people email me to say that hard drives could in fact be analyzed and emails recovered using other forensic techniques on individual computers.

With the government's current configuration, it is possible that an email could be deleted prior to being captured by regularly scheduled backups. It may be possible to recover some emails in some instances from individual computers using forensic techniques however, this must be done in a timely manner following deletion of the email and would only be considered, if deemed necessary.

What other technological solutions is government exploring to prevent people from deleting their emails?

We look forward to the recommendations and advice that comes from David Loukidelis, who has agreed to advise government on how to address the recommendations. Mr. Loukidelis will also provide advice and direction on how we can enhance Freedom of Information training for staff.

To clarify part of the commissioner's report, is it government's understanding that the emails that were triple-deleted by Mr. Gretes have not been recovered and can't be recovered? They are permanently erased? They didn't show up in any other FOIs, or on any other computers, or anywhere else – they are gone? And does the ministry know what those records were, contained, or involved?

Government does not have conclusive evidence that emails were triple-deleted by Mr. Gretes. The emails were not retained as per regular backup schedules due to a misconfiguration during an infrastructure upgrade. It should be noted that government has already taken steps to improve all data migrations. The Ministry of Technology, Innovation and Citizens' Services has directed the service provider to conduct daily backups during data migrations and to ensure there is a monitoring function in place. Government has taken all reasonable steps to recover the emails in question but has been unable to do so. As such it's unlikely the emails in question will ever be recovered.

Why did the ability for staff to access their recover deleted email folder exist in the first place? For what purpose did government expect staff would want to access that folder?

It's a standard function provided by Microsoft and allows a person to recover an email that they may have inadvertently deleted, without needing to contact the help desk.

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 12:56 PM
To: Doyle, Dan PREM:EX
Subject: RE: Memo from Premier Clark

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Dan,

I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it.

Jordan

From: Doyle, Dan PREM:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 10:59 AM
To: LP Chief of Staff; LP Ministerial Assistants; LP Executive Assistants
Subject: Memo from Premier Clark

Good morning everyone,

Please see the attached memo from the Premier. Please confirm that you have received it by replying the following to me in an e-mail:

"I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it."

Let me know if you have any questions. Thank you for your attention to this matter,

Dan Doyle
Chief of Staff to Premier Christy Clark

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 11:48 AM
To: Stone, Todd TRAN:EX
Subject: PCC Summary

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

PCC avail summary

Michelle resign? Different. Clear in her view re: Gretes. She offered recs. we've been doing that way for long time. Her interpretation is different. We need to satisfy citizens expectations.

Triple delete?

I don't know how. Led me to ask. I don't govern by email but rather meetings. All political staff and ministers none of them delete any emails they have sent starting today. Da Id to go thru practice and fb we have to make changes then all those emails from today on and we can then dispose or keep appropriately.

Not much has changed over a decade. Report is everyone had different practice. Act covers disposal. Different people have done that differently.

Expand on not deleting anymore - everyone have to keep all emails or do they delete transitory?

All ministry staff to retain all emails they send. We have duty to dispose but while we wait for David to complete his report then all info is retained and then how we meet the expectations then we can dispose what we can dispose.

2011 - videos and statements about open data. Then just a few moments ago you said you haven't changed in decade?

We answered more FOI requests than AB SK and MN combined. Well over 40k answered. Interpretation of Act has been applied differently according to individuals. We need consistency.

Talking to Duncan - rampant disregard by staff..Denham confirms that? She says that hasn't been applied consistently. Public expects this info is consistently retained if necessary. I want to make sure it is done consistently. David will come in and do this. Commissioner welcomes him coming in.

Why need David?

She said we need consistency across govt. we need consistent training and understanding.

You are on emails - I've never seen any of you emails in fois?
I don't send a ton of email. I meet and talk. Decisions I make are made in cab meetings and that is evident to public- all is recorded and released (as allowed). I don't govern by email. I govern face to face and do everything we can to record that.

Sent from my mobile device.

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 11:13 AM
To: Stone, Todd TRAN:EX
Subject: FW: Memo from Premier Clark
Attachments: 2015 10 23 Memo.pdf

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

FYI.

From: Doyle, Dan PREM:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 10:59 AM
To: LP Chief of Staff; LP Ministerial Assistants; LP Executive Assistants
Subject: Memo from Premier Clark

Good morning everyone,

Please see the attached memo from the Premier. Please confirm that you have received it by replying the following to me in an e-mail:

"I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it."

Let me know if you have any questions. Thank you for your attention to this matter,

Dan Doyle
Chief of Staff to Premier Christy Clark

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Thursday, October 22, 2015 2:44 PM
To: Stone, Todd TRAN:EX
Subject: FOR APPROVAL - Media Request - CKPG Prince George - Hwy 16 transportation options

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Minister -

CKPG Radio is looking for comment from you on transportation options on Highway 16 – not the report. She's looking for identical information Vancouver Sun was looking for yesterday. They're looking for an interview but I'm wondering if you want to provide the below statement. Please let me know.

Jordan

Minister Request Y/N: Yes, requesting MTS for interview

Topic: OIPC report

Reporter/ Contact: Victoria Levy 250-563-0111

Outlet: CKPG Prince George

Date/ Time received: 9:30 am – Thursday, October 22

Deadline: asap to know

Reporter's Request: requesting MTS comment. Provide background if MTS not available.

Proposed response:

The ministry continues to have discussions with the municipalities, partners and local stakeholders to explore all suggestions and options for a practical, affordable and sustainable transportation solution for the Highway 16 corridor. We've already been told by community representatives that long-distance bus service is unsustainable and doesn't meet the local everyday needs of communities, such as going shopping, to the bank, appointments and attending local community events.

This is a large geographical region and a "one-size fits all" approach like a shuttle bus won't address the transportation challenges these communities face. We've looked at shuttle services from an operational perspective and don't believe this is an effective option because of the significant distance between communities and the number of communities in the region.

We are open to any ideas for solving these challenges, based on the needs of each local community along the Highway 16 corridor. That's why the ministry and the First Nations Health Authority are hosting a transportation symposium on November 24 to hear from the 23 First Nations communities along the corridor, as well as regional district representatives and other organizations. The discussion will focus on finding practical, affordable and sustainable transportation options to address both medical and non-medical travel along the corridor and ultimately, to develop a vision for a community-based transportation model that is supported by First Nations and neighbouring communities.

Please click here for more information on the symposium: <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2015TRAN0140-001701>

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Thursday, October 22, 2015 12:12 PM
To: Stone, Todd TRAN:EX
Subject: Horgan scrum summary

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Horgan scrum summary

When govt denied and deleted and deleted in May we had premier say she would take action.

We know her deputy has not one single email.

Denman has done good work to expose culture of deception and deletion.

Response was pathetic.

Resignation vs firing?

See what RCMP will do with him. This isn't first time and won't be last time. They want us to believe this is a one time. Staff hired by chief of staff to premier. Duncan said when he exposed it was win at any cost. Public is secondary to clinging to power.

Thank goodness we have independent officers to hold accountable. We tried via FOI to demonstrate how deceitful.

Premier not present to answer to this.

What is undermined when emails disappear?

NDP brought in the FOI act - to expose rationale to decision making. This govt has taken to a fine art - delete delete delete. Public doesn't have understanding on what government is doing.

Triple delete - no good reason to do it - tran said he knows and he does that?

How do you square that with most open transparent government. PCC has delivered triple delete. deputy doesn't have one record.

How do you learn to triple delete??

Is it a culture of deceit. When you sign on you get pass and how to delete.

Kwan as MLA for Disneyland? Culture - name calling?

It's incomprehensible when her chief objective is to divide - to degrade me.

One of the things you want to elevate is the change in tone. People haven't had rep for months. She took a shot. Disrespectful to Kwan and those who support Kwan. Partisans love it but normal people don't.

Standing committee hasn't sat in long time.

Former privacy commissioner also did stint in AG office (BC rail)...this is a fig leaf.

Where do you thing George learned to do this? Standard operating procedure. Blur lines...

We asked about representation in legislature and we get shots

George's salary? Subject to review by merit commissioner - if breaking law then he will have to be accountable to that in the future. Took salary after breaking law - see how that plays out.

***Mentions special prosecutor will report out next week??

Sent from my iPhone

Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX

From: Bell, Jordan TRAN:EX
Sent: Wednesday, October 21, 2015 5:12 PM
To: Stone, Todd TRAN:EX
Subject: Media Request - Vancouver Sun - Hwy 16 transportation options

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Minister – we have a request here from the Van Sun looking for more information on transportation options for Hwy 16. They've reviewed one of the FOIs we've put out on this that mentioned a highway coach between PG and PR and wants to know if this is still being looked at. Our response is below.

Let me know if this works for you on your end.

jb

Minister Request Y/N: No – requesting background information only

Topic: Transportation options for Hwy 16

Reporter/ Contact: Bethany Lindsay Office: s.21

blindsay@vancouver.sun.com

Outlet: Vancouver Sun

Date/ Time received: 12:45 pm – Wednesday, October 21

Deadline: 4:30 pm today

Reporter's Request: Reporter looking for more information on transportation options for Hwy 16, after reviewing the Open Information posting: (http://docs.openinfo.gov.bc.ca/Response_Package_TRA-2015-51542.pdf), specifically - the estimated \$1-million annual cost to run a heavy duty highway coach between Prince George and Prince Rupert on a daily basis.

She's asking if this option is still on the table, and if any costing has been done for other types of vehicles along this route. Reporter notices that on page 6, the shuttle option mentions using 23-seaters or even vans to take people between communities.

She's also asking what's the current status of discussions on transportation options along Highway 16? How close are we to a solution?

Proposed response:

The ministry continues to work with a number of partners, including the First Nations Health Authority, to explore practical, affordable and sustainable transportation options for the communities along the Highway 16 corridor. We've been told by community representatives that long-distance bus service is unsustainable and doesn't meet the local everyday needs of communities, such as going shopping, to the bank, appointments and attending local community events. This is a large geographical region and a "one-size fits all" approach like a shuttle bus won't address the transportation challenges these communities face. The \$1 million cost to run a bus service between Prince George and Prince Rupert would run mostly empty and would not be sustainable.

The ministry and the First Nations Health Authority are hosting a transportation symposium on November 24 to hear from the 23 First Nations communities along the Highway 16 corridor, regional district representatives and other organizations. The discussion will focus on finding practical, affordable and sustainable transportation options to address both medical and non-medical travel along the corridor and ultimately, to develop a vision for a community-based transportation model that is supported by First Nations and neighbouring communities.

Please click here for more information on the symposium: <https://news.gov.bc.ca/releases/2015TRAN0140-001701>

Gedney, Vanessa TRAN:EX

From: Sauder, Kit TRAN:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 11:18 AM
To: Doyle, Dan PREM:EX
Subject: Re: Memo from Premier Clark

I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it.

Kit Sauder
Ministerial Assistant
To the Honourable Todd Stone
Minister of Transportation and Infrastructure
(250) 889-9133

Sent from my iPhone

On Oct 23, 2015, at 10:59 AM, Doyle, Dan PREM:EX <D.Doyle@gov.bc.ca> wrote:

Good morning everyone,
Please see the attached memo from the Premier. Please confirm that you have received it by replying the following to me in an e-mail:

"I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it."
Let me know if you have any questions. Thank you for your attention to this matter,

Dan Doyle
Chief of Staff to Premier Christy Clark

Diacu, Raz TRAN:EX

From: Diacu, Raz TRAN:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 11:43 AM
To: Doyle, Dan PREM:EX
Subject: RE: Memo from Premier Clark

I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it.
Thank you,
Raz Diacu

From: Doyle, Dan PREM:EX
Sent: Friday, October 23, 2015 10:59 AM
To: LP Chief of Staff; LP Ministerial Assistants; LP Executive Assistants
Subject: Memo from Premier Clark

Good morning everyone,

Please see the attached memo from the Premier. Please confirm that you have received it by replying the following to me in an e-mail:

"I have received this memo from the Premier. I understand it and will abide by it."

Let me know if you have any questions. Thank you for your attention to this matter,

Dan Doyle
Chief of Staff to Premier Christy Clark



October 23, 2015

Dear Colleagues,

I know you share my sense of duty to British Columbians to ensure we lead a government that is open and accountable.

To that end, we will be taking action on the Privacy Commissioner's recommendations. I have asked David Loukidelis to help us strengthen our processes and training around Freedom of Information, and give us advice on the best ways to implement actions in response to this report.

Until Mr. Loukidelis completes his work, I am further directing my Cabinet Ministers and all political staff, to keep all the emails they send, regardless of whether they are transitory or not.

There can be conflicting views on how the rules have been applied over the decades. It is my expectation that we do our utmost to follow the regulations around Freedom of Information. But, we also need to recognize that technology, as well as public expectations are evolving.

We can, and should, take this additional step to give our citizens greater confidence that their government is open and accountable.

Sincerely,

Christy Clark
Premier